

Systems, Relations, and the Structures of International Societies

Inspired by recent work in evolutionary, developmental, and systems biology, *Systems, Relations, and the Structures of International Societies* sketches a robust conception of systems that grounds a new conception of levels (of organization, not merely analysis). Understanding international systems as multi-level multi-actor complex adaptive systems allows explanations of important features of the world that are inaccessible to dominant causal and rationalist explanatory strategies. The book also develops a comprehensive critique of IR's dominant conception of systems and structures; presents a novel conception of the interrelationship of the social production of continuities and the social production of change; and sketches models of spatio-political structure that cast new light on the development of international systems, including a distinctive account of the nature of globalization.

Jack Donnelly is the Andrew Mellon Professor in the Josef Korbel School of International Studies at the University of Denver. His book *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice* is widely acknowledged as one of the preeminent works in the field of international human rights and his work in international relations theory has been published in leading journals including *International Organization*, *European Journal of International Relations*, and *International Theory*.

Cambridge Studies in International Relations

Editors

Evelyn Goh

Christian Reus-Smit

Nicholas J. Wheeler

Editorial board

Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong Khong,
 Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Nicola Phillips, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd,
 Jacque True, Leslie Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.

165 *Jason Ralph***On global learning**

Pragmatic constructivism, international practice and the challenge of global governance

164 *Barry Buzan***Making global society**

A study of humankind across three eras

163 *Brian Rathbun***Right and wronged in international relations**

Evolutionary ethics, moral revolutions, and the nature of power politics

162 *Vincent Pouliot and Jean-Philippe Thérien***Global policymaking**

The patchwork of global governance

161 *Swati Srivastava***Hybrid sovereignty in world politics**160 *Rohan Mukherjee***Ascending order**

Rising powers and the politics of status in international institutions

Series list continues after index

Systems, Relations, and the Structures of International Societies

Jack Donnelly

University of Denver



Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-009-35520-9 — Systems, Relations, and the Structures of International Societies

Jack Donnelly

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009355209

DOI: 10.1017/9781009355193

© Jack Donnelly 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Donnelly, Jack, author.

Title: Systems, relations, and the structures of international societies / Jack Donnelly.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023021010 | ISBN 9781009355186 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781009355193 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: International organization. | Social systems. |

International relations – Philosophy.

Classification: LCC JZ1318 .D66 2024 | DDC 327–dc23/eng/20230821

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023021010>

ISBN 978-1-009-35518-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-35520-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiv

**Part I Systems, Relations, Levels, and Explanations:
Foundations for Systemic/Relational IR**

1	Systems and Relations	3
1.1	Systems	3
1.2	Systemic and Analytic Explanations	5
1.3	Levels of Organization	6
1.4	Relations and Systems	7
1.5	Relationalism	10
1.6	Processes	13
1.7	Mechanisms	15
1.8	Assemblages	17
1.9	Treating International Systems <i>as</i> Systems	18
1.10	Postscript: Waltz and Jervis on Systems	19
2	Complex Adaptive Systems	20
2.1	The Partial (In)separability of Systems and Their Components	20
2.1.1	Analysis, Reduction, Decomposition	20
2.1.2	The (Limited) Holism of Systemic Wholes	23
2.1.3	States and States Systems	24
2.2	Emergence	26
2.2.1	Non-aggregativity	26
2.2.2	Dense Interconnections Require Systemic Explanations	27
2.3	Complexity	29
2.3.1	Complex, Complicated, and Aggregated	29
2.3.2	Non-linearity	30
2.3.3	Self-Organization	31
2.3.4	Adaptation (Complex Adaptive Systems)	33
2.3.5	Modularity	34
2.4	The Difference Systemism/Relationism Makes	36
3	From Levels of Analysis to Levels of Organization	38
3.1	Levels of Abstraction/Explanation	38
3.2	Levels of Analysis in IR	39

