

The Politics of International Norms

Norm contestation is prevalent in international affairs: Legal ambiguities and tensions generate debate, even when well-established international norms are applied to concrete situations. This book discusses a wide range of norm disputes and develops a rhetorical approach to the politics of international norms. Anette Stimmer demonstrates how actors can agree or disagree on the norm frame (norm-based justification) and/or behavioral claim (implementing action) when applying international law. Thus, norm contestation can have four "alternate endings": norm impasse, norm neglect, norm recognition, and norm clarification. These alternate endings affect the clarity and strength of the contested norms, as well as subsequent debate, differently. Furthermore, Stimmer explains how three classical elements of rhetoric - speakers (including delegation to agents), argumentation, and audience reactions - influence the duration and outcome of contestation. This rhetorical approach is applied to eight norm disputes, ranging from military interventions to contestation over the human rights of terror suspects.

ANETTE STIMMER is a Lecturer in International Relations at the University of St Andrews. Her research focuses on norm contestation and change, reasons for action, international security, and human rights. Her work has been published in the *European Journal of International Relations*, *International Studies Quarterly*, and the *Journal of Global Security Studies*. She has received awards from the International Studies Association and the Political Studies Association.





The Politics of International Norms

A Rhetorical Approach

ANETTE STIMMER Lecturer in International Relations, University of St Andrews







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009455442

DOI: 10.1017/9781009455473

© Anette Stimmer 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009455473

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Stimmer, Anette, 1985- author.

Title: The politics of international norms: a rhetorical approach / Anette Stimmer. Description: First edition. | New York: Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024042251 (print) | LCCN 2024042252 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009455442 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009455459 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009455473 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: International law–Political aspects. | Jus cogens (International law) | International relations.

Classification: LCC KZ1250 .S75 2025 (print) | LCC KZ1250 (ebook) | DDC 341/ .1–dc23/eng/20241106

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024042251

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024042252

ISBN 978-1-009-45544-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-45545-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Emma and Ben





Contents

Li	st of Figures	page viii
Li	st of Tables	ix
Αc	knowledgments	X
Li	st of Abbreviations	xii
	Introduction	1
1	Alternate Endings of Norm Contestation	38
2	Persistence of Alternate Endings: Argumentation, Audience Reactions, and Speakers (Delegation to Agents)	78
3	Norm Impasse: Contested Statehoods of Kosovo, and of South Ossetia a Abkhazia (Territorial Integrity vs. Self-Determination)	and 118
4	Norm Neglect: 2011 Libya No-Fly Zone (R2P, PoC vs. Sovereignty) and South China Sea Dispute (UNCLOS, 2016 Arbitral Award vs. Nine-Dash Line)	156
5	Norm Recognition: 2003 Iraq War (Chapter VII Norms) and Targeted Sanctions (Due Process Rights)	209
6	Norm Clarification: International Terrorism (Right to Self-Defense and Torture Prohibition)	261
	Conclusion	299
Bi	bliography	311
Index		355
		vii



Figures

1.1	The basic structure of arguments	page 46
1.2	Overlapping frame disagreements	52
1.3	Changes in scope are relative	68
1.4	Undermining of a norm core	70
4.1	Map of nine-dash line	167
4.2	Contested areas in the SCS	169
6.1	Bush and White House argumentation	292
6.2	In-group members' support for	
	US interpretations	292
6.3	Rejection of US interpretations	293

viii



Tables

1.1	"Alternate endings" typology	page 44
3.1	Overview of case study findings	128
4. 1	Overview of case study findings	175
6.1	Overview of case study findings	267

