

## Avant-Garde on Record

An innovative contribution to music history, cultural studies and sound studies, *Avant-Garde on Record* revisits post-war composers and their technologically oriented brand of musical modernism. It describes how a broad range of figures (including Pierre Boulez, Karlheinz Stockhausen, Henri Pousseur, Toshirō Mayuzumi, Claire Schapira, Anthony Braxton and Gunther Schuller) engaged with avant-garde aesthetics while responding to a rapidly changing, technologically fuelled, spatialized audio culture. Jonathan Goldman focuses on how contemporary listeners understood these composers' works in the golden age of LPs and explores how this reception was mediated through consumer-oriented sound technology that formed a prism through which listeners processed the "music of their time." His account reveals unexpected aspects of twentieth-century audio culture: from sonic ping-pong to *son et lumière* shows, from Venetian choral music by Stravinsky to the soundscape of Niagara Falls, from a Buddhist cantata to an LP box set cast as a parlour game.

JONATHAN GOLDMAN is Professor of Musicology at the Faculty of Music of the Université de Montréal. His research focuses on modernist and avant-garde music. His publications include an Opus Prize-winning monograph, *The Musical Language of Pierre Boulez* (Cambridge, 2011), and four edited volumes.

# Avant-Garde on Record

## Musical Responses to Stereos

Jonathan Goldman

*Université de Montréal*



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-36339-6 — Avant-Garde on Record  
Jonathan Goldman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education,  
learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009363396](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009363396)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009363433

© Jonathan Goldman 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Goldman, Jonathan, 1972– author.

Title: Avant-garde on record : musical responses to stereos / Jonathan Goldman.

Description: [1.] | Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University  
Press, 2023. | Series: Msn music since 1900 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023017905 | ISBN 9781009363396 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009363419  
(paperback) | ISBN 9781009363433 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Electronic music – 20th century – History and criticism. | Music and  
technology – History – 20th century. | Avant-garde (Music) – History – 20th century.

Classification: LCC ML1092 .G65 2023 | DDC 786.7–dc23/eng/20230516

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023017905>

ISBN 978-1-009-36339-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-36339-6 — Avant-Garde on Record  
Jonathan Goldman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

In loving memory of Damien Goldman

## Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Ping-Pong and Its Discontents	29
3 Doubles, Rhymes and Groups in Stereo	54
3.1 Seating Plans	59
3.2 Composers on Their Works	66
3.3 Prominent Spatial Moments	78
3.4 Multiorchestral Works on Stereo LP	86
3.5 Critical Reception	90
4 Transnational Multiorchestralism	104
4.1 <i>Rural Antiphonies</i>	106
4.2 A Stereophonic <i>Concerto Grosso</i>	110
4.3 Orchestra in Seven Channels	115
4.4 A Spatialized Sutra	119
4.5 Neo-Venetian Antiphony	124
4.6 Canticles in Crossfade	133
4.7 “Taking Off into Vast Distances”	136
4.8 A Distant Choir in a New Age	139
4.9 Quadraphonic Futurism	146
5 The Monumental Stereo of <i>Son et Lumière</i>	160
5.1 The Sound of <i>Son et Lumière</i>	179
5.2 Composing Stereophony: From Lateral March to Circular Dance	184
6 Phonographic Spaces: Circling San Marco, Navigating Niagara	192
6.1 Spatial Features of <i>Canticum Sacrum</i>	194
6.2 Butor’s San Marco Promenade and Stereophonic Étude	204
6.3 John McClure’s Stereo Spectacular at San Marco	221
7 Open Works Locked into Grooves	238
7.1 Recordings in Musical Aesthetics	245
7.2 Open Works in Concert and on Record	250
7.3 Board Game Aleatorics: <i>Votre Faust</i> on LP	262
Epilogue	275

<i>Bibliography</i>	282
Archives	282
Scores	282
Selected Discography	283
Primary Sources	284
Secondary Sources	291
<i>Index</i>	311

