

THE USE OF FORCE AND THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEM

This book provides in-depth coverage and analysis of the international law rules and principles that govern the use of force. Through a unique intra-disciplinary perspective, it examines how the law on the use of force functions within the international legal system and how it interacts with other relevant areas of the law. This includes arms control law, the law governing the use of the international commons, the law of armed conflict and human rights law, and the law of international responsibility. It offers an accessible guide to the law on the use of force to students and practitioners, alongside providing a unique perspective on the place and function of the law on the use of force within the wider legal landscape which will appeal to both academic professionals and others interested in how law regulates the use of force.

TERRY D. GILL is Emeritus Professor of Military Law at the University of Amsterdam and is a globally recognized authority on the law of armed conflict. He is founder and co-director of the Research Program on the Law of Armed Conflict and Military Operations (LACMO) at the Amsterdam Centre for International Law and is co-convenor of the Netherlands Research Forum on the Law of Armed Conflict and Peace Operations (LACPO).

KINGA TIBORI-SZABÓ is a post-doctoral guest researcher in the Role of Law in Armed Conflict and Military Operations (LACMO) research programme. She has been publishing and conducting research on the use of force in public international law for the past two decades and has sixteen years of experience working for international criminal tribunals. Since 2023, she has been working on criminal investigations for the United Nations in Iraq. Her views expressed in this book do not necessarily reflect those of her employer.

THE USE OF FORCE AND
THE INTERNATIONAL
LEGAL SYSTEM

TERRY D. GILL
University of Amsterdam

KINGA TIBORI-SZABÓ
University of Amsterdam



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-40732-8 — The Use of Force and the International Legal System
erry D. Gill , Kinga Tibori-Szabó
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009407328

DOI: 10.1017/9781009407342

© Terry D. Gill and Kinga Tibori-Szabó 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of
relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place
without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-009-40732-8 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-40735-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

To Annelies: 'always and forever'
Terry
To my family
Kinga

CONTENTS

<i>List of Boxes</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xii
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xv

PART I Development of the Contemporary *jus ad bellum* in International Law 1

- | | | |
|---|---|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 3 |
| 2 | From Just War to the Great War | 7 |
| 3 | From the Regulation of War to the Prohibition on the Use of Force | 29 |

PART II Scope and Content of the Contemporary *jus ad bellum* 55

- | | | |
|---|--|----|
| 4 | The Prohibition on the Use or Threat of Force | 57 |
| 5 | The Use of Force in the UN Collective Security System: Maintenance and Restoration of International Peace and Security through Collective Measures | 74 |
| 6 | The Right of Self-Defence: Essence, Function, Legal Foundation, Requirements for Exercise, Scope and Modalities of Application | 94 |

PART III Controversies and Contested Justifications for the Use of Force 143

- | | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 7 | Humanitarian Intervention and the Responsibility to Protect | 145 |
| 8 | The Use of Force and the Rescue and Evacuation of Nationals | 163 |

- 9 Armed Reprisals and the Law on the Use of Force 178
- 10 The Use of Force and Weapons of Mass Destruction 198
- 11 New Technologies of Warfare and the Law on the Use of Force 228
- PART IV The Use of Force in the Wider Legal Landscape 247**
- 12 The Use of Force as an Attribute of State Sovereignty 249
- 13 The Use of Force in the International Commons 277
- 14 The Relationship of the Law on the Use of Force with the Law of Armed Conflict and Human Rights Law 315
- 15 International Responsibility for the Unlawful Use of Force: States, Organizations, Armed Groups and Individuals 347
- PART V Concluding Remarks 391**
- 16 Conclusions 393
- Bibliography* 413
- Index* 443

