

1 | The Many Haydns of Musicology

EMILY I. DOLAN AND MATTHEW HEAD

Introduction: Haydn's Unending Labour

Joseph Heyden will be received and treated as a house staff member. And his Serene Highness graciously places confidence in his belief that [Heyden] will conduct himself in a fitting manner, be mild, lenient, dignified, and composed with the musicians and not treat them in a brutal fashion. When the orchestra is called upon to perform, Vice Kapellmeister, as all subordinates, will appear in uniform, and this pertains not only to Joseph Heyden, but to all members, that they appear in white stockings and white shirt, with either pigtail or tie wig, and thoroughly powdered.¹

It is hard for teachers of courses on Enlightenment music to resist using this document: Haydn's 1761 contract with Prince Anton Esterházy, when he was appointed vice-kapellmeister. Students often find the stipulations almost comical in their quantity and specificity: the call for Haydn to appear daily in the princely antechamber to coordinate with his employer, his lack of ownership over his music, the expectation that he maintains both the instruments and the singers, and the inclusion of even the details of his expected appearance ('white stockings . . . pigtail or tie wig . . . thoroughly powdered'). The contract is a piece of historical evidence that makes Haydn's servitude vivid to students, who are often incredulous ('I wouldn't take that job!').

With this contract, Nicholas Mathew opens the final chapter of his recent book *The Haydn Economy*, which is simply entitled: 'Work'. 'For most of his life', Mathew writes, 'Haydn was constantly busy'.² In the chapter, Mathew deftly traces the common origins of the musical work concept and the economic concept of work. As Mathew builds his argument, he delves into Haydn's varying forms of labour and work, and

This chapter draws on and grows out of parts of our earlier essay 'Haydn and Ideas'.

¹ Anonymous secretary on behalf of Prince Paul Anton Esterházy, 'Convention and Rules for Behaviour of the *Vice-Capel-Meister* [sic]'. Translated and reproduced in Landon, *Chronicle and Works*, vol. 1, 350–52.

² Mathew, *Haydn Economy*, 125.

Haydn's reflections on them. Mathew places special emphasis on Haydn's career after the death of Prince Nikolaus in 1790: Haydn's new-found 'freedom' brought yet more labour as he entered the London marketplace. Mathew argues that Haydn's preoccupation with industry found an outlet in the finale of his Symphony No. 98 in B Flat Major, which makes zany fun of both Salomon's labour as a violinist (as he gets 'snagged' on a two-note upbeat), and Haydn's labour at the keyboard, with his tinkling solo, showing the 'author busily at work'.³ Mathew's chapter achieves something unusual in Haydn literature. Focusing closely on Haydn's expressions of stress, we catch a rare glimpse of Haydn as an ordinary man who was sometimes exhausted and homesick.

This chapter is also concerned with Haydn and labour: we focus not on his long days in the princely palaces in Eisenstadt or Esterháza, or his navigation of the bustling musical economy of London, but rather on the work that Haydn has done in music studies, long after his earthly productions ceased. From the nineteenth century onwards, Haydn's career and large body of works have been marshalled to many distinct ends – historiographical, musicological, and analytical – to make various arguments about music's social, aesthetic, and political efficacy. The sense of Haydn as a person that peeks through in Mathew's chapter is distinct from the more abstract and distant Haydn who is called upon to exemplify bigger and broader ideas about eighteenth-century musical culture.

Haydn's *The Creation* is a case in point. As we have written elsewhere, Haydn's much-beloved oratorio can be described as a much-used work: it joined the welcoming party for the belated entry of 'the Enlightenment' into Haydn scholarship in David P. Schroeder's pioneering study of the London Symphonies.⁴ Analyses of *The Creation* heralded a shift to hermeneutic approaches to Haydn's music with Lawrence Kramer's essay on the representation of chaos and the divine creation of light in the oratorio.⁵ In James Webster's work, *The Creation* was pressed into service as an example of the Romantic sublime of terror and transcendence, an aesthetic category previously reserved for Beethoven.⁶ For Matthew Head, it occasioned millennial reflection on Haydn's music-historical consciousness; Mathew used *The Creation* to articulate the importance of the choral work concept to late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century music,

³ See *ibid.*, 132.