ix



Acknowledgments

This book has accompanied me through my DPhil (PhD), postdoc years, and first year as a Lecturer (Assistant Professor). I am therefore grateful to have received advice and support from many scholars and institutions at different stages of this project. First, I would like to thank Nuffield College and the Department of Politics and International Relations (DPIR), University of Oxford, as well as the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, for their generous scholarships, and the Rothermere American Institute, for financial support for my fieldwork in New York. I am grateful for feedback from Nicholas Barker, John de Bhal, Nicole De Silva, Janina Dill, Matthias Dilling, Edmund Downie, Jessica Gliserman, Ezequiel González Ocantos, Todd Hall, Kristen Harkness, Patrick James, Ian Johnstone, Edward Keene, Christian Kreuder-Sonnen, Tony Lang, Gemma Lligadas, Walter Mattli, Karolina Milewicz, Jean-Frédéric Morin, Joel Ng, Lara Olson, Christian Reus-Smit, Duncan Snidal, Johanna Speyer, Nora Stappert, Jacqui True, Shaina Western, Laurence Whitehead, Carla Winston, Lea Wisken, and Yuan Yi Zhu. I would also like to thank Maddie Boyce, Jess Gliserman, Karen Katiyo, and Gemma Lligadas for their research assistance, and James Disley and Nicole De Silva for proofreading. I am also indebted to the two reviewers of this book, whose advice has strengthened this project.

A few people deserve special mention. Most of all, I would like to thank my DPhil supervisor, Duncan Snidal, for his support and guidance and for helping me to develop my own ideas. Duncan's advice on how to present and refine my arguments has been invaluable. It has also saved the reader from even more long German-style sentences and paragraphs. I am particularly grateful for his reassurance and belief in me and this project, and for all the little wisdoms on life as an academic that he has shared with me. I am also grateful to Eddie Keene and Shaina Western for their probing questions during an examination in the early stages of my DPhil studies, which gave me



Acknowledgments

хi

the idea for this project. Similarly, I would like to thank Janina Dill and Chris Reus-Smit for their helpful comments in the final thesis defense. A special thanks also goes to the diplomats, experts, and legal professionals who agreed to be interviewed for this book. Their opinions have been invaluable for my understanding of the politics of international norms.

My family and friends have been a great source of support. I would like to thank my parents for always being there for me and for traveling with us to many different countries during school holidays, which raised my interest in international affairs. I am grateful to my husband, Matthew Addis, for his (almost) never-ending patience and for his support. I developed my DPhil thesis further and turned it into this book during the early years of motherhood; this has not always been easy. My children, Emma and Ben, have brought so much joy into my life. More than anything else, seeing them develop their own personalities, their joy in the little things in life, and their curiosity about the world has inspired me. I dedicate this book to them. While you find it shocking in 2024 that there are books with hundreds of pages but only a handful of pictures, I hope that you might find reading this book a bit more interesting in twenty years or so.



Abbreviations

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CAT Convention Against Torture and Other
Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment

or Punishment

CC competence-control (trade-off)
CFI (European) Court of First Instance

CIA Central Intelligence Agency

CID cruel, inhuman or degrading (treatment)
CIS Commonwealth of Independent States

CIVIC Center for Civilians in Conflict

CSTO Collective Security Treaty Organization

ECJ European Court of Justice EEZ exclusive economic zone GCC Gulf Cooperation Council

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency

ICC International Criminal Court ICJ International Court of Justice

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
IFFMCG Independent International Fact-Finding

Mission on the Conflict in Georgia

IO international organization IR International Relations

ISIL Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

KFOR (NATO) Kosovo Force KIG Kalayaan Island Group LAS League of Arab States

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization NGO non-governmental organization

O opponent

xii



List of Abbreviations

xiii

OIC	Organization of the Islamic Conference
P3	Three permanent UNSC members: the US,
	the UK and France
P5	Five permanent UNSC members: the US, the
	UK, France, Russia and China
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PoC	Protection of Civilians
PoW	prisoner of war
R2P	Responsibility to Protect
RO	regional organization
RwP	Responsibility while Protecting
SCO	Shanghai Cooperation Organization
SCS	South China Sea
TAN	transnational advocacy network
TRIPS	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of
	Intellectual Property Rights
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of
	the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNMIK	United Nations Mission in Kosovo
UNMOVIC	United Nations Monitoring, Verification and
	Inspection Commission
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCOM	United Nations Special Commission
WMD	weapons of mass destruction
WTO	World Trade Organization