

Restrained Radicals

The entry of populist radical right parties into positions of power has generated anxious debate regarding the potential consequences for liberal democracy. Their activities in local government, however, have been largely overlooked. This comparative analysis of populist radical right-led local governments in Western Europe makes an important contribution to a crowded field through the study of so far uncharted terrain. Comparing cases in Austria, France, Italy and Switzerland, Fred Paxton details the extent of ideological impact in local politics and the various restraints that are placed on their radicalism. Drawing from a wealth of new data, he explains the varying degree of radicalism with recourse to two principal factors: the constraints of the local government institutional setting and the national party leaders' strategies towards the local arena. This book broadens our understanding of populist radical right parties in Western Europe and the subnational processes through which they are developing.

FRED PAXTON is a postdoctoral research fellow at the University of Milan. He was awarded his PhD at the European University Institute. His work has been published in various academic journals including *Political Science Research and Methods* and *Government and Opposition*. This is his first academic monograph.



Restrained Radicals

Populist Radical Right Parties in Local Government

FRED PAXTON
University of Milan







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009379083

DOI: 10.1017/9781009379069

© Fred Paxton 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Paxton, Fred, 1988- author.

Title: Restrained radicals: populist radical right parties in local

government / Fred Paxton, University of Milan.

Description: First edition. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2023.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023005685 | ISBN 9781009379083 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781009379069 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Local government - Europe, Western. | Political

parties – Europe, Western. | Conservatism – Europe, Western. |

Populism – Europe, Western. | Right and left (Political science) – Europe, Western.

Classification: LCC JS3000 .P39 2023 | DDC 320.8094–dc23/eng/20230501 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023005685

ISBN 978-1-009-37908-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Figures		bage vi	
Li	st of Tables	viii	
Αc	cknowledgements	X	
1	Introduction	1	
2	Going Local: Understanding the Impact of the Populist Radical Right in Local Government	25	
3	The Entry of Populist Radical Right Parties into Local Power	60	
4	Do They Make a Difference? The Policy Impact of Populist Radical Right Parties in Local Power	101	
5	Mainstreaming: The Impact of Local Power on Populist Radical Right Parties	136	
6	Laboratories or Showcases? Explaining the Varied Forms of Local Government under Populist Radical Right Mayors	171	
7	Conclusion	208	
Αţ	ppendices	227	
References		254	
In	Index		

V



Figures

1.1	Populist radical right mayors of Western European	
2.1	municipalities (2018)	page 5
	Core features of the populist radical right ideology	32
2.2	Theoretical framework of the factors that moderate the	
	radicalism of PRR party-led local government	58
3.1	Local election results of centre-left and populist radical	
	right parties	69
	Unemployment rates for locality and country	72
	Foreign-born population of locality and country	73
3.4	Results of PRR parties in national, regional and local	
	elections prior to local election victory	75
4.1	Proportion of issues mentioned by Austrian local	
	governments in policy agendas	103
4.2	Proportion of issues mentioned by Italian local	
	governments in policy agendas	105
4.3	Proportion of issues mentioned by French local	
	governments in policy agendas	107
4.4	Proportion of issues mentioned by Swiss local	
	governments in policy agendas	109
4.5	Budget spending by issue area in Wels	112
4.6	Budget spending by issue area in Cascina	115
4. 7	Budget spending by issue area in Hénin-Beaumont	116
4.8	Budget spending by issue area in Thun	119
4.9	Budget surplus and debt during period of PRR mayoralty	120
5.1	Share of issue types spoken about by Wels FPÖ	
	during council meetings	141
5.2	Share of issue types spoken about by Cascina Lega	
	during council meetings	142
5.3	Share of issue types as the subject of Thun SVP	
	council motions	144

vi



List of Figures		vii
5.4	Share of issue types in Facebook posts by	
	Hénin-Beaumont RN mayor	146
5.5	Position towards immigration in council meeting	
	speeches of Wels FPÖ	150
5.6	Position towards immigration in council meeting	
	speeches of Cascina Lega	151
5.7	Position towards immigration from Thun SVP in	
	council meeting initiatives and executive responses	152
5.8	Position towards immigration in Facebook posts by	
	Hénin-Beaumont RN mayor	153
5.9	Framing of other local parties by the Wels FPÖ	157
5.10	Framing of other local parties by the Cascina Lega	159
5.11	Framing of the Wels FPÖ by party actors themselves	164
5.12	Framing of the Cascina Lega by party actors themselves	166
7.1	PRR local election results before and after local	
	government leadership	216



