

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

Volume 203



Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

	1 (1919-22) 2 (1923-24)	}	Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, KC, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
	3 (1925-26) 4 (1927-28)	}	Edited by Arnold D. McNair, CBE, LLD, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
Vol. Vol. Vol. Vol. Vol. Vol. Vol. Vol.	5 (1929-30) 6 (1931-32) 7 (1933-34) 8 (1935-37) 9 (1938-40) 10 (1941-42) 11 (1919-42) 12 (1943-45) 13 (1946) 14 (1947) 15 (1948) 16 (1949)		Edited by H. Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
                       Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA
Vol. 20 (1953)
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
Vol. 24 (1957)
                       Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD,
                        FBA, and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                       Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27-68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 and 36-45
                       Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vols. 69-123 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
                          Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100 and Vols. 1-125
                       Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC,
                         and Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC
Vols. 124-68 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Table of Treaties to
                         Vols. 1-160
                       Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, LLD,
                         Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC, and K. L. Lee
Vols. 169-203
                       Edited by Sir Christopher Greenwood, GBE, CMG, KC,
                         and K. L. Lee
```



> Lauterpacht Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 203

Edited by

SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD, GBE, CMG, KC

Master of Magdalene College, Cambridge Member of the Iran-United States Claims Tribunal Bencher of Middle Temple Formerly Judge of the International Court of Justice

and

KAREN LEE

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Fellow and former Vice-Mistress of Girton College, Cambridge







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009437653

DOI: 10.1017/9781009213509

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

Printed in United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-43765-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	XV
Digest (main headings)	xvii
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 203	xix
Table of Treaties	xxix
Reports of Cases	1
Index	723



PREFACE

The present volume contains the 2018 and 2019 orders on provisional measures, and the 2021 judgment on preliminary objections of the International Court of Justice in Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates). International jurisprudence is further reflected in decisions from the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda), the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights (Mango v. Tanzania) (Merits and Reparations), the European Court of Human Rights (Georgia v. Russia (No 1)) (Just Satisfaction), the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean) and the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates). National jurisprudence is reflected in decisions from England (Maduro Board and UK Pérl Club).

The Editors wish to thank the many people whose work has made this volume possible. Dr Massimo Lando summarized the cases from the International Court of Justice and the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea. Ms Caroline Kimeu prepared the summaries of the case from the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights and *Maduro Board*. Ms Nnenna Mazi wrote the summary of the case from the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights and Mr Darren Peterson prepared the summary of *UK Pér Club*. Ms Karen Lee summarized the decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination and saw the volume through the press. Ms Nahide Basri, the ILR Editorial Assistant, prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest. Mrs Rowena Gavars compiled the Table of Treaties and Index. Mr Jeremy Langworthy checked the copy and Mr Jack Webb read the proofs.

The Editors are very grateful to the International Court of Justice, the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights, the European Court of Human Rights and the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination for kindly permitting these Reports to use the electronic files of the relevant decisions posted on their official websites.



viii PREFACE

Thanks are also due to the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea and to Brill publishers for their kind permission to publish the text of the judgments from the *ITLOS Reports* posted on the ITLOS website. The decisions from England published in this volume carry Crown copyright and contain public sector information licensed under the Open Government Licence v.3.0; the electronic files were sourced from the UK Supreme Court and British and Irish Legal Information Institute Websites.

Finally, our thanks go to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, Straive, and their staff.

C. J. GREENWOOD

Magdalene College Cambridge

K. L. LEE

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE
FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

February 2023



EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Union). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Human Rights Committee. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public



x

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-43765-3 — International Law Reports Edited by Christopher Greenwood, Karen Lee Frontmatter More Information

EDITORIAL NOTE

international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these Reports are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Stephan W. Schill, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

Editorial Treatment of Materials

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.



EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

Presentation of Materials

For reproduction of material in this volume, electronic files have been used wherever possible and their source acknowledged in the Preface. Citations of the reports in which the case may be found are listed in the "Report" section in square brackets at the end of the case; the language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report where included.

Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-160 were published in 2017. Volume 200 contains Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-200.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Application of the International
Convention on the Elimination of All
Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar
v. United Arab Emirates) (First Request
for Provisional Measures) (Second
Request for Provisional Measures)
(Preliminary Objections) 1

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire) (Order on Provisional Measures) (Judgment) 376

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction) 349

Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela 612 Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania (Application No 8/2015) 318

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates (Jurisdiction) (Admissibility) 562

UK P&I Club N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela 685

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda (Communication No 426/12) 254



More Information

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda (Communication No 426/12) 254

> African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania (Application No 8/2015) 318

European Court of Human Rights

2019

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction) 349

International Court of Justice

2018

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (First Request for Provisional Measures) 1, 18

2019

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Second Request for Provisional Measures) 1, 102

2021

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Preliminary Objections) 1, 145

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

2015

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire) (Order on Provisional Measures) 376, 389

2017

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire) (Judgment) 376, 408

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

2019

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates (Jurisdiction) (Admissibility) 562, 568, 585



Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-43765-3 $\stackrel{\circ}{-}$ International Law Reports Edited by Christopher Greenwood, Karen Lee Frontmatter

More Information

xvi

TABLE OF CASES

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

United Kingdom, England

2021 Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela 612

2022 UK P&I Club N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela 685



DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air International Organizations

Aliens International Tribunals

Arbitration Jurisdiction

Canals Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Claims Nationality
Comity Recognition

Conciliation Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

Damages Reprisals and Countermeasures

Rivers

Diplomatic Relations
Sea

Consular Relations

Economics, Trade and Finance

Sources of International Law

Evidence before International Courts

and Tribunals State Immunity

Expropriation State Responsibility

Extradition State Succession

General Principles of International Law | States

Governments Territory

Human Rights Terrorism

International Court of Justice Treaties

International Criminal Law War and Armed Conflict

xvii



DIGEST OF CASES **REPORTED IN VOLUME 203**

Page Contract of insurance — Arbitration clause — Whether arbitration

clause in contract of insurance binds third party State seeking compensation for loss and damage — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela 685

Claims

Arbitration

Inter-State cases — Claims for just satisfaction — Whether Article 41 of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 applicable to inter-State cases — Judgment in *Cyprus* v. *Turkey* — Whether Article 41 of Convention applicable to present case — Whether present case fulfilling three criteria set out in Cyprus v. Turkey -Whether award of just satisfaction justified — Determination of sufficiently precise and objectively identifiable group of people — Criteria for award of just satisfaction for non-pecuniary damage Requirement for distribution of damages to members of group

— European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

Comity

Respect for courts and tribunals of other jurisdictions — Contract of insurance — Exclusive jurisdiction clause — Arbitration clause — Third party State seeking to enforce contract of insurance — Requirement of comity — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela 685

Diplomatic Relations

Whether United Kingdom Government's continued diplomatic relations with Mr Maduro's representatives in England constituting implied recognition of Mr Maduro as *de facto* President — Whether Court of Appeal erred in introducing concept of implied de facto recognition — Whether scope for

xix

349



xx

DIGEST OF CASES

Diplomatic Relations (cont.)

application of any notion of implied recognition by English courts
— United Kingdom, Supreme Court

Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela

612

General Principles of International Law

Estoppel — Whether part of international law — Conditions — Clear and unequivocal statement — Reliance to detriment — Maritime boundaries — Whether capable of being established by estoppel — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Governments

Recognition — Rival governments — Venezuela — Disputed 2018 Venezuelan presidential election — Whether Mr Maduro or Mr Guaidó President of Venezuela — Whether Maduro Board or Guaidó Board entitled to give instructions on behalf of Central Bank of Venezuela concerning its assets in England — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela

612

Human Rights

European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Article 41 — Inter-State case — Claims for just satisfaction for breach of human rights — Non-pecuniary damage — Whether victims identifiable — Determination of sufficiently precise and objectively identifiable group of people — Whether claim could be submitted under Article 41 of Convention — Whether award of just satisfaction justified — Criteria to be applied — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Freedom of expression — Right of access to information — Freedom of opinion — Legitimate limitations — Proportionality — Requirement of precise definition — Criminal defamation —



DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights' Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019 — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda

254

International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1(1) — Meaning of "national origin" — Whether including current nationality — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Right to equality and non-discrimination — African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981, Articles 2 and 3 — Whether Tanzania's exercise of presidential pardons arbitrary and discriminatory — Right to a fair trial — Article 7 — Whether Tanzania's sentencing of first and seventh applicants exceeding prescribed legal limits — African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania

318

Right to fair trial — Right of access to court — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6 — State immunity — State Immunity Act 1978 — Section 13 — Immunity from injunction — Whether State immunity from injunction engages Article 6 rights — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief pursues legitimate objective — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief provided for in customary international law — Whether proportionate — Human Rights Act 1998, Section 3 — Whether Section 13 of the State Immunity Act 1978 capable of being read down — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

Rights to non-discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — International law — Whether fight against terrorism justifying discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic



xxii

DIGEST OF CASES

Human Rights (cont.)

