

Advance Praise

As India's rich diversity of cultures faces the challenges of nationalist uniformity and authoritarian governance, Aligarh Muslim University and Jamia Millia Islamia have shown that pluralism and difference are the essence of democracy. Laurence Gautier combines thorough research with insightful analysis to argue that Muslims in all their variety are indeed active citizens of India and constituents of India's historic civilisation.

David Lelyveld, author of *Aligarh's First Generation: Muslim Solidarity in British India* (1978)

This book ventures into new grounds: it presents the first scholarly monograph on the history of Jamia Millia Islamia and the investigation of Aligarh Muslim University after independence. Laurence Gautier bases her work on a close reading of multiple archives in English and Urdu, resulting in a much-needed balanced and nuanced analysis. In an innovative reading, this history of the two universities is less focused on a history of education in the narrow sense but opens up to a political history. Both Jamia and Aligarh were central to the political debates on the future of Muslims in India. In a masterly interpretation, Laurence Gautier brings together the multiple debates within the universities, their navigation 'between nation and community' and the ways they were perceived and used by different state actors. A must-read for everyone interested in the history, but even more so in the present of Muslims in India.

Margrit Pernau, author of *Emotions and Modernity in Colonial India: From Balance to Fervor* (2019)

Between Nation and 'Community' is one of the most comprehensive and profound interventions in the study of Muslim communities in the first fifty years of India's republican journey. Gautier brings out the politics of various communities and classes of Muslims, in their efforts towards the 'pluralisation' of India's democratic politics. Through Muslim-established universities, this book looks into the emergence of new educated middle classes, paying attention to caste- and gender-based stratifications among India's Muslims. Gautier busts many a myth regarding Indian Muslims in both progressive and majoritarian narratives by using a wide range of untapped primary sources. Empirically rich, analytically sharp and

articulated in lucid prose, this book is an enjoyable read. It is intellectually edifying, particularly for those interested in minority rights, student and youth movements and gender studies. It is undoubtedly one of its own kind and promises a very long shelf life.

Mohammad Sajjad, author of *Muslim Politics in Bihar: Changing Contours* (2014)

Between Nation and 'Community' provides an important new interpretation of the history of Muslim universities and Muslim politics in postcolonial north India. Based on rich archival materials in English and Urdu, the book rejects the overly simplistic analysis of much of the scholarship on Aligarh Muslim University and Jamia Millia Islamia. Instead, it unearths the many complexities, tensions and debates within these universities and in India's Muslim communities as they coped with the aftermath of partition, the rise of Mandal politics and the emergence of Hindutva as a political force. It is sure to become essential reading for anyone wishing to understand the second half of the twentieth century in India.

Taylor C. Sherman, author of *Nebru's India: A History in Seven Myths* (2022)

Between Nation and 'Community'

This book proposes a political history of Muslim universities in post-independence India, from 1947 to the 1990s. Based on a wide range of sources in English and in Urdu, it highlights the central role that these educational institutions played in the debates on national integration, secularism, minority rights and Muslim backwardness.

After independence, Muslim universities found themselves at a critical juncture between central state authorities and India's Muslim population. As public and Muslim institutions, they were to participate in nation-building as much as in the development of the Muslim 'community'. By closely looking at the relation between these institutions and state authorities, the book teases out the ambiguities of the state's Muslim policy. It also examines, in turn, how university members responded to this policy and developed competing conceptions of Muslim identity and citizenship, which structured the wider public debates on Muslims' status in post-partition India.

Laurence Gautier is a researcher at the Centre de Sciences Humaines, New Delhi. She completed her PhD in History at the University of Cambridge and taught for four years at O.P. Jindal Global University, Sonipat. She writes on university politics, nation-building, secularism and Muslims' political representation in post-independence India.

Between Nation and 'Community'

Muslim Universities and Indian Politics
after Partition

Laurence Gautier



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-35849-1 — Between Nation and 'Community'
Laurence Gautier
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009358491

© Laurence Gautier 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment

First published 2024

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-35849-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-35849-1 — Between Nation and 'Community'
Laurence Gautier
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Gagan, Gabriel and Nilima

Contents

| | |
|---|------|
| <i>List of figures</i> | xi |
| <i>List of tables</i> | xiii |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xv |
| <i>A note on transliteration and translation</i> | xix |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i> | xxi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| 1 A laboratory for composite India: Jamia Millia Islamia around the time of partition | 35 |
| 2 Sifting Sir Syed’s legacy: From the ‘arsenal of Muslim India’ to a symbol of India’s national integration? | 90 |
| 3 Re-legitimising minority rights: The campaign for Aligarh Muslim University’s minority status | 137 |
| 4 Resisting minority politics, holding on to composite nationalism: Jamia Millia Islamia in the post-Nehruvian period | 189 |
| 5 Uplifting backward Muslims: The new consensus? | 229 |
| 6 Bastions of Islam: The defence of Islam as a narrative of empowerment and contestation | 284 |
| 7 Women in Muslim universities: Guardians of tradition or actors of change? | 335 |
| Conclusion | 406 |

| | |
|---------------------|----------|
| x | Contents |
| <i>Appendix</i> | 422 |
| <i>Glossary</i> | 424 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 426 |
| <i>Index</i> | 458 |