Tables

	party mayor (2022)	page 6
1.2	Populist radical right parties in national government	1 0
	in Western Europe	8
1.3	Typical forms of PRR-led local government	18
	Policy issues central to core features of PRR ideology	30
	Theoretical expectations of PRR ideological content in	
	policy design of PRR mayors	34
2.3	Patterns of local democracy	40
2.4	Forms of local government leadership in Continental	
	Western Europe	42
2.5	Different forms of governance arrangements in	
	multi-level settings	55
3.1	Overview of cases	63
3.2	Patterns of local democracy	65
3.3	Hénin-Beaumont 2014 local election results	87
3.4	Cascina 2016 local election results	89
3.5	Wels 2015 local election results	90
3.6	Thun 2010 local election results	90
3.7	Portfolio allocation of PRR-led local governments	94
4.1	Overview of data and methods for Chapter 4	
	analysis of policy	102
4.2	PRR framing of immigration, security and institutional	
	reform policies	131
4.3	New policies of PRR-led local governments regarding	
	immigration/integration, security and institutional reform	
	considered for policy design analysis	132
5.1	Overview of structure for Chapter 5 analysis	
	of mainstreaming	137
5.2	Overview of data used for Chapter 5 analysis	
	of mainstreaming	137

1.1 Western European municipalities led by a PRR

viii



List	ist of Tables	
5.3	Policy issue categories in the mainstreaming	
	analysis (Chapter 6) coding scheme	140
5.4	Overview of coding scheme for analysis of immigration	
	issue position and framings	148
5.5	Overview of coding scheme for framing of	
	opposition parties	156
5.6	Overview of coding scheme for analysis of framing of	
	PRR party themselves	163
5.7	Summary of findings regarding the mainstreaming of	
	the PRR parties in local government	169
6.1	Summary of institutional constraints upon PRR local	
	government control	184
6.2	Summary of partisan linkages and their influence	
	upon PRR local government	193
6.3	Summary of responses to the migrant crisis by	
	PRR local governments	204
6.4	Overview of the change in governance arrangements in	
	Wels and Cascina due to the change in national	
	government control	206



Acknowledgements

There are many people to whom I owe sincere thanks for helping me to write this book. The idea first emerged as part of a master's thesis, begun in Vienna in 2016, and then developed into a doctoral thesis, defended at the European University Institute in 2021. First, I would like to thank my doctoral supervisor, Hanspeter Kriesi, from whom I received continuously expert guidance. I am grateful for his constant devotion to the role of a supervisor, along with his razor-sharp feedback and everpresent good humour. I would also like to thank the other members of the jury, Daniele Albertazzi, Sarah De Lange and Ellen Immergut, who gave me valuable feedback which helped to advance my thinking and the resulting work. I am also grateful to my friends and colleagues at the EUI, from whom I learnt an enormous amount over the years.

Arranging and conducting research interviews across various contexts and in several different languages was a particularly challenging part of this work. To deal with the various obstacles I faced, there are several people I would like to thank. To prepare for the interviews in Austria and Switzerland, Silke Tork and Tobias Widmann. For the interviews in Italy, Francesca Feo, Raffaele Bazzurli and Gaia Pieraccioni. For the interviews in France, Naïs Ralaison and Ann-Marie Diogo. Above all, I would like to thank all of the interviewees who gave their time to participate. This book would simply not have been possible without their input.

I would like to express my profound gratitude to Tim Peace for his contributions in conducting the French interviews. Over the course of several trips to the north and south of France we conducted fieldwork in often challenging circumstances. Despite various obstacles, these excursions were some of the most memorable and rewarding parts of the project.

I would also like to thank many people who offered their time and expertise to help me develop a close understanding of the context of these case studies. Regarding the Austrian cases, Manès Weisskircher

X



Acknowledgements

хi

and Georg Wolfmayr. For the Swiss cases, Klaus Armingeon, Laurent Bernhard, Maximilian Schubiger, Anna Storz and Philipp Lutz. For the Italian cases, Andrea Pettrachin and Pietro Castelli Gattinara. And for the French cases, Tim Peace.

To acquire the specific research techniques used in writing this book, there are a number of people I would also like to thank: Kostas Gemenis and Bastiaan Bruinsma for their quantitative text analysis course at the ECPR Winter School 2020, and Sophia Hunger and Theresa Gessler for their workshop on the same subject at the EUI.

Much of this book was prepared in the form of research papers that I presented at workshops and conferences. I am indebted to all the scholars who gave me feedback on these papers which were crucial to the development of my ideas. In so doing, they also provided the sense of a scholarly community which has sustained and encouraged me. Heartfelt thanks in particular go to: Daniele Albertazzi, Jørgen Axelsen, Ramon Bauer, Benjamin Biard, Manuela Caiani, Dorothee Bohle, Pietro Castelli Gattinara, Emile Chabal, Léonie De Jonge, Sarah De Lange, Caterina Froio, Sophia Hunger, Ellen Immergut, Ofra Klein, Marta Lorimer, Nonna Mayer, Andrea L. P. Pirro, Astrid Hauge Rambøl, Uwe Remer, Matthias Scantamburlo, Nick Schuermans, Omran Shroufi, Kristof Steyvers, Vicente Valentim, Bas Van Heur, Tobias Widmann, Manès Weisskircher, and Annika Werner.

There are many others who played a less direct contribution to this project, but one that has been no less valuable and appreciated: my family and friends, old and new. I look forward to raising a glass and expressing my gratitude to each of you in person.