The Christianization of Knowledge in Late Antiquity

*The Christianization of Knowledge in Late Antiquity: Intellectual and Material Transformations* traces the beginning of Late Antiquity from a new angle. Shifting the focus away from the Christianization of people or the transformation of institutions, Mark Letteney interrogates the creation of novel and durable structures of knowledge across the Roman scholarly landscape, and the embedding of those changes in manuscript witnesses. Letteney explores scholarly productions ranging from juristic writings and legal compendia to theological tractates, military handbooks, historical accounts, miscellanies, grammatical treatises, and the *Palestinian Talmud*. He demonstrates how imperial Christianity inflected the production of truth far beyond the domain of theology – and how intellectual tools forged in the fires of doctrinal controversy shed their theological baggage and came to undergird the great intellectual productions of the Theodosian Age and their material expressions. Letteney’s volume offers new insights and a new approach to answering the perennial question: What does it mean for Rome to become Christian? This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Mark Letteney is an assistant professor of history at the University of Washington. He holds a PhD from Princeton University and has held fellowships at the American Academy in Rome and the American School of Classical Studies in Athens. He is coauthor, with Matthew D. C. Larsen, of *Ancient Mediterranean Incarceration* (University of California Press, forthcoming 2024).
“Mark Letteney’s book approaches the question of the rise of Christianity in the late Roman Empire through a new perspective: not the more traditional one of Christianizing people, doctrinal controversies or demographic changes, but that of knowledge structures. The book is characterized by a particularly careful exegesis of the sources and a very extensive comparison with the earlier literature. It stands out for its great originality and is an uncommon example of how productive research in Late Antiquity can be given the aptitude for capturing the echoes that can come from texts of diverse origins.”

– Lucio De Giovanni, Università di Napoli Federico II

“Letteney’s remarkable new book charts the impact of Christianity not on religion or institutions – the focus of so much work on early Christianity – but rather on the organization of knowledge and the production of meaning in Late Antiquity. Drawing on a range of specialized texts (law codes, technical and bureaucratic treatises, military handbooks, and so on), he demonstrates that the particular forms of meaning-making that emerged in the context of theological and doctrinal dispute became broadly generalized in late-antique thought, and could be found in everything from the writings of the jurists to the Palestinian Talmud. A compelling and sensitive new sociology of knowledge, The Christianization of Knowledge in Late Antiquity will be required reading for students of early Christianity and the cultures of Late Antiquity, and will also be of interest to everyone working on the production of knowledge in premodern societies more generally.”

– Carlos F. Noreña, University of California, Berkeley

“Mark Letteney has produced a remarkable book that seeks to answer a question of relevance still today: What difference did Christianity make to Rome? Letteney contends that the fourth century was not a time of pagan–Christian conflict, nor a simple transition from a Roman to a new Christian empire, but rather a period of rupture as well as creative construction in the very ways in which fourth-century Nicene Christians made arguments and conveyed knowledge. These changes were promoted by the emergence of the codex and of new tools of Christian scholarship that promulgated a novel and long-lasting late antique book-oriented culture. Drawing on Roman law, ancient technical treatises, Christian theology, and Rabbinic texts, Letteney shows the development of this shared book culture and new scholarly practices that gradually permeated the empire and transcended religious differences as Nicene Christians emerged in the late fourth century in positions of power as the new elite of Rome. Letteney’s book thus provides original and thoughtful insight into why the Christianization of Rome matters to intellectual as well as religious history.”

– Michele Salzman, University of California, Riverside
The Christianization of Knowledge in Late Antiquity

Intellectual and Material Transformations

MARK LETTENEY
University of Washington
For my parents, Debbie and John, who have always loved me anyway.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Figures</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Abbreviations</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Christianizing Knowledge, or a Beginning of Late Antiquity</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations on Method</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond Comparison</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theologians and Jurists</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART I NEW READERS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 A History of Christian Fact Finding</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epistemic and Preceptual Knowledge in Antiquity</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Scholastic Practices</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignatius</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justin Martyr</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irenaeus</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertullian</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The <em>Gospel of Truth</em></td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A Methodological Revolution in Fourth-Century Theology</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constantine’s Idealized World Order: Universality through Unity</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Athanasius of Alexandria</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Athanasius and the “Canon”</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerning the Decrees</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 A New Order of Books in the Theodosian Age</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools of the Trade: Aggregation, Distillation, and Promulgation</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Contents

Interpretation and “Patristic Commentary” 89  
Christian Aggregation 91  
*The Proceedings of the Council of Ephesus* (431) 97  
Aggregation beyond Theology 101  
Traditionalist Rejection 112  
Post-Theodosian Collection, or the Shift to Florilegia 119  
Conclusion 122

## Part II New Texts

5 New Bookforms 127  
The Code(x) 127  
Christians and the Codex 130  
Canon and Codex 134  
Conclusion 144

6 New Texts 145  
Gratian’s Talisman 146  
Ambrose: *Concerning the Faith* 148  
Hilary: *Concerning the Synods* 154  
Jerome’s Obelus 160  
The Problem of Discernment in Nonthological Texts 163  
New Texts 166