BOXES

Fact Boxes

2.1	Just war perspectives around the world	<i>page 8</i>
2.2	The Concert of Europe (1815–1914)	21
2.3	The <i>Caroline</i> incident (1837)	23
2.4	The <i>Alabama Claims</i>	25
3.1	The Treaty of Versailles and the League Covenant	33
3.2	Negotiating the Pact of Paris (Kellogg-Briand Pact)	38
3.3	Mid-1930s conflicts and the response of the League of Nations	42
3.4	The road to the San Francisco Conference	47
4.1	The Friendly Relations Declaration (1970) – excerpt	59
4.2	Definition of Aggression (1974) – excerpt	72
5.1	The responsibility to protect	87
5.2	UN peacekeeping	89
6.1	UNSC measures under Article 51 of the Charter	114
6.2	Imminent threat of invasion in the Nuremberg and Tokyo judgments	134
7.1	The Security Council debate on the NATO use of force in the Kosovo crisis	156
8.1	The US invasion of Panama	168
8.2	Evacuation of foreign nationals (Liberia, Albania and Lebanon)	171
8.3	The Entebbe rescue	175
9.1	The Beirut airport raid (1968)	186
9.2	Air strikes on Syria as reprisals for the use of chemical weapons	192
10.1	WMD treaties – excerpts	203
11.1	Weapon systems	229
11.2	Stuxnet	237
12.1	IDI resolution on intervention on request – excerpts	253
12.2	The Greek War of Independence (1821–1832)	263
12.3	The Hungarian Revolution (1848–1849)	264
12.4	The Soviet intervention in Afghanistan (1979–1989)	266
12.5	The U2 incident	274
13.1	Embargoes and blockades	284

13.2	Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982) – excerpts	290
13.3	The shooting down of KAL flight 007	300
13.4	Chicago Convention on Civil Aviation (1944) – excerpt	303
13.5	Article 1 of the Antarctic Treaty (1959) – excerpt	305
13.6	Outer Space Treaty (1967) – excerpt	311
14.1	The sinking of the <i>General Belgrano</i> and the relevance of the <i>jus ad bellum</i> to targeting	323
14.2	Origins of the terms (qualified) neutrality and non-belligerence	335
15.1	ARSIWA – excerpts	350
15.2	Reparations for Iraq’s invasion of Kuwait	368
15.3	Articles 8bis and 25 of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	382

Summary Boxes

2.1	Just war conditions according to Aquinas	12
2.2	Just causes according to Grotius	16
2.3	Perfect and imperfect wars	20
2.4	Important steps towards a prohibition on war	27
3.1	Article 10 of the League Covenant	35
3.2	Kellogg on the right of self-defence	40
3.3	The final adopted text of Article 2(4)	53
4.1	The main characteristics of the prohibition to use force	70
6.1	The essence of self-defence	95
6.2	The legal basis of self-defence	98
6.3	Level of an armed attack	105
6.4	Authors of an armed attack	106
6.5	Customary law requirements of self-defence	111
10.1	Main treaties on WMDs	203
10.2	Possession of nuclear weapons as an imminent threat	218
12.1	Power to consent or invite	250
13.1	Description of orbital space	306
14.1	Belligerent equality and combatant privilege	320
14.2	Distinguishing the different notions of ‘attack’	325
14.3	Necessity and proportionality in different branches of international law	330

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are grateful to our support base at the Amsterdam Center for International Law (ACIL) of the University of Amsterdam and the Law of Armed Conflict and Military Operations Research Programme within ACIL for helping to facilitate this project.

We would like to thank Mitja Ličar of DEWESoft (Slovenia) for permission to use a hypertext link to the diagram of satellites in orbit (<https://tinyurl.com/4ftkc2sk>). Likewise, we are grateful to Dr Valentin Schatz for his kind permission to use the diagram of maritime zones in Chapter 13.

We would also like to thank Marianne Nield and her colleagues at Cambridge University Press for their support and assistance in making the book accessible. A vote of thanks also goes to our copy-editor, Virginia Hamilton, for her invaluable assistance. Any shortcomings or errors are wholly our own.