Figures

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 1.1 | The front page of Abdul Ghaffar Mudholi’s <i>Jamia Ka Tareeqa</i> (Jamia’s Way) (1964) depicting JMI’s ‘learning by doing’ approach | 44 |
| 1.2 | Students at JMI engaged in various artistic and hands-on activities: (<i>clockwise from top-left</i>) poultry farming, gardening, handicraft and clay modelling | 45 |
| 1.3 | Students’ government at JMI in charge of running the school once every year | 46 |
| 1.4 | <i>Payam-e-Taleem</i> (The Message of Education), 1946, a children’s magazine by Maktaba Jamia | 49 |
| 1.5 | ‘Dilli kya hai?’ (What is Delhi?) | 62 |
| 1.6 | ‘Hindustan ka project’ (India’s project) | 63 |
| 2.1 | Places of origin of AMU alumni who moved to Pakistan | 104 |
| 2.2 | Destinations of AMU alumni who moved to Pakistan | 105 |
| 2.3 | Occupations of students who moved to Pakistan | 106 |
| 3.1 | AMU students’ origin I: type of locality | 144 |
| 3.2 | AMU students’ origin II: states (within India) | 145 |
| 3.3 | AMU students’ origin III: top cities | 146 |
| 3.4 | A high proportion of upper-caste students among Muslims | 147 |
| 5.1 | A vast majority of students from western UP | 240 |
| 5.2 | Anwar Jamal Kidwai’s Mass Communication Research Centre (1983) | 244 |
| 7.1 | Girl and boys in JMI’s reading room (c. 1950) | 346 |
| 7.2 | The family tree of the ‘Zaidi sisters’ | 355 |
| 7.3 | Drama performance at AMU’s Women’s College (1983) | 360 |
| 7.4 | Sports at AMU’s Women’s College (1980) | 360 |

Tables

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 2.1 | Permanent grants for AMU before independence (1943–1944) | 95 |
| 2.2 | AMU alumni in Pakistani public institutions: some examples | 102 |
| 3.1 | Changes in the composition of AMU’s court: Muslim culture and education | 164 |
| 3.2 | List of dignitaries present at the AMU Action Committee meet (22 April 1978, Delhi) | 170 |
| 4.1 | A large proportion of AMU alumni among JMI teachers (1991–1992) | 193 |
| 5.1 | Muslim colleges in India (1983) | 236 |
| 5.2 | State origin of AMU students (per cent) | 255 |
| 5.3 | Evolution of the proportion of Muslim students in AMU’s departments (per cent) | 262 |
| 6.1 | Muslim and non-Muslim candidates in Okhla’s constituency: assembly elections (1977–2020) | 303 |
| 7.1 | Women’s representation among postgraduate AMU students (1960) | 353 |
| 7.2 | Men–women distribution in JMI’s university departments (1990–1991) | 385 |

Acknowledgements

This book project started many years ago when I joined the University of Cambridge as an MPhil student. It continued to evolve after my PhD, when I joined O. P. Jindal University, Sonipat, and later the Centre de Sciences Humaines (CSH), New Delhi. I thank these three institutions which made it possible for me to pursue my research work. At Cambridge, I would like to thank especially Trinity College, which granted me a Trinity External Research Studentship, as well as the Faculty of History, the Smuts Memorial Fund and the Cambridge Political Economy Society Trust for granting me additional funding.

I owe a lot to the many scholars, librarians, archivists and friends who helped me on the way. First and foremost, I would like to thank my former supervisor, Joya Chatterji, who started guiding me in my MPhil days. Her encouragement kept me going in times of self-doubt, and her suggestions helped me sharpen my arguments and see the larger picture. Most importantly, she created, for me and for my peers, a warm and stimulating environment that enabled us to build lasting ties of friendship and to grow as scholars. I am immensely grateful to her for this.

