

#### THE STOIC COSMOS

Stoic cosmology held that our cosmos is periodically destroyed and restored. In this, it is unique compared to earlier cosmologies. Ricardo Salles offers a detailed reconstruction of the philosophical ideas behind this thesis, which explains its uniqueness and how it competes with earlier cosmologies. The reconstruction is based on a rigorous analysis of the evidence, made accessible to nonspecialists who are familiar with the history of ancient philosophy but do not specialize in Stoicism. Furthermore, the book reveals how the Stoics combined their meteorology, their cosmology, their physics, and their metaphysics to explain natural phenomena, thereby illustrating how different disciplines can interact in ancient philosophy. It also refers to central questions in the interpretation of Stoicism, such as the role of the Stoic god in cosmology and the Stoic theory of events.

RICARDO SALLES is a researcher at the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México. He is the editor of *Cosmology and Biology in Ancient Philosophy* (Cambridge, 2021).



# THE STOIC COSMOS

Conflagration, Cosmogony, and Recurrence in Early Stoicism

RICARDO SALLES

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009422796

> DOI: 10.1017/9781009422819 © Ricardo Salles 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009422819

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Salles, Ricardo, author.

TITLE: The stoic cosmos: conflagration, cosmogony, and recurrence in early stoicism / Ricardo Salles, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Includes bibliographical references.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2024056349 (print) | LCCN 2024056350 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009422796 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009422840 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009422819 (epub) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Stoics. | Cosmology, Ancient.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B528 .S246 2025 (print) | LCC B528 (ebook) |

DDC 188-dc23/eng/20241206

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024056349

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024056350

ISBN 978-1-009-42279-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



A dedé, chosim e teresa



> Seas that restlessly aspire, Surging unto skies of fire E. A. Poe, *Dream-Land*, vv. 15–16

This life as you live it at present and have lived it, you must live once more and also innumerable times; and there shall be nothing new in it, but every pain and every joy and every thought and sigh and everything unspeakably small or large in your life must return to you, and everything in the same series and sequence – and likewise this spider and this moonlight among the trees, and similarly this moment and I myself.

F. Nietzsche, The Joyful Wisdom 4.341



## Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments			<i>page</i> ix	
Translations and Texts				
Li	st of Ab	breviations	xiii	
	Intro	duction		
	I.1	The Stoic Cosmos and Other Cosmic Systems in Antiquity	I	
	I.2	The Goal of This Book and Its Methodology	5	
	I.3	Synopsis of the Argument	9	
Ι	Overview of the Stoic Cosmos		I 2	
	1.1	The Structure of the Stoic Cosmos	12	
	1.2	God as a Basic Cosmic Principle	18	
	1.3	The Living Cosmos and God as Its Seminal Reason	21	
	1.4	Theological Determinism	29	
2	The Conflagration		35	
	2.1	The Physics of Desiccation	35	
	2.2	The Role of Sublunary Desiccation in the Conflagration	40	
	2.3	The Concept of Combustion by Absorption	47	
	2.4	Absorption in Stoic Elemental Theory	51	
	2.5	The Place of the Conflagration in Stoic Elemental Theory	58	
	2.6	The Duration of the Conflagration	61	
3	Presocratic Antecedents of the Stoic Conflagration		64	
	3.1	Is the Sublunary Region Drying up and Will It Dry Out?	65	
	3.2	Do Celestial Bodies Feed on Evaporation?	73	
	3.3	Will the Whole Sublunary Region Change into Fire?	83	
	3.4	Aristotle on Meteorology and the Stability of the Cosmos	90	
4	The Cosmogony		97	
	4. I	The Generation of Composite Substances	98	
	4.2	The Zenonian Theory of Cosmogony	101	
	4.3	Philosophical Motivations and Presocratic Antecedents of the		
		Zenonian Theory	106	



