## Cambridge Elements<sup>=</sup>

Elements in Philosophy of Law

edited by George Pavlakos University of Glasgow Gerald J. Postema University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill Kenneth M. Ehrenberg University of Surrey

## THE PHILOSOPHY OF LEGAL PROOF

Lewis Ross London School of Economics and Political Science





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009507394

DOI: 10.1017/9781009127745

© Lewis Ross 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009127745

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-50739-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-12504-8 Paperback ISSN 2631-5815 (online) ISSN 2631-5807 (print)

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## The Philosophy of Legal Proof

Elements in Philosophy of Law

DOI: 10.1017/9781009127745 First published online: April 2024

Lewis Ross London School of Economics and Political Science Author for correspondence: Lewis Ross, L.ross2@lse.ac.uk

Abstract: Criminal courts make decisions that can remove the liberty and even the lives of those accused. Civil trials can cause the bankruptcy of companies employing thousands of people, asylum seekers to be deported, or children to be placed into state care. Selecting the right standards when deciding legal cases is of utmost importance in making sure those affected receive a fair deal. This Element is an introduction to the philosophy of legal proof. It is organised around five questions. First, it introduces the standards of proof and considers what justifies them. Second, it discusses whether we should use different standards in different cases. Third, it asks whether trials should end only in binary outcomes – e.g., guilty or not guilty – or use more fine-grained or precise verdicts. Fourth, it considers whether proof is simply about probability, concentrating on the famous 'Proof Paradox'. Finally, it examines who should be trusted with deciding trials, focusing on the jury system.

Keywords: legal proof, evidence law, trials, juries, beyond reasonable doubt

© Lewis Ross 2024

ISBNs: 9781009507394 (HB), 9781009125048 (PB), 9781009127745 (OC) ISSNs: 2631-5815 (online), 2631-5807 (print)

## Contents

	Introduction	1
1	Standards of Proof	1
2	Proof: Fixed or Flexible?	18
3	Should Proof Be Binary?	27
4	Legal Probabilism and Anti-Probabilism	36
5	Who Should Decide?	52
	References	67