

## CONCEPTUALISING CONCEPTS IN GREEK PHILOSOPHY

Concepts are basic features of rationality. Debates surrounding them have been central to the study of philosophy in the medieval and modern periods, as well as in the analytical and Continental traditions. This is a collection of seminal philosophical studies on ancient Greek approaches to the various notions of concept, exploring the early history of conceptual theory and associated philosophical debates from the end of the archaic age to the end of antiquity. It asks when and how various notions of concept emerged and evolved in the authors from the pre-classical to the post-classical periods, what questions were raised by ancient philosophers in the Greco-Roman tradition about concepts, and what were the theoretical presuppositions that made the emergence of notions of concept possible. The volume furthers our own contemporary understanding of the nature of concepts, concept formation, and concept use.

GÁBOR BETEGH is Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Christ's College. He is the author of *The Derveni Papyrus: Cosmology, Theology and Interpretation* (Cambridge, 2004) and co-editor of *Cicero's De Finibus: Philosophical Approaches* (with J. Annas) (Cambridge, 2015).

VOULA TSOUNA is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Santa Barbara, President of the Society for Ancient Greek Philosophy, and member of the Scientific Committee of the Fondation Hardt. She is the author of *The Epistemology of the Cyrenaic School* (Cambridge, 1998), *The Ethics of Philodemus* (2007), and *Plato's Charmides: An Interpretative Commentary* (Cambridge, 2022), and co-author of *[Philodemus] [On Choices and Avoidances]* (Bibliopolis, 1995), which received the Theodor Mommsen Award.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-36957-2 — Conceptualising Concepts in Greek Philosophy  
Edited by Gábor Betegh , Voula Tsouna  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

CONCEPTUALISING  
CONCEPTS IN  
GREEK PHILOSOPHY

EDITED BY  
GÁBOR BETEGH  
*University of Cambridge*  
VOULA TSOUNA  
*University of California, Santa Barbara*



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-36957-2 — Conceptualising Concepts in Greek Philosophy  
Edited by Gábor Betegh , Voula Tsouna  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009369572](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009369572)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009369596

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-009-36957-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

## *Contents*

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction <span style="float: right;">I</span>	
<i>Gábor Betegh and Voula Tsouna</i>	
1 The Emergence of the Concept in Early Greek Philosophy <span style="float: right;">16</span>	
<i>André Laks</i>	
2 The Place of Concepts in Socratic Inquiry <span style="float: right;">35</span>	
<i>Terence Irwin</i>	
3 Early Learning in Plato, <i>Republic</i> 7 <span style="float: right;">56</span>	
<i>James Warren</i>	
4 Are Platonic Forms Concepts? <span style="float: right;">74</span>	
<i>David Sedley</i>	
5 Do Forms Play the Role of Concepts in Late Plato? <span style="float: right;">96</span>	
<i>Lesley Brown</i>	
6 Concepts and Concept Formation in Aristotle's Logical Works <span style="float: right;">119</span>	
<i>Richard McKirahan</i>	
7 Concepts and Universals in Aristotle's Metaphysical Thought <span style="float: right;">147</span>	
<i>Christof Rapp</i>	
8 Aristotle on the Stages of Cognitive Development <span style="float: right;">178</span>	
<i>Thomas Kjeller Johansen</i>	
9 Epicureans on Preconceptions and Other Concepts <span style="float: right;">203</span>	
<i>Gábor Betegh and Voula Tsouna</i>	

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
10	The Stoics on Conceptions and Concepts <i>Katerina Ierodiakonou</i>	237
11	Doing Things with Concepts in Sextus Empiricus <i>Richard Bett</i>	259
12	Relative Concepts <i>Matthew Duncombe</i>	285
13	Concepts in Greek Mathematics <i>Reviel Netz</i>	307
14	Platonist Notions and Forms <i>Mauro Bonazzi</i>	330
15	Contested Concepts: Plutarch's <i>On Common Conceptions</i> <i>Thomas Bénatouïl</i>	345
16	Alexander of Aphrodisias on Concepts <i>Frans A.J. de Haas</i>	368
17	Plotinus on Concepts <i>Sara Magrin</i>	384
18	Concepts in the Neoplatonist Tradition <i>Péter Lautner</i>	404
19	Early Christian Philosophers on Concepts <i>George Karamanolis</i>	427
	<i>Bibliography</i>	452
	<i>Index</i>	476

## *Contributors*

THOMAS BÉNATOUÏL is Professor of Ancient Philosophy University of Lille, CNRS, UMR 8163-STL.

