

Economic Analysis of Property Rights

Third Edition

The standard neoclassical model of economics is incapable of explaining why one form of organization arises over another. It is a model where transaction costs are implicitly assumed to not exist; however, transaction costs are here defined as the costs of strengthening a given distribution of economic property rights, and they always exist. *Economic Analysis of Property Rights* is a study of how individuals organize resources to maximize the value of their economic rights over these resources. It offers a unified theoretical structure to deal with exchange, rights formation, and organization that traditional economic theory often ignores. It explains how transaction costs can be reduced through reorganization and, in the end, how the distribution of property rights that exists is the one that maximizes wealth net of these transaction costs. This necessary hypothesis explains much of the puzzling organizations and institutions that exist now and have existed in the past.

Yoram Barzel (1931–2022) was Professor Emeritus of the University of Washington. He published extensively and helped create the field of economic property rights. He published *A Theory of the State* (Cambridge, 2002), was president of the Western Economic Association in 2001, and winner of the Elinor Ostrom Lifetime Achievement Award in 2017.

Douglas W. Allen is Burnaby Mountain Professor of Economics, Simon Fraser University, British Columbia. He has contributed to the theory of transaction costs and property rights in over ninety publications. His books include *The Institutional Revolution* (Chicago, 2012) which won the Douglass North 2014 book prize.





POLITICAL ECONOMY OF INSTITUTIONS AND DECISIONS

Series Editors

Jeffry Frieden, Harvard University John Patty, Emory University Elizabeth Maggie Penn, Emory University

Founding Editors

James E. Alt, Harvard University
Douglass C. North, Washington University of St. Louis

Other books in the series

Faisal Ahmed, Conquests and Rents: A Political Economy of Dictatorship and Violence in Muslim Societies

Alberto Alesina and Howard Rosenthal, *Partisan Politics, Divided Government and the Economy*

Lee J. Alston, Thrainn Eggertsson and Douglass C. North, eds., *Empirical Studies in Institutional Change*

Lee J. Alston and Joseph P. Ferrie, Southern Paternalism and the Rise of the American Welfare State: Economics, Politics, and Institutions, 1865–1965

James E. Alt and Kenneth Shepsle, eds., *Perspectives on Positive Political Economy* Josephine T. Andrews, *When Majorities Fail: The Russian Parliament*, 1990–1993 Jeffrey S. Banks and Eric A. Hanushek, eds., *Modern Political Economy: Old Topics*, *New Directions*

Yoram Barzel, Economic Analysis of Property Rights, 2nd edition

Yoram Barzel, A Theory of the State: Economic Rights, Legal Rights, and the Scope of the State

Robert Bates, Beyond the Miracle of the Market: The Political Economy of Agrarian Development in Kenya

Jenna Bednar, The Robust Federation: Principles of Design

Adam Bonica and Maya Sen, The Judicial Tug of War: How Lawyers, Politicians, and Ideological Incentives Shape the American Judiciary

Charles M. Cameron, Veto Bargaining: Presidents and the Politics of Negative Power Erin Baggott Carter and Brett L. Carter, Propaganda in Autocracies: Institutions, Information, and the Politics of Belief

Kelly H. Chang, Appointing Central Bankers: The Politics of Monetary Policy in the United States and the European Monetary Union

Tom S. Clark The Supreme Court: An Analytical History of Constitutional Decision Making

Mark Copelovitch and David A. Singer, Banks on the Brink: Global Capital, Securities Markets, and the Political Roots of Financial Crises

(Continued on page following index)





Economic Analysis of Property Rights

Third Edition

YORAM BARZEL

University of Washington

DOUGLAS W. ALLEN

Simon Fraser University, British Columbia







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009374736

DOI: 10.1017/9781009374712

First and Second editions © Yoram Barzel 1997 Third edition © Yoram Barzel and Douglas W. Allen 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

Third edition published 2023 First edition published 1989 Second edition published 1997 Reprinted 1999, 2000, 2003, 2005

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Barzel, Yoram, author. | Allen, Douglas W., author.

TITLE: Economic analysis of property rights / Yoram Barzel, University of Washington,

Douglas W. Allen, Simon Fraser University, British Columbia.

Description: Third edition. | New York, NY: Cambridge University Press,

2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023007396 (print) | LCCN 2023007397 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009374736 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009374712 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Property. | Right of property.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HB701 .B37 2023 (print) | LCC HB701 (ebook) |

DDC 330.1/7-dc23/eng/20230602

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023007396

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023007397

ISBN 978-1-009-37473-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-37472-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Lis	t of Figures	page ix
	t of Tables	xi
Pre	face to the Third Edition	xiii
Pre	face to the Second Edition	XV
Pre	face to the First Edition	xvii
P A	RT I: CONCEPTUAL ISSUES	I
Ι	The Neoclassical Problem	3
2	Economic Property Rights	14
3	Transaction Costs	33
4	Information Costs	50
5	The Theory of Economic Property Rights	64
PΑ	RT II: CONTRACTS, ORGANIZATIONS, AND INSTITUTIONS	5 79
6	Exchange, Contracts, and Contract Choice	81
7	Divided Ownership and Organization	110
8	Institutions	135
P A	RT III: ESTABLISHING PROPERTY RIGHTS	159
9	Capture in the Public Domain	161
10	Forming Property Rights	181
ΙΙ	Benefits of the Public Domain	205
P A	RT IV: NON-PRICE ALLOCATION AND OTHER ISSUES	217
12	Nonwage Labor Markets	219
13	Property Rights in Non-market Allocations	232

vii



viii	Contents
14 Additional Property Rights Applications	243
15 The Property Rights Model	254
References	261
Index	273



