

INDEX

Abbreviations used in the index ACHPR (African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (1981) (Banjul Charter)) ACHPRP (Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Establishment of an African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights (1998)) ACtHPR (African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights) ARC (Autonomous Republic of Crimea) CERD (UN Committee/Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (1965))CIL (Customary International Law) CMM (Conservation and Management Measures) CPLR (Civil Practice Law and Rules of New York) ECHR (European Convention on Human Rights (1950)) FRCP (Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (US)) FSIA (Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act (1976) (US)) I-USTA (Iran-US Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations, and Consular Rights (1955)) ICJ (International Court of Justice) ICSFT (International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism (1999))ILC (International Law Commission) ILC(DP) (ILC [Draft] Articles of Diplomatic Protection (2006/2009)) ILC(SR) (ILC Draft Articles on the Responsibility for States for Internationally Wrongful Acts (2001)) ITRSHRA (Iran Threat Reduction and Syria Human Rights Act (2012) (US)) JCPOA (Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action) PIL (public international law) SIA (State Immunity Act (1978) (UK)) SPRFMO Commission (Commission of the South Pacific Regional Fisheries Management Organisation) SPRFMÖ Convention (Convention on the Conservation and Management of High Seas Fishery Resources in the South Pacific Ocean (2012)) SPRFO (South Pacific Regional Fisheries Organisation) TRIA (Terrorism Risk Insurance Act (2002) (US)) UNCLOS (UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982)) UNGA (UN General Assembly) UNSCR (UN Security Council Resolutions) VCDR (Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations (1961)) VCLT (Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969))

abuse of process

abuse of rights, relationship with 209-13 conduct amounting to abuse of process 193-4 exceptional circumstances basis for rejection of claim 193, 195-6 importance in international law 209-15 interpretation difficulties 216-17 risk of illegitimate advantage 193, 195-6 (LIDP (1991) benefit.)

ACHPR (1981), by article

1 (recognition of rights) 261-4, 267-8 4 (right to life) 261-6, 272-3, 288-91

5 (right to dignity) 266-7



678 INDEX

```
ACHPR (1981), by article (cont.)
  7(1)(a) (right to be heard by competent court) 260-1
  7(1)(d) (right to be tried within reasonable time) 255-7
  26 (duty to guarantee judicial independence) 264
ACHPRP (1998), by article
  3(1) (jurisdiction) 229-30
ACtHPR
  jurisdiction of court
    admissibility 229-32
    appellate jurisdiction, as 230-1
    exhaustion of local remedies 232-4
    failure to file within reasonable time 234-7
ACtHPR, Rules of Court, by rule
  26 (jurisdiction) 229-31
  39(1) (preliminary examination of jurisdiction and admissibility) 229, 232, 250-1
  40 (admissibility of application) 232-4, 250-1
  63 (reparations) 268-9
ACtHR, Rules of the Court (2010), by rule
  26 (jurisdiction) 229-31
  30 (legal costs) 237, 276
  39 (preliminary examination of competence of the Court) 229-30, 232, 247, 250, 281
  40 (admissibility of applications) 229, 232-6, 246, 250, 254, 279, 281
  60 (Court deliberations) 278
  63 (judgment on reparations) 268-9
Anthony and Kisite v. United Republic of Tanzania (jurisdiction and admissibility) 225-37
  background and facts
    alleged violations 228
    application subject matter 227-8
    overview 225-6
    parties 227
    submissions of the parties 229
    violation of Constitutional rights 228
  costs 237
  Court ruling 226, 237
  jurisdiction of ACtHPR
    admissibility 231-2
    appellate jurisdiction 230-1
    limitations of 230-1
    objections, basis for
      failure to file application within reasonable time 234-7
      non-exhaustion of local remedies 232-4
    preliminary investigations 231-2
    scope of 229-31
  jurisdiction of ACtHPR—jurisprudence
    African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights v. Kenya 234
    Amiri Ramadhani v. Tanzania 236
    Norbert Zongo v. Burkina Faso 235-6
    Werema Wangoko v. Tanzania 236
```

