

ENFORCING MORALITY

What parts of morality ought the law to enforce? What considerations justify its enforcement? What is the relationship between the legal and social enforcement of morality? Are there principled moral limits that constrain the enforcement of morality? How should we think about the pragmatic limits to the effective enforcement of morality? These are some of the main questions addressed by Steven Wall in this comprehensive and provocative study of a fundamental debate in jurisprudence and political theory. The book defends the practice of ethical environmentalism: the deliberate effort to improve the ethical character of the social environment of a society by political, legal and other means. The presumptive case for ethical environmentalism is presented and then assessed in light of a range of important considerations, including fair treatment, governmental neutrality, the value of personal liberty, rights to do wrongs and free expression.

Steven Wall is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona, where he is also a member of the Philosophy, Politics, Economics and Law program. Among other publications, he is the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Liberalism* (2015) and Oxford Studies in Political Philosophy (2015–).



CAMBRIDGE INTRODUCTIONS TO PHILOSOPHY AND LAW

Series Editors

Brian H. Bix University of Minnesota

William A. Edmundson Georgia State University

This introductory series of books provides concise studies of the philosophical foundations of law, of perennial topics in the philosophy of law, and of important and opposing schools of thought. The series is aimed principally at students in philosophy, law, and political science.

Matthew Kramer, Objectivity and the Rule of Law

Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin, Demystifying Legal Reasoning

Larry Alexander and Kimberly Kessler Ferzan with Stephen J. Morse, Crime and

Culpability: A Theory of Criminal Law

William A. Edmundson, An Introduction to Rights, 2nd edition

Robin West, Normative Jurisprudence: An Introduction

Gregory S. Alexander and Eduardo S. Peñalver, An Introduction to Property Theory

Brian H. Bix, Contract Law: Rules, Theory, and Context

Liam Murphy, What Makes Law: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Law

Pablo E. Navarro and Jorge L. Rodríguez, Deontic Logic and Legal Systems

Alexander Somek, The Legal Relation: Legal Theory after Legal Positivism

David Lefkowitz, Philosophy and International Law: A Critical Introduction



Enforcing Morality

STEVEN WALL

University of Arizona







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009363792

DOI: 10.1017/9781009363808

© Steven Wall 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-009-36379-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-36376-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments		page viii
1	Introduction	1
	PART I BACKGROUND CONTROVERSIES	
2	Mill's Principle	23
3	The Hart/Devlin Debate	44
4	Sovereignty and Consent	64
	PART II CRITICAL LEGAL MORALISM	
5	Ethical Environmentalism I	89
6	Ethical Environmentalism II	111
7	The Good of Personal Liberty	131
8	Rights to Do Wrongs	150
9	Free Expression	168
10	Pragmatism and the Perils of Enforcement	199
Bibliography		224
Index		231



Acknowledgments

I have been thinking and teaching about the topics in this book for well over a decade. I am grateful to Brian Bix and William Edmundson, the editors of this series, for giving me the opportunity to set my thoughts down on the issues addressed in the book in a systematic and comprehensive way. The book draws on several previously published papers, chief among which include "Moral Environmentalism," in C. Coons and M. Weber, *Paternalism: Theory and Practice* (Cambridge University Press, 2013) and "Enforcing Morality," in *Criminal Law and Philosophy* (2013). Thanks to Massimo Renzo for inviting me to contribute this latter paper to a symposium on the fiftieth anniversary of Hart's contribution to the Hart/Devlin debate.

I am grateful to David Schmidtz for organizing a reading group on an earlier draft of the book. That group brought together a stellar list of participants including, among others, Larry Alexander, Jason Brennan, Gerald Dworkin, Peter de Marneffe, Iskra Fileva, Harrison Frye, Michael Huemer and Dan Jacobson. In the fall 2020 term I taught a seminar on the topic of this book and benefited from discussions with the graduate students who attended. Special thanks to Andrew Lichter, Will Schumacher, Alex Motchoulski, Travis Quigley and Ritwik Agrawal.

Some of the ideas advanced in this book were first aired at various NOISE conferences. Thanks to David Shoemaker, who co-organizes these events with me, and to the other regular attendees including David Sobel, Dale Dorsey, Doug Portmore, Simon May, Justin D'Arms, Dan Jacobson, Connie Rosati, Mike Valdman, Jeff Moriarty, Rosa Terlazzo and Elizabeth Brake.

Writing this book at the University of Arizona has been a great pleasure, thanks in large measure to my terrific colleagues in moral and political philosophy, and especially to David Schmidtz, Michael McKenna, Tom Christiano, and the late Jerry Gaus. A penultimate version of Chapter 9 was presented at a seminar on free speech at Cornell run by Andrei Marmor and David Shoemaker. Comments from that seminar led to some last-minute revisions.

Thanks finally, and most significantly, to Lynn for her support and encouragement.