Unequal Democracies

While economic inequality has risen in every affluent democracy in North America and Western Europe, the last three decades have also been characterized by falling or stagnating levels of state-led economic redistribution. Why have democratically accountable governments not done more to distribute top-income shares to citizens with low and middle incomes? Unequal Democracies offers answers to this question, bringing together contributions that focus on voters and their demands for redistribution with contributions on elites and unequal representation that is biased against less-affluent citizens. While large and growing bodies of research have developed around each of these perspectives, this volume brings them into rare dialogue. The chapters also incorporate analyses that center exclusively on the United States and those that examine a broader set of advanced democracies to explore the uniqueness of the American case and its contribution to comparative perspectives. This book is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Noam Lupu is Associate Professor of Political Science at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of Party Brands in Crisis (2016) and the coeditor of Campaigns and Voters in Developing Democracies (2019). He has received numerous awards for his publications and three Emerging Scholar awards from the American Political Science Association.

Jonas Pontusson is a research-active Emeritus Professor at the University of Geneva. Before moving to Geneva in 2010, he taught at Cornell University and Princeton University. He has published extensively in the domains of comparative political economy and comparative welfare states, focusing on labor markets, trade unions, partisan politics, and income inequality and redistribution. From 2017 to 2023, he directed a research program funded by the European Research Council on political inequality and the politics of inequality in advanced industrial states.
SSRC Anxieties of Democracy

Editors
John A. Ferejohn, New York University
Ira Katznelson, Columbia University
Deborah J. Yashar, Princeton University

With liberal democracies afflicted by doubt and disquiet, this series probes sources of current apprehensions and explores how such regimes might thrive. What array of pressures most stresses democratic ideas and institutions? Which responses might strengthen these regimes and help them flourish?

Embedded in the Social Science Research Council’s program on “Anxieties of Democracy program,” the series focuses on how representative institutions – including elections, legislatures, political parties, the press and mass media, interest groups, social movements, and policy organizations – orient participation, learning, and accountability.

The volumes in the series further ask how particular policy challenges shape the character of democratic institutions and collective actors, and affect their capacity to address large problems in the public interest. These challenges include, but are not limited to: (1) designing democratic institutions to perform successfully under conditions of social and political polarization; (2) managing and orienting contemporary capitalism and alleviating hierarchies of inequality; (3) addressing questions of membership, including population movements and differentiated citizenship; (4) choosing policies to balance national security and civil liberty; (5) exploring the effects of global climate on citizens and the human impact on the environment; (6) managing the development of media and information technologies to ensure they enhance, rather than degrade, robust pluralism and civil political engagement.

Other Books in the Series
Can America Govern Itself? Frances E. Lee and Nolan McCarty
Social Media and Democracy: The State of the Field, Prospects for Reform Nathaniel Persily and Joshua A. Tucker
The Disinformation Age: Politics, Technology, and Disruptive Communication in the United States W. Lance Bennett and Steven Livingston
Who Gets What? The New Politics of Insecurity Frances Rosenbluth and Margaret Weir
Contested Representation: Challenges, Shortcomings and Reforms Edited by Claudia Landwehr, Thomas Saalfeld, and Armin Schäfer
When the People Rule: Popular Sovereignty in Theory and Practice Edited by Ewa Atanassow, Thomas Bartscherer and David A. Bateman
Sponsored by the Social Science Research Council

The Social Science Research Council (SSRC) is an independent, international, nonprofit organization driven by its mission to mobilize social science for the public good. Founded in 1923, the SSRC fosters innovative research, nurtures new generations of social scientists, deepens how inquiry is practiced within and across disciplines, and amplifies necessary knowledge on important public issues.