GÁBOR BETEGH is Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Fellow of Christ's College, University of Cambridge.

RICHARD BETT is Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Classics at Johns Hopkins University.

MAURO BONAZZI is Professor in the History of Ancient and Medieval Philosophy at the University of Utrecht.

LESLEY BROWN is Emeritus member of the Philosophy Faculty, University of Oxford.

MATTHEW DUNCOMBE is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Nottingham.

FRANS A. J. DE HAAS is Professor of Ancient and Medieval Philosophy at the University of Leiden.

KATERINA IERODIAKONOU is Associate Professor of Ancient and Byzantine Philosophy at University of Geneva and Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens.

TERENCE IRWIN is Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Oxford and Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at Cornell University.

THOMAS KELLER JOHANSEN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo.

GEORGE KARAMANOLIS is Associate Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Vienna.

RICHARD MCKIRAHAN is Edwin Clarence Norton Professor of Classics and Professor of Philosophy at Pomona College, and Visiting Professor of Philosophy at the University of California–Santa Barbara

ANDRÉ LAKS is Professor of Ancient Philosophy Emeritus at Université Paris-Sorbonne and Professor of Ancient Philosophy at Universidad Panamericana.

PÉTER LAUTNER is Professor of Philosophy at Pazmany Peter Catholic University.

SARA MAGRIN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh.

REVIEL NETZ is Patrick Suppes Professor of Greek Mathematics and Astronomy at Stanford University.

CHRISTOF RAPP is Professor at Ludwig Maximilian University, Munich.

DAVID SEDLEY is Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy Emeritus at the University of Cambridge.

VOULA TSOUNA is UCSB Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of California–Santa Barbara.

JAMES WARREN is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Corpus Christi College.

## *Preface*

The conception, planning, and editorship of this volume have been from the very start a joint project. It has been motivated by philosophical interests that we share and by our common perception of a glaring gap in the study of Greek and Latin philosophical texts. Both of us, independently of each other, have been engaged over the years with contemporary work in the philosophy of mind and, in particular, concepts. Both of us were struck by the vast tensions between rival accounts of concept formation, the disagreements regarding the psychological mechanisms involved in the acquisition and use of different sorts of concepts, and the debates over the epistemology of concepts and the relation between concepts and language in contemporary as well as Greco-Roman philosophy. While we benefitted from valuable publications on such topics, many questions, we thought, remained unanswered, and a comprehensive study was still missing from the secondary literature in Greco-Roman philosophy.

We had many opportunities to discuss these matters in professional as well as in private settings, thus pursuing a philosophical dialogue and an intellectual and personal companionship that stretches back to the years of our graduate studies and the training that we both received in Paris from Jacques Brunschwig and, subsequently, in the Cambridge Faculty of Classics from the specialists in Ancient Philosophy active at that time. The idea of preparing together a collection of essays exploring ancient Greek approaches to the concept of concept (or, more precisely, different concepts of concept) presented itself naturally and quite spontaneously in one of these conversations. In light of what seemed to be the *status questionis*, we agreed that an effort should be made to fill an important lacuna in the relevant scholarship. We began planning the volume in Cambridge, in Lent term of 2016, and we issued invitations to our prospective authors over the course of the next few months.

The completion of the volume took approximately six years plus an additional year devoted to the final revisions taking into consideration the



comments made by the anonymous referees. This stretch of time is not especially surprising for a work of such complexity, magnitude, and scope. But perhaps the main reason why the preparation of the manuscript took so long to be completed was our determination to do all the editorial work together rather than in parallel with each other. We are still convinced that this was the best way of giving substantial comments to our authors and of preserving a certain level of unity and consistency throughout the volume. We composed the Introduction and our chapter ‘Epicurean Preconceptions and Other Concepts’ in a similar way: this is genuinely joint writing, not parallel writing.

In addition to reducing the number of stylistic disparities and conceptual tensions between the different chapters, the primary benefit of our method of working undoubtedly derived from our direct and sustained philosophical interactions over the ideas, contentions, arguments, and interpretations advanced by our authors or indeed ourselves. We regret that the participants did not have the opportunity to interact in person with each other and with ourselves in the context of a common venue. We planned to hold a conference about half way through the preparation of the volume at which the contributors could have presented and discussed the first drafts, but this conference never materialised for reasons outside our control.