TABLE OF CASES

Reports of International Arbitral Awards (RIAA)

- Alabama Claims of the United States of America against Great Britain, Award,
 14 September 1872, Vol. XXIX (RIAA), 25
- Case Concerning the Difference between New Zealand and France Concerning the
 Interpretation or Application of Two Agreements, Concluded on 9 July 1986
 between the Two States and Which Related to the Problems Arising from the
 Rainbow Warrior Affair, Decision, 30 April 1990, Vol. XX (RIAA), 354
- Ethiopia/Eritrea Claims Commission, *Jus Ad Bellum* – Ethiopia’s Claims 1–8,
 Partial Award, 19 December 2005, Vol. XXVI (RIAA), 61
- Island of Palmas Case (Netherlands, USA), Award, 4 April 1928, Vol. II (RIAA),
 126, 250, 358
- Responsabilité de l’Allemagne à raison des dommages causés dans les colonies
 portugaises du sud de l’Afrique, 31 July 1928, Vol. II (RIAA) (Naulilaa Case), 182

Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ)

- Factory at Chorzów (Jurisdiction), Judgment, 26 July 1927, Series A, No. 9,
 354, 369
- Factory at Chorzów (Merits), Judgment, 13 September 1928, Series A,
 No. 17, 354
- Phosphates in Morocco, Judgment, 1938, PCIJ Series A/B, No. 74, 349

International Court of Justice (ICJ)

- Armed Activities on the Territory of Congo (DRC v. Uganda) (Merits) Judgment,
 19 December 2005, 98, 256, 358
- Armed Activities on the Territory of Congo (Reparations) Judgment,
 9 February 2022, 363, 369
- Case Concerning Application of the Convention on the Prevention and
 Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and
 Montenegro), Judgment, 26 February 2007, 348, 357, 358
- Case Concerning the Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia),
 Judgment, 25 September 1997, 348, 354
- Certain Expenses of the United Nations (Article 17, paragraph 2, of the Charter),
 Advisory Opinion, 20 July 1962, 78

TABLE OF CASES

xiii

- Corfu Channel (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v. Albania) (Merits), Judgment, 9 April 1949, 363, 369
- Corfu Channel (United Kingdom v. Albania), Assessment of the Amount of Compensation Due from the People's Republic of Albania to the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Judgment, 15 December 1949, 66, 126, 128, 162, 184, 285, 359, 364
- Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Advisory Opinion, 9 July 2004, 257, 358
- Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, 8 July 1996, 60, 98, 189, 217
- Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States) (Merits), Judgment, 27 June 1986, 58, 60, 67, 68, 71, 97, 98, 103, 104, 106, 107, 126, 147, 188, 234, 244, 249, 251, 349, 355, 357, 358, 369
- Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America), Judgment, 6 November 2003, 71, 98, 104, 106, 117, 188, 189, 285, 287, 369
- Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom) (Preliminary Objections), Judgment, 27 February 1998, 379
- Reparation for Injuries Suffered in the Service of the United Nations, Advisory Opinion, 11 April 1949, 376
- United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (Jurisdiction and/or Admissibility), Judgment, 24 May 1980, 349

Nuremberg and Tokyo Tribunals

- Government Commissioner of the General Tribunal of the Military Government for the French Zone of Occupation in Germany, In the Case against Hermann Roehling and Others, Trials Records, Trials of War Criminals before the Nuremberg Military Tribunals under Control Council Law No. 10 (NMT), Vol. XIV, 381
- International Military Tribunal for the Far East, United States et al. v. Sadao Araki et al., Judgment, 4 November 1948, 134
- International Military Tribunal Nuremberg, United States et al. v. Hermann H. Göring et al., Judgment, 1 October 1946, 133, 134
- US Military Tribunal, United States v. Alfred Felix Alwyn Krupp von Bohlen und Halbach et al. (Krupp Case), Trial Records, NMT, Vol. IX, 381
- US Military Tribunal, United States v. Carl Krauch et al. (IG Farben Case), Trial Records, NMT, Vols. VII-VIII, 381
- US Military Tribunal, United States v. von Weizsäcker et al. (Ministries Case), Trial Records, NMT, Vol. XI, 129, 381
- US Military Tribunal, United States v. Wilhelm von Leeb et al. (High Command Case), Trial Records, NMT, Vols. X-XI, 381