The SSRC is guided by the belief that justice, prosperity, and democracy all require better understanding of complex social, cultural, economic, and political processes. We work with practitioners, policymakers, and academic researchers in the social sciences, related professions, and the humanities and natural sciences. We build interdisciplinary and international networks, working with partners around the world to link research to practice and policy, strengthen individual and institutional capacities for learning, and enhance public access to information.
Unequal Democracies

Public Policy, Responsiveness, and Redistribution in an Era of Rising Economic Inequality

Edited by
NOAM LUPU
Vanderbilt University

JONAS PONTUSSON
University of Geneva
Contents

List of Figures page ix
List of Tables xiii
List of Contributors xv
Acknowledgments xix

1 The Political Puzzle of Rising Inequality
Noam Lupu and Jonas Pontusson 1

PART I GOVERNMENT RESPONSIVENESS

2 Unequal Responsiveness and Government Partisanship in Northwest Europe
Ruben Mathisen, Wouter Schakel, Svenja Hense, Lea Elsässer, Mikael Persson, and Jonas Pontusson 29

3 Democracy, Class Interests, and Redistribution: What Do the Data Say?
Mads Andreas Elkjær and Torben Iversen 54

4 Measuring Political Inequality
Larry M. Bartels 77

5 Why So Little Sectionalism in the Contemporary United States?
The Underrepresentation of Place-Based Economic Interests
Jacob S. Hacker, Paul Pierson, and Sam Zacher 98

PART II POLITICAL INEQUALITY AND REPRESENTATION

6 Organized Interests and the Mechanisms behind Unequal Representation in Legislatures
Michael Becher and Daniel Stegmueller 133
Contents

7 How Do the Educated Govern? Evidence from Spanish Mayors 156
Marta Curto-Grau and Aina Gallego

8 Working-Class Officeholding in the OECD 177
Nicholas Carnes and Noam Lupu

9 Political Participation and Unequal Representation: Addressing the Endogeneity Problem 196
Ruben Mathisen and Yvette Peters

PART III VOTERS AND DEMAND FOR REDISTRIBUTION

10 Fairness Reasoning and Demand for Redistribution 219
Charlotte Cavaillé

11 The News Media and the Politics of Inequality in Advanced Democracies 245
J. Scott Matthews, Timothy Hicks, and Alan M. Jacobs

12 Deflecting from Racism: Local Talk Radio Conversations about the Murder of George Floyd 276
Katherine J. Cramer

13 Class and Social Policy Representation 300
Macarena Ares and Silja Häusermann

Bibliography 325
Index 359

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/9781009428644
Figures

1.2 Support for redistribution, by country  
2.1 Coefficients for support by income on the probability of policy change (bivariate linear probability models with two-year windows)  
2.2 Predicted probabilities of policy change at different preference gaps between P90 and P10 or P50 (two-year windows)  
2.3 Policy responsiveness when the preferences of two groups align and the third group diverges (two-year windows)  
2.4 Predicted probabilities of policy change conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)  
2.5 Predicted probabilities of policy change, economic/welfare issues only, conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)  
2.6 Predicted probabilities of policy change by time period, conditional on the P90–P50 preference gap and government partisanship (two-year windows)  
3.1 Net transfers to M as a share of the net extended income of H and M  
3.2 Net transfers by income decile  
3.3 The median net income relative to mean net income, 1985–2010  
3.4 Real extended income growth in 17 Europe and the United States, 1980–2019  
5.1 The end of state economic convergence in the United States  
5.2 Gross public investment in the United States  
5.3 Federal aid to the thirty-four biggest US cities  
5.4 Federal grants for states and localities, 1980–2020  
5.5 Federal housing and urban development spending  
5.6 Republican overrepresentation in the US Senate
List of Figures

