Theistic Evolution

In this book, Mariusz Tabaczek develops a contemporary, reimagined proposal of an Aristotelian-Thomistic perspective on theistic evolution. Deeply rooted in classical philosophy and theology, the volume combines careful textual analysis of ancient, medieval, and contemporary literature with innovative, original, and constructive argumentation and modelling. Tabaczek offers a wide-ranging set of arguments on behalf of those who advocate for the relevance of classical philosophical and theological thought in the context of contemporary science and the dialogue between science and religion. Avoiding simplistic answers to complex questions concerning the origin of species, including the human species, his book inspires critical thinking and a systematic approach to all major philosophical presuppositions and both philosophical and theological repercussions of the theory of evolution. Without contradicting or abandoning the letter of the tradition, Tabaczek echoes the spirit of Aristotle’s and Aquinas’s philosophy and theology, moving them forward to embrace the evolutionary aspect of the contemporary view of reality.

Mariusz Tabaczek, O.P., is a friar preacher, professor of theology, and member of the Thomistic Institute at the Pontifical University of Saint Thomas Aquinas in Rome. He is the author of *Emergence: Towards a New Metaphysics and Philosophy of Science* (2019) and *Divine Action and Emergence: An Alternative to Panentheism* (2021).
Theistic Evolution

A Contemporary Aristotelian-Thomistic Perspective

MARIUSZ TABACZEK

Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas, Rome
To my family
You must let me thank you for the pleasure which the Introduction to the Aristotle book [Parts of Animals] has given me. I have rarely read anything which has interested me more, though I have not read as yet more than a quarter of the book proper. From quotations which I had seen, I had a high notion of Aristotle’s merits, but I had not the most remote notion what a wonderful man he was. Linnaeus and Cuvier have been my two gods, though in very different ways, but they were mere schoolboys to old Aristotle.


Throughout all our efforts, in every dramatic struggle between old and new views, we recognize the eternal longing for understanding: the ever-firm belief in the harmony of our world, continuously strengthened by increasing obstacles to comprehension.

Albert Einstein and L. Infeld, The Evolution of Physics
Contents

List of Figures page x
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xii
List of Abbreviations xv

Introduction
Evolutionary Biology 1
Aristotelian–Thomistic Metaphysics 2
Thomistic Theology of Creation 12
The Plan of the Project 14

1 Metaphysics of Evolutionary Transitions 18
Hylomorphic Notion of a Living Being 19
Substantial Unity of a Living Being and Virtual Presence of Its Parts 26
Disposition of Matter and Levels of Potentiality 28
Matter as Striving for Perfection – Scala Naturae 31
Metaphysics of Evolutionary Transitions 34
The Principle of Proportionate Causation and Evolution 42
Conclusion 55

2 Essentialist and Hylomorphic Notion of Species and Species Transformation 57
Nominalism versus Realism about Species 58
Debate over Species Concepts 61
Relational Species Concepts 62
Intrinsic Species Concepts 71
Classifying Species under Higher Taxa 88
Conclusion 91
## Contents

3 Natural Selection, Teleology, and Chance in Evolution
   Natural Selection, Teleology, and Chance in Evolution 92
   Classical Notion of Teleology 95
   Aristotle on Teleology and Chance 99
   Aquinas on Teleology and Chance 104
   Natural Selection in Aristotle and Aquinas 105
   Contemporary Debate on Teleology 107
   Evolution and the Interplay of Teleology and Chance 123
   Conclusion 125

4 Aquinas’s Account of Creation
   Augustine’s Account of Creation 127
   The Meaning of Rationes Seminales 131
   Augustine’s Creation Theology as Evolutionary 135
   Aquinas’s Philosophical Theology of Creation 137
   Aquinas on the Three Stages of the Work of the Six Days 147
   Aquinas’s Use of Augustine’s Notion of Rationes Seminales 149
   Evolutionary Redefinition of the Concept of Rationes Seminales 154
   Conclusion 155

