

SENSES, COGNITION, AND RITUAL EXPERIENCE IN THE ROMAN WORLD

How do the senses shape the way we perceive, understand, and remember ritual experiences? This book applies cognitive and sensory approaches to Roman rituals, reconnecting readers with religious experiences as members of an embodied audience. These approaches allow us to move beyond the literate elites to examine broader audiences of diverse individuals, who experienced rituals as participants and/or performers. Case studies of ritual experiences from a variety of places, spaces, and contexts across the Roman world, including polytheistic and Christian rituals, state rituals, private rituals, performances, and processions, demonstrate the dynamic and broad-scale application that cognitive approaches offer for ancient religion, paving the way for future interdisciplinary engagement. This title is part of the Flip it Open Programme and may also be available Open Access. Check our website Cambridge Core for details.

BLANKA MISIC is Instructor in Ancient Civilizations at Champlain College Lennoxville. She researches and publishes on cognitive and sensory aspects of religious rituals and was recently awarded the HORIZON EU Marie Skłodowska-Curie Postdoctoral Fellowship at Institut für Klassische Archäologie, Universität Wien.

ABIGAIL GRAHAM is Research Fellow at the Institute of Classical Studies at the University of London and an honorary research fellow at the British School Rome, where she is the founder and coordinator of their Postgraduate Course in Roman Epigraphy. She researches and publishes on cognition, epigraphy, and monumentality in the urban landscape.



ANCIENT RELIGION AND COGNITION

Series Editors

Esther Eidinow, *University of Bristol* Thomas Harrison, *University of St Andrews*

This series seeks to take advantage of a critical moment in the development of the study of ancient religion. This is one in which previous models (especially the sharp oppositions frequently drawn between ritual and belief, or between the social and the individual) are increasingly being questioned, and in which scholars of the ancient world are more and more drawing on cognitive approaches in the search for new paradigms. The 'cognitive science of religion' draws on insights developed in a wide range of fields: cognitive and evolutionary psychology, social anthropology, and neurobiology, amongst others. In essence, however, it seeks to understand religious experience as rooted in the ordinary cognitive capacities of the human brain. The series covers not only Greek and Roman religion but a range of ancient cultures from the Mediterranean and Near East, including Greece, Rome, Egypt, Babylonia, Persia, and Phoenicia, as well as cultures from Iron Age Europe. It will also explore the implications for the study of these cultures of a range of different cognitive approaches to religion and will include work by scholars from a wide range of disciplines in anthropology, the study of religion, evolutionary psychology, and neuroscience in addition to that by historians and archaeologists of the ancient world.

Titles in the series:

Cognitive Approaches to Ancient Religious Experience Esther Eidinow, Armin W. Geertz, and John North



SENSES, COGNITION, AND RITUAL EXPERIENCE IN THE ROMAN WORLD

EDITED BY
BLANKA MISIC

Champlain College Lennoxville

ABIGAIL GRAHAM

Institute of Classical Studies







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009355544

DOI: 10.1017/9781009355513

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

1SBN 978-1-009-35554-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	t of Figures	page vi
	t of Contributors	viii
	enowledgements	X
List	t of Abbreviations	xi
	Introduction: Experiencing Rituals Abigail Graham and Blanka Misic	Ι
I	Remembering the Rites: Religious Learning Network Model a Transmission of Religious Rituals in the Worship of <i>Nutrices Augustae</i> (<i>Poetovio, Pannonia Superior</i>) Blanka Misic	and 27
2	The Haptic Production of Religious Knowledge among the Vestal Virgins: A Hands-On Approach to Roman Ritual <i>Emma-Jayne Graham</i>	59
3	Haptic Colour: Experiential Viewing in Graeco-Roman Sacre Spaces Vicky Jewell	d 89
4	Nobody Is Gonna Rain on My Parade: Experiencing Salutaris Procession As a Ritual Event Abigail Graham	s's 118
5	Objects and Ritual in Egeria's Fourth-Century Pilgrimage: The Props of My Faith Steven Muir	ne 167
	Conclusion: (Re)Creating Ritual Experiences Blanka Misic and Abigail Graham	200
Ind	lex	225



