

Unequal Democracies

While economic inequality has risen in every affluent democracy in North America and Western Europe, the last three decades have also been characterized by falling or stagnating levels of state-led economic redistribution. Why have democratically accountable governments not done more to distribute top-income shares to citizens with low and middle incomes? *Unequal Democracies* offers answers to this question, bringing together contributions that focus on voters and their demands for redistribution with contributions on elites and unequal representation that is biased against less-affluent citizens. While large and growing bodies of research have developed around each of these perspectives, this volume brings them into rare dialogue. The chapters also incorporate analyses that center exclusively on the United States and those that examine a broader set of advanced democracies to explore the uniqueness of the American case and its contribution to comparative perspectives. This book is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Noam Lupu is Associate Professor of Political Science at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of *Party Brands in Crisis* (2016) and the coeditor of *Campaigns and Voters in Developing Democracies* (2019). He has received numerous awards for his publications and three Emerging Scholar awards from the American Political Science Association.

Jonas Pontusson is a research-active Emeritus Professor at the University of Geneva. Before moving to Geneva in 2010, he taught at Cornell University and Princeton University. He has published extensively in the domains of comparative political economy and comparative welfare states, focusing on labor markets, trade unions, partisan politics, and income inequality and redistribution. From 2017 to 2023, he directed a research program funded by the European Research Council on political inequality and the politics of inequality in advanced industrial states.

SSRC Anxieties of Democracy

Editors

John A. Ferejohn, *New York University*
Ira Katznelson, *Columbia University*
Deborah J. Yashar, *Princeton University*

With liberal democracies afflicted by doubt and disquiet, this series probes sources of current apprehensions and explores how such regimes might thrive. What array of pressures most stresses democratic ideas and institutions? Which responses might strengthen these regimes and help them flourish?

Embedded in the Social Science Research Council's program on "Anxieties of Democracy program," the series focuses on how representative institutions – including elections, legislatures, political parties, the press and mass media, interest groups, social movements, and policy organizations – orient participation, learning, and accountability.

The volumes in the series further ask how particular policy challenges shape the character of democratic institutions and collective actors, and affect their capacity to address large problems in the public interest. These challenges include, but are not limited to: (1) designing democratic institutions to perform successfully under conditions of social and political polarization; (2) managing and orienting contemporary capitalism and alleviating hierarchies of inequality; (3) addressing questions of membership, including population movements and differentiated citizenship; (4) choosing policies to balance national security and civil liberty; (5) exploring the effects of global climate on citizens and the human impact on the environment; (6) managing the development of media and information technologies to ensure they enhance, rather than degrade, robust pluralism and civil political engagement.

Other Books in the Series

Can America Govern Itself? Frances E. Lee and Nolan McCarty

Social Media and Democracy: The State of the Field, Prospects for Reform Nathaniel Persily and Joshua A. Tucker

The Disinformation Age: Politics, Technology, and Disruptive Communication in the United States W. Lance Bennett and Steven Livingston

Who Gets What? The New Politics of Insecurity Frances Rosenbluth and Margaret Weir

Contested Representation: Challenges, Shortcomings and Reforms Edited by Claudia Landwehr, Thomas Saalfeld, and Armin Schäfer

When the People Rule: Popular Sovereignty in Theory and Practice Edited by Ewa Atanassow, Thomas Bartscherer and David A. Bateman

Sponsored by the Social Science Research Council



The Social Science Research Council (SSRC) is an independent, international, nonprofit organization driven by its mission to mobilize social science for the public good. Founded in 1923, the SSRC fosters innovative research, nurtures new generations of social scientists, deepens how inquiry is practiced within and across disciplines, and amplifies necessary knowledge on important public issues.

The SSRC is guided by the belief that justice, prosperity, and democracy all require better understanding of complex social, cultural, economic, and political processes. We work with practitioners, policymakers, and academic researchers in the social sciences, related professions, and the humanities and natural sciences. We build interdisciplinary and international networks, working with partners around the world to link research to practice and policy, strengthen individual and institutional capacities for learning, and enhance public access to information.

Unequal Democracies

*Public Policy, Responsiveness,
and Redistribution in an Era of
Rising Economic Inequality*

Edited by

NOAM LUPU

Vanderbilt University

JONAS PONTUSSON

University of Geneva



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-42864-4 – Unequal Democracies
 Noam Lupu, Jonas Pontusson
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009428644

DOI: 10.1017/9781009428682

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions
 of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version
 the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009428682 under
 a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and
 reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the
 original work is given and any changes made are indicated.