vi	Contents	
3.3	Levels of Analysis vs. Levels of Organization	42
3.4	Micro and Macro	43
3.4.1	Triads of Levels	43
3.4.2	Against Micro-foundations	44
3.5	The Agent–Structure Problem	46
3.6	Biological Individuals	49
3.7	Individual Human Beings	51
3.8	Social Groups Are Individuals Too	52
3.9	Genidentity: A Processual Perspective on Identity	53
3.10	Identities and Persons	56
3.11	Structure	58
4	Systems, Causes, and Theory: Explanatory Pluralism in IR	60
4.1	Waltz on Theory	61
4.1.1	Causes, Independent Variables, and Structural Theory	61
4.1.2	“A Theory Is a Picture”	62
4.1.3	How Explanations	63
4.1.4	The Diversity of Scientific Explanations	64
4.2	Explanation	64
4.3	Causes, Causation, and Explanation	64
4.4	Independent-Variable vs. Systemic Causation	67
4.5	This-Is-a-Cause-of-That vs. How Explanations	68
4.6	Explanation: How, What, and Why	69
4.6.1	Associational Explanations	70
4.6.2	Systemic Explanations	70
4.6.3	Additional Kinds of Explanations	72
4.7	Explanatory Pluralism	73
4.8	Theories, Models, and Explanations	73
4.8.1	Social-Scientific “Theory”	74
4.8.2	Laws and Theories vs. Mechanisms and Models	76
4.8.3	Schemas, Sketches, Perspectives, and Causal Thickets	77
4.9	Descriptive Accuracy in Systemic/Structural Explanations	78

Part II Waltzian Structural Theory: A Postmortem

5	Structural Theory	85
5.1	Waltz’s Theory of International Politics	85
5.1.1	Systems, Structures, and Levels	85
5.1.2	The Elements of Political Structures	86
5.1.3	Structural Realism and Structural Effects	86
5.2	A Structure and Interacting Units	87
5.3	Structural Theory	89
5.4	Reductive Explanations	90
5.5	“Units”	91
5.6	“The System”	92
5.7	The Individualism of Waltzian Theory	93
5.8	Systems Are Not Environments	94
5.9	Systems of Structured Relations	95

Contents	vii
6 Anarchy	97
6.1 Anarchy Is Not an Ordering Principle	97
6.1.1 Anarchy, Government, and Hierarchy	97
6.1.2 Anarchy over “Anarchy”	100
6.1.3 Waltz’s Double Dichotomy	101
6.1.4 Anarchy Is Not the Ordering Principle of International Systems	103
6.1.5 Demarcation, Structure, and Explanation	103
6.1.6 What Is Anarchy?	104
6.2 Anarchy Has No Effects: The Consequences of Anarchy	105
6.3 Anarchy Has No Effects: The Case of Forager Societies	109
6.3.1 Demography and Economy	110
6.3.2 Politics	112
6.3.3 Conflict and Violence	113
6.3.4 Forager Warlessness	114
6.3.5 Binding through Sharing: A Logic of Anarchy	115
6.3.6 Anarchy Has No Effects	116
6.4 The Discourse of Anarchy in IR	117
6.4.1 “Anarchy” in Pre-1979 IR: Quantitative Evidence	117
6.4.2 The Pattern of Usage in Pre-1979 IR	118
6.4.3 The Rise of a Discourse of Anarchy	121
6.4.4 Words and Concepts	123
6.5 The Construction of Anarchy	127
7 The Tripartite Conception of Structure	134
7.1 The Distinctiveness of the Waltzian Conception	135
7.2 Three Simple Anarchic Systems	136
7.2.1 The Hobbesian State of Nature and Forager Societies	137
7.2.2 Great Power States Systems	138
7.2.3 The Effects of Existential Fear	139
7.2.4 The Failure of the Tripartite Conception	141
7.3 Looking Behind the Tripartite Conception	143
7.4 Structural Theory vs. Theory of International Politics	144
8 Functional Differentiation and Distribution of Capabilities	146
8.1 International Systems <i>Are</i> Functionally Differentiated	146
8.2 The Distribution of Capabilities	147
8.2.1 The Distribution of Capabilities in Domestic Political Systems	148
8.2.2 The Distribution of Capabilities in International Political Systems	150
9 Ordering Principles	153
9.1 Hierarchy	153
9.1.1 Hierarchy Is Not an Ordering Principle	154
9.1.2 The Discourse of Hierarchy in IR	155
9.2 Political Systems Do Not Have Ordering Principles	156
9.3 Ryan Griffiths: Two-Dimensional Ordering Principles	157
9.3.1 Anarchy, Hierarchy, Centralization, and Sovereignty	157
9.3.2 Mechanical and Organic Solidarity	159

