

ADVOCACY

Lord Pannick celebrates advocacy: that controversial legal issues are decided in court after reasoned argument in which the participants refrain (usually) from shouting, personal insults or threats, and the points on each side of the debate are tested for their relevance, their accuracy, and their strength. The book seeks to identify the central characteristics of good and bad advocacy with the aid of examples from courtrooms in the UK and abroad. Lord Pannick also examines the morality of advocacy – that the advocate sets out views to which he does not necessarily subscribe, on behalf of clients for whom she may feel admiration, indifference or contempt. Lord Pannick seeks to answer the question he is often asked – more by friends than by judges – "How can you act for such terrible people?" Finally, he addresses the future of advocacy, arguing it should and will survive pressures for efficiency and technological developments.

LORD DAVID PANNICK KC has been a practising barrister since 1980. His most famous case was arguing for Gina Miller in persuading the Supreme Court that it was unlawful for Prime Minister Boris Johnson to advise the Queen to suspend parliament in 2019 because of his wish to "get Brexit done". Lord Pannick has appeared in more than 125 cases in the Supreme Court and its predecessor the Appellate Committee of the House of Lords. He is also a crossbench member of the House of Lords and a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.



ADVOCACY

LORD DAVID PANNICK KC

Blackstone Chambers Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford Crossbench Peer in the House of Lords







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009338110

DOI: 10.1017/9781009338097

© Lord David Pannick KC 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Pannick, David, author.

TITLE: Advocacy / Lord David Pannick KC, Blackstone Chambers, Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford, Crossbench Peer in the House of Lords.

DESCRIPTION: First edition. | New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2023. | SERIES: Haml the hamlyn lectures | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022046579 (print) | LCCN 2022046580 (ebook) |
ISBN 9781009338103 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009338110 (paperback) |
ISBN 9781009338097 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Practice of law–Great Britain. | Practice of law–Moral and ethical aspects–Great Britain. | Lawyers–Great Britain.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KD460 .P33 2023 (print) | LCC KD460 (ebook) | DDC 340.023/41-dc23/eng/20230103

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022046579 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022046580

ISBN 978-1-009-33810-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-33811-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Nathalie



CONTENTS

The Hamlyn Trust page viii
The Hamlyn Lectures xi

Preface and Acknowledgements xvii

- 1 The Essence of Advocacy 1
- 2 The Morality of Advocacy 64
- 3 The Future of Advocacy 126

Index 176

vii



THE HAMLYN TRUST

The Hamlyn Trust owes its existence today to the will of the late Miss Emma Warburton Hamlyn of Torquay, who died in 1941 at the age of eighty. She came of an old and well-known Devon family. Her father, William Bussell Hamlyn, practised in Torquay as a solicitor and JP for many years, and it seems likely that Miss Hamlyn founded the trust in his memory. Emma Hamlyn was a woman of strong character, intelligent and cultured, well-versed in literature, music and art, and a lover of her country. She travelled extensively in Europe and Egypt, and apparently took considerable interest in the law and ethnology of the countries and cultures that she visited. An account of Miss Hamlyn by Professor Chantal Stebbings of the University of Exeter may be found, under the title "The Hamlyn Legacy", in volume 42 of the published lectures.

Miss Hamlyn bequeathed the residue of her estate on trust in terms which it seems were her own. The wording was thought to be vague, and the will was taken to the Chancery Division of the High Court, which in November 1948 approved a Scheme for the administration of the trust. Paragraph 3 of the Scheme, which follows Miss Hamlyn's own wording, is as follows:

The object of the charity is the furtherance by lectures or otherwise among the Common People of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland of the

viii



THE HAMLYN TRUST

knowledge of the Comparative Jurisprudence and Ethnology of the Chief European countries including the United Kingdom, and the circumstances of the growth of such jurisprudence to the Intent that the Common People of the United Kingdom may realise the privileges which in law and custom they enjoy in comparison with other European Peoples and realising and appreciating such privileges may recognise the responsibilities and obligations attaching to them.