Figures

I.I	Ownership and optimal allocation	page 7
2.1	Different definitions of property rights	20
3.1	Wealth and property right perfection I	37
3.2	Wealth and property right perfection II	38
3.3	Optimal property right strength	42
3.4	Crude divorce rate 1922–2008, Canada	46
	Sales for a given distribution of tastes	52
6.1	The effect of a tax on the level of farm labor	86
6.2	The transfer of wealth from sharing	87
6.3	Transaction costs of land rental contract	90
6.4	Fixing a complementary attribute level	94
8.1	The institution of marriage	145
9.1	Demands as functions of prices or time	163
9.2	Individual and market demands in terms of time	165
9.3	Racing equilibrium	169
9.4	Heterogeneous land qualities	170
9.5	Simple price control	172
	Price control, heterogeneous waiting costs	173
	Minimizing dissipation	179
10.1	Forming private property	189
10.2	Private property and imperfection	190
10.3	Optimal value of good	194
II.I	Homesteader arrival, with/without railroad arrival	209
	Homestead arrivals by year	215
12.1	Slave Labor Supply	224

ix





Tables

3.1 Joint values married and divorced: Efficient marriage	page 45
3.2 Joint values married and divorced: Inefficient marriage	48
4.1 Examples of variability and alterability	54





Preface to the Third Edition

When I wrote the first edition of *Economic Analysis of Property Rights* in the mid-1980s, I was Douglas Allen's PhD supervisor. He had been taught as an undergraduate by another former student – Chris Hall – and had arrived in Seattle already well versed in the University of Washington School of Property Rights thought. We met in the spring of 1985 after I returned from a sabbatical in Israel, and we have been friends, colleagues, and co-authors ever since.

Doug was heavily involved (and thanked) in the first edition of the book. He read every page and critically commented on my ideas. At the time he was formulating his own ideas on transaction costs, and his 1988 thesis explicitly linked these costs with the concept of property rights for the first time (later published in Allen, 1991a). He has gone on to publish over ninety articles utilizing the economic property rights approach, and he has published two significant books demonstrating how operational it is: *The Nature of the Farm* (with my former student Dean Lueck) and *The Institutional Revolution* (which won the Douglass North prize).

It was only natural, then, that I would ask Doug to help with a third edition of the book. I asked ten years ago, but it took some time for him to relent. The result is a significant change from the second edition. The book has doubled in size and so the number of chapters. Much of this additional material is up front, where we now spend five chapters developing the fundamental ideas behind an economic analysis of property rights. Every chapter has new material, and there is a new chapter on the relationship between property rights and institutions.

One thing that has not changed is the target audience. Like the first two editions, there has been an attempt to "appeal both to those with little training in economics and to specialists." For students in both economics and related fields, the mostly verbal text should allow easy access. For those well versed in institutional economics, the detailed discussion of fundamental property

xiii



xiv

Preface to the Third Edition

right ideas and the linkage of these ideas to the concepts of organizations and institutions should also provide some utility.

We would like to thank Lee Alston, David Friedman, Jonathan Greenacre, Avner Greif, D. Bruce Johnsen, Ennio Piano, and last (but never least) John Wallis for all of their comments. We might not always agree, but everyone helped us in articulating our own ideas better. Special thanks are due to Aurora Stephany (MA, Economics, University of Washington) for her extensive discussions with Barzel on the theory of information and the marriage contract.



Preface to the Second Edition

Since the publication of the first edition of this book, I have continued to conduct research regarding economic organization and political economy. This work is reflected primarily in Chapters 5 and 6 of the current edition. I have also separated the discussion of divided ownership from that of the firm. The former now occupies Chapter 4, whereas in Chapter 5, I offer new thoughts on the latter. In Chapter 6, I briefly speculate on the emergence of property rights and the state.

Teaching property rights courses over the last few years has led me to discover in the first edition some errors, many ambiguities, and several instances that call for elaboration. I have attempted to correct the mistakes, clarify the exposition, and elaborate when necessary. I have also added a number of illustrations, some of which derive from new research on property rights.

I wish to thank Dean Lueck, who read the entire manuscript, for his helpful comments; my daughter Tamar, for enlivening the presentation and protecting the English language; and the Earhart Foundation for its generous financial support.





Preface to the First Edition

The intellectual content of "property rights," a term that has enchanted and occasionally mesmerized economists, seems to lie within the jurisdiction of the legal profession. Consistent with their imperialist tendencies, however, economists have also attempted to appropriate it. Both disciplines can justify their claims, since the term is given different meanings on different occasions. Perhaps economists should initially have coined a term distinct from the one used for legal purposes, but by now the cost of doing so is too high. I attempt, however, to make clear the meaning I give to "property rights" and to demonstrate why property rights so defined are an appropriate subject for economic analysis.

The material of the book is at the heart of a course I have taught in recent years. Undergraduate students take my approach in stride. Graduate students often vigorously resist my dissatisfaction with the zero transaction costs model; converting them is, however, rewarding. This book is influenced by the diverse classroom reactions. It is an attempt to appeal both to those with little training in economics and to specialists.

I am grateful to my former students Douglas Allen and Dean Lueck and to my colleague Paul Heyne, who read early drafts of the book and forced me to reformulate many of my ideas and to clarify their presentation. Douglass North, who supported the project from its infancy, also read the entire manuscript and made numerous valuable suggestions. Victor Goldberg and Levis Kochin provided useful comments as well. I also thank Elizabeth Case and my daughter Tamar for excellent editing; they demonstrated that clear writing enhances clear thinking. Finally, I wish to thank the Earhart Foundation for financial support.

xvii