7 Christian Tools in Traditionalist Texts 172  
Nomina Sacra and Nomina Vulgaria 174  
Conclusion 197

8 New Meanings 199  
Rules for Deciding 202  
Institutionalized Suspicion of Documents and Archives 209  
The Proceedings of the Council of Chalcedon 211  
The Theodosian Talmud 217  
Conclusion 224  
Conclusion 225

*Case Study: The Theodosian Code in Its Christian Conceptual Frame* 231  
*Magisterium Vitae* and Christian Tradition 234  
*Lex Generalis* in Classical Jurisprudence 238  
General Law in Christian Tradition 245  
The *Theodosian Code* and General Law 249  
“Resting on the Force of Edicts or on Sacred Imperial General Law” 254

*Bibliography* 263  
*Index* 285
Figures

1 Religious identification of western senate high-office holders at time of highest office page 123
2 Relative proportion of book formats, 350 BCE–800 CE 131
3 Books extant by format, 350 BCE–800 CE 131
4 Bern, Burgerbibliothek, Cod. 212, f. 113v 132
5 Stemma of *Theodosian Codices* described in *Gesta Senatus* 7 143
6 Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 34r 149
7 Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 10v 150
8 Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 15r 151
9 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 8907, 298v 152
10 Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 4r 152
11 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 8907, 315r 153
12 Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 33v 153
13 Vat. Arch.Cap.S.Pietro.D.182, 303r 155
14 Vat. Arch.Cap.S.Pietro.D.182, 303v 155
15 Vat. Arch.Cap.S.Pietro.D.182, 304r 155
16 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 2630, 320r 157
17 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 2630, 322r 158
18 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 2630, 335r 158
19 Vat. Reg. Lat. 886, 17r 165
20 Vat. Reg. Lat. 886, 244r 166
21 Vat. Lat. 3867, 86r 176
22 *P. Haun* III 45 179
23 *P. Haun* III 45 180
24 CPL 73 B recto 180
25 Supralinear abbreviations in *P. Haun* III 45 181
List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Supralineate contractions in <em>P. Haun</em> III 45</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Vat. Urb. Lat. 1154, 20v</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek Latin cod. 15, 162r</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Vat. Lat. 10959, 1r</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 5730, 22v</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 5730, 28r (left); Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 54v (right)</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 5730, 25v (left); Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 54v (right)</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 5730, 2v (left); Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 8v (right)</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale Lat. 5730, 9r (left); Stiftsbibliothek Lavanttal 1, 7r (right)</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Occurrences of the lemma <em>magisterium</em> across Latin literature</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Occurrences of lemma <em>magisterium</em> across Latin literature, Christians separate</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

Of all academic tasks, acknowledging one’s many debts is among the most difficult, but it is also perhaps the most joyful. There is a sense in which this book began in 2012, when I was fortunate to read two books that introduced to me a new form of investigation and type of analysis; in parallel but distinct monographs of 2007, Ramsay MacMullen and Fergus Millar each opened doors through which my work has tried to step. The project would not have been possible without their intellectual guidance and it would not have been the same without their personal encouragement that the questions I was asking, and the answers that I sought, were worthwhile. Both Ramsay and Fergus passed before this book went to print; I wish them a peaceful rest, and thank them for their work, their mirth, and their kindness.

This project has morphed and grown considerably since my graduate school days, but it began as many first books do – advised by a team of extraordinary scholars with whom I am honored to have worked. Elaine Pagels, AnneMarie Luijendijk, Anthony Grafton, Brent Shaw, and Moulie Vidas came together to advise a rather unorthodox project, and I received valuable advice from Martha Himmelfarb and Helmut Reimitz along the way. I consider myself incalculably lucky to have been given the opportunity to sit at the feet of these inimitable scholars, and to learn from each the trade of research, the craft of writing, and the joy of teaching. Each taught me many of the skills on display in this book, but more so they showed me the virtue of academic kindness and the value of attention paid to people as friends and colleagues first and foremost, quite apart from the work that we produce. I cannot thank them enough, but I plan to spend the rest of my career trying.
The majority of this book was written in a small office on the second floor of the American Academy in Rome, between sumptuous meals and outings with an extraordinary collection of humanists, artists, and administrators that made my Rome Prize year unforgettable and unimaginably joyous. A great debt of gratitude is due to John Ochsendorf and Lynne Lancaster for overseeing operations and curating an intellectual community from whom I learned immensely and with whom laughed blissfully, including Liana Brent, Allison L. C. Emmerson, Victoria C. Moses, Karyn Olivier, Basil Twist, Austin Powell, Jim Carter, Denis J.-J. Robichaud, Kirsten Valdez Quade, Helen O’Leary, Anna Majeski, Marcel Sanchez Prieto, and Zaneta Hong. The staff of the Vatican Library made working on Chapters 6 and 7 smoother than it might have been without their congeniality, and P. Petrus Tschreppitsch OSB and Christine Ottowitz at St. Paul Stift im Lavanttal kindly provided me with high-quality facsimiles of the Ambrose manuscript that serves as a cornerstone my analysis. Thanks is due, as well, to the Provost at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) and the MIT Library’s department of Scholarly Communications for providing funds to publish this book Open Access.