To view a copy of this license visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties.

Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these
 third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009428682

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Lupu, Noam, editor. | Pontusson, Jonas, editor.

Title: Unequal democracies : public policy, responsiveness, and redistribution in an era of
 rising economic inequality / edited by Noam Lupu, Jonas Pontusson.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. |

Series: SSRC anxieties of democracy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023029220 (print) | LCCN 2023029221 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009428644 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009428682 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Democracy – Economic aspects – United States. | Democracy – Economic aspects – Europe. |

Income distribution – Political aspects – United States. | Income distribution – Political aspects – Europe. |

Representative government and representation – United States. | Representative government and
 representation – Europe.

Classification: LCC JK271 .U5325 2024 (print) | LCC JK271 (ebook) | DDC 320.473–dc23/eng/20230907

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023029220>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023029221>

ISBN 978-1-009-42864-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-42863-7 Paperback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/9781009428644

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xix
1 The Political Puzzle of Rising Inequality <i>Noam Lupu and Jonas Pontusson</i>	1
PART I GOVERNMENT RESPONSIVENESS	
2 Unequal Responsiveness and Government Partisanship in Northwest Europe <i>Ruben Mathisen, Wouter Schakel, Svenja Hense, Lea Elsässer, Mikael Persson, and Jonas Pontusson</i>	29
3 Democracy, Class Interests, and Redistribution: What Do the Data Say? <i>Mads Andreas Elkjær and Torben Iversen</i>	54
4 Measuring Political Inequality <i>Larry M. Bartels</i>	77
5 Why So Little Sectionalism in the Contemporary United States? The Underrepresentation of Place-Based Economic Interests <i>Jacob S. Hacker, Paul Pierson, and Sam Zacher</i>	98
PART II POLITICAL INEQUALITY AND REPRESENTATION	
6 Organized Interests and the Mechanisms behind Unequal Representation in Legislatures <i>Michael Becher and Daniel Stegmueller</i>	133
	vii

viii		<i>Contents</i>
7	How Do the Educated Govern? Evidence from Spanish Mayors <i>Marta Curto-Grau and Aina Gallego</i>	156
8	Working-Class Officeholding in the OECD <i>Nicholas Carnes and Noam Lupu</i>	177
9	Political Participation and Unequal Representation: Addressing the Endogeneity Problem <i>Ruben Mathisen and Yvette Peters</i>	196
PART III VOTERS AND DEMAND FOR REDISTRIBUTION		
10	Fairness Reasoning and Demand for Redistribution <i>Charlotte Cavaillé</i>	219
11	The News Media and the Politics of Inequality in Advanced Democracies <i>J. Scott Matthews, Timothy Hicks, and Alan M. Jacobs</i>	245
12	Deflecting from Racism: Local Talk Radio Conversations about the Murder of George Floyd <i>Katherine J. Cramer</i>	276
13	Class and Social Policy Representation <i>Macarena Ares and Silja Häusermann</i>	300
	<i>Bibliography</i>	325
	<i>Index</i>	359

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/9781009428644

Figures

1.1	Income inequality growth, 1995–2018/2019	<i>page 6</i>
1.2	Support for redistribution, by country	18
2.1	Coefficients for support by income on the probability of policy change (bivariate linear probability models with two-year windows)	36
2.2	Predicted probabilities of policy change at different preference gaps between P90 and P10 or P50 (two-year windows)	38
2.3	Policy responsiveness when the preferences of two groups align and the third group diverges (two-year windows)	40
2.4	Predicted probabilities of policy change conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)	43
2.5	Predicted probabilities of policy change, economic/welfare issues only, conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)	45
2.6	Predicted probabilities of policy change by time period, conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)	47
3.1	Net transfers to M as a share of the net extended income of H and M	65
3.2	Net transfers by income decile	66
3.3	The median net income relative to mean net income, 1985–2010	71
3.4	Real extended income growth in 17 Europe and the United States, 1980–2019	74
5.1	The end of state economic convergence in the United States	103
5.2	Gross public investment in the United States	106
5.3	Federal aid to the thirty-four biggest US cities	107
5.4	Federal grants for states and localities, 1980–2020	109
5.5	Federal housing and urban development spending	111
5.6	Republican overrepresentation in the US Senate	113