viii	Contents	
	9.3.3 Two-Dimensional Ordering Principles	160
	9.3.4 “Ordering Principles” That Do Not Specify Forms of International Order	162
9.4	Albert, Buzan, and Zurn: Three Principles of Differentiation	163
	9.4.1 Types of Societies and Dimensions of Differentiation	164
	9.4.2 Types Are Not Defined by a Dominant Dimension of Differentiation	164
	9.4.3 Fitting Types to the World	166
	9.4.4 Combining “Forms” of Differentiation	168
9.5	Causal Depth and Generative Structures	169
9.6	From Structure to the Structuring of Systems	171
9.7	Postscript: The Dead End of Waltzian Structuralism	172
Part III Systems, Relations, and Processes: Reframing Systemic International Theory		
Part III (A) Differentiation and Continuous (Trans)formation		177
10	Relations, Processes, and Systems: Configuring Configurations That Configure	179
10.1	Relations and Processes: Toward Relational Processualism	179
10.2	Configuring Configurations That Configure	183
10.3	The Attractions of a Relational Processual Frame	184
10.4	<i>Relational</i> Processualism	185
10.5	International Systems as Hierarchically Layered Assemblages	185
11	Multiple Dimensions of Differentiation in Assembled International Systems	188
11.1	Differentiation	188
	11.1.1 Checklists, Toolkits, and Building Blocks	188
	11.1.2 Vertical and Horizontal Differentiation	189
	11.1.3 Formal and Substantive Differentiation	190
11.2	Differentiating Actors, Activities, and Authorities	190
	11.2.1 Segmentation (Actors) and Terminal Peer Politics	190
	11.2.2 Functional Differentiation (Activities)	192
	11.2.3 Stratification (Authorities)	193
11.3	Material Differentiation: Geotechnics and Scarcity	194
	11.3.1 Material Factors in Structural Realism	195
	11.3.2 Geotechnics and Scarcity	196
11.4	Additional Dimensions of Differentiation	198
	11.4.1 Polarity	198
	11.4.2 Levels of Organization	199
	11.4.3 Interaction Capacity	199
11.5	Positioned Social Persons	200
11.6	International Systems as Ecosystems	201
11.7	Summary	203

Contents	ix
12 Continuous (Trans)formation: Producing Social Continuity and Social Change	204
12.1 Systems Far from Thermodynamic Equilibrium	204
12.2 Continuous (Trans)formation	207
12.3 The Continuous (Trans)formation of Early Modern Militaries	209
12.3.1 The Military Revolution in Early Modern Europe	209
12.3.2 The Military Revolution in Early Modern France	210
12.4 The Inseparability of Continuities and Transformations	214
12.5 Transposition and Re-functionality	215
12.6 Eventful History	219
12.7 Conclusion	221
13 Life Sciences and Social Sciences: Studying Co-evolving Complex Adaptive Systems	223
13.1 Evolution	224
13.1.1 Units and Levels of Evolution	224
13.1.2 The Process and Progress of Evolution	226
13.1.3 Co-evolution	227
13.1.4 Evolution as Modular Tinkering	229
13.2 “Evolution” in the Social World	230
13.3 Development	233
13.3.1 Cell Differentiation	233
13.3.2 Performing Processes of Development	235
13.3.3 Phenotypic Plasticity and Environmental Influences on Development	236
13.4 Systems Biology and Relational/Systemic Social Science	238
13.4.1 Systems Biology: A Model for the Social Sciences	238
13.4.2 Beyond Causes and Theories: How (Not What or Why) Explanations	239
13.4.3 Models and Theories	241
Part III (B) Four Excursions in Relational/Systemic IR	245
14 Normative-Institutional Differentiation	247
14.1 Institutions and Practices	248
14.2 Constitutional Structures	249
14.2.1 Principles and Practices of International Legitimacy	250
14.2.2 Principles and Practices of Domestic Legitimacy	252
14.2.3 Foundational Functional Practices	252
14.2.4 Hegemonic Cultural Values	254
14.3 Types of Security Systems	254
14.4 Transforming Post-World War II International Society	259
14.4.1 Abolishing Territorial Acquisition by War	259
14.4.2 Abolishing Overseas Colonial Empires	260
14.4.3 Norms, Causes, and Changing Social Practices	262
14.4.4 The Forcible Acquisition of Territory since 1945	263
14.4.5 The 2022 Russian Invasion of Ukraine	265
14.5 Regulative Regimes and International Governance	267