Clifford Ando offered prescient advice at an early point that colored this project throughout; if it is impactful, it will have been for his insistence that I tackle the question of causation head-on. Mark Vessey and Éric Rebillard each encouraged me to take up questions that they had raised in seminal articles, and their work remains an inspiration. I thank Mary Beard for many spirituous and spirited conversations filled with erudite suggestions for further reading that have leavened the project as a whole, and Silvia Orlandi for academic and administrative support that allowed me to bring this project to completion in Rome. Two anonymous peer reviewers performed the all too often thankless task of reading and critiquing a manuscript that needed critical eyes and thorough revision. Not only did they offer their considerable expertise and wisdom, but they read the book again, finding both something ready to be published and what is perhaps best described as a small armada of typos. I cannot thank them enough. Beatrice Rehl took an early and active interest in this project, and showed me the ropes of academic publishing – I thank her for shepherding this book to completion.

The Appendix was drafted during an intense and invigorating month at the Centro Studi e Ricerche sui Diritti Antichi in Pavia and is indebted to long conversations, many through late evenings, with Sebastian Schmidt-Hofner, Bernhard Palme, Boudewijn Sirks, Dario Mantovani, Detlef Liebs, Gisella Bassanelli Sommariva, Benet Salway, Serena Ammirati,
Acknowledgments

Lorena Atzeri, Elio Dovere, Marzena Wojtczak, Laurent Cases, Joanna Kulawiak-Cyrankowska, and David Pitz. I was honored to receive time, space, funding, and impetus to revise the Appendix alongside brilliant colleagues and mentors as a recipient of a Premio di merito alla ricerca from the Associazione Internazionale di Studi Tardoantichi. I want to thank Lucio De Giovanni especially for coordinating a wonderful visit to Naples, and to my fellow recipients, with whom it was a joy to celebrate and an honor to learn beside: Julia Aguilar Miquel, Guilhem Bartolotti, Marco Cristini, Miriam Cutino, Emanuela Malafronte, Giulia Marolla, and Simone Mollea.

As this project changed and grew over the years, my academic circle expanded; colleagues became interlocutors, and interlocutors became friends. I want particularly to thank Cavan Concannon, Jeremiah Coogan, J. Gregory Given, Joe Glynias, Sarit Kattan Gribetz, Henry Gruber, Amit Gvaryahu, Zachary Herz, Joseph Howley, Caroline Humfress, David Hunter, Yitz Landes, Rachel Love, Jessica Marglin, Irene Soto Marín, Charles Mathewes, Candida Moss, Travis Proctor, Sailakshmi Ramgopal, Michele Renee Salzman, and Jakub Urbanik for reading and strengthening parts of this book through their critique.

Matthew D. C. Larsen has been a constant interlocutor, performing the virtuous duty of first responder to half-formed thoughts and incipient ideas; all of my work is better for his friendship and his sage advice. All along my family did what families do best (to paraphrase David Sedaris): remind me that I might reinvent myself to colleagues, but to this day I'm still the one most likely to set the house on fire. Stephanie Nelli came into my life only late in this process, but her presence has made it immeasurably sweeter. To all these, and to those whom I've inevitably missed, I offer my sincerest gratitude.

January 2023
Cambridge, MA
Abbreviations


AW  Athanasius Werke, edited by Hans-Georg Opitz. (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1934–)

CCL  Corpus Christianorum Series Latina (Turnhout: Brepols, 1953–)

CI  Codex Iustinianus, edited by Paul Krüger, Corpus Iuris Civilis, vol. 2 (Berlin: Weidmann, 1877)

CIL  Corpus inscriptionum latinarum (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1862–)


CMG  Corpus medicorum graecorum (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1927–)

CPL  Corpus papyrorum latinorum (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1958)

CSCO  Corpus scriptorum christianorum orientalium (Leuven: Peeters, 1906–)

CSEL  Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum (Vienna: Geroldi, 1866–)

CTh  Codex Theodosianus: Theodosiani libri XVI, cum constitutionibus Sirmondianis, edited by Theodor Mommsen with Paul Meyer and Paul Krüger (Berlin: Weidmann, 1905)
List of Abbreviations

GCS  Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei Jahrhunderte (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1897–)
ILCV  Inscriptiones latinae christianae veteres, edited by Ernst Diehl, 3 vols. (Berlin: Weidmann, 1924–1931)
LCL  Loeb Classical Library (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1911–)
SC  Sources Chrétienennes (Paris: Cerf, 1942–)
SEG  Supplementum epigraphicum graecum (Leiden: Brill, 1923–)
Urk.  Urkunden zur Geschichte des arianischen Streites, edited by Hans-Georg Opitz, Athanasius Werke 3.1 (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1934)