The House that Fox News Built?

The influence of partisan news is presumed to be powerful, but evidence for its effects on political elites is limited, often based more on anecdotes than science. Using a rigorous quasi-experimental research design, observational data, and open science practices, this book carefully demonstrates how the reemergence and rise of partisan cable news in the United States affected the behavior of political elites during the rise and proliferation of Fox News across media markets between 1996 and 2010. Despite widespread concerns over the ills of partisan news, evidence provides a nuanced, albeit cautionary, tale. On one hand, findings suggest that the rise of Fox indeed changed elite political behavior in recent decades. On the other hand, the limited conditions under which Fox News' influence occurred suggests that concerns about the network's power may be overstated.

Kevin Arceneaux is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Center for Political Research at Sciences Po in Paris, France. He studies how people make political decisions and how those decisions are shaped by social group identities and exposure to the news media.

Johanna Dunaway is Professor of Political Science in the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs at Syracuse University and Research Director of the Syracuse University Institute for Democracy, Citizenship, and Journalism in Washington, DC. Her areas of research include news media, democracy, political attitudes, and behavior.

Martin Johnson was Professor of Mass Communication and Political Science and Kevin P. Reilly Sr. Chair in Political Communication in the Manship School of Mass Communication at Louisiana State University in Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

Ryan J. Vander Wielen is Professor of Political Science and Economics (by affiliation) and Director of the MA in Public Policy at Stony Brook University in Stony Brook, New York. His research focuses on American political institutions, quantitative methodology, and formal modeling. It examines how legislators strategically navigate their electoral circumstances and whether voters hold them accountable.

Communication, Society and Politics

Editor

W. Lance Bennett, University of Washington

Founding Co-Editor, Emeritus Robert M. Entman, The George Washington University

Politics and relations among individuals in societies across the world are being transformed by new technologies for targeting individuals and sophisticated methods for shaping personalized messages. The new technologies challenge boundaries of many kinds – between news, information, entertainment, and advertising; between media, with the arrival of the World Wide Web; and even between nations. Communication, Society and Politics probes the political and social impacts of these new communication systems in national, comparative, and global perspective.

Other Books in the Series:

- Erik Albæk, Arjen van Dalen, Nael Jebril, and Claes de Vreese, *Political Journalism in Comparative Perspective*
- Eva Anduiza, Michael James Jensen, and Laia Jorba, eds., Digital Media and Political Engagement Worldwide: A Comparative Study
- C. Edwin Baker, Media Concentration and Democracy: Why Ownership Matters
- C. Edwin Baker, Media, Markets, and Democracy
- W. Lance Bennett and Robert M. Entman, eds., *Mediated Politics:* Communication in the Future of Democracy
- Rodney Benson, *Shaping Immigration News: A French-American* Comparison
- Bruce Bimber, Information and American Democracy: Technology in the Evolution of Political Power
- Bruce Bimber, Andrew Flanagin, and Cynthia Stohl, Collective Action in Organizations: Interaction and Engagement in an Era of Technological Change
- Clifford G. Christians, Media Ethics and Global Justice in the Digital Age
- Lynn S. Clark and Regina Marchi, Young People and the Future of News
- Peter Dahlgren, Media and Political Engagement, Citizens, Communication and Democracy
- Murray Edelman, The Politics of Misinformation
- Frank Esser and Barbara Pfetsch, eds., Comparing Political Communication: Theories, Cases, and Challenges
- Myra Marx Ferree, William Anthony Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht, *Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States*

(continued after the Index)

The House that Fox News Built?

Representation, Political Accountability, and the Rise of Partisan News

KEVIN ARCENEAUX Sciences Po

JOHANNA DUNAWAY Syracuse University

MARTIN JOHNSON

Louisiana State University

RYAN J. VANDER WIELEN Stony Brook University





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009432085

DOI: 10.1017/9781009432092

© Kevin Arceneaux, Johanna Dunaway, Martin Johnson, and Ryan J. Vander Wielen 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009432092

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Arceneaux, Kevin, author. | Dunaway, Johanna, author. | Johnson, Martin, 1970–2020 author. | Vander Wielen, Ryan J., author. TITLE: The house that Fox news built? : representation, political accountability, and the rise of partisan news / Kevin Arceneaux, Sciences Po, Paris; Johanna Dunaway, Syracuse University; Martin Johnson, Louisiana State University; Ryan J. Vander Wielen, State University of New York, Stony Brook. DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Series: Communication, society and politics | Includes bibliographical references and index. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023054391 (print) | LCCN 2023054392 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009432085 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009432092 (ebook) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Fox News. | Television broadcasting of news - United States. | Television and politics - United States. CLASSIFICATION: LCC PN4888.T4 A73 2025 (print) | LCCPN4888.T4 (ebook) | DDC 070.4/30973-dc23/eng/20240119 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023054391 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023054392 ISBN 978-1-009-43208-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-43207-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Dedicated to the memory of our friend Martin Johnson.