5 Aquinas and Evolution
   Aquinas on the Emergence of New Species 156
   Thomistic Version of Theistic Evolutionism 156
   A Response to an Objection 169
   Conclusion 176

6 Evolution and Creation
   The Meaning of Theistic Evolutionism 178
   God as Creating through Evolution 180
   Thomistic Notion of God Creating through Evolution 185
   “Theistic Evolutionism” versus “Evolutionary Creationism” 187
   Distinctiveness of Creation 189
   Creation and Evolution 198
   Conclusion 200

7 Concurrence of Divine and Created Causes in Evolutionary Transitions
   Concurrence of Divine and Created Causes in Evolutionary Transitions 201
   Divine Action 202
   Secondary Causation in Theistic Evolution Outside of Thomistic Circles 204
   Secondary Causation in Theistic Evolution within Thomistic Circles 207
   Concurrence of Divine and Natural Causes in Begetting Offspring 212
   Concurrence of Divine and Natural Causes in an Evolutionary Transformation 216
   The Question of Unity of Immanent Cause(s) in an Evolutionary Transformation 219
   Conclusion 220
Contents

ix

8 Theological Anthropogenesis and Evolution 222
   Aristotelian-Thomistic Notion of Human Nature 223
   Thomistic View of the Evolutionary Origin of the Human Species 231
   Other Views on the Origin of the Human Species 236
   Monogenism versus Polygenism 244
   Conclusion 277

General Conclusion 278

Bibliography 281

Index 308
Figures

1.1 Two levels of potentiality and the flexibility of the dynamic processes in nature  
1.2 Hylomorphic metaphysics of an evolutionary transition  
2.1 Classification of species concepts  
2.2 Depiction of evolutionary processes  
2.3 Classification of domestic cat (*Felis catus*) under two different schools of taxonomy  
3.1 Two divisions of events in Aristotle  
3.2 The distinction between chance and luck (fortune)  
4.1 Graphic depiction of the sequence of the work of the six days in the account of Genesis 1  
7.1 Concurrence of divine and natural causes in begetting offspring of the same species  
7.2 Concurrence of divine and natural causes in an evolutionary transition  
8.1 Concurrence of divine and natural causes in the evolution of man
Tables

5.1 Selection of the passages from the works of Aquinas showing the complexity of the debate on the possibility of the emergence of new species through biological evolution in reference to his theology of creation  page 158

5.2 Categories used in the proposed model of theistic evolutionism  172
Acknowledgments

The material presented in this volume originates from several years of my reflecting, teaching, researching, and writing on the topic of evolution – shared between the Thomistic Institute in the Dominican priory of St. Joseph in Warsaw (Poland) and the Thomistic Institute at the Angelicum in Rome (Italy). I would like to thank my brothers assigned to the priory of St. Joseph in the years 2017–2020, the director of the Thomistic Institute in Warsaw, Fr. Mateusz Przanowski, O.P., and the regent of studies from the Polish Dominican Province in those years, Fr. Maciej Roszkowski, O.P., for their fraternal support. After my transition to the Pontifical University of Saint Thomas Aquinas in Rome (Italy), my further research conducted under the auspices of Thomistic Institute at the Angelicum was generously supported by the benefactors of the Institute to whom I am deeply grateful. Many thanks to my students both in Rome and in Poland for their curiosity and challenging questions. I also thank the Dominican community at the priory of saints Dominic and Sixtus in Rome for shared experience of the Dominican life. I am forever grateful to my family and friends and all who support me and show appreciation of my work. Last but not least, I would like to thank my teacher and mentor, Michael Dodds, O.P. He taught me the principles of the Aristotelian–Thomistic system, which I have applied in this volume to the theory of biological evolution.

Part of my research on species, covered in Chapter 2, was sponsored by the Templeton Foundation (Grant ID 61360, Thomistic Evolution and the Defense of Faith and Reason: Engaging Catholic Families, Philosophers, and Theologians). I wish to express my gratitude for this support.