All in all, this has been a unique and marvellous intellectual journey, and it is time to express our gratitude to those that made it possible. Our first thanks are due, of course, to the authors who participated in the volume for their outstandingly valuable contributions as well as their patience, flexibility, and collegiality. We could not have had a more fruitful and felicitous experience as editors, and we are very grateful to them all. We owe a special debt to David Sedley for advice on practical and procedural matters and for the loving support that he so characteristically and generously gave. We are obliged to Paul Kalligas for his input on the structure of the volume, especially the part concerning Platonism. Our students and colleagues, at the Cambridge Faculty of Classics and at UCSB respectively, have been an inexhaustible source of information, inspiration, and constructive criticism. Of particular importance for the philosophical relevance of our project were two reading groups on concepts and concept-formation organised by UCSB graduate students and attended by members of the faculty as well. They showed us the way towards the most recent literature on the subject, facilitated our deeper engagement with the relevant philosophical issues, and enabled us to better situate ancient and modern views in relation, comparison, or contrast with each other.

*Preface*

xi

Moreover, we warmly thank the anonymous referees for their detailed and helpful comments and criticisms, which led to substantial revisions of the form and the contents of the collection.

We presented penultimate versions of our own chapter on the Epicurean approach to concepts at a conference held by Alex Long at the University of St Andrews (April 2022) and a conference organised by Stéphane Marchand and Pierre-Marie Morel at the University of Paris I - Panthéon Sorbonne (September 2022). We thankfully acknowledge the feedback we received at those events for our own paper. At the end of the conference in Paris, and after a last day of joint work, we sent off the complete manuscript from Le Rostand, a café across from the Jardin du Luxembourg in the Quartier Latin, familiar to us from our student years and still special to us both.

We extend our warmest thanks for Michael Sharp for his unparalleled expertise and diligence, his wise guidance and advice, and his unstinting support of this project. Also, many thanks to Katie Idle for all her help, to Angela Roberts for the copy-editing, and to Franklin Mathews Jebaraj for the general management of the production of the book.

We have debts of a different kind as well, though no less important. Apart from the hours, days, and indeed, months spent on zoom, we did our most productive writing and editing in the summers, in Voula and Richard's country home in Galaxidi, often in the company of our respective families. We are profoundly grateful to our spouses, Ági and Richard, and our children – Juli, Zsófi, and Eleni – for graciously putting up with our long hours of work and for the gift of their presence, company, and good spirits. Our co-authored chapter is dedicated to them, with all our love.

## *Abbreviations*

### **Aëtius**

*Plac.*     *Placita*

### **Anon. in Theaet.**

Anonymi Commentarius *In Platonis Theaetetum*

### **Albinus**

*Albin.*     Albinus  
*Prolog.*     *Prologos*

### **Alcinous**

*Alc.*     Alcinous  
*Did.*     *Didaskalikos*

### **Alexander of Aphrodisias**

*Alex.*     Alexander of Aphrodisias  
*De an.*     *De anima*  
*Eth. Probl.*     *Ethical problems*  
*in Metaph.*     *In Aristotelis Metaphysica Commentaria*  
*in Sens.*     *In librum de sensu commentarium*  
*in Top.*     *In Aristotelis Topicorum libros octo commentaria*  
*Mantissa*     *De anima libri mantissa*

*List of Abbreviations*

xiii

*Mixt.*            *De Mixtione*  
*Quaest.*        *Quaestiones*

**Ammonius**

*In Porph. Isag.*    *In Porphyrii isagogen sive quinque voces*

**Aristotle**

*Arist.*            *Aristotle*  
*An. post.*        *Analytica Posteriora*  
*An. pr.*          *Analytica Priora*  
*Cael*            *De Caelo*  
*Cat.*            *Categoriae*  
*De an.*          *De Anima*  
*De insomn.*      *De insomniis*  
*Eth. Eud.*        *Ethica Eudemia*  
*Eth. Nic.*        *Ethica Nicomachea*  
*Gen. an.*        *De generatione animalium*  
*Gen. corr.*      *De generatione et corruptione*  
*Hist. an.*        *Historia animalium*  
*Int.*            *De Interpretatione*  
*Mem.*          *De Memoria*  
*Mete.*          *Meteorologica*  
*Metaph.*        *Metaphysica*  
*Part. an.*        *De Partibus Animalium*  
*Ph.*            *Physica*  
*Resp.*          *De Respiratione*  
*Top.*            *Topica*