At present there are eight Trustees:

Professor Avrom Sherr, University of London (Chair)
Professor Gordon Anthony, Queen's University Belfast
Dame Laura Cox QC
Professor Roger Halson, University of Leeds
Professor Jane Mair, University of Glasgow
Mr Joshua Rozenberg
Professor Rebecca Probert, University of Exeter
Professor Thomas Watkin, Bangor University

From the outset it was decided that the objects of the Trust could be best achieved by means of an annual course of public lectures of outstanding interest and quality by eminent lecturers, and by their subsequent publication and distribution to a wider audience. The first of the Lectures were delivered by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Denning (as he then was) in 1949. Since then there has been an unbroken series of annual Lectures published until 2005 by Sweet & Maxwell and from 2006 by Cambridge University Press. A complete list of the Lectures may be found on pages xi–xv. In 2005 the Trustees decided to supplement the Lectures with an annual

ix



THE HAMLYN TRUST

Hamlyn Seminar, normally held at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies in the University of London, to mark the publication of the Lectures in printed book form. The Trustees have also, from time to time, provided financial support for a variety of projects which, in various ways, have disseminated knowledge or have promoted a wider public understanding of the law.

This, the seventy-second series of lectures, was delivered by Lord David Pannick KC at Grays Inn Hall, London, the Senedd Building, Cardiff, and the Gulbenkian Theatre at the University of Oxford. The Board of Trustees would like to record its appreciation to David Pannick and also to the three institutions which generously hosted these Lectures.

Avrom Sherr Chair of the Trustees



THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1949	Preedom under the Law by the Rt Hon. Lord Denning
1950	The Inheritance of the Common Law by Richard O'Sullivan
1951	The Rational Strength of English Law by Professor F. H. Lawson
1952	English Law and the Moral Law by Professor A. L. Goodhart
1953	The Queen's Peace by Sir Carleton Kemp Allen
1954	Executive Discretion and Judicial Control by Professor C. J. Hamson
1955	The Proof of Guilt by Professor Glanville Williams
1956	Trial by Jury by the Rt Hon. Lord Devlin
1957	Protection from Power under English Law by the Rt Hon. Lord MacDermott
1958	The Sanctity of Contracts in English Law by Professor Sir David Hughes Parry
1959	Judge and Jurist in the Reign of Victoria by C. H. S. Fifoot
1960	The Common Law in India by M. C. Setalvad
1961	British Justice: The Scottish Contribution by Professor Sir Thomas Smith
1962	Lawyer and Litigant in England by the Rt Hon. Sir Robert Megarry
1963	Crime and the Criminal Law by the Baroness Wootton of Abinger

хi



THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1964	Law and Lawyers in the United States by Dean Erwin N. Griswold
1965	New Law for a New World? by the Rt Hon. Lord Tangley
1966	Other People's Law by the Rt Hon. Lord Kilbrandon
1967	The Contribution of English Law to South African Law: and the Rule of Law in South Africa by the Hon. O. D. Schreiner
1968	Justice in the Welfare State by Professor H. Street
1969	The British Tradition in Canadian Law by the Hon. Bora Laskin
1970	The English Judge by Henry Cecil
1971	Punishment, Prison and the Public by Professor Sir Rupert Cross
1972	Labour and the Law by Professor Sir Otto Kahn-Freund
1973	Maladministration and Its Remedies by Sir Kenneth Wheare
1974	English Law – the New Dimension by the Rt Hon. Lord Scarman
1975	The Land and the Development; or, The Turmoil and the Torment by Sir Desmond Heap
1976	The National Insurance Commissioners by Sir Robert Micklethwait
1977	The European Communities and the Rule of Law by Lord Mackenzie Stuart
1978	Liberty, Law and Justice by Professor Sir Norman Anderson
1979	Social History and Law Reform by Professor Lord McGregor of Durris
1980	Constitutional Fundamentals by Professor Sir William Wade