origin — Applicant State enforcing coercive measures against Respondent State in 2017 — Whether respondent State failing to enact measures to prohibit racial discrimination — Whether respondent State promoting racial discrimination — Whether respondent State violating international law — Whether respondent State violating Articles 2, 4, 5 and 6 of International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether Committee having jurisdiction — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Oatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

International Court of Justice

Preliminary objections — Whether Court having jurisdiction under Article 22 of International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD Treaties — Interpretation — Scope — International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1(1) — Meaning of "national origin" — Whether including current nationality — Object and purpose of treaty — *Travaux préparatoires* — Whether CERD intending to prohibit discrimination based on nationality — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Provisional measures — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 ("CERD") — Article 22 — Whether the Court having *prima facie* jurisdiction *ratione materiae* — Distinction between "national origin" and "nationality" under CERD — Whether procedural preconditions to the Court's jurisdiction met — Prior negotiation — Exhaustion of CERD-based procedures — Plausibility — Whether the acts of which Qatar complained were plausibly acts of racial discrimination — Irreparable prejudice — Urgency — Whether evidence submitted



DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

by Qatar proving that the rights claimed were under a real and imminent risk of irreparable prejudice — Reports of international organizations as evidence — Unilateral undertaking — Statement of 5 July 2018 by UAE — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Provisional measures requested by respondent State — Whether extending to protection of procedural rights — Procedural rights arising under Article 22 of CERD — Right to obtain compliance with provisional measures indicated earlier — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — Provisional measures for non-aggravation and non-extension of the dispute — Whether capable of being indicated only if provisional measures for protection of rights also indicated — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

International Tribunals

African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights — Jurisdiction — Material jurisdiction — Whether Court having jurisdiction to hear application — Admissibility — Whether application admissible — Exhaustion of local remedies — Whether applicants obliged to exhaust remedies despite claims of judicial bias — African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania

318

European Court of Human Rights — Damages — Nonpecuniary damages — Inter-State case — Damages awarded for distribution to group of nationals — Supervision of distribution — Role of Council of Ministers — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Jurisdiction — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights — Admissibility decisions — Contesting admissibility of Communication based on Article 56(7) of African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — *Res judicata* — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda

254



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

International Tribunals (cont.)

Jurisdiction — Special agreement — Admissibility of request for delimitation of continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf — Forum prorogatum — International responsibility — Whether ITLOS having jurisdiction to decide on international responsibility of a State in accordance with UNCLOS — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Jurisdiction and admissibility — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — Inter-State communication — Whether Committee lacking jurisdiction — Scope of Article 11 of Convention — Nationality issue — Whether exception to jurisdiction — Interpretation of concept of racial discrimination prohibited by Convention — Whether raising preliminary issue of competence ratione materiae — Issue to be examined at same time as admissibility — Whether jurisdiction extending only to current ongoing violations of Convention communication admissible — Non-exhaustion of domestic remedies — Issue to be examined jointly with merits -Concurrent proceedings — Nationality — Appointment of ad hoc Conciliation Commission — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965, Articles 11(2) and 12(1) — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Provisional measures — Preservation of rights of Parties — Protection of marine environment — Protection of confidentiality of information relating to exploration and exploitation of natural resources of continental shelf — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — Agreement that Special Chamber having *prima facie* jurisdiction — Plausibility of rights — Côte d'Ivoire's claimed rights being plausibly based on United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Whether Ghana's activities in disputed area could cause irreparable prejudice to rights of Côte d'Ivoire — Problems of prescribing suspension of all oil exploration and exploitation —



DIGEST OF CASES

XXV

Possibility for compensation of financially assessable damage — Report on compliance with provisional measures — Power of President of Special Chamber to request further information concerning compliance — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Special Chamber of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Constitution of the Special Chamber — Transfer of proceedings from an Annex VII arbitral tribunal to the Special Chamber — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Court of Justice — Concurrent proceedings — Article 22 of International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether principle of *lis pendens* or *electa via* applicable — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Oatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — Weight to be given to practice of Committee — Jurisprudence of regional human rights courts — Relevance — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Nationality

Distinction between citizens and non-citizens — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1 — Prohibition of racial discrimination — Interpretation of concept of racial



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

Nationality (cont.)

discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — General Recommendation No 30 (2004) on discrimination against non-citizens — Differences of treatment based on nationality — Whether constituting discrimination as prohibited by Convention — Allegations in communication concerning racial discrimination — Whether Committee having competence *ratione materiae* — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Nature of citizenship — Bond between State and citizen — Whether distinct from "national origin" — International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965, Article 1 — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Recognition

Whom United Kingdom Government recognizing as Head of State and Head of Government of Venezuela — Whether United Kingdom Foreign Secretary's statement constituting unequivocal recognition of Mr Guaidó as Interim President — Whether United Kingdom Government's recognition of Mr Guaidó de facto or de jure — "One voice" doctrine — Whether English courts obliged to accept United Kingdom Government's recognition of Mr Guaidó as conclusive — Foreign act of State doctrine — Whether challenges to validity, under Venezuelan law, of the Transition Statute 2019 and Mr Guaidó's appointments justiciable in English courts — Whether English courts should recognize judgments of the Supreme Tribunal of Justice of Venezuela nullifying the Transition Statute 2019 — Whether such recognition contravening UK public policy — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela

612

Sea

Maritime boundary delimitation — Single maritime boundary — Territorial sea — Exclusive Economic Zone — Continental shelf — Continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Article 15 — Articles



DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

74 and 83 — Equidistance/relevant circumstances — Angle bisector — Whether location of base points justified using a methodology other than equidistance/relevant circumstances — Whether coastal instability justified using a methodology other than equidistance/relevant circumstances — Whether same methodology applied to delimitation of all maritime zones — Relevant coast — Relevant area — Provisional equidistance line — Appropriate base points — Relevant circumstances — Concavity of coast — Cut-off effect — Location of natural resources — Conduct — Methodology for delimiting the continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Entitlement to a continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Disproportionality test — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

State Immunity

State Immunity Act 1978 — Section 1 — Section 3 — Section 9 — Section 13 — Adjudicative immunity — Jure imperii — Jure gestionis — Whether initiating proceedings against insurers regarding sunken naval vessel a sovereign or commercial act — Enforcement immunity — State immunity from injunctive relief — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief engages human rights — England, High Court of Justice

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

State Responsibility

Alleged responsibility for violation of sovereign rights — Alleged responsibility for violation of Article 83(1) of United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Whether Ghana's oil activities violating its obligations under Article 83(3) — Alleged responsibility for violating order on provisional measures of 25 April 2015 — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Obligation on State responsible for internationally wrongful act to make reparations — Just-satisfaction rule deriving from public international law principles relating to State liability — Duty of States to co-operate under European Convention on Human



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

State Responsibility (cont.)

Rights, 1950 — Obligation on State to abide by final judgment of European Court of Human Rights — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Treaties

Human rights treaties — African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — Compliance of Rwanda's Penal Code 1977 with African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — Human rights obligations under regional and international human rights treaties — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda

254

Interpretation — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1 — Prohibition of racial discrimination — Interpretation of concept of racial discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — Meaning of national origin — "Nationality" excluded from definition — Distinction between citizens and noncitizens — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — General Recommendation No 30 (2004) on discrimination against non-citizens — Differences of treatment based on nationality — Whether constituting discrimination as prohibited by Convention — Applicant State's allegations against respondent State in communication concerning violations of Convention — Whether allegations concerning ongoing and current violations of Convention — Issue relating to essential facts and to be examined at merits stage — Whether Committee having competence ratione materiae — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Tacit agreement — Oil practice — Maps — Seismic surveys — Drilling activities — National legislation — Representations to international organizations — Bilateral exchanges and negotiations — Standard of proof — Whether Côte d'Ivoire estopped from objecting to customary equidistance boundary claimed by Ghana — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376



TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Names of countries follow contemporaneous usage except in the case of small spelling changes (e.g. Roumania/Romania) where modern usage is adopted throughout. Where this seems helpful, the name of a treaty as it is commonly known is included.

Wherever possible, each treaty includes a reference to where an online English-language version of the treaty can be found. For treaties between 1648 and 1919, this is almost always the Consolidated Treaty Series (CTS), under Oxford Historical Treaties on the Oxford Public International Law website. Post-1919, references are most frequently to the League of Nations Treaty Series/United Nations Treaty Series (LNTS/UNTS). Here it should be noted that historically LNTS/UNTS references have taken the form "39 UNTS 55", 39 being the volume number, 55 the page number. With effect from UNTS volume 2301, UNTS no longer includes the volume and page number as part of the reference, using simply the registration number. UNTS references are now in the form UNTS 42146. For ILR purposes, because of its value as an identifier, the registration number is now being added parenthetically to prevolume 2301 treaties in the form 213 UNTS 221 [UNTS 2889].

Reference is also made to other treaty databases such as the European Treaty Series (ETS), Organization of American States Treaty Series (OASTS) or to Official Journals, particularly where these are the only databases currently hosting a treaty. Where a treaty appears to be available only on the website of the parent international organization, usually without any citation identifier, users are referred to the relevant website. For bilateral treaties, often the only source it has been possible to find is a non-English-language version on one of the parties' official websites, such as the parliamentary proceedings approving the treaty. Users requiring a comprehensive list of written sources should refer to the CTS, or to the Flare Index to Treaties, available at IALS Digital.

For abbreviations used in the Table of Treaties reference should be made to the list of abbreviations attached to the index in this volume.

1904

xxix