5.7 Partisan skew in statehouse district maps, 1972 vs. 2020 114
7.1 Continuity of the forcing variable 167
7.2 Distribution of difference in average years of education of government and opposition members 168
8.1 Working-class representation in the OECD 185
8.2 Left-party representation and worker representation 187
8.3 Worker representation, by electoral system 189
8.4 Public financing predicts modest differences in worker representation 190
8.5 Economic characteristics of society matter on the margin 192
8.6 Worker representation varies more in parties than countries 194
9.1 Voting, by education and income 202
9.2 Alternative forms of political participation, by education and income 202
9.3 Possible mechanisms explaining the association between unequal participation and unequal representation 206
9.4 Participation by satisfaction with the system 209
9.5 The power of differential satisfaction with the system in explaining differences in participation across income and education 212
9.6 Country variation in the voting gap by income and education 213
10.1 What is fair? Who is deserving? 225
10.2 Fairness reasoning and demand for redistribution: unidimensional approach 228
10.3 Fairness reasoning and demand for redistribution: two-dimensional approach 231
10.4 Changes in fairness beliefs 240
10.5 Correlation between proportionality and reciprocity beliefs 241
11.1 Posttax-and-transfer income share of the top 1 percent of individuals for nineteen advanced democracies 248
11.2 Correlation between the annual rate of GDP growth and annual change in top-1-percent pretax income shares for a broad set of countries, before and after 1980 253
11.3 Correlation between the annual change in the unemployment rate and annual change in top-1-percent pretax income shares for a broad set of countries, before and after 1980 254
11.4 Association between economic news tone and pretax income growth for each income quintile, conditional on income growth for all other quintiles 262
11.5 Association between economic news tone and pretax income growth for top-income groups, controlling for bottom- and middle-income growth 263
11.6 Estimated coefficient ratios from models predicting economic news tone with pretax income growth for different parts of the income distribution 266
List of Figures

11.7 Association between economic news tone and disposable income growth for each income quintile, conditional on income growth for all other quintiles 267
11.8 Association between economic news tone and disposable income growth for top-income groups, controlling for bottom- and middle-income growth 268
11.9 Estimated coefficient ratios from models predicting economic news tone with disposable income growth for different parts of the income distribution 269
13.1 Social classes’ average predicted perceptions of systemic congruence on social policy 304
13.2 Social class differences in proximity to preferred party and party system 314
13.3 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and party system, by social policy area 316
13.4 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on social consumption across different party system configurations 317
13.5 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on social investment across different party system configurations 318
13.6 Social class differences in subjective proximity to preferred party and the party system on benefits for migrants across different party system configurations 319
## Tables

1.1 Inequality and redistribution among working-age households, 1995–2007  
   page 7  
1.2 Top-10-percent income shares and redistribution, 1995–2007  
   8  
1.3 Inequality and redistribution among working-age households,  
   2007–2018  
   9  
1.4 Top-10-percent income shares and redistribution, 2007–2019  
   10  
2.1 Survey items by country  
   33  
2.2 Average values of independent and dependent variables by country  
   34  
2.3 Average marginal effects of support for policy change  
   when preferences diverge by at least 10 percentage points  
   (two-year windows)  
   37  
2.4 Average marginal effects of preference gaps on policy adoption,  
   controlling for P50 support (two-year windows)  
   38  
2.5 Linear probability models interacting the P90–P10 preference  
   gap with Left government (two-year windows)  
   42  
2.6 Linear probability models interacting the P90–P50 preference  
   gap with Left government (two-year windows)  
   42  
2.7 Average marginal effects of preference gaps on policy adoption,  
   controlling for P50 support, economic, and welfare issues only  
   (two-year windows)  
   45  
3.1 Determinants of net transfers to $M$ as a percentage of $H$’s net income  
   68  
3.2 Determinants of net transfers to $L$ and $H$ as a percentage of own net  
   income  
   69  
5.1 Representation of PBEIs in the US knowledge economy  
   112  
6.1 Parameter values  
   148  
6.2 Group strength, electoral selection, lobbying, and legislative  
   responsiveness  
   150  
6.3 Mediation analysis  
   151
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Estimates of group strength on roll-call votes for some key bills</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>with high support among low-income constituents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Discontinuities in political and socioeconomic covariates</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Effect of mayors with university degrees on performance outcomes</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Effect of mayors with university degrees on fiscal outcomes</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Effect of mayors with university degrees on key revenue categories and tax rates</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Effect of governments’ education on key areas</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>Effect of mayors with university degrees on lagged fiscal outcomes</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>Heterogeneous effects of governments’ education: left- and right-wing parties</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Oaxaca–Blinder decomposition of the voting gap between high income/highly educated and low income/low educated</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Attitude structure in Great Britain: confirmatory factor analysis</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Reciprocity beliefs: factor loadings</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Opposition to redistribution is not predicted by reciprocity beliefs</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Proportionality beliefs and “redistribution from”: factor loadings</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Mechanisms of class-biased economic news</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Characteristics of broadcast communities</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>Strength of expected class bias in representation of social policy preferences, depending on challenger parties</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Macarena Ares is Assistant Professor in the Political Science Department of the University of Barcelona and part of the WelfarePriorities project at the University of Zurich. Her research focuses on social class politics, distributive conflict over welfare policies, and corruption voting.