burden of proof

barriers to admissibility 429 general principles 428-30 jurisdictional issues 432-3



```
central banks
  assets
    immunity from attachment in execution of damages for state-sponsored terrorism
             591-2, 613-14
    ownership of blocked assets 609-12
  state immunity 588-9, 594, 613-14, 620, 626
Chambers v. United States (jurisdiction of employment tribunal)
  background and facts
    claims of parties 553-4
    conclusions 551
    facts 555-8
    overview 551
  conditions of employment
    overview 556-8
    role and responsibilities 558-63
      whether performing sovereign functions 571-2
    state immunity, applicable law 557, 563-4
      CIL 568-70
      excluded matters 564-7
      general provisions 563-4
      Sengupta v. India 568-9
    training 558-63
  Court conclusions 571-2
  jurisdiction of employment tribunal
    importance of employment functions to mission of US air base 571-2
    investigation of US policies relating to sovereign functions performed within
             employment duties 571
    sovereign functions performed within employment duties 571-2
  state immunity, applicable law
    CIL 568-70
    common law principles 567-8
      Benkharbouche v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs 568,
      I Congreso del Partido 567-9
      Littrell v. USA 567
    contracts of employment, application to 568-70
      I Congreso del Partido 568-9
      Sengupta v. India 568-9
    SIA 1978
       1(1) (general immunity) 563, 564
      4 (contracts of employment) 564
      16(2) (excluded matters) 564-7
         Harrington v. USA 566-7
Hicks v. USA EAT 566, 571
         Holland v. Lampen-Wolfe 564-5, 571
         Littrell v. USA (No 2) 565-6
         Webster & Wright v. USA 567
CIL
  conventional and customary standards, relationship between 291
Commission of the South Pacific Regional Fisheries Organisation
  objection by Ecuador to decision of: see Objection by the Republic of Ecuador to a
             Decision of the Commission of the South Pacific Regional Fisheries
             Organisation
```



680 INDEX

Convention on the Conservation and Management of High Seas Fishery Resources in the South Pacific Ocean, 2012

interests of developing states 527

```
death penalty (municipal law/general)
  mandatory death penalty
    ACHPR 4, interpretative conflicts with 288-91
    arbitrariness assessment criteria 262-5
    moral prejudice and psychological suffering, compensation for 240, 272-3
    non-material losses relating to 272-3
    reparations for 286-7
    right to dignity, and 267
    status in international law, conflicts with compulsory sentences 283-7
    violation of right to life, as 239, 240, 261-8
    whether constitutes torture and inhuman and degrading treatment 240, 266-7
  right to life, and
    mandatory death penalty as violation of 239, 240, 261-7
death penalty, abolition
  ICCPR 6(1) 263, 284-6, 289
  mandatory death penalty as violation of right to life 239, 240, 261-8
death penalty, jurisprudence
  Eddie Johnson Dexter case 284
  Eversley Thompson v. St. Vincent & the Grenadines 263, 286-7
  Forum of Conscience v. Sierra Leone 263
  Hilaire, Constantine & Benjamin v. Trinidad & Tobago 263-4
  Interights (on behalf of Bosch) v. Botswana 262
  International Pen (Ken Saro-Wiwa) v. Nigeria 262-3
differential treatment, justification/requirements (ECHR 14)
  administrative practice as violation 499-501
dignity, right to
  mandatory death penalty 267
diplomatic premises, designation
  criteria
    actual or effective assignment 25-6
    choice, discretion over 26, 28, 30-1
    mutual consent 27
    presumption of validity 28
    prior consent requirement 24-5, 32, 46
    transfer of premises 24-5, 36-7, 42, 45
    verification procedures 41-2
  objection to designation
    actual and effective use 40-1, 44-6
    criminal proceedings, involvement in 45-6
    imposition of choice, amounting to 42-3
    non-arbitrary and non-discriminatory nature of 39-48
    premises as private domain 20, 35, 40, 42, 44-5
    prior dealings, consistency 42-4, 47
    scope of restrictions on 33-4
    timeliness 38-9, 48
    validity 33-8
```



```
diplomatic premises, inviolability (including VCDR 22)
  disputed status of premises 33-8
   "premises of the mission" 23, 26-7, 45-6
    whether breach of 27, 35, 49
  scope of inviolability 83, 95-6, 98-9, 108-12, 117-18, 120, 124-5, 125-6,
  searches, legality of 65-71, 79-80, 145-6, 148-9
  state responsibility (ILC (DP)) 148-9
diplomatic relations
  rights and duties of states regarding 104-5, 107
ECHR (1950), applicability within their jurisdiction (ECHR 1)
  effective control test 326-42, 364-7, 431-58
    administrative practice, meaning 430-1
      official tolerance 431
      repetition of acts 431
    state agent authority and control 448-9
  extraterritorial jurisdiction
    exceptional circumstances, standard of proof 451
    sovereign entitlement to 437
  recognition of change to territorial integrity 460-1
  state military presence, conduct and strength of 452-7
  state's jurisdictional competence under PIL 460-1
  territorial principle 446
ECtHR
  jurisdiction
    applicability to ARC: see Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea)
ECtHR, Rules of Court (2023), by rule
  28 (inability to sit, withdrawal or exemption) 316, 317
  39 (interim measures) 294, 296, 315, 501
  42(1) (joinder of applications) 486, 503
  44(3) (third-party intervention) 315
51 (assignment of applications) 314, 316-17, 486, 502-3
  58(1) (inter-state applications) 486, 503
  71(1) (applicability of procedural provisions) 316, 317, 486, 503
  72 (relinquishment of jurisdiction) 316
education, right to (ECHR Protocol 1:2)
  native language, in
    administrative practice in violation 495-7
evidence (ICJ)
  burden/standard of proof
    assessment of evidence, principles for 428-30
    jurisdictional issues 432-3
exhaustion of local remedies
  ACtHPR jurisdiction 232-4, 239-40, 250-2, 278-80
exhaustion of local remedies (ECHR 35(1))
  applicability of rules 431, 464-5
  evidentiary threshold 431-2, 465-6
expropriation/nationalization
  act of genocide, as 666-8, 670-4
```