5.7	Partisan skew in statehouse district maps, 1972 vs. 2020	114
7.1	Continuity of the forcing variable	167
7.2	Distribution of difference in average years of education of government and opposition members	168
8.1	Working-class representation in the OECD	185
8.2	Left-party representation and worker representation	187
8.3	Worker representation, by electoral system	189
8.4	Public financing predicts modest differences in worker representation	190
8.5	Economic characteristics of society matter on the margin	192
8.6	Worker representation varies more in parties than countries	194
9.1	Voting, by education and income	202
9.2	Alternative forms of political participation, by education and income	202
9.3	Possible mechanisms explaining the association between unequal participation and unequal representation	206
9.4	Participation by satisfaction with the system	209
9.5	The power of differential satisfaction with the system in explaining differences in participation across income and education	212
9.6	Country variation in the voting gap by income and education	213
10.1	What is fair? Who is deserving?	225
10.2	Fairness reasoning and demand for redistribution: unidimensional approach	228
10.3	Fairness reasoning and demand for redistribution: two-dimensional approach	231
10.4	Changes in fairness beliefs	240
10.5	Correlation between proportionality and reciprocity beliefs	241
11.1	Posttax-and-transfer income share of the top 1 percent of individuals for nineteen advanced democracies	248
11.2	Correlation between the annual rate of GDP growth and annual change in top-1-percent pretax income shares for a broad set of countries, before and after 1980	253
11.3	Correlation between the annual change in the unemployment rate and annual change in top-1-percent pretax income shares for a broad set of countries, before and after 1980	254
11.4	Association between economic news tone and pretax income growth for each income quintile, conditional on income growth for all other quintiles	262
11.5	Association between economic news tone and pretax income growth for top-income groups, controlling for bottom- and middle-income growth	263
11.6	Estimated coefficient ratios from models predicting economic news tone with pretax income growth for different parts of the income distribution	266

<i>List of Figures</i>	xi
11.7 Association between economic news tone and disposable income growth for each income quintile, conditional on income growth for all other quintiles	267
11.8 Association between economic news tone and disposable income growth for top-income groups, controlling for bottom- and middle-income growth	268
11.9 Estimated coefficient ratios from models predicting economic news tone with disposable income growth for different parts of the income distribution	269
13.1 Social classes' average predicted perceptions of systemic congruence on social policy	304
13.2 Social class differences in proximity to preferred party and party system	314
13.3 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and party system, by social policy area	316
13.4 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on social consumption across different party system configurations	317
13.5 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on social investment across different party system configurations	318
13.6 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on benefits for migrants across different party system configurations	319

Tables

1.1 Inequality and redistribution among working-age households, 1995–2007	<i>page</i> 7
1.2 Top-10-percent income shares and redistribution, 1995–2007	8
1.3 Inequality and redistribution among working-age households, 2007–2018	9
1.4 Top-10-percent income shares and redistribution, 2007–2019	10
2.1 Survey items by country	33
2.2 Average values of independent and dependent variables by country	34
2.3 Average marginal effects of support for policy change when preferences diverge by at least 10 percentage points (two-year windows)	37
2.4 Average marginal effects of preference gaps on policy adoption, controlling for P50 support (two-year windows)	38
2.5 Linear probability models interacting the P90–P10 preference gap with Left government (two-year windows)	42
2.6 Linear probability models interacting the P90–P50 preference gap with Left government (two-year windows)	42
2.7 Average marginal effects of preference gaps on policy adoption, controlling for P50 support, economic, and welfare issues only (two-year windows)	45
3.1 Determinants of net transfers to M as a percentage of H 's net income	68
3.2 Determinants of net transfers to L and H as a percentage of own net income	69
5.1 Representation of PBEs in the US knowledge economy	112
6.1 Parameter values	148
6.2 Group strength, electoral selection, lobbying, and legislative responsiveness	150
6.3 Mediation analysis	151
	xiii