The late David Washbrook was a central figure at Cambridge's Centre of South Asian Studies. We all cherished his bonhomie and admired his sharp, always spot-on questions. I benefitted from his precious comments on the early drafts of my thesis. I also owe a lot to Christophe Jaffrelot and Taylor Sherman, my PhD examiners, whose encouragement and suggestions helped me improve and expand my research work. Ornit Shani, Margrit Pernau and Eleanor Newbiggin have been wonderful interlocutors. I have enjoyed and drawn inspiration from our conversations on our related research topics. I am also very grateful to David Lelyveld, whose work *Aligarh's First Generation* remains one of my main reference points. David has been incredibly generous during and after the PhD. He helped me get in touch with several scholars at Aligarh Muslim University (AMU), took the time to read my full thesis and continued to encourage me thereafter. His suggestions and gracious comments have been of great value to me.

In Delhi, Shohini Ghosh and the late Rizwan Qaiser quickly became mentors and friends. They introduced me to Jamia Millia Islamia's (JMI) vibrant and

diverse community and remained major interlocutors throughout my research project. This work could not have happened without their friendship and support. This is also true of the members of the Premchand Archives at JMI, particularly its former directors, S. M. Azizuddin Husain and Sabiha Zaidi, as well as Snigdha Roy and Shradha Shankar, with whom I shared many hot afternoons exploring JMI's papers (and sipping tea, of course). A few hundred metres away, Gayas Makhdumi and Umaima Faruqi helped me access the rich collections of JMI's central library. I thank them for this.

Around JMI, I met many former students and teachers, who shared with generosity their memories of the institution. These interactions—some of which I explicitly refer to in the book—shaped much of my understanding of JMI's ethos and trajectory. Among them, I would like to thank in particular the late Shamim Hanfi, Mujeeb Rizvi and Rashid Nomani, as well as Azra Rizvi, Ameera Khatoon, Arif and Sarwat Ali, Akhtarul Wasey, Sadiqur Rahman Kidwai, Asad Ali, Z. A. Zargar, Payal Randhawa, Samina Bashir and Ammar Naqvi. I am also grateful to Syeda Hameed for helping me check information about her family's manifold connections with both JMI and AMU.

At AMU, Sharmila Tagore helped me meet the vice-chancellor, Zameeruddin Shah, at a time when I had just started my research work. I thank them for helping me at this critical stage. Throughout my PhD years, Rahat Abrar always made sure that I would have a comfortable and productive stay on campus. He generously shared primary sources, some of which he had himself compiled, and put me in touch with a wide range of current and former members of the university. So too did Salman and Shahla Haider at the Women's College. They also gave me precious insights into the foundational role that their mother and grandparents had played in the institution. Much like at JMI, the conversations that I had with former students and teachers were of crucial importance to get a sense of the diversity of opinions and trajectories at AMU. I would like to thank in particular Irfan Habib, Ali Amir, Zakia Siddiqi, Fauzia Mujeeb, S. M. Faizan Ahmed, Iftikhar Alam Khan, Shireen Moosvi, Mohsin Raza, Saghir Beg, Arif Mohammad Khan, Mohammad Masood Khalid, Mohammad Asif, Meher Ilahi, Q. A. Husain, Rashid Shaz, Asiya Islam, Adil Hossain, Riad Azam and Iram Khan, as well as the late A. K. Qasmi and Nawab Ibne Saeed Khan of Chhatari. Special thanks to Mohammad Sajjad, whose work has been an important reference and who gave me useful feedback on repeated occasions. I am indebted to Sajad Khan, who worked hard to recover some of the photos that appear in this book. Likewise, I owe much to Shaista Bedar, from the Maulana Azad Library, Aligarh, who kindly guided me through the university's archives, often pointing me to resources that I was hardly aware of. Outside the university, Hakim Syed Zillur Rahman's Ibn Sina Academy was a real treasure trove for me. I benefitted from its unique collection of magazines related to the university.

Besides AMU’s and JMI’s own resources, my work largely relied on government archives and on some politicians’ private papers. I am grateful to the staff members of the National Archives of India, the Nehru Memorial Museum and Library and the Uttar Pradesh State Archives for granting me access to these indispensable documents, as well as to Masood Hasan, from the Khuda Baksh Oriental Public Library, for making my short stay in Patna as productive as possible.

Back at Cambridge, I thank Kevin Greenbank, Barbara Roe and Rachel Rowe for creating such a warm, homely atmosphere at the Centre of South Asian Studies. They made it a wonderful place to work, and chat, over a cup of tea and biscuits. I also wish to thank my friends and former colleagues from the centre, many of whom helped me with my work during and after the PhD. Among them, Bérénice Guyot-Réchart, Anjali Bhardwaj-Datta, Ed Anderson, Sophie-Jung Kim, Alix Chartrand, Saumya Saxena and Simon Fuchs carefully read draft versions of the PhD or book chapters. Ali and Amir Khan, Atiyab Sultan and Kamran *sahab* helped me with Urdu translations. Devyani Gupta, Aishwarya Pandit, Helene Ilkjaer, Apurba Podder, Alastair McClure and Aditya Balasubramanian completed the enthusiastic ‘green-sofa team’. I do not forget, of course, my fellow musketeers, Ishan Mukherjee and Partha Pratim Shil, with whom I shared most of the joys, sorrows and last-minute panic attacks of our PhD years. They willingly or unwittingly were party to the rehearsal of many of my arguments. They know how much I owe to them.

