

PORPHYRY'S COMMENTARY ON PTOLEMY'S *HARMONICS*

Porphyry's *Commentary*, the only surviving ancient commentary on a technical text, is not merely a study of Ptolemy's *Harmonics*. It includes virtually free-standing philosophical essays on epistemology, metaphysics, scientific methodology, aspects of the Aristotelian categories and the relations between Aristotle's views and Plato's, and a host of briefer comments on other matters of wide philosophical interest. For musicologists it is widely recognised as a treasury of quotations from earlier treatises, many of them otherwise unknown; but Porphyry's own reflections on musical concepts (for instance notes, intervals and their relation to ratios, quantitative and qualitative conceptions of pitch, the continuous and discontinuous forms of vocal movement, and so on) and his snapshots of contemporary music-making have been undeservedly neglected. This volume presents the first English translation and a revised Greek text of the *Commentary*, with an Introduction and notes designed to assist readers in engaging with this important and intricate work.

ANDREW BARKER is Emeritus Professor of Classics at the University of Birmingham. He has been researching in the field of ancient Greek music and musical theory since the 1970s, and has published six books (including *The Science of Harmonics in Classical Greece*, Cambridge 2007) and a great many articles on these topics. He is the Founding President of the International Society for the Study of Greek and Roman Music (Moisa), and Editor of the journal *Greek and Roman Musical Studies*.

PORPHYRY'S COMMENTARY
ON PTOLEMY'S
HARMONICS

A Greek Text and Annotated Translation

ANDREW BARKER



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-49086-3 — Porphyry's Commentary on Ptolemy's Harmonics
Edited and translated by Andrew Barker
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009490863

© Andrew Barker 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2015
First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-00385-9 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-49086-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Acknowledgements	<i>page</i> vi
Introduction	i
Texts and Translations	61
Porphyry's commentary on Ptolemy's <i>Harmonics</i> book 1	63
Porphyry's commentary on Ptolemy's <i>Harmonics</i> book 2	465
<i>Bibliography</i>	564
<i>Index of names</i>	570
<i>General index</i>	574

Acknowledgements

Without the advice and encouragement that other people have given me, and without the generous amounts of time that fellow-scholars have devoted to discussing it, this volume would certainly have been much more badly flawed than it is; quite possibly I would have decided that the task was too daunting, and simply abandoned it. I cannot give personal thanks to all the people who have helped me along the way, whether they realised it or not; I have probably forgotten about some useful conversations, and among those who have discussed it with me are some whose names I never knew. Others, some of whom I mention below, could not possibly be forgotten. But to all of them, whether I name them or not, I am sincerely grateful.

At one stage in the slow progress of my work I was thinking of cutting it short and only publishing translations of selected passages of the *Commentary*; and when I mentioned the possibility to Geoffrey Lloyd, it was his horrified reaction to this pusillanimous strategy that spurred me into pressing on. During the project's later years I had the privilege of working with Massimo Raffa on his Italian translation of the text, which will probably appear at about the same time as mine. I learned a great deal from him in the process; he opened up some fascinating fresh perspectives on Porphyry's arguments, and alerted me to a number of textual and interpretative difficulties I had missed. Stefan Hagel's persistent questioning of the ways in which I construed certain passages compelled me to rethink and sharpen my interpretations, and he gave invaluable guidance about the puzzles presented by one particularly problematic chapter. Others to whom I am indebted for advice and encouragement include David Sedley, Malcolm Schofield, Angelo Meriani, Eleonora Rocconi and David Creese. Those whom for various reasons I cannot name include many members of my audiences who have commented and raised questions about papers I have presented at conferences and seminars in Europe and the United States, and the two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press,

Acknowledgements

vii

whose reports were not only flatteringly favourable, but offered detailed and worthwhile suggestions which have greatly improved the book. My heart-felt thanks to all these people, named and unnamed.

As always, the staff of Cambridge University Press have been unfailingly patient, efficient and helpful, from the sprouting of the project's first shoots right through to the harvest. In particular, Michael Sharp not only welcomed my original proposal and supported my subsequent efforts; he is also the source of the idea that I should include a revised Greek text and apparatus as well as the translation, and his gentle persuasion overcame my initial reluctance. In view of the amount of additional work it involved, I didn't feel particularly grateful to him at the time, but I have revised that churlish attitude; I now think it was worth the effort and I hope that readers will agree. Many thanks, too, to Elizabeth Hanlon, who oversaw the book's progress through to production, to the expert who transformed my crudely hand-drawn diagrams into accurate and elegant figures, and to my admirable copy-editor, Linda Woodward, whose meticulous work has done much to eliminate imperfections I had overlooked.

To my wife, Jill, I owe more than I can possibly say, not just for her loving friendship, but also for the inspiring example of the intelligence, care and resolute persistence that she brings to projects of her own. And although it seems unlikely that any of them will ever find much use for this volume – except perhaps as a door-stop – I should like to dedicate it to my extensive tribe of children, Jonathan, Nick, Michael, Kate and Will, and grandchildren, Ben, Amy, Ashlyn, Rio, Holly, Raf, Sam and Alex, who are a constant, delightful and salutary reminder that there are even more important things in life than the study of ancient texts.