6.4	Estimates of group strength on roll-call votes for some key bills with high support among low-income constituents	153
7.1	Discontinuities in political and socioeconomic covariates	167
7.2	Effect of mayors with university degrees on performance outcomes	169
7.3	Effect of mayors with university degrees on fiscal outcomes	170
7.4	Effect of mayors with university degrees on key revenue categories and tax rates	171
7.5	Effect of governments' education on key areas	172
7.6	Effect of mayors with university degrees on lagged fiscal outcomes	174
7.7	Heterogeneous effects of governments' education: left- and right-wing parties	174
9.1	Oaxaca–Blinder decomposition of the voting gap between high income/highly educated and low income/low educated	210
10.1	Attitude structure in Great Britain: confirmatory factor analysis	236
10.2	Reciprocity beliefs: factor loadings	237
10.3	Opposition to redistribution is not predicted by reciprocity beliefs	238
10.4	Proportionality beliefs and “redistribution from”: factor loadings	239
11.1	Mechanisms of class-biased economic news	271
12.1	Characteristics of broadcast communities	281
13.1	Strength of expected class bias in representation of social policy preferences, depending on challenger parties	307

Contributors

Macarena Ares is Assistant Professor in the Political Science Department of the University of Barcelona and part of the WelfarePriorities project at the University of Zurich. Her research focuses on social class politics, distributive conflict over welfare policies, and corruption voting.

Larry M. Bartels is University Distinguished Professor of Political Science and Law and May Werthan Shayne Chair of Public Policy and Social Science at Vanderbilt University. His books include *Unequal Democracy: The Political Economy of the New Gilded Age* (2nd ed.), *Democracy for Realists: Why Elections Do Not Produce Responsive Government* (with Christopher H. Achen), and *Democracy Erodes from the Top: Leaders, Citizens, and the Challenge of Populism in Europe*.

Michael Becher is Assistant Professor in the School of Global and Public Affairs at IE University in Madrid. His research on political economy and comparative politics focuses on issues related to accountability, (unequal) representation, and the design of political institutions. His work has been published in the *American Journal of Political Science*, the *American Political Science Review*, and the *Journal of Politics*, among others.

Nicholas Carnes is Professor of Public Policy and Sociology in the Sanford School of Public Policy at Duke University. He is the author of *White-Collar Government* and *The Cash Ceiling*.

Charlotte Cavallé is Assistant Professor at the Ford School of Public Policy at the University of Michigan. She received a Ph.D. in government and social policy from Harvard University. Her research examines the dynamics of popular attitudes toward redistributive social policies at a time of rising inequality, fiscal stress, and high levels of immigration.

Katherine J. Cramer is Natalie C. Holton Chair of Letters & Science and Virginia Sapiro Professor of Political Science at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, and Visiting Professor at the Center for Constructive Communication at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology Media Lab. She is the author of *The Politics of Resentment: Rural Consciousness in Wisconsin and the Rise of Scott Walker*.

Marta Curto-Grau is General Director of Economic Analysis in the Catalan government. She holds a Ph.D. in economics from the University of Barcelona and has written about economic history, public economics, and political economy. She was a postdoctoral scholar at Heidelberg University and a Marie Curie Fellow.

Mads Andreas Elkjær is a postdoctoral research fellow in the Department of Politics and International Relations at the University of Oxford and at Nuffield College. His research interests include political representation, inequality, and redistribution, and more broadly comparative politics and political economy.

Lea Elsässer is a postdoctoral researcher at the University of Münster and the University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany. From 2013 to 2017, she was a doctoral researcher at the Max-Planck Institute for the Study of Societies in Cologne, Germany. Her work focuses on representational inequality along class lines.

Aina Gallego is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Barcelona and a research associate at the Barcelona Institute for International Studies. She has worked on inequalities in political participation, attitudes toward corruption, and the characteristics of political elites, among other topics.

Jacob S. Hacker is Stanley Resor Professor of Political Science at Yale University. An expert on American politics and policy, he is the author or coauthor of more than a half-dozen books, numerous journal articles, and a wide range of popular writings. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Science, a Robert A. Dahl Fellow of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, and a recipient of the Robert Ball Award of the National Academy of Social Insurance.

Silja Häusermann is Professor of Political Science at the University of Zurich in Switzerland. She studies welfare state politics and party system change in advanced capitalist democracies. She directs the European Research Council (ERC) project “WelfarePriorities” and is the codirector of Equality of Opportunity, the University of Zurich Research Priority Programme.

Svenja Hense is a postdoctoral researcher at Goethe University Frankfurt, where she works in the ERC-funded project Polarization and Its Discontent. Before joining the team in Frankfurt, she was a research associate at the University of Osnabrück and the University of Münster.