Human Rights Bodies

- European Court of Human Rights, Application No. 54522/00, *Kotov v. Russia*,
Grand Chamber Judgment, 3 April 2012, 348
Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Case of Ruano Torres et al. *v. El Salvador*,
Judgment (Merits, Reparations and Costs), 5 October 2015, 348
UN Human Rights Committee, General Comment 36, Article 6 (124th Session,
2018), 326, 327, 328, 329
UN Human Rights Committee, General Comment 6, Article 6 (16th Session,
1982), 70

Other International and Domestic Courts

- ICTY, Prosecutor *v. Dusko Tadić*, Case No. IT-94-1-A, Appeals Chamber,
Appeals Judgment, 15 July 1999, 107, 358
ICTY, Prosecutor *v. Dusko Tadić*, Case No. IT-94-1-AR-72, Appeals Chamber,
Decision on Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction,
2 October 1995, 331
Supreme Court of Canada, *Re Secession of Quebec*, Judgment,
20 August 1998, 258

TABLE OF TREATIES

Pre-Charter Treaties

- Hague Convention (II) Respecting the Limitation of the Employment of Force for the Recovery of Contract Debts (18 October 1907), 26
- Hague Convention (III) Relative to the Opening of Hostilities (18 October 1907), 26
- Hague Convention (IV) Concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land (18 October 1907), 362
- Hague Convention (V) Respecting the Rights and Duties of Neutral Powers and Persons in Case of War on Land (18 October 1907), 335, 406
- Hague Convention (XIII) Concerning the Rights and Duties of Neutral Powers in Naval War (18 October 1907), 335, 406
- Covenant of the League of Nations (28 June 1919), 32, 33, 35, 36, 39, 41, 48, 150, 181, 182, 263, 394
- Treaty of Mutual Guarantee between Germany, Belgium, France, Great Britain and Italy (16 October 1925) (The Locarno Pact), 37, 41, 99, 132, 362
- Kellogg-Briand Pact (27 August 1928), 29, 38, 41, 42, 44, 48, 53, 99, 150, 183, 263, 333, 394

UN Charter

- Article 2(4), 52, 57, 60, 61, 65, 67, 76, 104, 147, 164, 183, 216, 217, 226, 234, 251, 355, 360, 384, 395
- Article 39, 70, 72, 76, 156, 218, 284, 365, 378
- Article 40, 77
- Article 41, 77, 284, 366
- Article 42, 77, 80, 91, 366, 378
- Article 51, 63, 67, 69, 71, 91, 97, 98, 102, 103, 104, 106, 108, 111, 113, 114, 116, 118, 131, 133, 184, 186, 187, 206, 209, 218, 224, 226, 325, 356, 360, 377

Post-Charter Treaties and Conventions

- Chicago Convention on Civil Aviation (7 December 1944), 271, 277, 289, 299, 300, 303, 313, 401
- (European) Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (4 November 1950), 70

- Antarctic Treaty (1 December 1959), 303, 304, 305, 307
 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (16 December 1966),
 70, 325
 Outer Space Treaty (27 January 1967), 305, 306, 308, 311, 408
 Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (1 July 1968) 202, 203, 205
 Biological Weapons Convention (10 April 1972), 202, 203
 Additional Protocol I of the Geneva Conventions (8 June 1977), 230, 316, 324,
 325, 328, 330, 362
 Law of the Sea Convention (10 December 1982), 270, 271, 275, 277, 279, 283,
 307, 313
 Chemical Weapons Convention (13 January 1993), 192, 202, 203, 204, 221
 Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons (7 July 2017), 202, 203, 205

Seminal UNGA Resolutions

- Friendly Relations Declaration (24 October 1970), 58, 59, 126, 147, 148, 184, 249,
 355, 364
 Definition of Aggression (14 December 1974), 61, 72, 107, 249, 355, 381, 382