## Figures

1.1	Johannes Brahms, Piano Concerto no. 2, op. 83 (1881), first movement, three bars after rehearsal B, strings.	page 15
1.2	Cover of <i>Karlheinz Stockhausen, Mikrophonie I and II</i> (Columbia Masterworks, MS 7355, 1967).	20
1.3	Album cover of <i>Sounds in Space</i> (LP, RCA Victor, SP 3313, 1958).	21
2.1	Cover of <i>Sound in the Round</i> (stereo LP, Concert-Disc, CS-22, 1958).	34
3.1	Advertisements for Klipschorn Speaker Systems from the October 1958 issue of <i>High Fidelity</i> , p. 90 (a); advertisement in October 1958 issue of <i>High Fidelity</i> magazine, p. 57 (b).	60
3.2	Transcription of seating plan of Pierre Boulez, <i>Figures – Doubles – Prismes für Orchester</i> . Copyright © 1964 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 13994.	62
3.3	Seating plan of Karlheinz Stockhausen, <i>Gruppen</i> , “Gruppen für 3 Orchester.” Copyright © 1963 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 13673.	64
3.4	Seating plan of Karlheinz Stockhausen, <i>Carré</i> , “Carré für 4 Orchester und 4 Chöre (4 Dirigenten) Nr. 10.” Copyright © 1971 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 14815.	65
3.5	Seating plan of Pousseur’s <i>Rimes</i> . Copyright by Sugarmusic S.p.A. – Edizioni Suvini Zerboni, Milan, 1962.	67
3.6	Instrumental groups used for each constituent chord of the slow theme. Pierre Boulez, <i>Figures – Doubles – Prismes für Orchester</i> . Copyright © 1964 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 13994.	80
3.7	Transcription of Boulez’s sketch for spatialization and superstructural procedure in <i>Doubles</i> . Used by permission of the Paul Sacher Stiftung.	81
3.8	Reduction of the first seven bars of the first occurrence of the fast theme in <i>Figures – Doubles – Prismes</i> (rehearsal 3) (transcribed from Edwards, “Boulez’s ‘Doubles’ and ‘Figures Doubles Prismes,’” p. 10) overlaid with instrumental groups used for each of its constituent chords; pitches and durations only. Pierre Boulez, <i>Figures – Doubles – Prismes für Orchester</i> . Copyright © 1964 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 13994.	82
3.9	Spatial motion in Group 119 (1 m. after reh. 119 until reh. 120), brass only, Karlheinz Stockhausen, <i>Gruppen</i> , “Gruppen für 3 Orchester.” Copyright © 1963 by Universal Edition (London) Ltd., London/UE 13673.	83

- |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |     |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.10 | Chord displacements in <i>Rimes</i> , 2nd movement, from rehearsal L to R. 7:30–8:58 in the recording (RCA VICS 1239). Copyright © 1962 by Sugarmusic S.p.A. – Edizioni Suvini Zerboni, Milan.                                                                                                                   | 86  |
| 3.11 | Cover of LP <i>The New Music</i> (RCA VICS 1239, 1968).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 87  |
| 4.1  | Instrumental placement in Gunther Schuller, <i>Spectra</i> . Copyright © 1958 Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany. Copyright © renewed. Used by permission of European American Music Distributors Company, agent for Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany.                                         | 117 |
| 4.2  | Comparison of Bb clarinet motif in Henri Dutilleux's Symphony no. 2 ("Le Double") (1959). Copyright © 1959 Heugel SA (top), mm. 2–6 and Gunther Schuller's <i>Spectra</i> , rehearsal 9 (bottom), concert pitch. Gunther Schuller, <i>Spectra</i> . Copyright © 1958 Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany. | 118 |
| 4.3  | Toshirō Mayuzumi, <i>Nirvāna-Symphonie</i> (Time Records, S/8004, 1962; this cover, reissue Mainstream Records, MS 5012, 1970). Artwork by Yoko Ono. Copyright © 1962 Time Records.                                                                                                                              | 123 |
| 4.4  | Placement of instrumental groups in Luigi Nono, <i>Composizione per orchestra n. 2: Diario polacco '58</i> . Copyright © 1959 Ars-Viva-Verlag GmbH Copyright © renewed. Used by permission of European American Music Distributors Company, US and Canadian agent for Ars-Viva-Verlag GmbH.                      | 126 |
| 4.5  | Giovanni Gabrieli, <i>O magnum mysterium</i> , mm. 65–68.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 131 |
| 4.6  | Gilles Tremblay, <i>Cantique de durées</i> (Paris: Éditions Salabert, 1960), mm. 1–5. Copyright © 1960 Editions Salabert, a catalogue of Universal Music Publishing Classical. International Copyright secured. All Rights Reserved. Reproduced by permission of Hal Leonard Europe BV (Italy).                  | 134 |
| 4.7  | Instrumental placement in Harry Somers, <i>Stereophony</i> (1963).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 138 |
| 4.8  | Charles Ives, Symphony no. 4 (Columbia Masterworks MS 6775, 1965).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 141 |
| 4.9  | Cover of Anthony Braxton, <i>For Four Orchestras</i> (Arista A3L 8900, 1978).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 147 |
| 4.10 | Diagram of speaker position, Anthony Braxton, <i>For Four Orchestras</i> (Arista A3L 8900, 1978), liner notes, p. 12.                                                                                                                                                                                            | 151 |
| 5.1  | Transcription of motifs from the opening of <i>Nucléa</i> , music by Maurice Jarre, with the waveform of the stereophonic recording.                                                                                                                                                                             | 185 |
| 6.1  | Floor plan of San Marco (annotations added), from James Fergusson, <i>Illustrated Handbook of Architecture</i> (London: John Murray, 1855), vol. 2, p. 963.                                                                                                                                                      | 198 |
| 6.2  | Plan of <i>Canticum Sacrum</i> as sketched by Eric Walter White, <i>Stravinsky: The Composer and His Works</i> (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1966), p. 443 (with added numbers).                                                                                                                    | 199 |
| 6.3  | Plan of eastern portion of San Marco displaying three outcroppings under East Dome, from Michel Butor, <i>Description de San Marco</i> (Paris: Gallimard, 1963), p. 111. Copyright © Éditions Gallimard. Used by permission.                                                                                     | 200 |