Contents

List	t of Figures	page ix
List	t of Tables	xi
Pre	face	xiii
I	A New Sheriff in Town?	I
2	The Roll Out of Fox News and Its Content	21
3	Did Fox News Influence Decisions to Run for Congress?	42
4	Did Fox News Influence How Members of Congress Voted of	n
	Legislation?	67
5	Did Fox News Affect Dyadic Representation?	84
6	Did Fox News Affect Collective Representation?	102
7	Politicians Are People, Too	118
App	pendix:Details of Empirical Studies and Statistical Analyses	133
Ref	References	
Ind	ex	225

Figures

 2.2 Balance test 2.3 Proportion of member network appearances made by Republicans, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 2.4 Predicted count of Fox News appearances by ideology and party, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 2.2 Balance test 2.3 Proportion of member network appearances made by Republicans, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 2.4 Predicted count of Fox News appearances by ideology and party, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005-2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 2.3 Proportion of member network appearances made by Republicans, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.4 Predicted count of Fox News appearances by ideology and party, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	<i>ige</i> 25
 Republicans, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.4 Predicted count of Fox News appearances by ideology and party, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	28
 2.4 Predicted count of Fox News appearances by ideology and party, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 and party, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 2.5 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005–2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	31
 Ideological content of house member network statements, 109th Congress (2005–2007) States from which PCs were drawn Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 109th Congress (2005–2007) 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	34
 3.1 States from which PCs were drawn 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 3.2 Predicted probability of PC overestimating Republican support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	38
 support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	52
 3.3 Predicted probability that PC perceives out-party incumbent as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 as likely to win reelection, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	55
 and district partisanship 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 3.4 Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 challenger, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	58
 3.5 Simulated effect of Fox News on Republican quality challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
 challenger emergence by election 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	60
 3.6 Simulated effect of Fox News on Democratic quality challenger emergence by election 4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship 	
challenger emergence by election4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship	62
4.1 Predicted probability of party support, by Fox News availability and district partisanship	
availability and district partisanship	63
	74
4.2 Predicted probability of Democratic member voting with	
Democrats on final passage party votes and all party votes,	
by Fox News availability and vote type	76

х

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-43208-5 — The House that Fox News Built? Kevin Arceneaux , Johanna Dunaway , Martin Johnson , Ryan J. Vander Wielen Frontmatter More Information

List of Figures

4.3	Predicted probability of party support by Fox News availability and district partisanship for members with significant change in Fox News availability	77
4.4	Predicted probability of Democratic member voting with	
	Democrats on final passage party votes and all party votes	
	for members with significant change in Fox News	
	availability, by Fox News availability and vote type	78
4.5	Predicted difference-in-differences estimator across parties	80
5.1	The spatial model of voting	86
5.2	The logic of candidate convergence	86
5.3	The polarization of preferences in the U.S. House across time	89
5.4	The centripetal force of Fox News in marginal districts	90
5.5	Correspondence between a district's median ideology and the	
	policy position of its House member	93
5.6	Predicted divergence between member and district ideal	
	points, by Fox News availability and district partisanship	95
5.7	Predicted Fox News effect on probability of contacting	
	member of Congress	99
6.1	Algorithm for collective representation simulation	106
6.2	Simulated effect of Fox News on support for Republican	
	policies	108
6.3	Predicted Fox News effect on Republican support among	
2	Democrats voting on H.R. 1 in the 108th Congress	
	(2003-2004)	115
A2.1	Effect of member ideology on standardized appearances, by	5
	member ideology and party	170
A3.1	Predicted probability of incumbent facing a quality challenger	/ -
-)	including time trend in model, by Fox News availability and	
	district partisanship	189
	and the particularity	109