Jindal University provided me yet another welcoming environment to pursue my work. I would like to thank in particular Zaheer Abbas for helping me with Urdu translations, as well as Anish Vanaik, Maaz Bin Bilal, Lipika Kamra and Ishan Mukherjee for their helpful feedback on one of my draft chapters. I am also very grateful to my former students Shreeya Bhayana, Aditya Jain, Eesha Sheel, Manisha Agarwal and Sanskriti Madhwal who patiently collated data from AMU’s directory and helped me make sense of it.

Since 2021, the CSH has become my new home. The book in its final form owes much to my conversations with friends and colleagues there, especially Julien Levesque and Jean-Thomas Martelli. Special thanks to Christophe Guilmoto for bearing with my anguished questions on maps and datasets.

Finally, on a more personal note, I would like to thank Ray and Bulbul Pillai, without whom many of the most important things in my life would simply not have happened. Last but not least, I thank my own ‘composite’ family in Delhi, France and London, especially my parents, Claire and François. I am grateful for their curiosity about my work and, most importantly, for their unfailing love and support. I dedicate this book to Gagan, Gabriel and Nilima, as a token of gratitude for the joy that they bring to my life.

A note on transliteration and translation

I have avoided using diacritical marks when transliterating Urdu terms into the Roman script. For names of organisations and titles of magazines, I have adopted the official or the most commonly used transliterations (for instance, 'Jamaat-e-Islami' and *Payam-e-Taleem*), even though they do not follow a standardised transliteration pattern. Likewise, I have not changed the way Urdu terms were transcribed in some quotes in English. This may lead to minor variations in the transliteration of certain words. All translations are my own unless otherwise indicated.

Abbreviations

| | |
|-------------|---|
| ABVP | Akhil Bharatiya Vidyarthi Parishad |
| AICC | All India Congress Committee |
| AIMEC | All India Muhammedan Educational Conference |
| AIMPLB | All India Muslim Personal Law Board |
| AISA | All India Students' Association |
| AMU | Aligarh Muslim University |
| BHU | Banaras Hindu University |
| BJP | Bharatiya Janata Party |
| BKD | Bharatiya Kranti Dal |
| BSP | Bahujan Samaj Party |
| AITUC | All-India Trade Union Congress |
| CAA | Citizenship Amendment Act |
| CEPECAMI | Centre for the Promotion of the Educational and Cultural Advancement of the Muslims of India |
| CPI | Communist Party of India |
| CPI(M) | Communist Party of India (Marxist) |
| CPI(ML) | Communist Party of India (Marxist–Leninist) |
| FDR | Forum for Democratic Rights |
| HTS | Hindustani Talimi Sangh |
| IAS | Indian Administrative Service |
| INTUC | Indian National Trade Union Congress |
| IPTA | Indian People's Theatre Association |
| IUML | Indian Union Muslim League |
| JANAM | Jan Natya Manch |
| JNU | Jawaharlal Nehru University |
| JMI | Jamia Millia Islamia |
| MAO College | Muhammedan Anglo-Oriental College |
| MES | Muslim Education Society |
| MCRC | Mass Communication Research Centre |

| | |
|-------|---|
| ME | Ministry of Education |
| MEA | Ministry of External Affairs |
| MHA | Ministry of Home Affairs |
| MIB | Ministry of Information and Broadcasting |
| MIM | Majlis-e-Ittehadul Muslimeen |
| MLA | member of legislative assembly |
| MP | member of parliament |
| MS | Ministry of States |
| NAI | National Archives of India |
| NCC | National Cadet Corps |
| NCERT | National Council of Educational Research and Training |
| NMML | Nehru Memorial Museum and Library |
| NPE | National Policy of Education |
| OBC | Other Backward Classes |
| PD | Political Department |
| POW | Progressive Organisation of Women |
| PWA | Progressive Writers' Association |
| RJD | Rashtriya Janata Dal |
| RSS | Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh |
| SC | Scheduled Castes |
| SIMI | Students Islamic Movement of India |
| SIO | Students Islamic Organisation |
| SP | Samajwadi Party |
| SSP | Samyukta Socialist Party |
| ST | Scheduled Tribes |
| UGC | University Grant Commission |
| UP | United Provinces (before 1950)/Uttar Pradesh |
| UPSA | Uttar Pradesh State Archives |
| VHP | Vishva Hindu Parishad |