682 INDEX

expropriation/nationalization (cont.)

```
applicable law
    general principles of international law 668
  domestic takings rule
    property belonging to country's own nationals, applicability to 670, 675
    statutory intention 665, 668-70, 675
    whether violation of human rights law 664-5, 670-4
    whether violation of international law 664, 667-70
    whether violation of international law of expropriation 667, 671, 676
  domestic takings rule—jurisprudence
    Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Farr 670
    Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino 668-70
    F. Palicio y Compañía v. Brush 670
Gudmundsson v. Iceland 669
    Jurisdictional Immunities of the State case 664
    Republic of Austria v. Altmann 670
expropriation/nationalization, compensation
  Holocaust victims' restitution mechanisms 675
fair and public hearing, entitlement (ECHR 6)
  administrative practice in violation 481-2
fair hearing (right to be heard) (ACHPR 7)
  competent court, by 260-1
  duty to guarantee judicial independence 264
  right to hearing within reasonable time (ACHPR 7(1)(d)) 255-7
family/private life, respect for/freedom from interference (ECHR 8(1))
enforced citizenship 483-5
Federal Republic of Germany and Others v. Philipp and Others
  background and facts
    Court conclusions (summary) 664-5
    overview 663-4
  Court ruling
    expropriation of property
      act of genocide, as 666-8, 670-4
      commercial property exception 672, 674-5
      domestic takings rule 668-70
      exception for property taken in violation of international law 667-8
      general principles of international law 668
      Holocaust victims' restitution mechanisms 675
      property belonging to country's own nationals 670
      violation of human rights 666-8, 670-4
      whether "art exhibition activities" constitute commercial activity 674-5
    factual background
      claims and suits 666-8
      "foreign state", meaning 667
      sale of relics 665-6
    FSIA, by section
       1604 (jurisdiction over foreign state) 667
      1605A (terrorism exception) 673
      1605(a)(2) (commercial activity exception) 672, 674-5
      1605(a)(3) (expropriation exception) 664-5, 667-8, 671-5
```



