

When Nations Can't Default

War reparations have been large and small, repaid and defaulted on, but the consequences have almost always been significant. Ever since Keynes made his case against German reparations in *The Economic Consequences of the Peace*, the effects of transfer payments have been hotly debated. *When Nations Can't Default* tells the history of war reparations and their consequences by combining history, political economy, and open economy macroeconomics. It visits often forgotten episodes and tells the story of how reparations were mostly repaid – and when they were not. Analysing fifteen episodes of war reparations, this book argues that reparations are unlike other sovereign debt because repayment is enforced by military and political force, making it a senior liability of the state.

Simon Hinrichsen runs investments in emerging market sovereign bonds for a pension fund and has published in journals on history and economics. He is an external associate professor at the University of Copenhagen where he teaches a course on sovereign debt. He has advised governments and was previously a visiting fellow at the London School of Economics.

STUDIES IN MACROECONOMIC HISTORY

Series Editor: Michael D. Bordo, *Rutgers University*

Editors:

Owen F. Humpage, *Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland*
Christopher M. Meissner, *University of California, Davis*
Kris James Mitchener, *Santa Clara University*
David C. Wheelock, *Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis*

The titles in this series investigate themes of interest to economists and economic historians in the rapidly developing field of macroeconomic history. The four areas covered include the application of monetary and finance theory, international economics, and quantitative methods to historical problems; the historical application of growth and development theory and theories of business fluctuations; the history of domestic and international monetary, financial, and other macroeconomic institutions; and the history of international monetary and financial systems. The series amalgamates the former Cambridge University Press series *Studies in Monetary and Financial History* and *Studies in Quantitative Economic History*.

Other Books in the Series:

Barry Eichengreen and Andreas Kakridis, *The Spread of the Modern Central Bank and Global Cooperation: 1919–1939* (2023)

Alain Naef, *An Exchange Rate History of the United Kingdom: 1945–1992* (2021)

Barrie A. Wigmore, *The Financial Crisis of 2008: A History of US Financial Markets 2000–2012* (2021)

Max Harris, *Monetary War and Peace: London, Washington, Paris, and the Tripartite Agreement of 1936* (2021)

Kenneth D. Garbade, *After the Accord: A History of Federal Reserve Open Market Operations, the US Government Securities Market, and Treasury Debt Management from 1951 to 1979* (2020)

Harold James, *Making a Modern Central Bank: The Bank of England 1979–2003* (2020)

Claudio Borio, Stijn Claessens, Piet Clement, Robert N. McCauley, and Hyun Song Shin, Editors, *Promoting Global Monetary and Financial Stability: The Bank for International Settlements after Bretton Woods, 1973–2020* (2020)

Patrick Honohan, *Currency, Credit and Crisis: Central Banking in Ireland and Europe* (2019)

- William A. Allen, *The Bank of England and the Government Debt: Operations in the Gilt-Edged Market, 1928–1972* (2019)
- Eric Monnet, *Controlling Credit: Central Banking and the Planned Economy in Postwar France, 1948–1973* (2018)
- Laurence M. Ball, *The Fed and Lehman Brothers: Setting the Record Straight on a Financial Disaster* (2018)
- Rodney Edvinsson, Tor Jacobson, and Daniel Waldenström, Editors, *Sveriges Riksbank and the History of Central Banking* (2018)
- Peter L. Rousseau and Paul Wachtel, Editors, *Financial Systems and Economic Growth: Credit, Crises, and the Regulation from the 19th Century to the Present* (2017)
- Ernst Baltensperger and Peter Kugler, *Swiss Monetary History since the Early 19th Century* (2017)
- Øyvind Eitrheim, Jan Tore Klovland, and Lars Fredrik Øksendal, A *Monetary History of Norway, 1816–2016* (2016)
- Jan Fredrik Qvigstad, *On Central Banking* (2016)
- Michael D. Bordo, Øyvind Eitrheim, Marc Flandreau, and Jan F. Qvigstad, Editors, *Central Banks at a Crossroads: What Can We Learn from History?* (2016)
- Michael D. Bordo and Mark A. Wynne, Editors, *The Federal Reserve's Role in the Global Economy: A Historical Perspective* (2016)
- Owen F. Humpage, Editor, *Current Federal Reserve Policy Under the Lens of Economic History: Essays to Commemorate the Federal Reserve System's Centennial* (2015)
- Michael D. Bordo and William Roberds, Editors, *The Origins, History, and Future of the Federal Reserve: A Return to Jekyll Island* (2013)
- Michael D. Bordo and Ronald MacDonald, Editors, *Credibility and the International Monetary Regime: A Historical Perspective* (2012)
- Robert L. Hetzel, *The Great Recession: Market Failure or Policy Failure?* (2012)
- Tobias Straumann, *Fixed Ideas of Money: Small States and Exchange Rate Regimes in Twentieth-Century Europe* (2010)
- Forrest Capie, *The Bank of England: 1950s to 1979* (2010)
- Aldo Musacchio, *Experiments in Financial Democracy: Corporate Governance and Financial Development in Brazil, 1882–1950* (2009)
- Claudio Borio, Gianni Toniolo, and Piet Clement, Editors, *The Past and Future of Central Bank Cooperation* (2008)
- Robert L. Hetzel, *The Monetary Policy of the Federal Reserve: A History* (2008)