viii		Contents	
	4.4	The Cleanthean Theory of Cosmogony	109
	4.5	Did Chrysippus Side with Cleanthes?	119
	4.6	Recapitulation of the Zeno-Cleanthes Dispute	124
5	The Metaphysics of Everlasting Recurrence		125
	5.I	The First Problem	126
	5.2	The Solution to the First Problem (i): Stoic Events	127
	5.3	The Solution to the First Problem (ii): Chrysippus'	
		Theory of the Present	140
	5.4	The Solution to the First Problem (iii): The Causal Unity	
		of Events	146
	5.5	The Type/Token Distinction and the Solution to the	
	- (	Second Problem What Is It That Individuates Times?	154
	5.6	what is it I hat individuates Times:	165
6	The I	Recurring Cosmos: Why Identical?	174
	6.1	The Strongest Version of the Stoic Theory of Everlasting	
		Recurrence	174
	6.2	The Two Weaker Versions and the Pythagorean Theory	180
	6.3	The Argument for <i>Identity</i> (I)	187
	6.4	The Argument for <i>Identity</i> (II)	195
	6.5	Individuality without Identity and Identity without Individuality	204
	6.6	Attribution of the Weaker Theories	210
7	The I	Paradox of Destruction and Restoration	213
	7.I	Timaean Concomitants	214
	7.2	The Contrary Powers of Fire in Zeno and Cleanthes	219
	7.3	Desiccation and Conflagration as Timaean Concomitants	223
	7.4	Cohesive Fire and Chrysippean Breath	226
	7.5	Boethus and the Paradox	236
8	Conc	luding Remarks	247
	8.1	Why Would the Chrysippean God Want the Conflagration?	248
	8.2	When Does the Stoic God Design the Cosmos?	253
Wo	rks Ci	ted	263
Ina	'ex Loc	orum	284
Ina	Index		297



## Preface and Acknowledgments

I started writing this book in March 2020, when the Covid pandemic began. My original plan was to offer a synthesis of what I had published on the subject up to that moment. The task ahead was supposed to be easy and expeditious. But I soon realized that many views I had defended in the past were incomplete, confused, or simply mistaken. It became necessary to change them entirely or at least reformulate and complete them. Thus, some ideas I now hold are inconsistent with those I had in the past, and very few are exactly the same.

The main changes are the following: the account of the conflagration is much fuller and I hope clearer in Section 2.2 than in Salles 2005; the analysis of Stoic elemental theory and the process of combustion in Sections 2.3–2.4 differs significantly from the one in Salles 2015b, 2015c, and 2016; the account of the Stoic theory of cosmogony in Chapter 4 is also substantially different from the one I offer in Salles 2015a; my presentation of the Stoic theory of events and of Chrysippus' theory of the present in Chapter 5 departs in some vital respects from the one I give in Salles 2018b; my reconstruction of the Argument for Identity in Sections 6.3–6.4 is new but complements the one I develop in Salles 2003; and the conclusions I reach concerning the Stoic god's motivation for destroying the cosmos and restoring a type-identical one in Sections 7.1–7.4 are at variance with those in Salles 2005 and 2017b.

The general framework of this book is the classic work on Stoic cosmology published in the past fifty years by Jonathan Barnes, John Cooper, David Hahm, Anthony Long, Jaap Mansfeld, David Sedley, R. W. Sharples, and Richard Sorabji. Recent discussions with individual colleagues, students, and friends, to whom I am grateful, helped me to refine and correct my ideas. I want to mention Nazyheli Aguirre, James Allen, Peter Adamson, Rachel Barney, Gábor Betegh, Marcelo Boeri, Victor Caston, Rocío Cázares, Vanessa de Harven, Marion Durand,



#### Preface and Acknowledgments

Mariana Gardella, Laura Gómez, Edgar González Varela, Reier Helle, Ian Hensley, Brooke Holmes, Jacob Klein, Inna Kupreeva, Andrea Lozano, Anna Marmodoro, Carlo Natali, José Luis Ponce, Nathan Powers, Christian Pfeiffer, Graham Priest, Leonardo Ramos-Umaña, Teresa Rodríguez, Barbara Sattler, Francisco Serrano, Katja Vogt, and Marco Zingano. I am especially indebted to Edgar González Varela, Reier Helle, Ian Hensley, and Teresa Rodríguez for extensive written comments on previous versions of several chapters and to the two anonymous reviewers appointed by Cambridge University Press for their evaluation of a previous version of the book (including an annotated PDF proposing more than 300 changes).