List of Figures	xi
6.4 Proposed correspondence between <i>Canticum Sacrum</i> and the plan of San Marco.	201
6.5 Cover of Stravinsky, <i>Agon</i> and <i>Canticum Sacrum</i> (Columbia Masterworks, MS 6022, 1959).	203
6.6 Annotated page excerpt of Michel Butor, <i>Description de San Marco</i> (Paris: Gallimard, 1963), p. 78, showing placement of three text categories (inscriptions, glosses and the dialogue ribbons). Copyright © Éditions Gallimard. Used by permission.	207
6.7 Excerpt from Michel Butor, <i>Description de San Marco</i> , pp. 65–67 with spatial terms highlighted. Line breaks marked with slashes.	208
6.8 Length (number of lines) of “rubans de dialogue” in the sections of <i>Description de San Marco</i> (from Jongeneel, <i>Michel Butor, le pacte romanesque</i> , p. 180).	210
6.9 Near palindrome formed by first and fifth movements of Igor Stravinsky, <i>Canticum Sacrum</i> , mvt. i, mm. 10–12 and mvt. v, mm. 340–344. Copyright © 1956 by Hawkes & Son (London) Ltd. US copyright renewed. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission.	212
6.10 First (p. 10, a) and last (p. 112, b) dialogue ribbons, each five lines long, in Michel Butor, <i>Description de San Marco</i> . Copyright © Éditions Gallimard. Used by permission.	213
6.11 Common tones of different transpositions of series linking different voices of <i>Canticum Sacrum</i> , mvt. ii, mm. 86–89.	213
6.12 Album cover, <i>The Glory of Gabrieli</i> (Columbia Masterworks, MS 7071, 1968). Photo: John Ross.	224
6.13 Cover art for <i>Vivaldi: Four Concertos for Two Orchestras</i> , HMV (HQS 1060, 1966, Photo: Giraudon).	234
7.1 Michel Butor’s playing board, Henri Pousseur, <i>VOTRE FAUST</i> , text by Henri Pousseur and Michel Butor. Copyright © 1969 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien. Copyright © renewed. All Rights Reserved. LP box set, BASF/Harmonia Mundi, 01 20358–1 1–3, 1973. Used with kind permission of Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany, and Harmonia Mundi.	268
7.2 Various playing cards (front and back), Henri Pousseur, <i>VOTRE FAUST</i> , text by Henri Pousseur and Michel Butor. Copyright © 1969 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien. Copyright © renewed. All Rights Reserved. LP box set, BASF/Harmonia Mundi, 01 20358–1 1–3, 1973. Used with kind permission of Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany, and Harmonia Mundi.	270
7.3 Henri Pousseur’s array of figures on playing cards, Henri Pousseur, <i>VOTRE FAUST</i> , text by Henri Pousseur and Michel Butor. Copyright © 1969 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien. Copyright © renewed. All Rights Reserved. LP box set, BASF/Harmonia Mundi, 01 20358–1 1–3, 1973. Used with kind permission of Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany, and Harmonia Mundi.	271

- 7.4 Pousseur's playing board, Henri Pousseur, *VOTRE FAUST*, text by Henri Pousseur and Michel Butor. Copyright © 1969 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien. Copyright © renewed. All Rights Reserved. LP box set, BASF/Harmonia Mundi, 01 20358-1 1-3, 1973. Used with kind permission of Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz, Germany, and Harmonia Mundi.