> INDEX 683

human rights expropriation of property as act of genocide 666-8, 670-4 whether domestic takings rule as violation of 664-5, 670-4 human rights—jurisprudence Permanent Mission of India to United Nations v. City of New York 671 Taggart v. Lorenzen 671 international law general principles of 668 international law of expropriation 667, 671, 676 state immunity, applicability to 667-8 whether domestic takings rule as violation of 664, 667-70 Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino 668-70 state immunity applicable international law 667-8 domestic takings rule property belonging to country's own nationals, applicability to 670, 675 statutory intention 665, 668-70, 675 whether violation of human rights law 664-5, 670-4 whether violation of international law 664, 667-70, 676 whether violation of international law of expropriation 667, 671, 676 domestic takings rule—jurisprudence Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Farr 670 Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino 668-70, 673 F. Palicio y Compañía v. Brush 670 Gudmundsson v. Iceland 669 Malewicz v. Amsterdam 674-5 Republic of Austria v. Altmann 670, 672, 675 exceptions commercial activities 672, 674-5 general 664-5 human rights, relationship with 673-4 Nazi-era claims 675 non-commercial tort 673 restrictive theory 672-3 terrorism 673 Nelson 674 jurisdiction over foreign state 667-8 Argentine Republic v. Amerada Hess Shipping 667 Saudi Arabia v. Nelson 667 presumption of immunity 667 state immunity—jurisprudence Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela v. Helmerich & Payne Int'l Drilling 668, 673-4 Jurisdictional Immunities of the State case 664, 672 US law interpretation foreign policy consequences 673-4 international law and human rights law, relationship with 673-4 US law interpretation—jurisprudence Kiobel v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co. 674 RJR Nabisco v. European Community 674 fisheries, conservation and management measures (general)

fishery resources allocation, whether decision unjustifiably discriminatory: see Objection by the Republic of Ecuador to a Decision of the Commission of the South Pacific Regional Fisheries Organisation



684 INDEX

freedom of assembly/association (ECHR 11) administrative practice as violation 492-4 freedom of expression/freedom of the press (ECHR 10) administrative practice as violation 490-2 apprehension/intimidation of journalists 490-2 suppression of media 490-1 freedom of movement (ECHR Protocol 4:2) administrative practice as violation 497-9 FSIA 1976 (USA), by section 1603 (definition of foreign state) 588-9 1604 (jurisdiction over foreign state) 667 1605A (terrorism exception) 588-9, 673 1605(a)(2) (commercial activity exception) 672, 674-5 1605(a)(3) (expropriation exception) 664-5, 667-8, 671-5

General Assembly Resolutions in number/date order

217A (III) of 10 December 1948 on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights 266, 289, 303, 484, 669
2625 (XXV) of 24 October 1970 on the Principles of International Law concerning Friendly Relations and Co-operation among States 105
61/295 of 13 September 2007 on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples 354
68/262 of 27 March 2014 on the territorial integrity of Ukraine 381
71/205 of 19 December 2016 on the situation of human rights in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol (Ukraine) 381-2

1610 (exceptions to immunity relevant to fulfilment of judgment) 588-9

genocide

whether expropriation of property as act of 666-8, 670-4

ICCPR, by article 6(1) (right to life) death penalty, abolition of 263, 284-6, 289 ICJ jurisdiction ratione materiae: see Islamic Republic

1611 (central banks) 588, 594

jurisdiction ratione materiae: see Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America (Alleged violations of the 1955 Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations and Consular Rights) (Preliminary Objections)

ICJ Rules of Court (1978 as amended), by rule

79 (admissibility of jurisdiction) 174, 196, 198, 200

Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) (Merits) (principal ruling) 1-50

background and facts
chronology of proceedings 11-14
overview 2-4, 19-22
submissions of the Parties
Equatorial Guinea 15-19
France 18-19
ruling
background and facts 2-4, 19-22

