

CONSTITUTIONAL INTOLERANCE

Constitutional Intolerance offers a deeper reflection on intolerance in politics and society today, explaining why minorities face the contestation of their public visibility, and how the law could protect them. Mariëtta van der Tol refers to historical practices of toleration, distilling from them the category of “the other” to the political community, whose presence, representation, and visibility are often subject to regulation. The book considers “the other” in the context of modern constitutions, with reference to (ethno) religious, ethnic, and sexual groups. Theoretical chapters engage questions about the time and temporality of otherness, and their ambivalent relationship with (public) space. The book offers examples from across the liberal–illiberal divide: France, the Netherlands, Hungary, and Poland. It highlights that vulnerability towards intolerance is inscribed in the structures of the law and is not merely inherent to either liberalism or illiberalism, as is often inferred.

Mariëtta D. C. van der Tol (University of Oxford) specialises in the comparative study of religion in constitutional law, politics, and society. She obtained graduate degrees in law, history (Utrecht University), and religion (Yale University) before completing her doctorate in politics at the University of Cambridge. She is Lecturer in Politics at Lincoln College and Alfred Landecker Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Blavatnik School of Government, University of Oxford.

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg *University of Chicago*
Zachary Elkins *University of Texas at Austin*
Ran Hirschl *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

Constitutional Reforms in China: Past, Present, Future Qianfan Zhang

The Entrenchment of Democracy: The Comparative Constitutional Design of Elections, Parties and Voting Tom Ginsburg, Aziz Z. Huq, and Tarun Khaitan

Deciphering the Genome of Constitutionalism: The Foundations and Future of Constitutional Identity Ran Hirschl and Yaniv Roznai

Courts that Matter: Activists, Judges, and the Politics of Rights Enforcement Sandra Botero

The Story of Constitutions: Discovering the We in Us Wim Voermans

Democracy Under God: Constitutions, Islam and Human Rights in the Muslim World Dawood Ahmed and Muhammad Zubair Abbasi

Buddhism and Comparative Constitutional Law Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Ben Schonthal

Amending America's Unwritten Constitution Edited by Richard Albert, Ryan C. Williams, and Yaniv Roznai

Constitutionalism and a Right to Effective Government? Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Yasmin Dawood

The Fall of the Arab Spring: Democracy's Challenges and Efforts to Reconstitute the Middle East Tofigh Maboudi

Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism: The Italian Case in a Comparative Perspective Giuseppe Martinico

Constitutionalism in Context David S. Law

The New Fourth Branch: Institutions for Protecting Constitutional Democracy Mark Tushnet

The Veil of Participation: Citizens and Political Parties in Constitution-Making Processes Alexander Hudson

Towering Judges: A Comparative Study of Constitutional Judges Edited by Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat

The Constitution of Arbitration Victor Ferreres Comella

Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives
Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions Edited by Tom Ginsburg
and Aziz Z. Huq

*The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards
Constitutional Autocracy* Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan

A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change Edited by
Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy, and Shishir Bail

*Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and
the United States* Stephan Stohler

Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, and
Georg Vanberg

*Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special
Administrative Regions* Eric C. Ip

Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence
C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer

The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective Edited by Rosalind Dixon and
Adrienne Stone

The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis Theunis Roux

Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen
and Andrew Harding

Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate Anine Kierulf

Constituent Assemblies Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and
Bjorn Erik Rasch

*The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial
Design* Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions? Andrew Arato

Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution Edited by
Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia, and Sri Lanka Dian
A. H. Shah

Courts and Democracies in Asia Po Jen Yap

Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and
Mark Tushnet

*Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the
Crafting of New Constitutions* Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

Assessing Constitutional Performance Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka
Benjamin Schonthal

Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave Brian Ray

Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America Julio Ríos-Figueroa

Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies David Kosař

Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco

Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton

Constitutions and Religious Freedom Frank B. Cross

International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia Edited by Susan H. Williams

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser

Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances Shubhankar Dam

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

Comparative Constitutional Design Edited by Tom Ginsburg

Constitutional Intolerance

THE FASHIONING OF THE OTHER IN EUROPE'S
CONSTITUTIONAL REPERTOIRES

MARIËTTA D. C. VAN DER TOL

University of Oxford



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-47395-8 — Constitutional Intolerance
Mariëtta D. C. van der Tol
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University’s mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009473958

DOI: 10.1017/9781009473927

© Mariëtta D. C. van der Tol 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009473927

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Tol, Mariëtta D.C. van der, author.

