

## PUBLIC NUISANCE

In *Public Nuisance*, Linda Mullenix describes the landscape of 21st century mass tort litigation involving public harms – including lead paint, opioids, firearms, e-cigarettes, climate change, and environmental pollution – and the novel theory of public nuisance that lawyers and local governments have used to receive compensation from those who have created public nuisances. The book surveys conflicting judicial decisions rooted in common law and statutory interpretation and evaluates the competing arguments for and against the expansion of public nuisance law. Mullenix argues that that the development of public nuisance theory is part of the historical arc of mass tort litigation and suggests a middle approach to new public nuisance law, namely, that we should embrace the common law and legislated public nuisance statutes.

Linda S. Mullenix is the Rita and Morris Atlas Chair in Advocacy at the University of Texas School of Law. She holds a Ph.D. in political theory from Columbia University and a J.D. from Georgetown University Law Center. Professor Mullenix has served as a U.S. Supreme Court Fellow; a scholar-in-residence at the Rockefeller Foundation Bellagio, Italy; and the Fulbright Senior Distinguished Chair in Law, in Trento, Italy. She is an elected Life Member of the American Law Institute, the Texas Bar Foundation, and the American Bar Foundation.



## Public Nuisance

THE NEW MASS TORT FRONTIER

LINDA S. MULLENIX

The University of Texas at Austin







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

 $www.cambridge.org\\ Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009334921$ 

DOI: 10.1017/9781009334907

© Linda S. Mullenix 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-009-33492-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-33491-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my next generations, children and grandchildren

Robert, Joyce, Jack, Laura, William, Amy, Chris, Ben, Ned,
Oliver, and Sophie



## Contents

Acknowledgements		page ix
	Introduction	1
1	Historical Context of Private and Public Nuisance at Law and Equity	8
2	Shifting Mass Tort Theories in the 1990s and the Judicial Resistance to the Expansion of Public Nuisance Liability	26
3	Expanding Public Nuisance Doctrine: Inroads and Retreats, the Lead Paint Mass Tort Litigation	48
4	Litigating Public Nuisance Claims: Burdens on Plaintiffs	71
5	Expanding Public Nuisance Doctrine: Defenses	90
6	Expanding Public Nuisance: Remedies beyond Injunctions and Abatement to Monetary Damages	114
7	Environmental Contamination, PCBs, and Climate Change as Public Nuisance Harms	131
8	Opioids as Public Nuisance Health and Welfare Harm	155
9	Firearms Violence as a Public Nuisance	182
10	E-Cigarettes and Vaping as a Public Nuisance Harm	211

vii



viii	Contents	
11	Evaluating the Competing Arguments Regarding the Contemporary Use of Public Nuisance in Mass Tort Litigation	230
	Conclusion	258
Index		271



## Acknowledgements

I have revised and repurposed portions of one book chapter and an article authored by me for use in this book. I am indebted to the copyright holders identified below for permission to reprint excerpts from the following materials:

Exposition in Chapter 2 uses material from my book chapter, Linda S. Mullenix, "Aggregationists at the Barricades: Assessing the Impact of the ALI Principles of the Law of Aggregate Litigation," in *The ALI at 100: Essays on Its Centennial* (American Law Institute, Andrew Gold and Robert W. Gordon, eds. 2023), copyright @ 2023 by the American Law Institute. Reprinted with a license to reproduce materials.

Exposition in Chapter 9 is based on materials from my article, Linda S. Mullenix, "Outgunned No More? Reviving the Prospect of A Firearms Mass Tort Litigation," 49 Sw. L. Rev. 390 (2020), copyright @ 2020 by the Southwestern University Law School. Reprinted with the permission of the Southwestern University Law Review.

I also wish to thank the Cambridge University Press editors and the anonymous reviewers of this manuscript for their help and comments.

Austin, Texas May 2023 Professor Linda S. Mullenix