x Contents

15 Vertical Differentiation: Stratification and Hierarchy in International Systems	268
15.1 Stratification, Hierarchy, and Inequality	268
15.2 Forms of Hierarchy	270
15.3 Single-Layer Systems: Unstratified and Autarchic Orders	272
15.4 Multilayered (Hierarchical) Orders	274
15.5 Single (Convergent) Hierarchies I: States Systems	274
15.5.1 Types of States Systems	274
15.5.2 Hierarchy in States Systems	280
15.6 Single (Convergent) Hierarchies II: Imperial International Systems	280
15.7 Multiply Ranked Orders: Heterarchies	282
15.7.1 Heterarchy	282
15.7.2 Hegemony as Heterarchy	284
15.7.3 Heterarchy at the Turn of the Twentieth Century	287
15.8 Conceptual Comments on Hierarchy and Heterarchy	289
15.9 Typologies and Model-Based Explanation	290
15.9.1 Model-Based Explanation	290
15.9.2 Thinking about Change with Typologies	291
16 Levels, Centers, and Peripheries: Spatio-Political Differentiation	295
16.1 Three Conceptions of Political Centralization	295
16.1.1 Centralization as the Concentration of Power	295
16.1.2 Centralization as the Centering of Power	296
16.1.3 Center-Periphery Differentiation	297
16.2 Spatio-Political Differentiation	299
16.3 Systems of Single-Level Governance (States Systems)	301
16.4 Systems of Single-Center Governance (States and Empires)	303
16.4.1 Integrated Polities (States)	303
16.4.2 Aggregated Polities (Empires)	305
16.4.3 Integrated and Aggregated Systems of Single-Center Rule	305
16.5 Systems of Multilevel Multiactor Governance (Heterarchies)	306
16.6 Summary: Types of Polities and International Systems	309
17 Continuous (Trans)formation of Eurocentric Political Systems (c. 1225 – c. 2025)	310
17.1 High Medieval Heterarchy	310
17.2 Late Medieval Changes	313
17.3 New Monarchies and the Rise of a European States System	314
17.4 Early Modern Dynastic Empire-States	316
17.4.1 France	317
17.4.2 Spain	319
17.4.3 England/Britain	320
17.4.4 The Holy Roman Empire of the German Nation	321
17.5 States, Status, Corporations, and Privileges	324
17.5.1 States and Status	324
17.5.2 Corporations, Privileges, and Estates	326
17.6 Agglomeration, Centralization, and Particularism	328
17.7 Early Modern Administration	329
17.7.1 Spain	330
17.7.2 France	331
17.7.3 Administering Early Modern Polities	333

Contents	xi
17.8 The Logic of Composition in Early Modern Europe	334
17.9 Change in Early Modern Europe	335
17.9.1 Crisis and Growth	335
17.9.2 Periodizing Early Modern Politics	337
17.10 Baroque Absolutism and Fiscal-Military States	337
17.10.1 “Absolutist” States	338
17.10.2 Fiscal-Military States	340
17.11 A Succession of Types of Polities	341
17.12 Pre-modern Politics in an Early Modern States System	342
17.13 Before (and Beyond) “International Relations”	344
17.13.1 Before “International Relations”	344
17.13.2 Beyond “National” and “International” Politics: Layered Systems of Polities	346
17.14 Re-assembling a Globalizing World	347
17.14.1 From States System to Heterarchy	348
17.14.2 Globalization as Continuous (Trans)formation	349
17.15 Alternative Framings	350
18 Afterword: Multiple Approaches to Multidimensional Systems of Relations	353
18.1 Multiple Models of Multidimensional Systems	353
18.2 The Nature of Systemic/Relational Explanations	354
<i>References</i>	358
<i>Index</i>	452