⁴ See Dolan and Head, 'Haydn and Ideas', 164–65; Schroeder, *Haydn and the Enlightenment*.

⁵ Kramer, 'Music and Representation'.

⁶ Webster, 'The Creation, Haydn's Late Vocal Music'; Webster, 'The Sublime and the Pastoral'.

setting the stage for Beethoven's later choral experiments.⁷ In Emily Dolan's work, *The Creation's* length and musical diversity made it useful for thinking about Haydn's approaches to orchestral forces, timbre, and mediation.⁸ The work's text painting and moments of representation invited reflection on the status of mimesis in this period, and also invoked contemporary entertainments, such as the magic lantern show and shadow puppetry, as Deirdre Loughridge has explored.⁹

These heterogeneous musicological uses of *The Creation* share a purpose: to take Haydn seriously as a modern, innovative composer, engaged with the foment of his age, with science, technology, aesthetics, and moral philosophy. In banishing stereotypes of Haydn's music as 'childlike' and 'naïve', recent scholarship on *The Creation* engages an heirloom project, one that Leon Botstein traces back to the third Haydn revival of the twentieth century, in Washington in 1975 with the Haydn festival conference. In that moment, Botstein discerns a project of (so to speak) 'rewilding' Haydn, a reaction against presumed 'elegance and refinement' that sought to recover 'passion and intensity'. Botstein might have given more credit to Donald Francis Tovey, Karl Geiringer, and H. C. Robbins Landon for developing a more complex account of the composer's expressive and moral ambitions, but certainly the Washington conference ushered in no less a pioneer of the new Haydn scholarship than James Webster, co-editor of the conference volume when it eventually appeared in 1981.¹⁰

Scholarly determination to take Haydn seriously has its critics. In his *Making Light: Haydn, Musical Camp, and the Long Shadow of German Idealism*, Raymond Knapp – who also references *The Creation* – finds Haydn scholarship unnecessarily burdened by a quest for depth and hidden meaning. Underwhelmed by Haydn's 'politely civilized' representation of chaos, weary of earnest explications of musical humour, he urges scholars to make light of *fiat lux*.¹¹ In a broad-brush critique, he suggests that attention to 'immediately appealing features' in Haydn's music, its 'congenial' manner, and 'sympathetically human' character is missing.¹² The entertaining pleasures of Haydn's music, he contends,

⁷ Head, 'Music with "No Past?"'; Mathew, 'Achieved is the glorious work'.

⁸ Dolan, *Orchestral Revolution*.

⁹ See Loughridge, 'Haydn's *Creation*'; Loughridge, *Haydn's Sunrise*.

¹⁰ Botstein, 'Demise of Philosophical Listening', 265. Caryl Clark also appraises the 1975 conference in Washington as representing a 'new wave' of Haydn scholarship. See Clark, 'Review', 245.

¹¹ Knapp, *Making Light*, 40. ¹² Ibid., 80, 85, 89.

belong to the pre-history of camp, as a self-consciously theatrical, artificial, rebellious sensibility – though he stops short of adding Haydn's wig and symphonic minuets to Susan Sontag's index of camp practices and artefacts.¹³

Knapp has a point. Interpretation of Haydn's humour, for example, has sometimes occasioned a return to ideas of 'absolute' music and stirred a yearning after metaphysical significance. From Scott Burnham's engaging essay, students infer that Haydn's humour is a purely instrumental matter, involving the manipulation of compositional conventions embodied in the expectations of an ideal listener.¹⁴ This formalist perspective figures Haydn's humour as a holiday from the seriousness of absolute music without tainting the purity of that ideal realm. From Mark Evan Bonds, students glean that Haydn is less comic than Romantically ironic, that he annihilates the aesthetic illusion conjured by art.¹⁵ Certainly, these readings – downplaying the explanatory significance of folly, of the carnivalesque, and of Haydn's time in the theatre – demonstrate a recuperative preference to relate Haydn forward to the nineteenth century, not back to the early modern era.