Caroline Fohlin, *Finance Capitalism and Germany's Rise to Industrial Power* (2007)

John H. Wood, *A History of Central Banking in Great Britain and the United States* (2005)

Gianni Toniolo (with the assistance of Piet Clement), *Central Bank Cooperation at the Bank for International Settlements, 1930–1973* (2005)

Richard Burdekin and Pierre Siklos, Editors, *Deflation: Current and Historical Perspectives* (2004)

Pierre Siklos, *The Changing Face of Central Banking: Evolutionary Trends since World War II* (2002)

Michael D. Bordo and Roberto Cortés-Conde, Editors, *Transferring Wealth and Power from the Old to the New World: Monetary and Fiscal Institutions in the 17th through the 19th Centuries* (2001)

Howard Bodenhorn, *A History of Banking in Antebellum America: Financial Markets and Economic Development in an Era of Nation-Building* (2000)

Mark Harrison, Editor, *The Economics of World War II: Six Great Powers in International Comparison* (2000)

Angela Redish, *Bimetallism: An Economic and Historical Analysis* (2000)

Elmus Wicker, *Banking Panics of the Gilded Age* (2000)

Michael D. Bordo, *The Gold Standard and Related Regimes: Collected Essays* (1999)

Michele Fratianni and Franco Spinelli, *A Monetary History of Italy* (1997)

Mark Toma, *Competition and Monopoly in the Federal Reserve System, 1914–1951* (1997)

Barry Eichengreen, Editor, *Europe's Postwar Recovery* (1996)

Lawrence H. Officer, *Between the Dollar-Sterling Gold Points: Exchange Rates, Parity and Market Behavior* (1996)

Elmus Wicker, *The Banking Panics of the Great Depression* (1996)

Norio Tamaki, *Japanese Banking: A History, 1859–1959* (1995)

Barry Eichengreen, *Elusive Stability: Essays in the History of International Finance, 1919–1939* (1993)

Michael D. Bordo and Forrest Capie, Editors, *Monetary Regimes in Transition* (1993)

Larry Neal, *The Rise of Financial Capitalism: International Capital Markets in the Age of Reason* (1993)

S. N. Broadberry and N. F. R. Crafts, Editors, *Britain in the International Economy, 1870–1939* (1992)

Aurel Schubert, *The Credit-Anstalt Crisis of 1931* (1992)

Trevor J. O. Dick and John E. Floyd, *Canada and the Gold Standard: Balance of Payments Adjustment under Fixed Exchange Rates, 1871–1913* (1992)

Kenneth Mouré, *Managing the Franc Poincaré: Economic Understanding and Political Constraint in French Monetary Policy, 1928–1936* (1991)

David C. Wheelock, *The Strategy and Consistency of Federal Reserve Monetary Policy, 1924–1933* (1991)

When Nations Can't Default

*A History of War Reparations and
Sovereign Debt*

SIMON HINRICHSEN
University of Copenhagen



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-34392-3 — When Nations Can't Default
Simon Hinrichsen
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009343923

DOI: 10.1017/9781009343978

© Simon Hinrichsen 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from
the Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-009-34392-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Mathilda