Tables

3.1	Number of quality challenger entries against opposing	
	party incumbents, 1998–2010	page 61
6.1	Democratic electoral vulnerability, 1997–2010	110
6.2	Final passage votes that passed by 17 or fewer votes in the	
	108th Congress	112
6.3	Average vote difference on final passage votes, 1997-2010	116
A1.1	PAP summary for Chapter 2	151
A1.2	PAP summary for Chapter 3	153
A1.3	PAP summary for Chapter 4	157
A1.4	PAP summary for Chapter 5	158
A1.5	PAP summary for Chapter 6	162
A2.1	Balance test	165
A2.2	Effect of ideology on the number of Fox News appearances	S
	by house members, 109th Congress (2005–2007)	168
A2.3	Descriptive statistics of member appearances by network	169
A2.4	Ideology of members making network appearances, 109th	
	Congress (2005–2007)	172
A2.5	Ideological content of House member network statements,	
	109th Congress (2005–2007)	175
A3.1	Logit model of PCs' propensity to overestimate Republican	1
	support	178
A3.2	Ordered logit model of PCs' propensity to overestimate	
	Republican support, using trichotomous dependent variable	e 180
A3.3	Perceptions of the likelihood of incumbent reelection amon	ıg
	PCs in districts with out-party incumbents	183
A3.4	House incumbents facing a quality challenger, 1998–2010	186

List of Tables xii A3.5 House incumbents facing a quality challenger, 1998–2010 - matched data 187 A3.6 House incumbents facing a quality challenger with time trend, 1998–2010 188 A_{3.7} The effect of Fox News on quality challenger success rates 190 A4.1 Likelihood of casting a vote supporting party, 105th–111th Congresses (1997–2010) 193 A4.2 Likelihood of casting a vote supporting party for members with significant change in Fox availability, 105th–111th Congresses (1997–2010) 196 A4.3 Difference-in-differences estimation of Fox News effects on members voting on identical bills across successive Congresses 198 A5.1 Divergence of member ideology from district preferences, 105th–111th Congresses (1997–2010) 202 A5.2 Divergence of member ideology from district preferences, 105th–111th Congresses (1997–2010) – matched data 203 A5.3 Divergence of member ideology from district preferences, 106th Congress (1999–2000) 205 A5.4 Likelihood of respondent contacting her/his member of Congress 207 A5.5 Likelihood of respondent contacting her/his member of Congress - including only respondents 28 years of age or younger 209

Preface

We decided to write this book over dinner one evening at the 2019 Meeting of the American Political Science Association in Washington, DC. The four of us had just published an article that studied the effect of the emergence of Fox News in the late 1990s on politicians' decisions to run for Congress. This article itself was an extension of another article published by three of us a few years before, which studied the effects of Fox News on the voting behavior of members of Congress. While at the table, we sketched out how there was still more to know and how the natural experiment created by Fox News' slow and haphazard roll out beginning in 1996 was essentially the gift that kept giving. We wrote down many ideas, and we vowed to preregister our expectations. As recent converts to the open science movement, we thought it would be exciting to methodically map out our analyses and declare them to the world before running a single statistical model and writing a single word. Not all of our ideas that evening made it into our preanalysis plan, but we report all the ones that did in the pages that follow.

We had expected to start right away, but many things conspired to slow us down – the largest obstacle being the COVID-19 pandemic that disrupted our personal and professional lives from March 2020 onward. As each of us regained our footing in the summer of 2020, we finalized our preanalysis plan and preregistered it at the end of August. A few weeks after the 2020 Meeting of the American Political Science Association, we sat in front of our individual computer screens over Zoom, a tool few of us had used before it had become a daily feature of our lives. We were excited to begin the work. Our analyses were preregistered and we put

xiii

xiv

Preface

into place a strategy for moving forward: who would draft which chapters, who would collect which data, and who would run which analyses. We shared some laughs as we caught up on each other's personal lives. It was good to see each other, even if it was in this new virtual world.

Not even a week later, the unexpected happened. Martin Johnson – our dear friend and coauthor – died at the age of 50. Martin was more than just a coauthor. He was a friend and a mentor. As Dean of the Louisiana State University Manship School of Communication, Martin did not have as much time as he would like for research, but he carved out time for this project and he generously funded our data collection efforts. The project brought together two of his passions: the study of mass media and the study of institutions. Even in the earliest stages of his graduate studies, Martin expressed his consternation that research on "political behavior" seemed wholly uninterested in the behavior of political elites. Martin was often prescient, and scholars of political behavior did in fact begin to turn their attention to the behavior of political elites. Just to name a few: Dan Butler, Cherie Maestas, Stuart Soroka, and fittingly Martin Johnson.

In the months after Martin's passing, we pushed the project forward. While our project meetings lacked Martin's warmhearted laugh and his trenchant insights, we continued to work on our shared vision. This project could not have come to fruition without Martin, and so we think that it is fitting that his name remain as a coauthor. We also think it is fitting to dedicate this book to his memory. There is little doubt that if he were still alive this book would be better written and make deeper insights, but it is what we have to offer.

We were lucky to have had him in our lives.