TITLE: Constitutional intolerance : The fashioning of the other in Europe’s constitutional repertoires /
Mariëtta D.C. van der Tol, University of Oxford.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2024. |
Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2024014479 (print) | LCCN 2024014480 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009473958 (hardback) |
ISBN 9781009473927 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Minorities—Legal status, laws, etc.—Europe. | Religious minorities—Legal status, laws,
etc.—Europe. | Constitutional law—Europe. | Laicism—Europe.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KJC5144.M56 T645 2024 (print) | LCC KJC5144.M56 (ebook) |
DDC 342.408—dc23/eng/20240402

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024014479>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024014480>

ISBN 978-1-009-47395-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

To my parents

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page xiii</i>
1 What Is Constitutional Intolerance?	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 What Is Toleration?	5
1.3 The Theoretical Incompatibility of (Religious) Intolerance and Constitutionalism	9
1.4 Outline of the Chapters	12
2 Governing Religious Difference: Toleration as Legal Practice	17
2.1 Toleration as an Administrative Discretion	17
2.2 Frames of Reference to Toleration	19
2.3 Layers of Visibility	23
2.4 Toleration Treaties: A Norm for Discernment in Action	27
2.5 The Imaginary and the Modern State	32
3 Toleration, Time, and the Other	35
3.1 Time and Its Relevance to Toleration	35
3.2 To Grow into Our Image: The Category of “Becoming”	37
3.3 The Centrality of the Constitutional Community	40
3.4 Constitutions as the Binding of Time	45
3.5 The Significance of Time and Temporalities to Constitutional Intolerance	49
4 National Identity, Publicness, and Public Space	51
4.1 National Identity and Its Entanglement with Public Space	51
4.2 National Identity as a Spectrum of Othering	52

4.3	Toleration as Privatisation, Secularisation as Privatisation? The Case for Trans-liminal Public Space	58
4.4	Neutrality or Substantive Democracy?	64
4.5	The Significance of Public Space to Constitutional Intolerance	67
5	Dynamic Interpretation of Constitutional Concepts: <i>Laïcité</i> in France	69
5.1	<i>Laïcité</i> beyond Religion	69
5.2	<i>Laïcité</i> as a Projection of National Identity	70
5.3	The Pseudo-constitutional Notion of <i>Vivre Ensemble</i> in the “Burqa Bans”	77
5.4	<i>Laïcité</i> as Control: The 2021 <i>Laïcité</i> Bill	81
5.5	The Significance of Dynamic Interpretation	85
6	<i>Ad libitum</i> Use of Constitutional Concepts: Public Order in the Netherlands	87
6.1	The Unwritten Nature of Religion–State Relationships in the Netherlands	87
6.2	Religion and National Identity in the Netherlands	89
6.3	Public Order as a Foundation of Constitutionalism	93
6.4	Public Order in the Dutch Burqa Ban	98
6.5	The Significance of Constitutional Intolerance in the Netherlands	102
7	Constitutional Identity as a Political Instrument: New Fundamental Law in Hungary	104
7.1	The Rise of Fidesz under the Leadership of Viktor Orbán	104
7.2	“There Are Things Which Are Eternal”: The Assertion of Sacredness of the Hungarian Nation and Its “Constitutional Identity”	107
7.3	The Church Law of 2011 and the Loss of Legal Personality of Disfavoured Religious Organisations	111
7.4	The Church Law as Constitutional Intolerance: Mapping the Repertoires	116
7.5	The Constitutional Theoretical Significance of Intolerant Repertoires	120
8	Pseudo-constitutional Repertoires: The “LGBT-Free Zones” in Poland	127
8.1	The Rise of Illiberalism since 2015	127
8.2	A Thousand-Year Christian Polish Identity?	129
8.3	Local Declarations on LGBT Identities and Family Charters	135

<i>Contents</i>	xi
8.4 The Wider Legal Context of the LGBT Resolutions and Family Charters	140
8.5 The Significance of Pseudo-constitutional Repertoires for Constitutional Intolerance	141
9 Conclusion: Constitutional Intolerance in Context	143
9.1 The Many Faces of Constitutional Intolerance	143
9.2 Normative Reflection: The Significance of Historical Toleration	146
9.3 Normative Reflection: The Meaning of Sharing Space and Time	149
9.4 The Rise of Cynical Democracy	153
<i>Bibliography</i>	157
<i>Index</i>	173

Acknowledgements

It was during one of the seminars on religious toleration at Yale that it first dawned on me that the antecedents of contemporary conflicts over diversity in Europe may very well be found in early modernity. Having completed graduate degrees in law and history at Utrecht University in the Netherlands, I had come to Yale Divinity School as a Fulbright scholar to study the history of Christianity, which I had initially thought of as an excursus. Little did I know how much this space would nurture my interest in the theoretical and historical foundations of constitutional law and equip me to engage this interest from across multiple disciplines during my doctoral work at the University of Cambridge.

