

## PRIVATE CRIMINAL JUSTICE

The United States is in the midst of a significant reevaluation of its criminal justice system, with increasing calls for reforming or defunding the police and efforts to curb mass incarceration. But focusing on the public criminal justice system paints an incomplete picture of how we address criminal activity. In *Private Criminal Justice*, Ric Simmons shows how significant amounts of criminal activity are detected by private police and how many disputes are settled not in public courts, but through informal agreements between the victim and the accused or through adjudicative procedures run by private institutions. In this timely and eye-opening book, Simmons examines the vast, diverse, and underappreciated private criminal justice system, suggesting reforms that can make these private responses fairer and revealing lessons that the private criminal justice system can teach reformers of the public criminal justice system.

Ric Simmons is the Jacob E. Davis and Jacob E. Davis II Chair in Law and the Associate Dean for Faculty and Intellectual Life at The Ohio State University Moritz College of Law. He is the author of *Smart Surveillance: How to Interpret the Fourth Amendment in the Twenty-First Century* (2019) and the coauthor of four textbooks on criminal procedure and evidence.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-34717-4 — Private Criminal Justice  
Ric Simmons  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Private Criminal Justice

HOW PRIVATE PARTIES ARE ENFORCING CRIMINAL  
LAW AND TRANSFORMING OUR JUSTICE SYSTEM

**RIC SIMMONS**

The Ohio State University



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-34717-4 — Private Criminal Justice  
Ric Simmons  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009347174](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009347174)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009347181

© Ric Simmons 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Simmons, Ric, author.

TITLE: Private criminal justice : how private parties are enforcing criminal law and  
transforming our justice / Ric Simmons, Ohio State University.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press,  
2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023015889 (print) | LCCN 2023015890 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009347174  
(hardback) | ISBN 9781009347136 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009347181 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Criminal justice, Administration of – United States. | Police, Private –  
Legal status, laws, etc. – United States. | Dispute resolution (Law) – United States. |  
Alternatives to imprisonment – United States. | Alternative convictions – United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF9223 .S556 2024 (print) | LCC KF9223 (ebook) | DDC 345.73/05–  
dc23/eng/20230712

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023015889>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023015890>

ISBN 978-1-009-34717-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-34713-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vi</i>
<b>Introduction: The Rise of Private Criminal Justice</b>	1
1 <b>Criminal Justice without the State</b>	9
2 <b>A Brief History of Crime</b>	29
3 <b>Public Failings, Private Opportunities</b>	40
4 <b>Private Law Enforcement</b>	54
5 <b>Private Criminal Settlements as Plea Bargains</b>	73
6 <b>Private Criminal Settlements as Blackmail</b>	101
7 <b>Private Adjudications</b>	117
8 <b>Private Dispositions</b>	134
9 <b>Regulating Private Criminal Justice</b>	156
10 <b>The Verdict on Private Criminal Justice</b>	170
<i>Notes</i>	194
<i>Index</i>	244

## Acknowledgments

For their feedback on earlier incarnations of this work, I would like to thank Erin C. Blondel, John Braithwaite, Sarah Cole, Elizabeth Joh, Brenner Fissell, Michael Gentithes, Joe Kennedy, Guha Krishnamurthi, Michael J. Zydney Mannheimer, Alice Ristroph, and David Sklansky. I am indebted to my many wonderful Ohio State colleagues who participated in numerous faculty workshops for different parts of this book. I also received helpful feedback from the faculty of Salmon P. Chase College of Law at Northern Kentucky University and from participants in the CrimFest conference in the summer of 2021 and the summer of 2022. I would like to extend further thanks to Jessica Ackerman, Courtney Cook, Shawn Davisson, Leah Finley, Doug Hattaway, Chloe Palmer, and Brian Stewart for their research assistance. I especially want to thank my research assistant Nathan Rhodes for his extremely helpful contributions in pulling this book together. Above all, and as always, I give my thanks to Angie Lloyd for her constant support and invaluable feedback.

Portions of the following articles appear in a substantially reworked form in this book: *Legal Vigilantes*, *AMERICAN CRIMINAL LAW REVIEW* (forthcoming 2024); *Constitutional Double Standards: The Unintended Consequences of Reducing Police Presence*, 91 *GEORGE WASHINGTON LAW REVIEW* (2023); *Private Plea Bargains*, 89 *NORTH CAROLINA LAW REVIEW* 1125 (2011); and *Private Criminal Justice*, 42 *WAKE FOREST LAW REVIEW* 911 (2007).