

# THE MAKING OF THE CHINESE CIVIL CODE

The Chinese Civil Code (2020) is the first civil code in mainland China since 1949. As well as consolidating existing civil legislation, the Code incorporated a number of doctrinal and structural changes that are significant both in and beyond China. The chapters in this volume demonstrate the extent of European influence on Chinese civil law and also show how Chinese law innovates, building upon those influences. The book shares insights from both the key Chinese scholars who were directly involved in the drafting process and veteran Western scholars who study Chinese private law.

HAO JIANG is Assistant Professor of Comparative Private Law at Bocconi University. He has written about Chinese, European, and American private law from a comparative perspective. He also writes about contract theory. With James Gordley, he co-authored the *Introduction to the Comparative Study of Private Law* (2021).

PIETRO SIRENA is Professor of Civil Law, European Private Law, and Comparative Private Law at Bocconi University, where, since 2018, he has served as Dean of the Law School. He also serves on the Executive Committee of the European Law Institute (ELI) and as Director of the Società Italiana per la Ricerca nel Diritto Comparato (SIRD). In 2022, he was elected President of the Society of European Contract Law (SECOLA) and, in 2018, as associate member of the Académie International de Droit Comparé (AIDC).



# THE MAKING OF THE CHINESE CIVIL CODE

Promises and Persistent Problems

Edited by
HAO JIANG
Bocconi University
PIETRO SIRENA

Bocconi University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781009336635$ 

DOI: 10.1017/9781009336611

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023 First paperback edition 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data
Names: Jiang, Hao (Law teacher), editor. | Sirena, Pietro, editor.

Title: The making of the Chinese Civil Code: promises and persistent problems / edited by Hao
Jiang, Università Commerciale Luigi Bocconi, Milan; Pietro Sirena, Università Commerciale Luigi
Bocconi, Milan.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2023. | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023018198 | ISBN 9781009336642 (hardback)
Subjects: LCSH: Civil law-China-Codification.
Classification: LCC KNQ500 .M37 2023 | DDC 346.51-dc23/eng/20230703
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023018198

ISBN 978-1-009-33664-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-33663-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Huimin, Ethan, and my parents. Thank you for letting me be me.

To the late Gabriele Crespi Reghizzi (1941–2022) for working to contribute to this volume until the very last moment of his life.

—H. J.

To the memory of Cesare Massimo Bianca (1932–2020) and Rodolfo Sacco (1923–2022), unparalleled forerunners of comparative legal thinking and shining models of commitment to academic life.

To the late Gabriele Crespi Reghizzi (1941–2022) for his friendship, generosity, and kindness.

—P. S.



#### CONTENTS

List of Tables	ix	
List of Contribute	ors	$\mathbf{x}$
Preface xiii		
Acknowledgemen	ts	xv
List of Abbreviati	ions	xvi

- 1 The Making of a Civil Code in China: Promises and Perils of a New Civil Law 1
  HAO HANG
- Personality Rights in China's New Civil Code:
   A Response to Increasing Awareness of Rights in an Era of Evolving Technology
   41
   WANG LIMING AND XIONG BINGWAN
- 3 Force Majeure or Change of Circumstances: An Enduring Dichotomy in Chinese Law? 77
- 4 Article 580 (2) of the Chinese Civil Code: Can Chinese Folk Medicine Cure Serious Illness? 94 HAN SHIYUAN
- 5 Contractual Consent in the New Chinese Civil Code 114 CATHERINE VALCKE
- 6 The Security Interests in Chinese Law: Some Nuances 131
  LEI CHEN
- 7 Chinese Tort Law in the Era of the Civil Code 153
  DING CHUNYAN

vii



riii	CONTENTS	
8	Causation in the Chinese Civil Code: A Comparative Law Appraisal 179	
	MARTA INFANTINO AND WEIWEI WANG	
9	The Aims of Tort Law across China and the West	197
	MAURO BUSSANI	
10	Classifying the Passive Appreciation of Separate Property during Marriage in the Chinese Civil Code: A Legal and Economic Analysis 214	
11	The Rule of Law in Traditional China 235  JAMES GORDLEY	
12	The Private Law Influence of the Great Qing Code ZHANG TAISU	249
13	The New Validity Rules in Chinese Civil Code and Chinese State-Owned Enterprises' Freedom in Contracting: One Step Too Far 269	
	HAO JIANG AND ANTONIA VON APPEN	202
14	Chinese Civil Law and Soviet Influences: What Is Left? GIANMARIA AJANI	292
15	The Connections between Roman Law and Chinese Civil Law: Traditions, Innovations and Environmental Protection 308  ENRICO TOTI	
	Index 325	



## **TABLES**

- 7.1 Torts based on presumed fault liability under the TLB 165
- 7.2 Torts based on strict liability under the TLB 166
- 7.3 The imputation system under the TLB 169
- 7.4 The multi-tier liability system under the TLB 170
- 7.5 The SPC's judicial interpretations regarding the TLB (May 2020 to December 2021) 174



#### CONTRIBUTORS

GIANMARIA AJANI, Professor of Law, University of Turin, Italy

MAURO BUSSANI, Professor of Law, University of Trieste, Italy, and Adjunct Professor of Law, University of Macau, S.A.R. of the P.R. of China

LEI CHEN, Chair Professor in International Arbitration and Chinese Law, Durham University, UK

