The Recasting of the Latin American Right

This book analyzes the transformation of the political right in Latin America in response to the strengthening of left-wing parties and movements throughout the region. While Latin America's post-2000 left has been widely studied, little is known about right-wing political formations during and after that time. There is a paucity of research on recent phenomena associated with the reorganization of the right: the polarization of Latin American electorates and elites; the rebranding of preexisting conservative parties; the creation of new right-wing parties; and the rise of the radical right. This volume provides a comprehensive account of the strategies used by the political right since 2000. It analyzes both the supply side (parties, movements, and personalist vehicles) and the demand side (voters and public opinion) to provide a description and explanation of how the right has recast itself as a new political force across the entire region of Latin America.

André Borges is Associate Professor at Universidade de Brasília. He received his PhD in Political Science from the University of Oxford. His latest research has appeared in *Government and Opposition*, *Party Politics*, and in the *Journal of Latin American Studies*.

Ryan Lloyd received his PhD in government from the University of Texas at Austin. He was previously a postdoc at the University of São Paulo and Visiting Assistant Professor of International Studies at Centre College. His research has been published in journals including *Public Opinion Quarterly* and *Electoral Studies*. He is now at Google.

Gabriel Vommaro is Professor at Universidad Nacional de San Martín and Researcher at the CONICET in Argentina. He received his PhD in Sociology from the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales. His books include *Conservatives against the Tide* (2023) and *Diminished Parties* (2021, edited with Luna, Piñeiro, and Rosenblatt).

The Recasting of the Latin American Right

Polarization and Conservative Reactions

Edited by ANDRÉ BORGES Universidade de Brasília

RYAN LLOYD

GABRIEL VOMMARO Universidad Nacional de San Martín CONICET





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009427449

DOI: 10.1017/9781009427432

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009427432

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Borges, André, 1975– author. | Lloyd, Ryan, 1988– author. | Vommaro, Gabriel, 1976– author.

TITLE: The recasting of the Latin American right : polarization and conservative reactions / André Borges, Ryan Lloyd, Gabriel Vommaro. DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2024007248 | ISBN 9781009427449 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781009427432 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Conservatism – Latin America. | Political parties – Latin America. | Right and left (Political science) – Latin America. | Polarization (Social sciences) – Political aspects – Latin America. |

Latin America – Politics and government – 21st century. CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC573.2.L3 B67 2024 | DDC 320.52098–dc23/eng/20240408 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024007248

> ISBN 978-1-009-42744-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-42740-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Figures	<i>page</i> vii
List of Tables	xi
List of Contributors	xiii
Introduction: The Recasting of the Latin American Right André Borges, Gabriel Vommaro, and Ryan Lloyd	I
PART I BUILDING RIGHT-WING PARTIES AND PARTISANS	31
I Conservative Decay and Reaction: Accounting for the Divergent Trajectories of the Latin American Right André Borges and Ryan Lloyd	33
2 Conservative Parties in Latin America in Adverse Times: The Rise of the Argentine PRO in Comparative Perspective <i>Gabriel Vommaro</i>	55
3 Crafting Partisanship in the Context of Party Organization Fragility: The Resilience of <i>Fujimorismo</i> in the Electoral Arena <i>Carlos Meléndez</i>	74
4 The Uneven Success of Uribismo in Colombia Juan Albarracín, Laura Gamboa, and Juan Pablo Milanese	95
5 Right-Wing Partisans in Contemporary Chile Ariel Becerra and Cristóbal Rovira Kaltwasser	115
PART II A NEW RIGHT? IDEATIONAL AND PROGRAMMATIC	
CHANGE AFTER THE LEFT TURN	137
6 Progressive Policy Change, Cultural Backlash, and Party Polarization in Latin America André Borges and Robert Vidigal	139

vi	Contents
7 The Latin American Populist Radical Right in Comparative Perspective: Constraints and Opportunities <i>Lisa Zanotti</i>	158
8 Between <i>Gattopardismo</i> and Ideational Change: The Mainstrea Chilean Right's Winding Road to Moderation Stéphanie Alenda, Miguel Angel López, Kenneth Bunker, and Nicolás Miranda	176 I
9 Whose Right, Whose Left? Analyzing the Complexities of Right-Wing Politics in Venezuela Maryhen Jiménez and Guillermo T. Aveledo	197
10 A Conversion to the Right: The Case of the 2018 Election of Jair Bolsonaro in Brazil <i>Matheus Ferreira, Mario Fuks, and Amy Erica Smith</i>	219
Conclusions: Reassessing the Resurgence of the Latin American Right André Borges, Gabriel Vommaro, and Ryan Lloyd	237
References	247
Index	271