Figures

3.1 Coleman’s boat	<i>page 45</i>
6.1 Types of consequences of anarchy	107
9.1 Griffiths on political centralization	158
9.2 Griffiths on social differentiation	160
9.3 Two-dimensional ordering principles	161
14.1 Constitutional structure of international societies	251
15.1 A typology of hierarchical stratification	271
15.2 “Flat” orders	273
15.3 Stratification in an unpolarized states system	275
15.4 Stratification in a multipolar states system	276
15.5 Stratification in a great power states system	277
15.6 Spheres of influence and protectorates	278
15.7 Stratification in a concert system	279
15.8 Stratification in an imperial system	281
15.9 Stratification in a unipolar states system	282
15.10 Stratification in a dual hegemony system	285
15.11 Stratification in a single hegemony system	286
15.12 Stratification in turn-of-the-twentieth-century international society	288
15.13 A typology of international systems	292
16.1 Centralized (spokes-and-hub) empires	296
16.2 Centralization in a states system	297
16.3 Centered hierarchy in an imperial system	298
16.4 A three-level spatial grid	300
16.5 A Waltzian states system	301
16.6 Single-level governance by terminal peer polities (a states system)	303
16.7 Single-center governance of a unitary integrated polity (a unitary state)	304
16.8 Single-center governance of a federal integrated polity	304
16.9 Single-center governance of an aggregated political system (empire)	305
16.10 Multilevel multiactor governance (heterarchy)	307
16.11 Heterarchic stratification in contemporary Europe	308

Tables

6.1 Occurrences of “anarchy” and “anarchic” in selected books	<i>page</i> 118
9.1 Uses of “hierarchy” or “hierarchical” in selected books	155
14.1 Types of international security systems	255

Acknowledgments

If this is more than an OK book, that is largely due to the efforts of the editors and reviewers at Cambridge University Press and at *International Theory*, *European Journal of International Relations*, and *International Organization*, where preliminary versions of more than a third of this MS first appeared. I am immensely appreciative of the prodigious quantity of thoughtful and constructive criticisms that I received from more than twenty anonymous referees and multiple editorial teams trying to drag out of me ideas and arguments that were not yet properly formulated (or, sometimes, not even apparent) in the draft in question. (If this book were to have a dedication, it would be “To Reviewer A (whoever you might be).”) And I am particularly grateful to John Haslam at CUP, who has shepherded this project through multiple proposals and drafts over (I am embarrassed to admit) five years.

I also owe a considerable debt to a large group of readers and listeners, going back in some cases nearly two decades. If my records serve me correctly, these include Emanuel Adler, Dogus Aktan, Mathias Albert, Debbie Avant, Sarah Bania-Dobbins, John Barkdull, Naaz Barma, Andy Bennett, Mariano Bertucci, Ahsan Butt, Chris Brown, Barry Buzan, Andy Bennett, George Demartino, Dan Deudney, Jon Elster, Rachel Epstein, Dave Forsythe, Paige Fortna, Claudia Fuentes, David Goldfischer, Ilene Gabel, John Hobson, Barry Hughes, Ian Hurd, Raslan Ibrahim, Patrick Jackson, Pat James, Leigh Jenco, Dave Lake, Anthony Langlois, Jae Won Lee, Andrew Linklater[†], Charles Lipson, Andy Moravcsik, Jonathan Moyer, Abe Newman, Dan Nexon, Nick Onuf, Lucas Paes, Louis Pascarella, M. J. Peterson, Alex Prichard, Brian Rathbun, Martin Rhodes, Randy Schweller, Jason Sharman, Chris Shay, Duncan Snidal, Jack Snyder, Hidemi Suganami, Cameron Thies, Alex Thompson, Matt Weinert, David Welch, Alex Wendt, Peter Wilson, Bill Wohlforth, Ayse Zarakol, and Michael Zurn as well as participants at seminars at American University, Columbia

[†] Deceased.

Acknowledgments

xv

University, Georgetown University, London School of Economics, National University of Singapore, Ohio State University, University of British Columbia, University of California at San Diego, University of Chicago, University of Denver, University of Southern California, and Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung.

Bob Jervis, who died while I was completing the final draft, deserves special mention. He was a reviewer of an early article that helped to define this book, hosted me twice for seminars at Columbia, and made some very useful suggestions on the structure of the book. And his fine book on systems was an inspiration. Although I did not know him well, he was a kind and gracious colleague whose support I greatly appreciated. Our discipline has been diminished by his death.

Finally, saving the most important for last, I thank my wife, Katy, and my son, Kurosh, who are the true lights of my life. They make me a very lucky boy indeed.