The main issue with Knapp's critique – which arguably pushes Haydn from the modern world into a postmodern one – is that it ultimately takes too monolithic a view of Haydn scholarship. Since David Schroeder brokered Haydn's marriage with the moral philosophy of the Scottish Enlightenment, since Elaine Sisman invited the German and French theatre to take up residence in the Esterhazy symphonies, and – perhaps most influentially – since James Webster tore up or perhaps renegotiated Haydn's contract with Viennese Classical style, many Haydns have entered the scholarly stage, far more than can be captured even through the wide lens of *The Creation*.¹⁶ Driven by, and driving, disciplinary change, they have risked the appearance of unruly multiplication. But there is a common denominator – the Enlightenment. But we need to be expansive in our understanding of the Enlightenment, as the older notion of it as 'the age of reason' is rarely at stake. Indeed, few have followed Leon Botstein in mapping the era's philosophical temper onto the 'systematic coherence' of Haydn's instrumental music – music purportedly exemplifying the unity of 'reason', 'beauty', and 'truth'.¹⁷ Rather, closer attention to Haydn has challenged a Classical understanding of the Enlightenment as something

¹³ Sontag, 'Notes on Camp'. ¹⁴ Burnham, 'Humour'. ¹⁵ Bonds, 'Haydn, Laurence Sterne'.

¹⁶ Schroeder, *Haydn and the Enlightenment*; Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies'; Webster, *Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony*.

¹⁷ Botstein, 'Demise of Philosophical Listening', 275. Greenwood, 'Enlightenment', 101, makes a similar point with reference to Geiringer, 'Joseph Haydn: Protagonist of the Enlightenment'.

that can be captured purely with these values. David Wyn Jones's observation from 1991 proved prescient: 'if the accepted tenets of the Enlightenment cannot be applied to [Haydn], then they will have to be modified'.¹⁸ In 2019, almost three decades later, Andrew A. Greenwood imagined a time – surely now upon us – when Haydn scholarship would offer a multidisciplinary home for rethinking Enlightenment itself – re-imagined as a 'multiple Enlightenment' – and the roles of music and sound within it.¹⁹

Enlightening Haydn

It was apt that Greenwood's recommendation to imagine a multiple Enlightenment appeared in a volume modelled on the *Encyclopédie* (1751–72), that icon of enlightening publication. *The Cambridge Haydn Encyclopedia* (*CHE*) eschewed 'entries on works, individuals, or genres' in favour of 'clusters of ideas'. The intention, the editors declared with Diderot, was to 'throw off the yoke of authority', to be 'thought-provoking and opinionated', to capture not eternal truth but the processes of thinking and writing through which knowledge is produced and contested. Alphabetical ordering of articles and ample cross-referencing invite readers to engage actively with an unabashedly partial and emergent scholarship.²⁰

Greenwood proposes not an Enlightenment of 'abstract and universal notions'²¹ but 'a holistic Enlightenment [of] "arts and sciences"',²² 'a complex social and intellectual formation' comprising diverse movements, moments, networks, and media.²³ Potentially all-encompassing, this capacious concept of Enlightenment triggers a proliferation of editorial cross-references, the reader directed to consult entries on 'sociability, sensibility, cosmopolitanism, the sublime, folk song, technology, science, social development, knowledge, . . . reason . . . networks . . . place, [and] institutions . . . instruments . . . musical materials, editions, publishing, and performances . . . the Catholic Church . . . education and Freemasonry'.²⁴ Exceeding the awareness of any one contributing author, Enlightenment emerges as the foundational concept of the *CHE*.

¹⁸ Jones, Review of *Haydn and the Enlightenment*. We see such a modification at work in Webster, 'Haydn's Aesthetics'.

¹⁹ Greenwood, 'Enlightenment', 106.

²⁰ Clark and Day-O'Connell (eds.), *Cambridge Haydn Encyclopedia*, xv, xvi.

²¹ Greenwood, 'Enlightenment', 101. ²² *Ibid.*, 105. ²³ *Ibid.*, 101. ²⁴ *Ibid.*, 101–5.