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xv
<i>List of Tables</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
<i>Data and Replication</i>	xxi
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Defining War Reparations and Indemnities	2
1.2 War Finance and Sovereign Debt	6
1.3 Summary	10
2 A Framework for War Reparations	17
2.1 How to Finance Reparations	19
2.2 Balance of Payments	22
2.3 Terms of Trade	25
2.4 A Terms of Trade Model	26
2.4.1 Growth after Wars	28
2.4.2 The Model	32
2.4.3 Equilibrium	35
2.4.4 Calibration	36
2.4.5 Results	38
3 Sovereign Debt	41
3.1 Sovereign Debt Defaults	45
3.1.1 When to Default	46
3.1.2 Frequency of Defaults	48
3.1.3 How to Default on Sovereign Debt	50
3.1.4 Costs of Sovereign Debt Default	53
3.2 Sovereign Debt Restructurings	56
3.3 Odious Debts	60

3.4	A Practical Guide for Restructuring Sovereign Debt	61
3.4.1	The Fundamental Problem	62
3.4.2	The Restructuring Process	63
3.4.3	The Players	64
3.4.4	The Legal Aspects	65
3.5	A Sovereign Debt Model	65
3.5.1	Government	68
3.5.2	Firms	69
3.5.3	Households	69
3.5.4	Equilibrium	70
3.5.5	Default	71
3.5.6	Calibration	73
3.5.7	Sensitivity	78
3.6	Stylised Macroeconomic Facts about Sovereign Debt Defaults	79
3.7	The Sovereign Debt Default Set	83
4	Napoleonic Wars Reparations	86
4.1	Terms of Trade	94
4.2	How France Paid Reparations	96
5	Haiti Indemnity and Sovereign Debt	100
6	Franco-Prussian War Indemnities	104
7	Smaller Nineteenth-Century War Reparations	112
7.1	Mexican–American War Reparations	112
7.2	Cretan War Reparations	113
7.3	Chinese Reparations to Japan and Britain	113
8	German World War I Reparations	115
8.1	Germany after the War	116
8.2	The Dawes Plan	120
8.3	The Young Plan	122
8.4	Enforcement of Reparations	124
8.5	Germany's Sovereign Debt Default	126
9	Russian and Bulgarian World War I Reparations	130
10	World War II Reparations to the Soviet Bloc	133
10.1	Finnish Reparations to the Soviet Union	134
11	World War II Reparations to the Allies	139
11.1	German Reparations to Denmark	142
12	Iraq Gulf War Reparations	144
12.1	Historical Background	147
12.2	The Iran–Iraq War (1980–1988)	149
12.3	The Gulf War and Reparations (1988–1991)	157
12.4	Sanctions (1991–2003)	160
12.5	Terms of Iraqi Borrowing	163
12.6	The Iraq Sovereign Debt Restructuring	167
12.6.1	Iraqi Debts	169

	<i>Contents</i>	xiii
12.6.2	Immunising Iraqi Assets and Reconciling Debts	170
12.6.3	Paris Club Negotiations	174
12.6.4	Non-Paris Club Bilateral Debt Negotiations	177
12.6.5	Commercial Debt Claims and Restructuring	179
12.7	Haircuts and Odious Debts	184
13	When Nations Can't Default	188
	<i>Appendix: Letter to Creditor Committees</i>	191
	<i>References</i>	193
	<i>Index</i>	215

Figures

2.1	Smoothing of reparations liabilities.	<i>page</i> 21
2.2	Long-run secular and cyclical real GDP (1870–1960).	29
2.3	Change in detrended real GDP per capita (after first transfer).	31
2.4	Trade balance impulse response for different values of ρ .	38
2.5	Response to a terms of trade shock for $\rho = 0.25$.	39
3.1	Countries in default (1800–2020).	49
3.2	Global sovereign debt in default since 1960.	50
3.3	Paris Club restructurings (1956–2020).	58
3.4	Secular and cyclical components of real GDP (1860–1960).	74
3.5	Log-linear detrending and HP-filter of real GDP (1860–1960).	75
3.6	Distribution of external debt.	77
3.7	German model output for different values of β .	80
3.8	Stylised sovereign debt defaults.	81
3.9	Estimate of capital controls.	83
3.10	Default sets.	84
4.1	French trade balance and fiscal balance (1815–20).	90
4.2	French government debt stock (1800–30).	91
4.3	French long-term bond yields (1799–1830).	93
4.4	French terms of trade (1805–20).	95
4.5	French government expenditures (1815–20).	98
6.1	French savings, investments, and current account (1868–80).	106
6.2	French default set, debt stock, and detrended output.	107
6.3	Model estimate and French historical data (1870–73).	108