Figures

I.1	Voters' identification with the right in Latin America,	
	2008-2020	page 12
I.2	Percentage of voters who consider crime, drugs, and political	
	violence/terrorism as major national problems,	
	Latinobarómetro (1996–2018)	14
I.3	Percentage of voters who would support a military coup	
	when there is a lot of crime, 2004/2006–2018	15
I.4	Mean support for gay marriage in Latin America (1-10 scale),	
	2010-2016/2018	16
I.5	Mean support for abortion in Latin America (1–10 scale),	
	2001-2006/2017-2018	16
I.6	Boxplot of right-wing parties' positions on the secular-confessio	nal
	divide, by party founding date	22
I.7	Boxplot of right-wing parties' positions on the state-market	
	divide, by party founding date	23
I.8	Boxplot of right-wing parties' positions on abortion,	
	by party founding date	24
I.9	Boxplot of right-wing parties' positions on gay marriage,	
	by party founding date	24
I.10	Mean party routinization by ideological bloc and party	
	founding date	25
	Right-wing bloc vote share by country	44
1.2	Share of the national vote obtained by major right-wing	
	parties, selected countries	47
1.3	Marginal effect of parties' roots in authoritarianism conditional	
	on intensity of political conflict during the dictatorship	49
1.4	Marginal effect of religious principles conditional	
	on the secular-religious cleavage	49

vii

viii	List of	Figures
τ.5	Marginal effects of left-wing incumbents conditional	
1.1	on lagged GDP growth	51
1.6	Marginal effect of left-wing incumbents conditional	5
	on the saliency of crime and political violence	51
3.1	Percentage of valid votes (excluding null and blank votes)	
	in favor of <i>Fujimorista</i> parties, 1990–2021	76
	Partisanship identification, 1990–2001	79
3.3	Ideological self-perception of Fujimoristas (hardcore and leaners	
	and anti- <i>Fujimoristas</i> , 2019 and 2021	84
3.4	Populist Index's scores for <i>Fujimoristas</i> (hardcore and leaners)	0.6
	and anti- <i>Fujimoristas</i> , 2019 and 2021	86
3.5	Percentages of valid votes for right-wing presidential candidates	00
26	in the 2011, 2016, and 2021 first-round presidential elections Populist Index scores for prospective voters	88
3.0	in the 2021 parliamentary elections	89
3.7	Populist Index scores for prospective voters in the 2021	09
3.1	presidential elections	90
4.1	Percentage of the vote won by the CD in legislative elections	100
	Percentage of votes for the CD in the presidential elections	
•	by municipality	101
4.3	Percentage of votes for the CD in elections for legislative	
	and subnational units by municipality	102
4.4	The CD's performance in legislative elections compared	
	to other parties	103
	Word count related to security issues of the CD	107
4.6	Number of entries with words pertaining to security	
	on documents posted in right-wing parties' websites	107
4.7	The answer to the question: "What is the most important	. 0
. 0	problem in Colombia?"	108
4.0	Difference in proportions of security as the biggest problem, as seen by <i>urubista</i> voters	108
4.0	The CD's networks of coalitions during Colombia's mayoral	100
4.9	elections, 2019	112
4.10	The CD's networks of coalitions during Colombia's	112
4.2.5	gubernatorial elections, 2019	113
5.1	Party identification by gender and age (in percentages)	123
	Party identification according to income groups (in percentage)	124
5.3	Party identification according to education (in percentage)	124
	Party identification by religion (in percentage)	125
0 0	Support for democracy according to partisanship (in percentage)	127
5.6	Positions on the state/market axis and moral issues,	
	by partisan identification	128
	Legislative party system polarization	148
6.2	Average left and right political conservatism	152