**Asclepius**

*in Metaph.*      *In Aristotelis Metaphysica Commentaria*

**Augustine**

*De civ. D.*      *De civitate Dei*

xiv

*List of Abbreviations***Basil***C. Eun.*     *Contra Eunomium***CAG***Commentaria in Aristotelem Graeca***Cicero**

<i>Cic.</i>	Cicero
<i>Acad.</i>	<i>Academicae quaestiones</i>
<i>Acad. post.</i>	<i>Academica posteriora</i>
<i>Acad. Pr.</i>	<i>Academica priora</i>
<i>Fin.</i>	<i>De finibus</i>
<i>Luc.</i>	<i>Lucullus = Academica posteriora</i>
<i>Nat. D.</i>	<i>De Natura deorum</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topica</i>
<i>Tusc.</i>	<i>Tusculanae disputationes</i>

**Clement of Alexandria***Strom.*     *Stromata***Damascius**

<i>in Phaed.</i>	<i>In Phaedonem</i>
<i>in Phil.</i>	<i>In Philebum</i>
<i>Princ.</i>	<i>De principiis</i>

**David***in Porph. Isag.*     *In Porphyrii isagogen commentarium***Dexippus***in Cat.*     *In Aristotelis categorias commentarium*

*List of Abbreviations*

xv

**Diodorus Siculus**

Diod. Sic. Diodorus Siculus

**Diogenes Laertius**

Diog. Laert. Diogenes Laertius

**Diogenes of Oinoanda**

NF New Fragment(s) of Diogenes' inscription

**DK**H. Diels and W. Kranz, *Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker* (Berlin, 1934–7; 5th ed.)**Epicurus**

Epic. Epicurus  
*Ep. Hdt.* *Epistula ad Herodotum*  
*Ep. Men.* *Epistula ad Menoeceum*  
*Nat.* *On nature*  
*RS* *Ratae sententiae*

**Epictetus**

Epict. Epictetus  
*Diss.* *Dissertationes ab Arriano digestae*

**Erotianus**

*Glossarii Hippocr. praef.* *Erotiani Vocum Hippocraticarum collectio*

**Euripides**

*Phoen.* *Phoenissae*

**Eusebius**

*Praep. evang.*     *Praeparatio evangelica*

**Galen**

*De opt. doct.*     *De optima doctrina*  
*Dig. Puls.*     *De dignoscendis pulsibus*  
*Hipp. Epid.*     *In Hippocratis epidemiarum commentarii*  
*Plac. Hipp. et Plat.*     *De placitis Hippocratis et Platonis*

**[Galen]**

*Def. Med.*     *Definitiones medicae*

**Gregory of Nyssa**

*C. Eun.*     *Contra Eunomium*  
*De hom. opif.*     *De hominis opificio*

**Homer**

*Od.*     *Odyssey*

**Iamblichus**

*Comm. M.*     *De communi mathematica Scientia liber*

**LM**

A. Laks and G. W. Most, *Early Greek Philosophy*. 9 volumes. Loeb Classical Library, 524–532. Cambridge, MA; London: Harvard University Press, 2016.

**LS**

A. A. Long and D. N. Sedley, 1987, *The Hellenistic Philosophers*, 2 vols. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

*List of Abbreviations*

xvii

**Lucretius**

Lucr.      Lucretius  
*DRN*      *De Rerum Natura*

**Loeb**

Loeb Classical Library

**LSJ**

H. Liddell, R. Scott, and H. Jones, *A Greek-English Lexicon* (Oxford, 1940; 9th ed.)

**Nemesius**

*De nat. hom.*      *De natura hominis*

**Origen**

*C. Cels.*      *Contra Celsum*  
*Hom. Jer.*      *Homiliae in Jeremiam*  
*In Joh.*      *Commentarii in evangelium Joannis*  
*Princ.*      *De Principiis*

**Philodemus**

Phld.      Philodemus  
*Ad*      [...] *Ad*  
*De poem.*      *De poematis*  
*De oec.*      *De oeconomia*  
*Piet*      *De pietate*  
*Rhet.*      *De rhetorica*  
*Sign.*      *De signis*

**Papyri Herculenses**

*PHerc.*      *Papyri Herculenses*



**Philoponus**

<i>in An. post.</i>	<i>In Aristotelis Analytica posteriora commentaria</i>
<i>in Cat.</i>	<i>In Aristotelis Categoriae commentaria</i>
<i>in De an.</i>	<i>In Aristotelis De anima libros commentaria</i>