Figures

I.I	Religious Learning Network theoretical model: Part 1	page 30
1.2	Religious Learning Network theoretical model: Part 2	35
1.3	Nutrices Augustae relief (PMPO, RL 978), held in Pokrajinsk	
	muzej Ptuj Ormož, photo Boris Farič (reproduced with	
	permission from the museum)	
1.4	Nutrices Augustae relief (PMPO, RL 82), held in Pokrajinski	39
	muzej Ptuj Ormož, photo Boris Farič (reproduced with	
	permission from the museum)	
2.1	Detail of the small procession frieze of the Ara Pacis Augustae	60
	showing six Vestal Virgins carrying objects	
2.2	Restored fragments of the entablature frieze of the Temple of	f 63
	Vesta in the Forum Romanum at Rome (late second	
	century CE)	
2.3	Bronze simpulum/simpuvium (ladle), late first-early second	72
	century CE	
2.4	Detail of the small procession frieze of the Ara Pacis showing	74
	the first three Vestals, preceded by two male figures	
	Detail of an altar from the Vicus Sandalarius, Rome (2 BCE)	75
2.6	Detail from the north frieze of the Ara Pacis showing a cult	76
	attendant for the Septemviri epulones grasping a decorated	
	acerra in his left hand	
2.7	Detail of the eastern passageway frieze of the Arch of the	79
	Argentarii (Rome), depicting instruments used in the cult	
2.8	Detail of the small procession frieze of the Ara Pacis showing	g 82
	the final three Vestals, followed by a male figure	
3.I	Relief of Mithras with a tauroctony from beneath the church	102
	of Santo Stefano Rotondo Inv. no. 2005837	
3.2	Tauroctony Fresco from the rear wall of the Mithraeum at the	103
	Palazzo Barberini, Rome	
4. I	Map of Ephesus depicting the Processional Route	128



	List of Figures	vii
4.2	Photograph of Salutaris's Foundation	131
4.3	Photograph of the Salutaris Inscription: Column One: lines	133
	I-9	
4.4	Photograph of the Salutaris Inscription: Column Six: lines	135
	528–536	
4.5	Photograph of the Kuretes Street from the Embolos	143
4.6	Statue base for the Teians. <i>I.Eph</i> 29	154
4.7	Diagram of theatre at Ephesus with added arrows indicating	155
	possible base locations and the site of Salutaris's foundation	
	on the south parodos	
5.I	Diagram of Performance Theory	171
5.2	Reconstruction of the Constantinian Church of the Holy	177
	Sepulchre	
5.3	Reconstruction of Egeria's procession experience	179
5.4	Comparison of Cyril and Egeria's ritual experience	183
5.5	Reconstruction of the Network of Ritual Objects	193



Contributors

ABIGAIL GRAHAM has been a lecturer and taught a range of material culture and history courses at the University of Warwick (2006–19) and subsequently joined the Institute for Classical Studies in London as Research Fellow in 2019. She specializes in monumentality and epigraphy in Roman Asia Minor with a focus on the presentation of writing and 'experiencing' epigraphy in the urban context. She has published on new approaches and methodologies for monumental writing (American Journal of Archaeology (2013 and 2021), La Sapienza, 2017, and Brill, 2019) including bilingualism, damnatio memoriae, recarving, and 'copies' of monuments. She also is the author of The Romans: An Introduction (3rd and 4th editions: Routledge, 2014 and 2020). She is the founder and coordinator of the Postgraduate Course in Roman Epigraphy at the British School at Rome, where she is also a Research Fellow.

EMMA-JAYNE GRAHAM is Senior Lecturer in Classical Studies at The Open University. Her research focuses on aspects of material religion, the archaeology of Roman Italy, mortuary practices, and ancient disability. Recent publications include *Reassembling Religion in Roman Italy* (Routledge, 2021) and *Bodies of Evidence: Ancient Anatomical Votives Past, Present and Future* (Routledge 2017, co-edited with Jane Draycott). She is co-founder of TheVotivesProject.org and Deputy Director of the Baron Thyssen Centre for the Study of Ancient Material Religion at The Open University.

VICKY JEWELL earned her PhD at the University of Warwick. Her thesis focused on colour in the ancient Greek world, exploring both the ways in which the Greek understanding of colour differed from our own and the implications that can have for the examination of text and art filled with polychromy. Her research interests include colour cognition across cultures and the synaesthetic experience of the ancient world as a whole.



List of Contributors

ix

BLANKA MISIC is Instructor in the Department of Ancient Civilizations at Champlain College Lennoxville. Her research focus is on religious cults in Roman Pannoniae from cognitive and sensory theoretical perspectives. She has published on cognitive approaches to religious rituals (Oxbow, 2015 and Archaeopress, 2022) and funerary commemoration (Steiner Verlag, 2019). She was recently awarded the HORIZON EU Marie Skłodowska-Curie Postdoctoral Fellowship at Institut für Klassische Archäologie, Universität Wien.

STEVEN MUIR is Professor of Religious Studies at Concordia University of Edmonton. He researches and publishes in New Testament and early Christian studies, and classics. His academic interests include ritual studies, inter-group relations, pilgrimage and sacred space, and health and healing in the ancient world. He is a co-editor of *Early Christian Ritual Life* (Routledge, 2017).