DING CHUNYAN, Professor of Law, City University of Hong Kong, China

JAMES GORDLEY, W. R. Irby Chair Professor in Law, Tulane University, New Orleans, LA, USA

HAN SHIYUAN, Professor of Law, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China

JIAN HE, Associate Professor of Law, Peking University, Beijing, China

MARTA INFANTINO, Associate Professor of Comparative Private Law, University of Trieste, Italy

HAO JIANG, Assistant Professor of Comparative Private Law, Bocconi University, Milan, Italy

LIU QIAO, Professor of Law, City University of Hong Kong, China

ENRICO TOTI, Professor of Chinese Law, Roma Tre University, Italy

CATHERINE VALCKE, Professor of Law, University of Toronto, Canada



#### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

хi

ANTONIA VON APPEN, PhD candidate, Department of Legal Studies, Bocconi University, Milan, Italy

WANG LIMING, Professor of Law, Renmin University of China, Beijing, China

WEIWEI WANG, practising lawyer, Trieste, Italy

XIONG BINGWAN, Associate Professor of Law, Renmin University of China, Beijing, China

ZHANG TAISU, Professor of Law, Yale Law School, New Haven, CT, USA



#### **PREFACE**

The passage of the Chinese Civil Code was a monumental event both for China and the international community. Yet, it is a daunting task to present a scientific account of the Code to a readership in and out of China. In fact, it is difficult for private law experts in the West to understand Chinese law without context if they only rely upon a superficial reading of the text. It is also difficult for Chinese scholars to understand their own law if they only seek internal explanations for incompatible yet coexisting doctrines that were likely the products of legal transplants from different sources. Moreover, any civil law would have to serve the socio-economic context in which it operates.

Therefore, we decided to approach Chinese Civil Code through comparative law and cross-disciplinary research. The vision of this book, as pointed out in Chapter 1, is to trace the root cause of a number of persistent problems such as the tensions between the rise of private law and the dominant state sector, the contradictions among legal transplants, the incompatibility between doctrinal innovations and the existing structure, and the clash between distributive justice – the foundation of Chinese moral philosophy – and commutative justice – the foundation of Western private law. In this regard, we owe a debt to Rodolfo Sacco's *Legal Formants* or *Formanti Giuridici*.

We are incredibly fortunate to have gathered a group of leading scholars to join this endeavour from mainland China, Hong Kong, Italy, Germany, the United Kingdom, and the United States. They are not only extremely diverse in origin but, more importantly, in expertise and methodology.

In fact, we went far beyond what is in the text. The breadth of expertise involved allowed us to carefully examine the core doctrinal changes through a comparative view and take a close look at the ideological, historical, sociological, and philosophical dimensions of Chinese civil law. Specifically, we invited contributors to explain the development of Chinese law through the lens of Soviet law (Gianmaria Ajani,



XİV PREFACE

Chapter 14), evaluate the applicability of liberal rules to state-owned enterprises (Hao Jiang and Antonia von Appen, Chapter 13), assess the sheer positive effect of codification in the Qing dynasty (Zhang Taisu, Chapter 12), and present the Confucian model of rule of law (James Gordley, Chapter 11). They also critically evaluated some fundamental doctrines in civil law such as change of circumstances (Han Shiyuan, Chapter 4; Liu Qiao, Chapter 3), security interests (Lei Chen, Chapter 6), and causation (Marta Infantino and Weiwei Wang, Chapter 8). Mauro Bussani (Chapter 9) offered a pluralistic view of tort law and explained why we should absolutely take the aim or societal function of torts into consideration when we assess the black-letter law. Ding Chunyan (Chapter 7) demonstrated how the doctrinal system of tort law has been transformed under the new Code. Wang Liming, the main architect of the Chinese Civil Code, along with Xiong Bingwan, presented a persuasive account of why personality rights law deserves an independent status in modern civil law (Chapter 2). Enrico Toti (Chapter 15) made a surprising connection between the procedural rules in Roman law and the green principle in Chinese Civil Code. Our deepest gratitude goes to all of them.



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Material that has previously appeared in the following articles has been reproduced in this book with the permission of the relevant journals.

- Hao Jiang. 'The Making of a Civil Code in China: Promises and Perils of a New Civil Law' (2021) 95 *Tulane Law Review* 777, www.tulanelawreview.org/pub/volume95/issue4/the-making-of-a-civil-code-in-china-promises-and-perils-of-a-new-civil-law-6622b.
- Hao Jiang and Antonia von Appen. 'The New Validity Rules in Chinese Civil Code and Chinese State-Owned Enterprises' Freedom in Contracting: One Step Too Far' (2022) *Chinese Journal of Comparative Law* Volume 10, Issue 3, https://doi.org/10.1093/cjcl/cxac024.
- Wang Liming and Xiong Bingwan. 'Personality Rights in China's New Civil Code: A Response to Increasing Awareness of Rights in an Era of Evolving Technology' (2021) 47 *Modern China* 37, https://doi.org/10.1177/0097700420977826.



## **ABBREVIATIONS**

BGB Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch
CCC Chinese Civil Code
ECL Economic Contract Law
GPCL General Principles of Civil Law
ISPs internet service providers
NPC National People's Congress

NPCSC National People's Congress Standing Committee

PRC People's Republic of China

ROC Republic of China

SASAC The State-Owned Assets Supervision and Administration

SOE state-owned enterprises
SPC Supreme People's Court
TLB Book on Tort Liability
TLL Tort Liability Law

TVE township and village owned enterprise