Although Greenwood and his fellow authors do not state it explicitly, their concept of Enlightenment is predicated on a notion of transformation. Transformation – or metamorphosis as Head and Pierpaolo Polzonetti style it in another Haydn context – captures the period's self-consciousness about radical change in human affairs, without signing up to the now embattled period notion of 'progress'.²⁵ As Polzonetti had earlier observed, it is also apt for describing Haydn's music itself, particularly the metamorphic motivic and thematic working.²⁶ An aspiration to transformation attended various enlightening projects – anthropological, medical, and technological – to which Haydn contributed. Developing material sketched in the *CHE*, Greenwood connects Haydn's arrangements of traditional Scottish melodies into anthropological discourse on Scottish 'improvement'. According to the stadial historiography of Adam Smith, among others, society moved progressively from hunting, through animal husbandry and agriculture, to cosmopolitan commercialism.²⁷ In this context, Haydn's arrangements of Scottish songs, though offering nostalgic encounters with a pastoral stage of social development and with a vanishing orality, acted as catalysts of commercial modernisation. Something more than buying and selling music was at stake in this final phase of Scottish improvement. Song culture, fostering bonds of sympathy and feeling between fellow Scots, was a medium for nurturing sociability and social cohesion.

Exploring another fugitive repertoire – Haydn's English canzonettas with texts by Anne Hunter – Sarah Day-O'Connell identifies the Enlightenment's forensic gaze in Anne's musical–literary salon and the anatomy lab of her surgeon husband in the adjoining room. John Hunter's melancholy demonstrations and drawings of the reproductive structures of pregnant women formed a macabre counterpoint to Haydn's minutely observed settings of Anne's feminocentric lyrics, often concerned with beautiful women in love, and with the somatic and psychological symptoms of their lovesickness. As Day-O'Connell puts it, Haydn, Anne Hunter, and her husband John 'shared medical and musical discourses regarding the nature of femininity'.²⁸

Music and Enlightenment technology converge in Deirdre Loughridge's account of musical corollaries of 'magnifying instruments' – the telescope and magnifying glass – in Haydn's opera *Il mondo della luna* (1777).²⁹ In

²⁵ Head et al., 'Music and/as Metamorphosis'.

²⁶ Polzonetti, 'Haydn and the *Metamorphoses*'. ²⁷ Greenwood, 'Song and Improvement'.

²⁸ Day-O'Connell, 'The Composer, the Surgeon', 77. ²⁹ Loughridge, *Haydn's Sunrise*.

one of the three intermezzi for the opening ‘observatory scene’, Haydn employed ‘muted violins to draw the audience into the [onstage] telescopic observation of a lunar world’, a *lontano* effect that creates ‘a change in auditory perspective’.³⁰ Each intermezzo opens with a phrase that ‘evokes the stasis of absorbed spectatorship’, while divided violins and double stops in the violas ‘manipulate the senses ... implying perception at a technologically mediated distance’.³¹ This moment offers a glimpse of Loughridge’s compelling account of ‘the pleasures and promises of sense-extending technologies’ in Haydn’s world.³²

In Loughridge, Day-O’Connell, and Greenwood, Haydn’s music is not just keeping company with Enlightenment themes but is imbricated with them. Though they allow Haydn agency and shed light on specific compositions, these authors decentre him and his works. The autonomy and unity summoned by the name ‘Haydn’ – Haydn’s author function, in Foucault’s terms – are dispersed across media, places, and actors.³³ A deep multidisciplinary lends a decentring effect to these important studies of Haydn – one we might even call ‘post-Haydn’. Day-O’Connell and Loughridge, writing on music, medicine, and technology, engage a multidisciplinary nexus with broad currency in twenty-first-century music scholarship – the varied relationships between music and the histories of science. This nexus encompasses a diverse range of scholarship, including Ellen Lockhart’s *Animation, Plasticity, and Music in Italy, 1770–1830* and her volume, co-edited with James Q. Davies, *Sound Knowledge: Music and Science in London, 1789–1850*.³⁴ And Haydn has been prominent since some of the earliest scholarship that took steps in this direction: for instance, in his exploration of evolving notions of musical organicism, Daniel Chua turned to Haydn’s instrumental music to illustrate how ‘conscious life had seeped into the score’.³⁵ In the opening chapter of her posthumous *The Secular Commedia*, Wendy Allanbrook considered Enlightenment fascination with polyps (the ambiguous life form, not the ailment that plagued Haydn, which Allanbrook took care to clarify.) Tracing how these creatures behaved simultaneously like plants and animals and ‘exhibited stunning generative and regenerative behaviors’, Allanbrook proposed an action-based and distinctly anti-Classical way of approaching eighteenth-century music, one that prized scintillating

³⁰ Ibid., 37. ³¹ Ibid., 43, 45. ³² Ibid., 45.