Larry M. Bartels is University Distinguished Professor of Political Science and Law and May Werthan Shayne Chair of Public Policy and Social Science at Vanderbilt University. His books include Unequal Democracy: The Political Economy of the New Gilded Age (2nd ed.), Democracy for Realists: Why Elections Do Not Produce Responsive Government (with Christopher H. Achen), and Democracy Erodes from the Top: Leaders, Citizens, and the Challenge of Populism in Europe.

Michael Becher is Assistant Professor in the School of Global and Public Affairs at IE University in Madrid. His research on political economy and comparative politics focuses on issues related to accountability, (unequal) representation, and the design of political institutions. His work has been published in the American Journal of Political Science, the American Political Science Review, and the Journal of Politics, among others.

Nicholas Carnes is Professor of Public Policy and Sociology in the Sanford School of Public Policy at Duke University. He is the author of White-Collar Government and The Cash Ceiling.

Charlotte Cavaillé is Assistant Professor at the Ford School of Public Policy at the University of Michigan. She received a Ph.D. in government and social policy from Harvard University. Her research examines the dynamics of popular attitudes toward redistributive social policies at a time of rising inequality, fiscal stress, and high levels of immigration.
List of Contributors

Katherine J. Cramer is Natalie C. Holton Chair of Letters & Science and Virginia Sapiro Professor of Political Science at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, and Visiting Professor at the Center for Constructive Communication at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology Media Lab. She is the author of The Politics of Resentment: Rural Consciousness in Wisconsin and the Rise of Scott Walker.

Marta Curto-Grau is General Director of Economic Analysis in the Catalan government. She holds a Ph.D. in economics from the University of Barcelona and has written about economic history, public economics, and political economy. She was a postdoctoral scholar at Heidelberg University and a Marie Curie Fellow.

Mads Andreas Elkjær is a postdoctoral research fellow in the Department of Politics and International Relations at the University of Oxford and at Nuffield College. His research interests include political representation, inequality, and redistribution, and more broadly comparative politics and political economy.

Lea Elsässer is a postdoctoral researcher at the University of Münster and the University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany. From 2013 to 2017, she was a doctoral researcher at the Max-Planck Institute for the Study of Societies in Cologne, Germany. Her work focuses on representational inequality along class lines.

Aina Gallego is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Barcelona and a research associate at the Barcelona Institute for International Studies. She has worked on inequalities in political participation, attitudes toward corruption, and the characteristics of political elites, among other topics.

Jacob S. Hacker is Stanley Resor Professor of Political Science at Yale University. An expert on American politics and policy, he is the author or coauthor of more than a half-dozen books, numerous journal articles, and a wide range of popular writings. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Science, a Robert A. Dahl Fellow of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, and a recipient of the Robert Ball Award of the National Academy of Social Insurance.

Silja Häusermann is Professor of Political Science at the University of Zurich in Switzerland. She studies welfare state politics and party system change in advanced capitalist democracies. She directs the European Research Council (ERC) project “WelfarePriorities” and is the codirector of Equality of Opportunity, the University of Zurich Research Priority Programme.

Svenja Hense is a postdoctoral researcher at Goethe University Frankfurt, where she works in the ERC-funded project Polarization and Its Discontent. Before joining the team in Frankfurt, she was a research associate at the University of Osnabrück and the University of Münster.
List of Contributors

Timothy Hicks is Associate Professor of Public Policy at University College London. He is a political scientist who studies “developed democracies” and is currently engaged in research projects relating to the politics of economic inequality, the politics of austerity, and political economy and the media.