While writing the book, I had the opportunity to present my work at various workshops, seminars, conferences, and congresses. I am obliged to the audiences for their searching questions and helpful comments and to the organizers for their kind invitation. I wish to thank, in particular, the Classical Dialogues Seminar at Columbia University in New York; the Workshop in Ancient Philosophy at Oxford, England; the London Ancient Science Conference at Birkbeck College in London; the History of Philosophy Seminar at the Instituto de Investigaciones Filosóficas in the Nacional Autónoma de México; Hellenisticum 'The Philosophy of Chrysippus' at the Fondation Hardt in Genève; the Ancient Philosophy Seminar at the Institute of Classical Studies in London; the Durham Centre for Ancient and Medieval Philosophy; the VI Congreso Iberoamericano de Filosofía at the Universidade do Porto in Portugal; the Royal Holloway Stoic Physics Workshop in London; the Classics Seminar at Corpus Christi College Oxford; the Dipartamento di Filosofia e Scienze dell'Educazione at the Università di Torino; the Oberseminar at the Munich School of Ancient Philosophy; the School of Philosophy, Psychology and Language Sciences at the University of Edinburgh; the Unidad Académica de Filosofía at the Universidad Autónoma de Zacatecas: the Faculdade de Filosofía, Letras e Ciências Humanas at the Universidade de São Paulo; and the Instituto de Filosofía at the Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile.

The penultimate version was completed at the University of Oxford. I am indebted to the Faculty of Philosophy for an academic visitorship in the academic year 2022–2023, to Corpus Christi College for a visiting fellowship and scholarship during the same year, and to the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México for a sabbatical leave. I benefited from the generous financial support provided by the program PASPA-UNAM and



#### Preface and Acknowledgments

хi

the sabbatical program of the Consejo Nacional de Ciencia Tecnología (now the Secretaría de Ciencia, Humanidades, Tecnología e Innovación - SECIHTI), and by the projects PAPIIT IN403620 and IN400123 and CONACYT CF 2023-I-44. I also wish to record my gratitude to Michael Sharp at Cambridge University Press for his keen interest and support throughout the process, to the production team for their efficient work, and to Mayra Huerta for helping me to check the references and to revise the proofs. All remaining errors are my own.



#### Translations and Texts

#### Text Numbering and Translations

I often cite ancient texts in the form of numbered passages in bold. For instance, Chapter 3 includes a **T1a**, a **T2b**, and a **T4c**. In this system, the number stands for the chapter section to which the passage belongs and the letter for its place within the section. For example, **T4c** in Chapter 3 is the third passage of Section 3.4 of that chapter. The numbering is repeated in each chapter. Thus, Chapter 3 has a **T4c** and so do Chapters 4 and 7 (but Chapter 8, for instance, does not have a **T4c** because it does not have a Section 8.4). Unless otherwise stated, all the translations are my own. Most of the translations, however, are based on or borrowed from previously existing translations (e.g., Long-Sedley 1987). I indicate when I borrow a translation, and I frequently modify or complement it.

#### Appendices to Ancient Texts

The texts quoted in the book proceed from standard critical editions listed in the Works Cited. These editions often cite in their critical apparatus textual variants. Some of these variants may alter the overall philosophical meaning of the texts. Appended to the texts, I usually mention the variants that I consider especially significant for meaning (which are very few). Although in some cases I do discuss them, the chief purpose of these appendices is merely to signal that the variants exist and to invite the readers to bear them in mind when they interpret the passages. In this respect, I follow the spirit of the textual notes in volume 2 of *The Hellenistic Philosophers* by Long and Sedley: 'We do not attempt to supply exhaustive information on the textual tradition, but we have tried to give full information at least in all cases where a philosophical interpretation might depend on the reading chosen' (Long-Sedley 1987: 2.ix).