³³ Foucault, ‘What is an Author’. For the context of Foucault’s essays, see Burke (ed.), *Authorship*.

³⁴ See also Trippett and Walton (eds.), *Nineteenth-Century Opera*; Cypess, *Modern Inventions*; Gordon, *Voice Machines*.

³⁵ Chua, ‘Haydn as Romantic’, 124.

and ever-changing musical surfaces over depth.³⁶ After delving into Pergolesi's *La serva padrona* and showing Uberto's 'polyp-y' nature, Allanbrook turned to the first movement of Haydn's Symphony No. 59 in A Major, drawing attention to its changeable surface: 'The opening', Allanbrook wrote, 'is successively annunciatory, misterioso, purposeful, agitated, urbane, rollicking, valedictory, and all in just over a minute of music'.³⁷

But beyond these scholars' linking of music and Enlightenment natural history, there is a broader and more diffuse sense in which Haydn's music and compositional style have inspired quasi-scientific experiment. Perhaps it is the sheer volume of Haydn's output – with its impressive variation – over his long career that invites us to think about his musical style as one full of experimentation in form, melody, rhetoric, and orchestration. Indeed, it was Haydn's pervasive timbral experimentation that motivated Dolan's creation of her experimental 'orchestral graphs', designed to visualise what we might call the large-scale 'orchestral structures' in the slow movements of Haydn's late symphonic works. Dolan's concept has since been taken up by the McGill-based ACTOR project and systemised into the *Orcheil* programme, which automatically produces visualisations based on MusicXML files.³⁸ This spirit of experimentation has also inflected creative output on Haydn: in a feat of virtual acoustic engineering, Tom Beghin produced *The Virtual Haydn* recordings.³⁹ They present Haydn's complete solo keyboard repertoire, performed in virtual spaces created by capturing the acoustics of nine rooms, and creating acoustic 'replications of actual rooms where Haydn or contemporary players of his keyboard music would have performed'.⁴⁰ Beghin's performances are certainly compelling, and yet even here, with actual performances of Haydn's core repertoire, this project also looks past Haydn – towards space, sound studies, and ideas of virtuality – in a way that echoes the 'post-Haydn' quality of Day-O'Connell's and Loughridge's work. Haydn scholarship is currently responding to critique of the interpretive constraints of 'the author function' (again, in Foucault's term) even as it retains a fascination with Haydn's agency.⁴¹ Perhaps we could think of Haydn less as a discrete author figure, and more as an invitation to experiment.⁴²

³⁶ Allanbrook, *Secular Commedia*, 4. ³⁷ *Ibid.*, 26.

³⁸ See Dolan, 'Haydn, Orchestration, and Re-orchestration', in *Orchestral Revolution*, 113ff. On *Orcheil*, programmed by Gregory Lee Newcome, see <http://orcheil.ca/faq>.

³⁹ See Beghin, *Virtual Haydn: Complete Works*. ⁴⁰ Beghin, *Virtual Haydn: Paradox*, xiii.

⁴¹ Foucault, 'What is an Author?'. ⁴² On this subject, see Chapter 8.

Global Haydn?

Looking at musicology more generally, we might say that the ‘post-Haydn’ quality of recent scholarship is part of the larger ‘post-composer’ and ‘post-work’ turn of musicology. In writing about the field’s current obsessions with mediation and materiality, Mathew recently quipped: ‘In the context of present-day scholarship, the musical work thus becomes the inverse of Bismarck’s proverbial sausage – nobody talks about liking it, but everyone wants to see how it was made.’⁴³ This is arguably not so distant from earlier analytical preoccupations regarding music; the idea of *making* is now accounted for not by formal analysis but by turning to the history of technology.