Torben Iversen is Professor of Political Economy in the Government Department at Harvard University. His research interests lie at the intersection of comparative political economy, electoral politics, and applied formal theory. He is the coauthor of five books, including (with David Soskice) Democracy and Prosperity: Reinventing Capitalism through a Turbulent Century.

Alan M. Jacobs is Professor of Political Science at the University of British Columbia, working in the fields of comparative political economy, political behavior, and qualitative and multimethod causal inference. His research interests include the relationship between economic inequality and democratic accountability, the politics of public goods provision, and models of causal inference.

Noam Lupu is Associate Professor of Political Science and Associate Director of LAPOP Lab at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of Party Brands in Crisis and coeditor of Campaigns and Voting in Developing Democracies (with Virginia Oliveros and Luis Schiumerini).

Ruben Mathisen is a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of Comparative Politics at the University of Bergen. His research focuses on political inequality, in particular the policy influence of affluent citizens and its consequences in established democracies.

J. Scott Matthews is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Memorial University. He specializes in the study of voting and public opinion in established democracies, with a focus on the impact of political information on policy attitudes and evaluations of government performance.

Mikael Persson is Professor of Political Science at the University of Gothenburg. His research revolves around political representation, political behavior, and public opinion.

Yvette Peters is Professor of Comparative Politics at the University of Bergen in Norway. She is Principal Investigator of The Politics of Inequality, a Trond Mohn Foundation Starting Grant. She has received the Gordon Smith and Vincent Wright Memorial Prize and the François Mény Prize. Her latest book is Political Participation, Diffused Governance, and the Transformation of Democracy.

Paul Pierson is John Gross Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley, where he serves as Director of the Berkeley Center for the Study of American Democracy and as Co-Director of the multiuniversity
List of Contributors

Consortium on American Political Economy. His research focuses on American political economy and public policy.

Jonas Pontusson is a research-active Emeritus Professor at the University of Geneva. Before moving to Geneva in 2010, he taught at Cornell University and Princeton University. He has published extensively in the domains of comparative political economy and comparative welfare states, focusing on labor markets, trade unions, partisan politics, and income inequality and redistribution. From 2017 to 2023, he directed a research program funded by the European Research Council on political inequality and the politics of inequality in advanced industrial states.

Wouter Schakel is a postdoctoral fellow in the Departments of Political Science and Sociology at the University of Amsterdam. His research focuses on the political economy of democratic representation and has appeared in *Socio-Economic Review*, the *European Journal of Political Research*, *West European Politics*, and *Politics & Society*.

Daniel Stegmueller is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Duke University. His research interests include the genesis of political preferences, the political economy of inequality and representation, and the role of religion in politics. He is a coauthor, with David Rueda, of *Who Wants What? Redistribution Preferences in Comparative Perspective*.

Sam Zacher is a Ph.D. candidate in political science at Yale University, studying the politics of redistribution and the climate crisis. He is the coeditor of *The Trouble* magazine on climate-left politics.
Acknowledgments

Our work on this volume has been supported by the ERC (grant no. 741538) as well as by Vanderbilt University and the University of Geneva. The idea was hatched while Noam was a visiting researcher at Jonas’ ERC-funded Unequal Democracies program, at the University of Geneva, in the Spring of 2020. We intended to bring potential contributors together for a conference, but the pandemic forced us instead to opt for an online seminar, which ran every other week from January to June 2021. Despite our initial reservations about the format, the seminar was consistently well attended and the discussion lively and stimulating, convincing us to move forward with plans for a volume.

We are most grateful to the chapter authors for the time and effort they put into this project. We learned a great deal from their contributions and from our discussions with them. We are also grateful for their patience when we, as editors, have missed deadlines that we set for them and for ourselves. We also thank Brian Burgoon and two anonymous reviewers for providing detailed comments and suggestions, and Guilherme Fasolin and Martín Gou for editorial assistance. Last but not least, we thank the editors of the Anxieties of Democracy series – John Ferejohn, Ira Katznelson, and Deborah Yashar – and the staff at Cambridge University Press – Rachel Blaifeder and Jadyn Fauconier-Herry in particular – for their encouragement and support.