Parts of the material presented in this volume have previously appeared in print. They have been rethought, extended in various degrees, and
organized into a coherent whole. I wish to thank the following publishers for their permission to reproduce my previously published works:


Acknowledgments

I also want to express my gratitude to all the reviewers of these articles, members of the philosophy and theology teams on the aforementioned Templeton grant project on the Thomistic view of evolution, and a number of my colleagues in philosophy and theology for their valuable comments and critical evaluation of my ideas. Thanks to audiences at conferences and public lectures at which I presented various parts of the research gathered in this volume.
Abbreviations

ABBREVIATIONS FOR THE WORKS OF ARISTOTLE

De an.  De anima (On the Soul)
De gen. an.  De generatione animalium (On the Generation of Animals)
De gen. et corr.  De generatione et corruptione (On Generation and Corruption)
De part. an.  De partibus animalium (On the Parts of Animals)
Hist. an.  Historia animalium (The History of Animals)
Meta.  Metaphysica (The Metaphysics)
Meteo.  Meteorologica (The Meteorology)
Phys.  Physica (The Physics)

ABBREVIATIONS FOR THE WORKS OF ST. THOMAS AQUINAS

Comp. theo.  Compendium Theologiae (Compendium of Theology)
De ente  De ente et essentia (On Being and Essence)
De mixt. elem.  De mixtione elementorum ad magistrum Philippum de Castro Caeli (On the Mixture of the Elements, to Master Philip of Castrocaeli)
De prin. nat.  De principiis naturae (The Principles of Nature)
De Trin.  Super Boethium De Trinitate (On Boethius’s De Trinitate)
De vir.  Quaestiones disputatae de virtutibus (Disputed Questions on the Virtues)
List of Abbreviations

In De an.  Sententia libri De anima (Commentary on Aristotle’s De anima)
In Meta.  In Metaphysicam Aristotelis commentaria (Commentary on Aristotle’s Metaphysics)
In Phys.  In octo libros Physicorum Aristotelis expositio (Commentary on Aristotle’s Physics)
Super Sent.  Scriptum super libros Sententiarum (Commentary on Sentences)
Q. de an.  Quaestiones disputatae de anima (Disputed Questions on the Soul)
Q. de malo  Quaestiones disputatae de malo (Disputed Questions on Evil)
Q. de pot.  Quaestiones disputatae de potentia (Disputed questions on the Power of God)
Q. de ver.  Quaestiones disputatae de veritate (Disputed questions on Truth)
Quod.  Quaestiones quodlibetales (Miscellaneous Questions)
SCG  Summa contra gentiles (On the Truth of the Catholic Faith)
ST  Summa theologiae (The Summa Theologica)
Super De causis  Super librum De causis expositio (Commentary on the Liber de causis)

ABBREVIATIONS FOR OTHER BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

De Gen. ad litt.  De Genesi ad litteram libros duodecim (The Literal Meaning of Genesis)
NABRE  New American Bible Revised Edition

OTHER ABBREVIATIONS

AF  accidental form
AAFF  accidental forms
BSC  biological species concept
ESC  ecological species concept
EssSC  essentialist species concept
EST  evolutionary school of taxonomy
EvoSC  evolutionary species concept
HPCSC  homeostatic property cluster species concept
List of Abbreviations

ID intelligent design
ISCs intrinsic species concepts
MSC morphology species concept
MT monophyletic taxon
NIODA non-interventionist objective divine action
P-CSC phylogenetic-cladistic species concept
PM primary matter
PorST Porphyrian school of taxonomy
PPC principle of proportionate causation
PSC phenetic species concept
PSSC “population structure” species concept
PST phenetic school of taxonomy
PT paraphyletic taxon
RSCs relational species concepts
SF substantial form
SSFF substantial forms
TVTE Thomistic version of theistic evolution