Knowledge, Faith, and Early Christian Initiation

In this book, Alex Fogleman presents a new history of the rise and development of catechesis in Latin patristic Christianity by focusing on the critical relationship between teaching and epistemology. Through detailed studies of key figures and catechetical texts, he offers a nuanced account of initiation in the early Christian era to explore fundamental questions in patristic theology: What did early Christians think that it meant to know God, and how could it be taught? What theological commitments and historical circumstances undergirded the formation of the catechumenate? What difference did the Christian confession of Jesus Christ as God-made-flesh make for practices of Christian teaching? Fogleman's study provides a dynamic narrative that encompasses not only the political and social history of Christianity associated with the Constantinian shift in the fourth century, but also the modes of teaching and communication that helped to establish Christian identity. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Alex Fogleman is an assistant research professor at Baylor University's Institute for Studies of Religion, and the founding director of the Catechesis Institute. He received his Ph.D. in patristics and historical theology from Baylor University.

Knowledge, Faith, and Early Christian Initiation

ALEX FOGLEMAN Baylor University





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009377393

DOI: 10.1017/9781009377430

© Alex Fogleman 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009377430 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009377430

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

> ISBN 978-1-009-37739-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-37744-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Molly

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> ix
List of Abbreviations		
	Introduction	I
I	Knowledge, Pedagogy, and Initiation: Classical and Christian Precedents for Catechesis	19
2	Knowledge of the Real: Irenaeus of Lyons and Aesthetic Knowing	46
3	Simplicity and Power: Tertullian of Carthage and Ritual Knowing	69
4	Hiddenness and Revelation: The Hippolytan School and the Knowledge of Mystery	93
5	The Harbor on High: Cyprian of Carthage and Ecclesial Knowing	114
6	Training the Senses: Ambrose of Milan and Visual Knowing	134
7	Catechesis in Late Antique Italy: Cosmological and Apophatic Knowing	155
8	The Memory of Christ: Augustine of Hippo and the Knowledge of Love	175
9	North African Catechesis after Augustine: Knowing God in an Apocalyptic Age	198
	Conclusion: The Knowledge of Faith	210
Bibliography Index		217 253

Preface and Acknowledgments

The seeds for this project were sown many years ago when I was a graduate student at Regent College in Vancouver, BC. It was then that the now late J. I. Packer – a self-proclaimed "latter-day catechist" – was hailing a call for the renewal of catechesis. I had no idea what that meant at the time, but I have come to see his call as a prescient one. Over the years, I have heard from many thoughtful Christians who agreed with Dr. Packer's assessment that several decades – perhaps a century – of catechetical neglect had left many Christians theologically and spiritually famished. But whereas Packer's interlocuters were English Puritans, I began to take interest in the patristic tradition under the tutelage of another professor at Regent at the time, Dr. Hans Boersma. Hans introduced me to the church fathers and the sacramental ontology that saturated their writings, and I began to wonder if this might have something to do with catechesis.

Whatever fuzzy notions I then brought to doctoral studies at Baylor University were sharpened under the keen supervision of my advisor there, Dr. D. H. Williams. Dr. Williams has written several eloquent invitations for Christians today, especially from evangelical traditions, to recover the patristic tradition as part of their own heritage. But he was convinced, as I have become, that retrieval theology is a difficult labor – a labor of love, to be sure, but a difficult one nonetheless. Good retrieval demands patient attention to difficult and sometimes confusing texts – texts that one may be inclined to dismiss if one is only in search of the quick scintillating insight. Dr. Williams taught me that retrieval theology requires patience, humility, and a willingness to let the fathers speak on their own terms, to ask their own questions, before attempting to make х

Preface and Acknowledgments

grand claims about what we need to recover. I do not pretend to have acquired these virtues, but I have seen them modeled in a way I aspire to imitate.

One will thus be hard-pressed to find in what follows an explicit attempt at retrieving patristic catechesis. I make few normative claims about what Christians today should learn from this history, or how these sources should be understood as speaking to something in our present moment. I have tried, rather, to attend to a particular aspect of patristic catechesis: how Christians learn to know God. While I am convinced that there is much we can draw from this history, this book's argumentation belongs not to practical theology but to patristic and historical theology. I hope, nevertheless, that this project, in its own small laborious way, contributes something to Dr. Packer's call for a renewal of Christian catechesis.