**Pindar**

<i>Ol.</i>	<i>Olympian Odes</i>
------------	----------------------

**Plato**

<i>Plat.</i>	<i>Plato</i>
<i>Chrm.</i>	<i>Charmides</i>
<i>Cra.</i>	<i>Cratylus</i>
<i>Cri.</i>	<i>Critias</i>
<i>Grg.</i>	<i>Gorgias</i>
<i>Hp. Mai.</i>	<i>Hippias maior</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistles</i>
<i>Euthphr.</i>	<i>Euthyphro</i>
<i>Euthyd.</i>	<i>Euthydemus</i>
<i>Lach.</i>	<i>Laches</i>
<i>Phd.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Phdr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
<i>Phlb.</i>	<i>Philebus</i>
<i>Plt.</i>	<i>Politicus</i>
<i>Parm.</i>	<i>Parmenides</i>
<i>Prt.</i>	<i>Protagoras</i>
<i>Resp.</i>	<i>Respublica</i>
<i>Soph.</i>	<i>Sophist</i>
<i>Symp.</i>	<i>Symposium</i>
<i>Tht.</i>	<i>Theaetetus</i>
<i>Tim.</i>	<i>Timaeus</i>

**Plotinus**

<i>Plot.</i>	<i>Plotinus</i>
<i>Enn.</i>	<i>Enneades</i>

*List of Abbreviations*

xix

**Plutarch**

Plut.	Plutarch
<i>Adv. Col.</i>	<i>Adversus Colotem</i>
<i>Comm. not.</i>	<i>De communibus notitiis</i>
<i>De E.</i>	<i>De E apud Delphos</i>
<i>De sera num. vind.</i>	<i>De sera numinis vindicta</i>
<i>De soll. an.</i>	<i>De sollertia animalium</i>
<i>Non posse</i>	<i>Non Posse Suaviter Vivi Secundum Epicurum</i>
<i>Stoic. rep.</i>	<i>De Stoicorum repugnantiiis</i>

**Michigan Papyri**

<i>PMich.</i>	<i>Michigan Papyri</i>
---------------	------------------------

**Porphyry**

Porph.	Porphyry
<i>Abst.</i>	<i>De abstinentia</i>
<i>Ad Marc.</i>	<i>Ad Marcellam</i>
<i>in Cat.</i>	<i>In Aristotelis Categorias commentaria</i>
<i>in Ptol. Harm.</i>	<i>Commentarius in Claudii Ptolemaei Harmonica</i>

**Pseudo-Alexander of Aphrodisias**

Ps-Alex.	Pseudo-Alexander of Aphrodisias
<i>in Metaph.</i>	<i>In Aristotelis Metaphysica Commentaria</i>

**Pseudo-Archytas**

Ps.-Archyt.	Pseudo-Archytas
<i>De int.</i>	<i>On intellect and sense perception</i>

**Proclus**

<i>El. Theol.</i>	<i>Elementatio theologica</i>
<i>in Alc.</i>	<i>in Platonis Alcibiadem priorem commentarii</i>
<i>in Crat.</i>	<i>In Platonis Cratylum commentaria</i>
<i>in Eucl.</i>	<i>in primum Euclidis elementorum librum commentarii</i>
<i>in Parm.</i>	<i>In Platonis Parmenidem commentaria</i>

xx

*List of Abbreviations*

*in Remp.*      *In Platonis Rempublicam commentarii*  
*in Tim.*        *In Platonis Timaeum commentarii*  
*Theol. Plat.*   *Theologia Platonica*

**ROT**

J. Barnes, ed. *Complete Works of Aristotle, 2 vol.: The Revised Oxford Translation*. Princeton University Press, 1984.

**Seneca**

*Ep.*      *Epistulae*

**Sextus Empiricus**

*Sext. Emp.*      Sextus Empiricus  
*M.*                *Adversus mathematicos*  
*PH.*               *Pyrrhoniae Hypotyposes*

**Simplicius**

*Simpl.*          Simplicius  
*in Phys.*        *in Aristotelis Physicorum Libros Quattuor Posteriores*  
                          *Commentaria*  
*in Cat.*         *In Aristotelis Categorias commentaria*

**SVF**

H. von Arnim, *Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta*, I–III (Leipzig, 1903–5; vol. iv, index, compiled by M. Adler, 1924.

**Syrianus**

*in Metaph.*      *In Aristotelis Metaphysica Commentaria*

**Theophrastus**

*Theophr.*        Theophrastus  
*Sens.*             *De sensibus*