## Acknowledgements

Many people helped me along the way to publishing this book. I wish to thank the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) for support through an Insight Research Grant, as well as the Observatoire interdisciplinaire de création et recherche en musique (OICRM) for a research development grant. I am incredibly grateful to the Faculty of Music of the Université de Montréal, my institutional home, for creating conditions conducive to bringing a project of this scope to fruition. I am indebted to series editors Philip Rupprecht and David Beard for all their help in bringing this project to completion, as well as to their predecessor, founding editor of the Music since 1900 series, Arnold Whittall, for his encouragement and advice. Kate Brett, music publisher at Cambridge University Press, was enormously supportive of this project ever since the first time I breathlessly pitched it to her at an annual meeting of the American Musicological Society. I am also grateful for the professionalism and skill of the editorial team, including copyeditor Bret Workman, Nigel Graves, content manager at Cambridge University Press, and Preethika Ramalingam, project manager at Integra. Discussions with mentors, colleagues, students and friends (the Venn diagram shows lots of overlap) nourished this book immensely. I am especially grateful to Jennifer Iverson, an early reader of the manuscript, for her extremely helpful suggestions. François Ribac and Serge Cardinal were wonderful first readers of parts of the book, as were Bartłomiej Gembicki and members of the APM-IRCAM Reading Group, including Clément Cannone, Igor Contreras-Zubillaga, Christophe Corbier, Hugo Rodriguez and François-Xavier Féron. Among other colleagues, friends and mentors, I wish to particularly thank Anne-Sylvie Barthel-Calvet, Dániel Péter Biró, Janet Borgerson, Brian Cherney, Rachelle Chiasson-Taylor, Nicolas Donin, Eric Drott, Michel Duchesneau, Jonathan Dunsby, Laurent Feneyrou, Michelle Fillion, Catrina Flint-Médicis, Malcolm Goldstein, Michel Gonneville, Fanny Gribenski, Eduardo Herrera, Martin Kaltenecker, Gordon Mumma, Christopher Murray, Jean-Jacques Nattiez, Robert Piencikowski, Andrew Raffo Dewar, John Rea, Jean-François Rivest, João Romão, Friedemann Sallis and Ezra Teboul. I also wish to thank students and research assistants (as they then were) I've had

the pleasure of working with over the years, including Julie Delisle, Jordan Meunier, Samael Pelletier, Jessica Pilon Pinette, Hugo St. Denis and Vicky Tremblay.

This book uses several archival sources, but one online resource proved particularly indispensable: the wonderfully collaborative Discogs database ([www.discogs.com](http://www.discogs.com)). That being said, the primary resource of this book is the LP albums themselves. As I write these lines, many university libraries have eliminated or substantially reduced their collections of physical audio media, LPs in particular. Often these institutional culls are justified by claiming that equivalent items can be accessed via streaming services such as Naxos Music Online. And yet, even if we accepted that the remastered, compressed audio files available on streaming services were “equivalent” to the tracks on records, they are seldom accompanied by the liner notes and credits that are readily accessible on LP covers. This precious metadata is therefore being lost. I hope that the coming years will bring an awareness by university library boards of the preciousness of their physical audio media, particularly in light of the environmental damage that we now know streaming, far from being “immaterial,” entails. True, the vinyl manufacture involved in LP production has its own deleterious impacts on the environment, to which Kyle Devine has alerted us in his 2019 book *Decomposed: The Political Ecology of Music*, but keeping LP collections safe in archives keeps their polyvinyl chloride away from dumps and the risks of their leakage into waterways; and, of course, available to the curious ears and eyes of students and scholars.

I would like to acknowledge the generosity of Schott Music and European American Music Distributors Company who allowed me to use examples from scores in their catalogue. Efforts were made to obtain permission from all rightsholders of materials used in this volume. If it is found that I did not secure appropriate permissions, corrections will be made in subsequent editions. An earlier version of Chapter 3 was published as “Of Doubles, Groups and Rhymes: A Seriation of Works for Spatialized Orchestral Groups (1958–1960),” in *The Dawn of Musical Semiology*, ed. Jonathan Dunsby and Jonathan Goldman (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2017), pp. 139–176, and parts were published as “Listening to *Doubles* in Stereo,” in *Pierre Boulez Studies*, ed. Edward Campbell and Peter O’Hagan (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 246–269. Chapter 7 is an expanded version of the essay “Open Works on Record: An Unsung Mediation” that appeared in *Revisiting the Historiography of Postwar Avant-Garde Music*, ed. Anne-Sylvie Barthel-Calvet and Christopher Murray (London: Routledge, 2022), pp. 152–171, and is used by permission. An earlier version of Chapter 5 was published in

### Acknowledgements

xv

French in *La Revue musicale de l'OICRM* 8/1 (2021), pp. 36–58. All translated passages in this book are my own unless otherwise stated.

Loving support by my mother Jeanette and my late father Ivan was an indispensable precondition for the things I am proud of achieving in life, however modest. Damien and Béatrice helped me along the way in more ways than they know. My brother Daniel was an especially solid source of support and comfort in the face of loss.

Most of all, I am indebted to Anaïs for her love and her strength and strive to return them in kind.