

## THE BOUNDARIES OF BLAME

How can our criminal law retain legitimacy in an era of growing awareness about the complexities of human vulnerability and the far-reaching harm of punitive attitudes? *The Boundaries of Blame* makes a fresh contribution to the evolving scholarship on the relationship between criminal responsibility and social justice. It challenges the constricted view of personhood underpinning doctrines of responsibility, encouraging new conversations about long-standing questions on the role of circumstances like deprivation and trauma in excusing wrongdoing. Testing entrenched boundaries can provoke resistance, but the book argues that pushing past these limits is essential to fostering a more just framework of state blame in our present time and place.

To achieve this objective, Louise Kennefick proposes a bold yet pragmatic response in the form of a Universal Partial Defence, grounded in the Real Person Approach – a blueprint that offers a practical and humane pathway towards a fairer measure of criminal accountability.

Louise Kennefick is Senior Lecturer in Criminal Law at the University of Glasgow and researches across criminal law theory and criminal justice. She is a Glasgow Law Fellow and Irish Research Council Scholar, and her work appears in publications such as the *Modern Law Review* and *Criminology and Criminal Justice*.

# The Boundaries of Blame

TOWARDS A UNIVERSAL PARTIAL DEFENCE  
FOR THE CRIMINAL LAW

LOUISE KENNEFICK

University of Glasgow



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-009-38610-4 — The Boundaries of Blame  
 Louise Kennefick  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009386104](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009386104)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009386142

© Louise Kennefick 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009386142

First published 2025

Cover image: Head Fracture / Morkeman / E+ / Getty Images

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Kennefick, Louise, author.

TITLE: The boundaries of blame : towards a universal partial defence for the criminal law / Louise Kennefick, University of Glasgow.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2025005493 (print) | LCCN 2025005494 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009386104 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009386098 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009386142 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Criminal liability. | Guilt (Law) | Blame. | Criminal law. | Defense (Criminal procedure)

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K5064 .K45 2025 (print) | LCC K5064 (ebook) | DDC 345/.04-dc23/eng/20250213

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025005493>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025005494>

ISBN 978-1-009-38610-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For EU product safety concerns, contact us at Calle de José Abascal, 56, 1º, 28003 Madrid, Spain, or email [eugpsr@cambridge.org](mailto:eugpsr@cambridge.org).

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page vii</i>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
PART I PURPOSE	
1 <b>Activating the Criminal Law: Establishing the Duty to Advance Social Justice</b>	<b>9</b>
PART II PARADIGM AND PRINCIPLE	
2 <b>The Real Person Approach: Recognising Vulnerability at Culpability Evaluation</b>	<b>49</b>
3 <b>Proportionality: Recalibrating the Desert Calculus</b>	<b>79</b>
4 <b>Parsimony: Offsetting Misrecognition at Culpability Evaluation</b>	<b>107</b>
PART III PARTIAL EXCUSE (PRACTICE, DOCTRINE, AND THEORY)	
5 <b>Universality: Understanding and Expanding the Bounds of Partial Excuse</b>	<b>145</b>
6 <b>Diminished Responsibility: Exploring the Template for the UPD</b>	<b>181</b>
7 <b>Bounded Causal Theory: Rethinking the Rationale of Partial Excuse</b>	<b>216</b>

PART IV PROPOSAL

8	The Universal Partial Defence: Outlining a Blueprint for Reform	249
	Conclusion	277
	Bibliography	283
	Index	325

## Acknowledgements

It takes a village to write a monograph. I am immensely grateful to all my family, friends, and colleagues who have supported me in many different ways (knowingly and unknowingly), over years and across oceans, towards the completion of this project.

For their ongoing support and constructive comments on earlier ideas and versions, I thank my colleagues of the School of Law, University of Glasgow, and the Virtual Criminal Law Group, from whom I am always learning. I am particularly indebted to the following people for their generosity and insight in reviewing draft chapters of this book – Lindsay Farmer, Antony Duff, Sandra Marshall, Andrew Cornford, Rachel McPherson, and Thomas Crofts. My further thanks to Lindsay Farmer, who has read and discussed numerous iterations, sharing his vast knowledge of the criminal law and providing invaluable guidance and encouragement.

I was fortunate to receive excellent feedback and advice from three anonymous reviewers at an early stage in the process, and I am very grateful to them for their close reading of my proposal and sample chapters, which helped to shape the direction of the book. I have also discussed aspects of the work at seminars and conferences where I benefitted from audience discussion – the Howard League for Penal Reform (2018); the Crime, Justice and Society Seminar Series at Edinburgh Law School (2019); the Law and Society Association Annual Conference (2021); the Socio-Legal Studies Association Annual Conference (2021); and the Gerald Gordon Seminar, University of Glasgow (2022). My thanks to Jamie Haughton at the University of Glasgow for his assistance in preparing the final manuscript and bibliography, to Ruth Martin for her efficient indexing support, and to Sharon McCann and the skilled editorial and production teams at Cambridge University Press.

I have drawn on material from previously published works (as detailed in Chapters 4, 5, and 7) and am grateful to Springer Nature and Routledge for permission to do so.

Finally, I owe a special thanks to my husband, Daniel, for his kindness and encouragement, and for creating the space for me to make progress while graciously holding the fort; and to Robert and Patrick, for helping me to keep the matter of monograph writing in perspective. This book is for you, with a promise that I will never make you read it.