Once it is dethroned from aesthetic autonomy, and score-based analysis, music becomes another ‘thing’ in the world. The challenge is to discern where music goes and what it does. At least this is one possible way of interpreting the rise of global music history, which has brought increasing attention to questions of transcontinental exchange, the musical structures of colonialism, and mechanisms of circulation. Indeed, it is telling that the two most recent articles to explore music in the eighteenth century in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* turn not to Haydn, Mozart, or any of the vaunted European hubs of music-making, but instead to Bolivia and Guatemala.⁴⁴ As of now, Haydn has not been a central figure in this proliferation of ‘global’ music history. He is not entirely absent – Haydn appears, for example, in Thomas Irvine’s *Listening to China: Sound and the Sino-Western Encounter*, as one of the composers performed by the British bands brought to the China of Emperor Qianlong by George Macartney on behalf of George III – but one might well wonder if Haydn will be left behind.

And yet there is also a sense in which Haydn might become newly relevant: after all, he is a composer who, despite being largely confined to courtly service, famously achieved international fame in his lifetime. Shortly after Haydn’s death, Ignaz Theodor Arnold could write that his music was praised in ‘St Petersburg as in Naples, in Moscow as in Madrid, in Paris and London, just as in Lisbon or Stockholm, through all of Germany and France, as in Philadelphia’.⁴⁵ Giuseppe Carpani could trace

⁴³ Mathew, ‘Listening(s) Past’. ⁴⁴ Grant, ‘Colonial Galant’; Oliva, ‘Sonic Decency’.

⁴⁵ Arnold, ‘Gallerie’, 82. (Translations are our own, unless stated otherwise.)

an even more impressive global zigzag, claiming Haydn's music was known 'from Mexico to Calcutta, as from Naples to London, from Pera to Paris'.⁴⁶

But while these geographic enumerations are well known, musicology has not always fostered much curiosity about what might lurk behind them. This has started to change in recent scholarship. Miguel Ángel Marín's editorial in *Eighteenth-Century Music* – 'Haydn from the "Frontier"' – opens by bemoaning the lack of engagement with Robert Stevenson's 1982 article 'Haydn's Iberian World Connection': the essay was largely ignored not only by canonically focused musicology but also by scholars of Iberian music, whose attention was trained on native composers, genres, and institutions.⁴⁷ And yet, as Marín shows, Haydn was an important virtual presence in Spain. Marín estimates, for example, that forty different editions of Haydn string quartets circulated in that country.⁴⁸ Recently, Thomas Tolley delved into Carpani's biography of Haydn, exploring Carpani's claims that Haydn composed a 'New World' symphony (Carpani also likens Haydn to Christopher Columbus). While Carpani's account of this symphony and its programme has typically been dismissed, Tolley takes seriously Haydn's interactions with seafarers and his fascination with 'all things nautical', to paint a picture of a composer who was far savvier and more aware of his growing global presence than we typically have given him credit for.⁴⁹ We note that, in this account, Haydn's Eszterháza 'isolation' was less a hurdle that Haydn improbably overcame and more the source of the preconditions for his future global reach, as his career grew through his virtual circulation in print. Indeed, we might say that Haydn's preoccupation with circulation – as Mathew explores in *The Haydn Economy* – helps provide a model for the very idea of a global music.⁵⁰

The global export of Haydn's music was bound up with its import or meaning, as construed in Western European journalism, historical and critical writing, and iconography. Before they were heard on far-flung shores, Haydn's scores were freighted with notions of creative freedom, technological innovation, moral improvement, and the progress of civil society. In other words, Haydn's music was widely conceptualised as enlightened and enlightening. This constellation of validating concepts crystallised in commentary on Haydn's visits to London in the 1790s, and in the reception of the London Symphonies (Nos 93–104), in part

⁴⁶ Carpani, *Le Haydine*, 3.

⁴⁷ Marín, 'Haydn from the "Frontier"'; Stevenson, 'Haydn's Iberian World Connection'.

⁴⁸ Marín, 'Haydn from the "Frontier"', 7; see also Marín, 'Haydn en la iglesia'.

⁴⁹ Tolley, 'Haydn's Global Enterprise', 63. ⁵⁰ On this topic, see also Chapter 9.