xii



THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1981	Intolerable Inquisition? Reflections on the Law of Tax by Hubert Monroe
1982	The Quest for Security: Employees, Tenants, Wives by Professor Tony Honoré
1983	Hamlyn Revisited: The British Legal System Today by Lord Hailsham of St Marylebone
1984	The Development of Consumer Law and Policy – Bold Spirits and Timorous Souls by Sir Gordon Borrie
1985	Law and Order by Professor Ralf Dahrendorf
1986	The Fabric of English Civil Justice by Sir Jack Jacob
1987	Pragmatism and Theory in English Law by Professor P. S. Atiyah
1988	Justification and Excuse in the Criminal Law by Professor J. C. Smith
1989	Protection of the Public – A New Challenge by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Woolf
1990	The United Kingdom and Human Rights by Dr Claire Palley
1991	Introducing a European Legal Order by Gordon Slynn
1992	Speech and Respect by Professor Richard Abel
1993	The Administration of Justice by Lord Mackay of Clashfern
1994	Blackstone's Tower: The English Law School by Professor William Twining
1995	From the Test Tube to the Coffin: Choice and Regulation in Private Life by the Hon. Mrs Justice Hale
1996	Turning Points of the Common Law by the Rt Hon. the Lord Cooke of Thorndon
1997	Commercial Law in the Next Millennium by Professor Roy Goode

xiii



THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1998	Freedom, Law and Justice by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Sedley
1999	The State of Justice by Professor Michael Zander QC
2000	Does the United Kingdom Still Have a Constitution? by Professor Anthony King
2001	Human Rights, Serious Crime and Criminal Procedure by Professor Andrew Ashworth QC
2002	Legal Conundrums in Our Brave New World by Baroness Kennedy of the Shaws
2003	Judicial Activism by the Hon. Justice Michael Kirby AC CMG
2004	Rights at Work: Global, European and British Perspectives by Sir Bob Hepple QC, FBA
2005	Can Human Rights Survive? by Professor Conor Gearty
2006	The Sovereignty of Law: The European Way by Sir Francis Jacobs KCMG, QC
2007	The Prisoners' Dilemma by Professor Nicola Lacey
2008	Judging Civil Justice by Dame Hazel Genn
2009	Widening Horizons: The Influence of Comparative Law and International Law on Domestic Law by Lord Bingham
2010	Lawyers and the Public Good: Democracy in Action? by Alan Paterson
2011	The Rule of Law and the Measure of Property by Jeremy Waldron
2012	Aspects of Law Reform: An Insider's Perspective by Jack Straw
2013	The Common Law Constitution by Sir John Laws
2014	UK, EU and Global Administrative Law by Paul Craig
2015	A "Magna Carta" for Children? – Rethinking Children's Rights by Professor Michael Freeman

xiv



THE HAMLYN LECTURES

2016	Fairness in Criminal Justice: Golden Threads and Pragmatic Patches by Dame Sian Elias
2017	Thinking about Statutes: Interpretation, Interaction, Improvement by Professor Andrew Burrows QC
2018	Making Comparisons in Equality Law by Robin Allen
2019	English Law under Two Elizabeths by Sir John



PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The three chapters of this book are expanded versions of the Hamlyn Lectures 2021. I gave the lectures on 9 November 2021 in Gray's Inn Hall, London, on 10 November 2021 in the Senedd Building, Cardiff, and on 11 November 2021 in the Gulbenkian Lecture Theatre in the St Cross Building, Oxford. There was also a very large remote audience watching and listening online.

I have added some references to developments after the delivery of the Lectures.

I am very grateful to Avrom Sherr, the Chair of the Hamlyn Trustees, for inviting me to give these Lectures and for his patience, good humour and organisational skills.

A number of friends and colleagues commented on drafts of the Lectures, pointing out some of my errors, exaggerations and stupidities. None of them is responsible for those that remain. Thank you, in particular, to Michael Beloff, Abraham Chan, Jeffrey Elkinson, Cécile Fabre, Bryan Garner, Tony Grabiner, Guy Pratte, Joshua Rozenberg and Richard Susskind.

Thank you for all their help in bringing this book to publication to Tom Randall and Claire Sissen of Cambridge University Press, to Vinithan Sedumadhavan (Project Manager at Straive) and to Joan Dale Lace (for her copyediting skills).

xvii



PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have on my desk the copy of Sir Malcolm Hilbery's *Duty and Art in Advocacy* (1959, written in 1946) presented to me by Leonard Caplan QC, the Treasurer of Gray's Inn, on my call to the Bar on 26 July 1979. I shall be very disappointed if my lectures are not more stimulating and entertaining for students, lawyers and others interested in advocacy.