List of Figures		ix
6.3	Marginal effect of left-wing incumbent conditional	
_	on the extension of LGBTQ rights	153
6.4	Marginal effect of left-wing incumbent conditional on the saliency of redistribution and poverty	
7 T	Main problems in Latin American countries according	155
/•1	to citizens in 2020	165
7.2	The five most salient categories for Bolsonaro (2018 elections)	-)
	and Kast (2021 elections)	168
7.3	Salience and policies toward immigration in twelve Latin	
	American countries by party	171
7•4	Index of salience of immigration for Kast (2021 elections)	
Q	and Bolsonaro (2018 elections) compared to others PRR actors Left–right placement of Chilean presidential candidates'	172
0.1	manifestos, 1989–2017	182
8.2	Left–right and economic placement of presidential candidates,	102
	1989–2017	184
8.3	Left-right and economic placement of congressmen, 1993-2017	186
8.4	Legislators' perceptions concerning the role of the state	
	in the economy (2010–2018)	187
	Distribution of blocs in the Constitutional Convention	192
9.1	Percentage of seats according to ideology, Chamber of Deputies	
0.0	Venezuela, 1958–1998 Parriers to parties, givil acciety organization repression	201
9.2	Barriers to parties, civil society organization repression, and political polarization in Venezuela, 1958–2020	203
0.2	Equality before the law and individual liberty, judicial	203
<i>J</i> •J	constraints on the executive and liberal democracy index	
	in Venezuela, 1958–2020	206
9.4	Venezuela: Selected social indicators, 1995–2020	210
	Votes for <i>Chavismo</i> (2000–2021)	212
10.1	Religious leaders' support for Bolsonaro between religious	
	groups and waves	229
10.2	Effect of religious affiliation on vote for Bolsonaro, moderated	
	by religious leaders' support for Bolsonaro (Wave 3)	234
10.3	Effect of religious affiliation on vote for Bolsonaro, moderated by attitude about homosexuality (Wave 3)	225
το.4	Effect of religious affiliation on vote for Bolsonaro, moderated	235
4	by attitude about abortion (Wave 3)	236

Tables

I.1	A typology of right-wing movements and parties	page 11
I.2	Voter polarization in Latin America, selected issues	18
1.1	Determinants of the right-wing vote in Latin America	48
1.2	Determinants of the right-wing vote in Latin America -	
	Alternative model	52
3.1	<i>Fujimorista</i> ID, different measurements, 2011–2021	82
3.2	A comparison of the organizational and ideational resources	
	of three right-wing Andean political parties	92
5.1	Party identification according to 2017 presidential election	
	results (in percentage)	126
5.2	Party identification according to the results of the October 25	
	plebiscite (in percentage)	126
5.3	Positions on immigration, according to party identification	130
	Position on social justice, according to party identification	131
	GEE regressions on the determinants of ideological extremism	154
6.2	GEE regressions on the determinants of ideological extremism	
	(no interactions)	157
8.1	Average ideological position of constitutional constituents	
	by coalition and alliances	193
	Determinants of vote for Bolsonaro among Pentecostals	230
10.2	Determinants of vote for Bolsonaro among	
	evangelicals (Wave 3)	231
10.3	Determinants of vote for Bolsonaro among	
	historical evangelicals	235

xi

Contributors

Juan Albarracín University of Illinois (Chicago) Stéphanie Alenda Universidad Andrés Bello Guillermo T. Aveledo Universidad Metropolitana, Caracas Ariel Becerra Universidad Diego Portales André Borges Universidade de Brasília Kenneth Bunker Núcleo Milenio MEPOP and Universidad San Sebastián Matheus Ferreira Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais Mario Fuks Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais Laura Gamboa University of Notre Dame Maryhen Jiménez University of Oxford Ryan Lloyd Miguel Angel López Núcleo Milenio and Universidad de Chile Carlos Meléndez Universidad Diego Portales Juan Pablo Milanese Universidad Icesi Nicolás Miranda Núcleo Milenio MEPOP and Universidad de Salamanca Cristóbal Rovira Kaltwasser Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile Amy Erica Smith Iowa State University Robert Vidigal New York University Gabriel Vommaro Universidad Nacional de San Martín Lisa Zanotti Universidad Diego Portales

xiii