### **Abbreviations**

Adv. Haer. Irenaeus, Adversus Haereses

Anth. Stobaeus, Anthologium (including the Eclogae

Physicae et Ethicae)

BS Boeri-Salles 2014

Cael. Cleomedes, Caelestia - Aristotle, De Caelo

Cels. Origen, Contra Celsum

CGTT Cornutus, Compendium de Graecae Theologiae

Traditionibus

Civ. Augustine, De Civita Dei

CN Plutarch, De Communibus Notitiis

Conf. Augustine, Confessiones

Contra Man. Augustine, De Genesi contra Manichaeos

DA Aristotle, De Anima

DAM Philo of Alexandria, De Aeternitate Mundi

De Gen. Augustine, De Genesi ad Litteram De Nat. Deor. Cornutus, De Natura Deorum

De Tremore Galen, De Tremore, Palpitatione, Convulsione et

Rigore Liber

DG Diels 1879

DI Theophrastus, De Igne

Diss. Epictetus, Dissertationes ab Arriano Digestae

Div. Cicero, De Divinatione

*DK* Diels-Kranz 1903 (1951–1952)

DL Diogenes Laertius, Vitae Philosophorum

DP Origen, De Principiis
EK Edelstein-Kidd 1989
Etymol. Magum. Etymologicum magnum
Plotinus, Enneades

Ep. Seneca, Epistulae Morales ad Lucilium

Fat. Alexander of Aphrodisias, De Fato ad Imperatores

xiii



xiv List of Abbreviations

GC Aristotle, De Generatione et Corruptione HA Aristotle, De Historia Animalium

Haer. Hippolytus, Refutatio Omnium Haeresium In Cael. Simplicius, In Aristotelis quattor libros de Caelo

Commentaria

In Cat. Simplicius, In Aristotelis Categorias Commentarium

/ Dexippus, In Aristotelis Categorias

Commentarium

In Evang. Ionn. Origen, Commentarii in Evangelium Ioannis In GC Philoponus, In Aristotelis libros de generatione et

corruptione commentaria

In Evang. Ionn.
Origen, Commentarii in Evangelium Ioannis
In Hipp. De Hum.
Ps. Galen, In Hippocratis De humoribus
Alexander of Aphrodisias, In Aristotelis

Metaphysica Commentaria

In Meteor. Alexander of Aphrodisias, In Aristotelis
Meteorologicorum Libros Commentaria

In Phys. Simplicius, In Aristotelis Physicorum Libros

Commentaria

In Pr. An. Alexander of Aphrodisias, in Aristotelis

Analyticorum Priorum Librum i commentarium

In Top. Alexander of Aphrodisias, In Aristotelis Topicorum

Libros Octo Commentaria

LM Laks-Most 2016
LS Long-Sedley 1987

LSJ Liddell-Scott-Jones-McKenzie 1940
M Sextus Empiricus, Adversus Mathematicos

MA Marcus Aurelius, Ad se ipsum

Man. Alexander Lycopolis, Alexandri Lycopolitani contra

Manichaei Opiniones Disputatio

Met.Aristotle, MetaphysicaMeteor.Aristotle, Meteorologica

Mixt. Alexander of Aphrodisias, De Mixtione

NDCicero, De Natura DeorumNHNemesius, De Natura HominisNQSeneca, Naturales QuaestionesOEDOxford English Dictionary

Off. Cicero, De Officiis

Or.Dio Chrysostom, OrationesPEEusebius, Praeparatio Evangelica



#### List of Abbreviations

ΧV

PH Sextus Empiricus, Pyrrhoniae Hypotyposes

Phd. Plato, Phaedo

Phil. Aristotle, De Philosophia

PHP Galen, De Placitis Ĥippocratis et Platonis

Phys.Aristotle, PhysicaPlen.Galen, De PlenitudineProb.[Aristotle], Problemata

SR Plutarch, De Stoicorum Repugnantiis Strom. Clement of Alexandria, Stromata

SVF von Arnim 1903
Th. Hesiod, Theogonia
Tim. Plato, Timaeus