

THE UNDERDETERMINATION OF MORAL THEORIES

In normative ethics, a small number of moral traditions, such as Kantianism or consequentialism, take center stage. Conventional wisdom has it that these traditions posit very different ways of looking at the world. In this book Marius Baumann develops the idea that just as scientific theories can be underdetermined by data, so can moral theories be underdetermined by our considered judgments about particular cases. Baumann goes on to ask whether moral theories from different traditions might arrive at the same verdicts while remaining explanatorily incompatible. He applies this idea to recent projects in normative ethics, such as Derek Parfit's *On What Matters* and so-called consequentializing and deontologizing, and outlines its important implications for our understanding of the relationship between the main moral traditions as well as the moral realism debate. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

MARIUS BAUMANN is Academic Director of the Centre for Ethics and Philosophy in Practice at Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich. His articles have appeared in *Synthese*, the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, and *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*.

THE UNDERDETERMINATION OF MORAL THEORIES

MARIUS BAUMANN

Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-49244-7 — The Underdetermination of Moral Theories
Marius Baumann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009492447

DOI: [10.1017/9781009492454](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009492454)

© Marius Baumann 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant
collective licensing agreements, with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for
which is provided below, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009492454 under a Creative
Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and
reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the
original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of
this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI [10.1017/9781009492454](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009492454)

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-009-49244-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

To my father, who is missed every day.

Contents

| | |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <i>page ix</i> |
| Introduction | I |
| I.1 A Puzzle | 1 |
| I.2 Underdetermination: From Science to Ethics | 3 |
| I.3 Demarcating the Main Idea | 6 |
| I.4 The Plan for the Book | 8 |
| PART I SCIENTIFIC UNDERDETERMINATION AND THE ANALOGY TO ETHICS | |
| 1 Underdetermination in Science | 13 |
| 1.1 Introducing the Idea and Its Earliest Forerunners | 13 |
| 1.2 Three Paths to Underdetermination | 23 |
| 1.3 Varieties of Underdetermination | 29 |
| 2 The Analogy to the Moral Realm | 35 |
| 2.1 The Underlying Picture of Moral Theories | 36 |
| 2.2 The Evidence of Moral Theories | 53 |
| 2.3 Complications | 61 |
| PART II UNDERDETERMINATION IN NORMATIVE ETHICS | |
| 3 Parfit and the Case Study of Case Studies | 73 |
| 3.1 Doubting the Dogma | 74 |
| 3.2 Climbing the Mountain | 77 |
| 3.3 Failed Conciliation and Moral Underdetermination | 80 |
| 4 Going Algorithmic | 89 |
| 4.1 Consequentializing: A Simple Recipe and a Two-Step Procedure | 90 |
| 4.2 Deontologizing: Leveling the Playing Field | 98 |
| 4.3 Algorithms and Underdetermination | 107 |

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| 5 | The Big Picture in Normative Ethics | 120 |
| 5.1 | The Roads to Moral Underdetermination | 120 |
| 5.2 | Varieties of the Phenomenon | 133 |
| 5.3 | Where to Go from Here | 151 |
| PART III SKEPTICISM AND A NEW METAETHICAL POSITION | | |
| 6 | Skeptical Repercussions | 161 |
| 6.1 | Duhem and Quine Again | 161 |
| 6.2 | From a Semantic to an Epistemic Challenge | 165 |
| 6.3 | Adapting the Skeptical Argument to the Realm of Ethics | 169 |
| 6.4 | In Defense of the Argument | 174 |
| 7 | A New Position in Metaethics | 185 |
| 7.1 | Constructive Empiricism and Constructive Deonticism | 186 |
| 7.2 | Classifying the New View | 196 |
| 7.3 | Two Worries | 206 |
| 8 | Looking Back and Ahead | 212 |
| 8.1 | How We Got Here | 212 |
| 8.2 | The Puzzle Solved? | 220 |
| | <i>Bibliography</i> | 223 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 234 |

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank, first and foremost, my PhD supervisor, Claus Beisbart, for invaluable guidance and unceasing support since my ideas on moral underdetermination began to take shape in the form of my MA thesis. Without his countless suggestions and remarks, this book would not have been possible. My thanks also go to the following people:

My second supervisor, Gerhard Ernst, for highly insightful and always encouraging comments on several occasions in Erlangen and Berne.

Christian List for enormously helpful feedback on several occasions, for hosting me at LSE, and for continuing support throughout the years.

Georg Brun, Tanja Rechnitzer, and many changing members of the *Reflective Equilibrium Jour Fixe* at the Institute of Philosophy in Berne, for many challenging discussions, as well as some most valuable suggestions on how to navigate the roads of academic philosophy.

Jamie Dreier, Brad Hooker, and Philip Stratton-Lake for hosting me during two research visits, taking the time to read drafts, and recommending many additional topics to consider. I remember very fondly how I met Philip for the first time and he asked me a lot of seemingly simple questions that opened my eyes about all the issues I had not thought through sufficiently.

In addition, my sincere gratitude goes to Christoph Baumberger, Monika Betzler, Susanne Boshammer, Christian Budnik, Matthias Egg, Jörg Löschke, Adriano Mannino, Michel Meliopoulos, Lukas Nägeli, Korbinian Rieger, Peter Schaber, Jussi Suikkanen, Folke Tersman, Jonas Vandieken, Laura Valentini, Silvan Wittwer, and some people I have undoubtedly forgotten for enlightening comments on drafts and papers.

I have had the pleasure to present parts of the book at conferences and in front of reading groups and seminars in Berne, Cologne, Edinburgh, Erlangen, Manchester, Munich, Osnabrück, Singapore, Southampton, Stockholm, Utrecht, and Zurich. I want to thank the audiences for their always

constructive and amicable discussions and the organizers for making these very enjoyable occasions possible.

My sincere thanks also go to Hilary Gaskin for patient support, two very perceptive referees for Cambridge University Press, and several anonymous journal referees, who have often gone way beyond what is required and helped me avoid countless mistakes.

I am grateful to the Swiss National Science Foundation for a generous, four-year full-time grant during my PhD, as well as two mobility grants for research visits at Brown and Reading Universities. The open access publication of this book has been published with the support of the Swiss National Science Foundation.

Finally, my eternal gratitude goes to my wife, who has put up with this for what feels almost as long, and our adorable boys, without whom none of this matters.