List of Contributors

xvii

Timothy Hicks is Associate Professor of Public Policy at University College London. He is a political scientist who studies “developed democracies” and is currently engaged in research projects relating to the politics of economic inequality, the politics of austerity, and political economy and the media.

Torben Iversen is Professor of Political Economy in the Government Department at Harvard University. His research interests lie at the intersection of comparative political economy, electoral politics, and applied formal theory. He is the coauthor of five books, including (with David Soskice) *Democracy and Prosperity: Reinventing Capitalism through a Turbulent Century*.

Alan M. Jacobs is Professor of Political Science at the University of British Columbia, working in the fields of comparative political economy, political behavior, and qualitative and multimethod causal inference. His research interests include the relationship between economic inequality and democratic accountability, the politics of public goods provision, and models of causal inference.

Noam Lupu is Associate Professor of Political Science and Associate Director of LAPOP Lab at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of *Party Brands in Crisis* and coeditor of *Campaigns and Voting in Developing Democracies* (with Virginia Oliveros and Luis Schiumerini).

Ruben Mathisen is a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of Comparative Politics at the University of Bergen. His research focuses on political inequality, in particular the policy influence of affluent citizens and its consequences in established democracies.

J. Scott Matthews is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Memorial University. He specializes in the study of voting and public opinion in established democracies, with a focus on the impact of political information on policy attitudes and evaluations of government performance.

Mikael Persson is Professor of Political Science at the University of Gothenburg. His research revolves around political representation, political behavior, and public opinion.

Yvette Peters is Professor of Comparative Politics at the University of Bergen in Norway. She is Principal Investigator of The Politics of Inequality, a Trond Mohn Foundation Starting Grant. She has received the Gordon Smith and Vincent Wright Memorial Prize and the François Mény Prize. Her latest book is *Political Participation, Diffused Governance, and the Transformation of Democracy*.

Paul Pierson is John Gross Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley, where he serves as Director of the Berkeley Center for the Study of American Democracy and as Co-Director of the multiuniversity

Consortium on American Political Economy. His research focuses on American political economy and public policy.

Jonas Pontusson is a research-active Emeritus Professor at the University of Geneva. Before moving to Geneva in 2010, he taught at Cornell University and Princeton University. He has published extensively in the domains of comparative political economy and comparative welfare states, focusing on labor markets, trade unions, partisan politics, and income inequality and redistribution. From 2017 to 2023, he directed a research program funded by the European Research Council on political inequality and the politics of inequality in advanced industrial states.

Wouter Schakel is a postdoctoral fellow in the Departments of Political Science and Sociology at the University of Amsterdam. His research focuses on the political economy of democratic representation and has appeared in *Socio-Economic Review*, the *European Journal of Political Research*, *West European Politics*, and *Politics & Society*.

Daniel Stegmueller is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Duke University. His research interests include the genesis of political preferences, the political economy of inequality and representation, and the role of religion in politics. He is a coauthor, with David Rueda, of *Who Wants What? Redistribution Preferences in Comparative Perspective*.

Sam Zacher is a Ph.D. candidate in political science at Yale University, studying the politics of redistribution and the climate crisis. He is the coeditor of *The Trouble* magazine on climate-left politics.

Acknowledgments

Our work on this volume has been supported by the ERC (grant no. 741538) as well as by Vanderbilt University and the University of Geneva. The idea was hatched while Noam was a visiting researcher at Jonas' ERC-funded Unequal Democracies program, at the University of Geneva, in the Spring of 2020. We intended to bring potential contributors together for a conference, but the pandemic forced us instead to opt for an online seminar, which ran every other week from January to June 2021. Despite our initial reservations about the format, the seminar was consistently well attended and the discussion lively and stimulating, convincing us to move forward with plans for a volume.

We are most grateful to the chapter authors for the time and effort they put into this project. We learned a great deal from their contributions and from our discussions with them. We are also grateful for their patience when we, as editors, have missed deadlines that we set for them and for ourselves. We also thank Brian Burgoon and two anonymous reviewers for providing detailed comments and suggestions, and Guilherme Fasolin and Martín Gou for editorial assistance. Last but not least, we thank the editors of the *Anxieties of Democracy* series – John Ferejohn, Ira Katznelson, and Deborah Yashar – and the staff at Cambridge University Press – Rachel Blaifeder and Jadyne Fauconier-Herry in particular – for their encouragement and support.