8.1	German savings, investments, and current account (1925–33).	117
8.2	German secular and cyclical real output per capita (1860–1940).	118
8.3	German default set, debt stock, and detrended output.	121
8.4	Model estimate and German historical data (1930–33).	127
8.5	Yields on German external bonds (1931–35).	129
9.1	Bulgaria net debt-to-GNP (1921–39).	131
10.1	Finnish savings, investments, and net goods exports (1945–52).	135
10.2	Finnish default set, debt stock, and detrended output.	136
10.3	Model estimate and Finnish historical data (1945–48).	138
12.1	Iraq government debt-to-GDP (1979–2020).	149
12.2	Iraqi expenditures and revenues (1980–89).	153
12.3	Iraqi trade balance and total trade in percentage of GDP (1980–95).	156
12.4	Iraqi debt and GDP.	161
12.5	Iraqi dual-currency values (1998–2003).	163
12.6	IMF oil price assumption and actual term structure.	175
12.7	BNL mark-to-market of Iraq loans (per cent of nominal and accrued).	183
12.8	Comparison of NPV haircuts in debt restructurings (1980–2009).	185

Tables

1.1	War reparations and indemnities since 1800.	<i>page 5</i>
2.1	Iraq balance of payments (US dollar billion).	23
2.2	Model parameters.	37
3.1	Model parameters.	78
3.2	Model statistics.	79
4.1	French reparations (million francs).	88
8.1	German economic phases between 1921 and 1933.	119
11.1	Recipients of reparations from Germany.	140
12.1	Iraqi debt by creditor, 1979.	148
12.2	Iraqi growth rates, 1970–89 (yearly average in percentage).	150
12.3	Iraqi debt by creditor, 1988.	155
12.4	Iraqi debt by creditor, 1991.	159
12.5	Iraqi debt by creditor, 2003.	162
12.6	Iraqi borrowing costs in US dollars and risk premium (1985–90).	165
12.7	Iraqi debt by creditor, 2019.	186

Acknowledgements

This book is the product of many years of work. It started because I thought there were not sufficiently good answers to questions I had about war reparations. Those questions led me more and more to focus on sovereign debt, my knowledge of which was only better because my day job for many years has been to invest in sovereign debt instruments. The book is therefore a good mix of academic, professional, and personal interests, and hopefully brings together a lot of the thoughts I have spent the better part of a decade formulating.

It is difficult to thank everyone who has been involved in the journey, because you always risk forgetting someone. If I do, I apologise, but I would like to thank everyone who helped with thoughts, discussions, and encouragement at the London School of Economics and Political Science, in particular Albrecht Ritschl, who spent many hours reading the manuscript and suggesting edits. Giancarlo Corsetti and Harold James both provided invaluable feedback on an early draft of the, at the time, thesis, which helped in expanding it into a book. Michael Bordo supported the idea of turning it into a book. Alain Naef read many drafts and I really thank him. Lots of people have been very helpful on the individual chapters that form the book. I would like to thank you all: Alan Beattie, Andrew Kilpatrick, Anna Gelpern, Anthony Marcus, Brad Setser, Clay Lowery, Daniel Zelikow, Eugene White, Francesco Saverio Leopardi, Gregor Smith, Jeremiah Pam, Lee Buchheit, Maanik Nath, Massimiliano Trentin, Mitu Gulati, Nazareth Festekjian, Olin Wethington, Patricia Adams, Patrick O'Brien, Sam Foxall, and Yasmin Shearmur. Finally, I want to thank the editors, who have been immensely helpful in making it into a final and much better read.

Above all else, I'd like to thank all my friends and family for support. I hope you enjoy the book.

Data and Replication

The data and code used in the book is available at the following link:
<https://sites.google.com/view/shinrichsen/research>.

The replication files run in MATLAB and are available alongside the underlying data. The names of the replication files used are specified under each figure or model, alongside the data source.