I am indebted to a great number of teachers and mentors. I would like to recognise the mentorship and guidance of Henk Kummeling, Henk Addink, Hans-Martien ten Napel, George Harinck, and Leon van den Broeke, as well as Bruce Gordon, Kenneth Minkema, David Sorkin, Tisa Wenger, Jennifer Herdt, and Vernice Randall. The Department of Politics and International Studies at the University of Cambridge gave me a unique opportunity to shape my doctoral research interdisciplinarily, enabled by the Arts and Humanities Research Council (AHRC) Doctoral Training Programme, the Vice-Chancellor's Award, and the Sint Geertruidsleen. I am indebted to my supervisors Sara Silvestri and Iza Hussin, my examiners Harald Wydra and Sophie van Bijsterveld, and my mentors Arnold Weggeman and Marjolein Swaanenburg-van Roosmalen during a research visit to the Netherlands Council of State. Special thanks go to Theodor Dunkelgrün, Simon Goldhill, Sami Everett for organising such inspiring Summer Schools on Religious Diversity in the University at the Cambridge Centre for Research in the Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences.

The Alfred Landecker postdoctoral research fellowship at the Blavatnik School of Government and non-stipendiary Junior Research Fellowship at New College, University of Oxford, offered a productive environment to build my research profile while building international networks, organising conferences and workshops, and

publishing collaborative work around the Alfred Landecker Programme and the project “Protestant Political Thought: Religion, State, Nation”. I am grateful for the mentorship of Jonathan Wolff and Nazila Ghanea, and my colleagues Dapo Akande, Maya Tudor, and Federica d’Alessandra. I am grateful to the Landecker Foundation and its community, especially Dan Diner, Silke Muelherr, Steffen Jost, and Alexander Busold, whose passion for the protection of minorities in Europe has been inspiring.

The Alfred Landecker Programme enabled me to take up learning Hungarian and organise several research visits to Hungary and Romania, and to present my work at conferences across Europe. This book has benefitted from in-depth seminars and discussions at the HUN-REN Center for Social Sciences, Institute for Legal Studies, the Democracy Institute at the Central European University, and the conference “Nationalismus und Christentum” at the Reformed Theological University of Debrecen, facilitated by Fruszina Orosz, Renáta Uitz, Andreas Schedler, László Levente Balogh, and Wolfgang Palaver, respectively. My thanks also go to Alexander Faludy, for his instant updates on Hungarian politics, and to David Baer, who selflessly sent me his notes on the Hungarian Church Law and a host of annotated primary sources in Hungarian for the chapter on the new Fundamental Law (Chapter 7).

I am grateful to John Witte and Whittney Barth of the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University for hosting discussions on law and religion with scholars from across the Atlantic. I thank Mika Vähäkangas, Björn Vikström, Tove Höglund, and Laura Wikström of the Inez and Julius Polin Institute for theological research at Åbo Akademi (Finland), where I completed the case study on Poland and delved into the wider geographical and political context of Northeastern Europe. Much of the writing came together during several silent retreats at the wonderful Anglican-Benedictine nunnery of Mallin Abbey. A research visit to Leiden University enabled me to complete the manuscript, and my special thanks to the hospitality of Anne Meuwese, Wim Voermans, and the constitutional and administrative law division. The book project has been brought to completion with the support of student-assistants Ben Davidson and Andrej Bukovac-Mimica, as well as Marianne Nield, Biju Singh, Camilya Anitta, Tom Ginsburg, Zachary Elkins, and Ran Hirschl of Cambridge University Press.

I have had the privilege of conversing with many scholars, practitioners, and journalists in the process of developing my thesis and this book, especially Philip Gorski, Petr Kratochvíl, Sophia Johnson, Elisabeth Becker-Topkara, Gülay Türkmen, Beatrice de Graaf, Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Jade Wong, Jan Petrov, Matthias König, John Dunn, Brendan Simms, Tobias Müller, John Adenitire, Emily Kempson, Carys Brown, Alexis Artaud de La Ferrière, Elizabeth Frazer, Hansko Broeksteeg, Viktória Kóczyán, Karolina Kocemba, Teresa Bejan, Sophie Smith, Sarah Mortimer, John Heathershaw, Zoltán Szente, Ulrich Schmiedel, Judd Birdsall, Tornike Metreveli, Matthew Rowley, Katharina Kunter, Anna Hennig,

Acknowledgements

xv

Tarunabh Khaitan, Tobias Cremer, Sophie Lauwers, László Gonda, John Morijn, Tina Magazzini, Margot Dazey, Anne Guillard, Jonathan Chaplin, Peter Sloman, Jim Walters, Kim Lane Scheppele, Dmytro Vovk, Júlia Mink, Hossein Dabbagh, Tariq Modood, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd, András Pap, and others who remain unnamed for political reasons.

Finally, I wish to thank my family, whose love and support have been invaluable, and who understand the personal depth of this piece of work.