background and facts 2-4, 19-22 consideration of submissions 49 Court conclusions 4-6, 48, 50



```
jurisdiction 13-14
     premises of the mission"
      a contrario interpretation 27, 31
      circumstances in which property acquires status as under VCDR 23-34
         actual or effective use 28, 40-1
         agreement versus notification 32-3
         date of occupancy 35-8
         implicit consent 27
         imposition of choice by receiving state 30-1, 42-3
         prior State practice 25, 32
      definition 23-4, 28
      designation as
         actual or effective assignment 25-6
         choice, discretion over 26, 28, 30-1
         mutual consent 27
         presumption of validity 28
         prior consent requirement 24-5, 32, 46
         transfer of premises 24-5, 36-7, 42, 45
         verification procedures 41-2
      inviolability of premises 23, 26-7, 45-6
         whether breach of 27, 35, 49
      object and purpose of VCDR 24-5, 27-9
      objection to designation
         actual and effective use 40-1, 44-6
         criminal proceedings, involvement in 45-6
         imposition of choice, amounting to 42-3
         non-arbitrary and non-discriminatory nature of 39-48
         premises as private domain 20, 35, 40, 42, 44-5
         prior dealings, consistency 42-4, 47
         scope of restrictions on 33-4
         timeliness 38-9, 48
         validity 33-8
    separate and dissenting opinions: see Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial
             Guinea v. France) (Merits) (separate opinions)
    VCDR, interpretation of
      balance of obligations to avoid abuse 30-1
      circumstances in which property may acquire "premises of the mission" status 32-3
      customary international law 28
      diplomatic immunity, terms of applicability 29-30
      diplomatic staff as personae non gratae 24, 30
      discretionary power, exercise in good faith requirement 33
      mutual consent requirement for diplomatic relations 29-31
      object and purpose 24-5, 27-9, 30-1
      prior practice, consistency with 32
      Nicaragua v. Colombia 31
    VCLT
      agreement of parties, conduct amounting to 32
Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) (Merits)
             (separate opinions)
  Bhandari, J (dissenting opinion)
    Conclusions 118-25
    diplomatic privileges, law of, generally
```



```
Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) (Merits)
(separate opinions) (cont.)
      customary international law interpretation 108-9, 112
      historical development 100-2
      ILC (DP) 102-3, 107-8, 118
      principles of 101-2
VCDR, background 100-4
    overview 8-9
     premises of the mission"
      actual use requirement 113-14, 118-22, 124-5
      agreement of parties 108-11
      consent requirement 99-100, 108, 110-11, 114, 123
      customary law interpretation 112, 116-18
      definition 112
      designation procedures 110-11
      inviolability 108-12, 117-18, 120, 124-5
      notification of designation 110
      objection criteria 114, 122-3 objections, validity of 121-4
      ownership, relevance of 113
      recognition 120
      subsequent practice 116-17
    sovereign equality and mutual consent principles
      applicability to VCDR 104-5
      historical basis for 105-6
      importance of 106-7
      United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 106
    treaty interpretation
      ILC (DP) 118
      North Sea Continental Shelf (Federal Republic of Germany/Denmark; Federal Republic
             of Germany/Netherlands) 117
      VCLT general rules, applicability 116-18
    VCDR, commentary on
    historical background 100-4
    objects and purpose 104-6, 114-15, 123
    sovereign equality principle 104-5
  Gaja, J (dissenting opinion)
    overview 7-8
     'premises of the mission"
      abuse of right 85
      consent requirement, whether need for 82-5
      customary law 83-4
      definition 82-3
      inviolability, scope of 83
      objections, implications of passing tests 83
      right of refusal, examples of 83-4
  Kateka, Judge ad hoc (separate opinion)
    conclusions 164
    diplomatic relations
      mutuality and reciprocity of obligations 154-5
    majority ruling, criticism of
      consent requirement 156-60
      diplomatic obligations, importance of 154-5
```



```
inconsistency of practice 159-60
    personae non gratae analogy 158
    preliminary issues 153-6
    status of premises of mission 161-4
    VCDR preamble, interpretation of 155-6
  overview 10, 152-3
   'premises of the mission"
    actual or effective use 160-4
    alleged abuse of rights 162-3
    attachment of building 159-61
    commencement date of diplomatic status 163-4
    consent or non-objection requirement 156-60