Acknowledgements

We started working on this volume in early 2020, shortly after the world came to an abrupt halt. We owe our gratitude first and foremost to our families who supported (and endured) our research endeavours through numerous lockdowns and a global pandemic. This work is dedicated to them.

There are many people who contributed to this volume in a number of ways. The past and present editors of the Ancient Religion and Cognition series, Esther Eidinow and Tom Harrison, supported us throughout the publication process – we could not have asked for more helpful, dedicated, and kind individuals. Many thanks to Michael Sharp and Katie Idle at Cambridge University Press who have been very generous and supportive along the way, and to our anonymous peer reviewers who provided invaluable feedback. We are deeply grateful to Thorsten Opper and the team at the British Museum, Carlotta Caruso and the Museo Nazionale Romano Baths of Diocletian museum, and Mojca Vomer Gojkovič and the Pokrajinski muzej Ptuj-Ormož, who allowed excellent access to materials in their collections.

Our gratitude is also extended to many scholars who we may not have met in person, but who have influenced our own scholarship and inspired this work, notably Armin W. Geertz, Dimitris Xygalatas, Harvey Whitehouse, Jörg Rüpke, Angelos Chaniotis, and Douglas Cairns.

The research in this volume was originally presented as part of a TRAC panel in 2019, and we appreciated the opportunity to present to such an innovative and engaged audience. The present chapters have evolved significantly based on suggestions and discussions between contributors that took place both during and after this panel. These discussions played a key role in shaping the content of this volume and illustrating the strengths of dynamic and diverse approaches to rituals and lived experiences. We are greatly indebted to the contributors of this volume without whose kindness, patience, and stellar scholarship this volume would not be possible.

Last but not least, we thank you, dear reader.



CIL

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-35554-4 — Senses, Cognition, and Ritual Experience in the Roman World Blanka Misic, Abigail Graham Frontmatter More Information

Abbreviations

AE L'Année Épigraphique, published

in Revue Archéologique and separately

(1888-)

AIJ Antike Inschriften aus Jugoslavien

(1938)

ANFThe Ante-Nicene Fathers: Translations of the Writings of the

Fathers Down to A.D. 325, 10 Vols.

Arist. [Mund.] Pseudo Aristotle De Mundo
Caes. BGall. Caesar Bellum Gallicum

CCSL Corpus Christianorum, series Latina

(1953-)

Cic. Att. Cicero (Marcus Tullius) Epistulae ad

Atticum

Cic. Brut. Cicero (Marcus Tullius) Brutus or De

Claris Oratoribus Corpus Inscriptionum

Cyril of Jerusalem, *Myst. Cat.*Latinarum (1863–)

Mystagogic Catecheses

Dio Cassius Dio Cassius

Dion. Hal. Ant. Rom.

Dionysius Halicarnassensis

Antiquitates Romanae

Empedo. Frag.

Empedocles Fragmenta

Gell. NA

Aulus Gellius Noctes Atticae

Hes. Theog. Hesiod, Theogonia.

Hom. Hom. Hymn Dem.
Homer Homeric Hymn to Demeter
Hom. Hom Hymn Hel.
Homer Homeric Hymn to Helios
Hom. Hom Hymn Her.
Homer Homeric Hymn to Hermes

Hom. *Il.* Homer *Iliad* Home *Odyssey*

хi



More Information

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-35554-4 — Senses, Cognition, and Ritual Experience in the Roman World Blanka Misic, Abigail Graham Frontmatter

> xii List of Abbreviations

I.Eph. H. Wankel, R. Merkelbach et al., Die

Inschriften von Ephesos, I-VIII (Bonn

1979–84)

Joseph. AJ Josephus Antiquitates Judaicae

Juvenal Juv. Livy, Epit. Livy Epitomae Livy, Per. Livy Periochae

Luc. De mort. Peregr. Lucan De morte Peregrini

Mart. Ep. Martial Epigrams

Pindar (ed. B. Snell and H. Maehler, Pind. Pae.

> 1987-88) Paeanes Plato Timaeus

Pl. Ti. Plaut, Truc. Plautus Truculentus Plin. HN

Pliny (the Elder) Naturalis historia Plut. De def. or. Plutarch De defectu oraculorum Procopius Bella Gothica, Persica, Procop. Bell. Pers.

Vandalica

Sophocles *Ajax* Soph. Aj. Soph. Trach. Sophocles Trachiniae

Strab. Strabo

Tac. Ann. Tacitus Annales

Theophr. Sens. Theophrastus De sensibus Varro, Ling. Varro, De lingua Latina Vitr. De arch. Vitruvius De architectura Xen Ephes Xenophon of Ephesus