There are many people to thank for seeing this book come to fruition. I am especially grateful for the committee that read the original dissertation that now seems to stand quite a distance removed from what appears before the reader. In addition to Dr. Williams, thanks go to David Wilhite, David Whitford, Carlos Cardoza-Orlandi, and Paul Gavrilyuk for their kind and constructive readings. David Wilhite read each chapter in advance and offered astute feedback. Paul Gavrilyuk provided the impetus to focus on theological epistemology. I am so thankful for this wonderful committee. Since then, I have been warmly welcomed into the generous and generative cadre of scholars at Baylor's Institute for Studies of Religion. I am grateful to my colleagues there, especially Byron Johnson, David Lyle Jeffrey, Philip Jenkins, Jeff Levin, Thomas Kidd, and Matthew Lee Anderson, for providing such an encouraging atmosphere for research and writing. I have also been grateful for the numerous friends - near and far - through the Catechesis Institute. Beth Conkle, Ryan Jones, Greg Peters, Joel Scandrett, and Leslie Thyberg, among others, have provided rewarding companionship in our shared labors. Beatrice Rehl at Cambridge University Press has been a wonderfully gracious editor and did so much to shepherd this book into being. My thanks to her and to the readers she solicited for their incisive comments on earlier drafts.

Many other friends and colleagues have played an instrumental part of this project. From Regent, the warm hospitality of professors and friends made the study of theology a source of great joy. I wish to thank Hans and Linda Boersma, Bruce and Carolyn Hindmarsh, and Craig and Julie Lane Gay for conversations, meals, and friendship during and since our

Preface and Acknowledgments

time there. In Waco, we have been sustained by the community of Christ Church Waco. Fr. Lee Nelson has been a great champion of catechesis from whom I have learned so much. Thanks also go to Fr. Ryan and Kristi Butler, Gideon and Anne Jeffrey, Paul and Paige Gutacker, Fr. Jonathan Kanary, Christina Lambert, Brittany McComb, Fr. Nicholas and Hannah Norman-Krause, Skylar Ray, Cody and Mary Strecker, and Sam and Cassie Young. It is hard to imagine the work of scholarship without the meals and conversations shared with this exceptional group of people. I owe a special debt of gratitude to Thomas James Breedlove. Thomas offered perceptive commentary on the arguments and stylings of this book, and he always knew when it was time to let a darling go. Brian and Lydia Dant have been the dearest of friends for many years. As our paths have crossed and re-crossed, they have always shown us the light of Christ.

Our family has been a tremendous source of encouragement. My parents, Jim and Mary Edna, have been steadfast supporters. Their home was my first and primary catechesis. I am thankful also to my brothers and their spouses, Will, Morgan, Rob, and Laura; to my in-laws, Tom and Peggy Spain; to my grandparents, Dr. Robert (d. 2021) and Ann Crawford and Jim (d. 2021) and Pat Fogleman; and to my "adopted" grandparents, Frank (d. 2012) and Eleanor Wrenn. Both my grandfathers passed away between dissertation and publication; their delight in my studies remained steadfast over the years and their memory lies close at heart.

I am most of all grateful for the blessings of family life. James, Thomas, William, and Charles make life incredibly undull, and it is hard to imagine the craft of writing without their exuberance and joy. Molly is simply the best. It has now been over ten years since we loaded the car, wrote the notes, and set out together. She believed in me from the beginning and, in a very real way, taught me how to think and write. I wouldn't have it any other way. Thank you, my love.

xi

Abbreviations

ACW	Ancient Christian Writers. New York: Paulist Press, 1946–
ANF	Ante-Nicene Fathers. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1866–72
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt (Rise and
	Decline of the Roman World)
AugStud	Augustinian Studies
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum: Series Latina. Turnhout:
	Brepols, 1954–
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum. Vienna:
	Tempsky, 1866–
FC	Fathers of the Church. Washington, DC: Catholic University
	of America Press, 1948–
GCS	Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller. Leipzig:
	Henrichs, 1891–
HTR	Harvard Theological Review
JECS	Journal of Early Christian Studies
JTS	Journal of Theological Studies
LCL	Loeb Classical Library. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University
	Press, 1912–
MA	Miscellanea Agostiniana. Rome: Tipografia Poliglotta
	Vaticana, 1930–1
NPNF	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers. Edinburgh: T&T Clark,
	1886–1900
PL	Patrologia Latina. Paris: Editions Garnier Frères, 1844-66
RBén	Revue Bénédictine
SC	Sources chrétiennes. Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1942-
SP	Studia Patristica

xiii

xiv	List of Abbreviations
SVTQ	St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly
VC	Vigiliae Christianae
WSA	Works of Saint Augustine for the 21st Century. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1990-
ZAC	Zeitschrift für antikes Christentum

This title is part of the Cambridge University Press *Flip it Open* Open Access Books program and has been "flipped" from a traditional book to an Open Access book through the program.

Flip it Open sells books through regular channels, treating them at the outset in the same way as any other book; they are part of our library collections for Cambridge Core, and sell as hardbacks and ebooks. The one crucial difference is that we make an upfront commitment that when each of these books meets a set revenue threshold we make them available to everyone Open Access via Cambridge Core.

This paperback edition has been released as part of our Open Access commitment and we would like to use this as an opportunity to thank the libraries and other buyers who have helped us flip this and the other titles in the program to Open Access.

To see the full list of libraries that we know have contributed to *Flip it Open*, as well as the other titles in the program please visit www.cambridge.org/fio-acknowledgements