

Modality in Mind

Modality – the ways in which language can express grades of reality or truth – is the subject of a vast and long-established body of research. In this book, field-leader Jan Nuyts brings together twenty years of his research to offer a comprehensive, fully integrated view on areas of contentious debate within modality, from a functional and cognitive perspective. The book provides an empirically grounded, conceptual reanalysis of modality and related categories including evidentiality, volition, intention, directivity, subjectivity and mirativity. It argues for the dissolution of the category of modality and for an alternative division of the wider field of semantic notions at stake. The analysis also reflects on how to model the language faculty, and on the issue of language and thought. It is essential reading for researchers interested in the semantics of modality and in the implications of this domain for understanding the cognitive infrastructure for language and thought.

JAN NUYTS is Professor of Linguistics at the University of Antwerp. His notable publications include *Aspects of a Cognitive-Pragmatic Theory of Language* (1992), *Epistemic Modality, Language and Conceptualization* (2001) and *The Oxford Handbook of Modality and Mood* (with van der Auwera, 2016).

Modality in Mind

Jan Nuyts

University of Antwerp



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009447225

DOI: 10.1017/9781009447201

© Jan Nuyts 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009447201

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Nuyts, Jan, author.

Title: Modality in mind / Jan Nuyts, University of Antwerp.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. |
Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024006534 | ISBN 9781009447225 (hardback) | ISBN
9781009447171 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009447201 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Modality (Linguistics) | Semantics. | Cognitive grammar.

Classification: LCC P299.M6 N896 2024 | DDC 415/.6–dc23/eng/20240414

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024006534>

ISBN 978-1-009-44722-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
0 Introduction	1
1 The Cognitive-Functional Approach	7
Overview	7
1.1 Basic Principles	7
1.1.1 Language as a Cognitive System for Communication	7
1.1.2 The Principles of Depth and Dynamism	9
1.2 Functional Linguistics, Cognitive Linguistics, and the Cognitive-Functional Approach	11
1.3 The Concept of a Functional Procedural Grammar	20
1.3.1 What Is a (Grammar) Model?	20
1.3.2 An Outline of Functional Procedural Grammar	23
1.4 Conclusion	35
2 Qualifying States of Affairs	36
Overview	36
2.1 Qualificational Categories and Their Hierarchical Organization	36
2.2 Semantic Paradigms: From Function to Form	47
2.3 Qualificational Categories as Conceptual Dimensions	58
2.4 Conclusion	65
3 Modality Revisited	67
Overview	67
3.1 Why Is It So Hard to Define the Category of Modality?	68
3.2 The Traditional Modal Core Categories	71
3.2.1 Defining Dynamic, Deontic, and Epistemic Modality	71
3.2.2 Alternative Divisions of the Field of Modality	85
3.3 Arguments for a ‘Supercategory’ of Modality Disassembled	92
3.4 Conclusion	100
4 Attitudes	101
Overview	101
4.1 From Modality to Attitudes	102
	v

vi	Contents	
4.2	Performativity versus Descriptivity	116
4.3	The Combinability of Attitudinal Categories	125
4.3.1	The Issue	125
4.3.2	Towards an Explanation	136
4.4	Conclusion	151
5	Beyond the Qualificational Hierarchy	152
	Overview	152
5.1	Planning Action: Directivity, Volition, and Intention	153
5.1.1	Directivity	153
5.1.2	Volition and Intention	159
5.1.3	Conceptualization and Action	165
5.2	Interlocutor Sensitivity and Interaction Management	171
5.3	Evidentiality	178
5.4	Conclusion	194
6	(Inter)subjectivity, and More	195
	Overview	195
6.1	Subjectivity in the Attitudinal Categories	196
6.1.1	The Traditional Notion of Subjective versus Objective Modality	196
6.1.2	An Alternative Analysis: Subjectivity versus Intersubjectivity	201
6.2	Other Notions of Subjectivity	211
6.3	The Conceptual Status of (Inter)subjectivity and Related Dimensions	219
6.4	Conclusion	231
7	Back to the Cognitive-Functional Approach	233
	Overview	233
7.1	Language and Conceptualization, Again	234
7.1.1	Why Functional Linguistics Needs Conceptualization	234
7.1.2	What Language Can Reveal about Conceptualization	238
7.1.3	Linguistic versus Conceptual Semantics	246
7.2	The Qualificational Hierarchy and Linguistic Processing	250
7.3	How to Model the Dynamics of Language Processing	256
7.4	Conclusion	270
8	Conclusion	271
	<i>Appendix</i>	273
	<i>References</i>	278
	<i>Person Index</i>	292
	<i>Subject Index</i>	295

Figures

1.1	Functional Procedural Grammar	<i>page 25</i>
6.1	(Inter)subjectivity, mirativity, experienced, hearsay, and memory in relation to the qualificational hierarchy	230

Tables

4.1	Semantic properties of meaning categories relevant for the modality debate	<i>page</i> 104
5.1	Semantic properties of directive versus qualificational categories	154
5.2	Semantic properties of action-related versus qualificational meanings	160
5.3	Semantic properties of evidential versus other meanings	186
6.1	Semantic properties of mirativity and (inter)subjectivity versus evidential and attitudinal categories	224
A.1	Frequency of combinations of deontic and epistemic lemmas	275
A.2	Frequency of combinations of epistemic and evidential lemmas	276
A.3	Frequency of combinations of deontic and evidential lemmas	277

Preface

The research reported in this book has been made possible by a number of research grants: by VNC project G.0470.03 on “Modal auxiliaries and other expressions of modality in Dutch” (2003–2006), project G.0443.07 on “The diachrony of Dutch modal expressions, especially the auxiliaries” (2007–2010) and FWO/NWO lead agency project G.0A18.15 N on “De-auxiliarization in the Dutch and English modals: A comparative diachronic corpus investigation” (2015–2018), all funded by the Research Fund Flanders (FWO-Vlaanderen); by Interuniversity Attraction Poles (IAP) project P6/44 on “Grammaticalization and (inter)subjectification” (2007–2011), funded by the Science Policy Department of the Belgian Federal Government; by a Concerted Research Actions (GOA) project on “Mood and modality” (2003–2006) and a New Research Initiatives (LP) project on “A diachronic investigation of the Dutch mental state predicates” (2012–2016), both funded by the Research Council of the University of Antwerp; and by a sabbatical leave for the academic year 2015/2016, funded by the Research Fund Flanders and the Research Council of the University of Antwerp.

Earlier versions of the research reported in parts of this book were published before. Chapter 3 draws on Nuyts (2005a), and to a lesser extent on Nuyts (2006) and (2016b). Section 4.3 is a substantially modified version of parts of Nuyts (2009b). Section 5.1 is based on Nuyts (2008), parts of Section 5.2 on Nuyts, Diepeveen and Byloo (2007). Parts of Section 5.3 are modified versions of parts of Nuyts (2017). Chapter 6 integrates revised parts of Nuyts (2012a), (2014) and (2015). Parts of Section 7.1 draw on parts of Nuyts (2002) and (2009b), and Section 7.3 is based on sections from Nuyts (2009b) and (2011). In all these cases the presentation is adapted to the present context, and there is often substantial elaboration and/or modification of the analyses and views, as compared to the predecessors, in view of new insights.