    objections, tests for 162-3
Robinson, J (dissenting opinion)
  alleged violations of VCDR
    abuse of rights 148-9
    attachment of building 145-6
    confiscation of building 146
    dignity of building 146
    remedies for 147-8
    searches, legality of 145-6
    United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 148
  conclusions 149-52
    France v. United States of America 150
  diplomatic relations, generally
    declarations of personae non gratae 131
    mutual consent principle 126, 131
    sovereign equality principle, interpretation in light of 132 VCDR preamble, interpretation of 131-4
  majority ruling, criticism of
    object and purpose of VCDR, interpretation of 131-4, 151-2
    power of objection, conflicts with prior consent requirement 126-30, 134,
           149-50
    state practice, interpretation 134-7
    "used for the purposes of the mission", interpretation 137-45
  overview 9-10
   'premises of the mission"
    attachment status 145-6
    consent requirement, a contrario interpretation 136-7
    customary practice, relevance of 134-7, 144
    definition 125-6, 137
    denial of status conflicts with purpose 125-6
    inviolability of 125-6, 140-1
    majority interpretation, criticism of 125-9, 150-1
    mutual consent principle, consistency with 131
    objection to designation, scope of power 126-31, 134, 136, 150
    prior consent requirement 127-30
  remedies for alleged violations of VCDR
    assurances and guarantees of non-repetition 147-8
    cessation 147
    compensation 148
    satisfaction 148
```



```
Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) (Merits)
(separate opinions) (cont.)
     "used for the purposes of the mission"
      actual use 139-45
      definitions 137-8
      intention to use 141-4
      jurisprudence
         Bennett and Ball v. Hungary 142
         Cassirer and Geheeb v. Japan 142
         Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Segrim 140-2
         Greece v. B 143
         Tietz v. Bulgaria 142
      Weinmann v. Latvia 142 object and purpose of VCDR, and 137-8, 145
      private residences 140-2
      subsequent practice 144
    VCDR, interpretation
       conflicts of interests and obligations between States 133-4, 151-2
       mutual consent principle, consistency with 131
      object and purpose 131-4, 151-2
       power to object, scope of 135-6
       preamble 131-4
       treaty interpretation rules, and 136
  Sebutinde, J (separate opinion)
    abuse of rights by Equatorial Guinea 96-9
       United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 98-9
    abuse of VCDR obligations by France 95-6
    Court jurisdiction 86, 95-6
    overview 8
     'premises of the mission"
       actual use requirement 87-9
      confiscation of premises, legality of 95-6
      criteria for designation, VCDR provisions 85-7, 93 inviolability of 95-6, 98-9
      ownership distinguished from assignment and use 86-8, 92-3, 98
       prior consent requirement 93-4, 93-6
       transfer of diplomatic premises 89-93
 Xue, Vice-President (dissenting opinion) objection to designation of "premises of the mission"
       non-arbitrariness 79-80
       non-discrimination 81
       timeliness 79
    overview 7
    scope of dispute
      acceptance of diplomatic representations 74-5
       criminal investigation searches, validity of 79-80
      customary law, relevance of 75-6
       interpretation of 73-6, 78
       'premises of the mission", ownership of 73-6
    VCDR provisions
       designation of premises, right of choice 77-8
       mutual consent principle 76-8
```



```
Yusuf, President (separate opinion)
    conclusion 71-2
       United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 72
    diplomatic immunity of "premises of the mission"
      scope of 70-1
      whether searches constituted breach 65-71
    overview 6-7
     premises of the mission", criteria for designation
      inviolability of diplomatic premises 55
      jurisprudence
         Bennett and Ball v. Hungary 54
         Cassirer and Geheeb v. Japan 54
         Certain Iranian Assets
        Croatia v. Ru-Ko 55-6
Echref v. Fanner 53-4
        Jurisdiction over Yugoslav Military Mission (Germany) Case 54-5
        Manoilescu and Dobrescu v. Romania and Russia 56
         Nicaragua v. Colombia 58-9
        North Sea Continental Shelf cases 58
         Qatar v. Bahrain 58-9
         R v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs (ex parte Samuel) 55
         Suède v. Petrocochino 53
         Tietz v. Bulgaria 54
         Tunisia/Libya and Libya/Malta 58
         Ukraine v. Russia 57-8
      ownership of building, relevance of 53
    prior consent or power to object requirement
      CIL basis for, whether 51, 62-4
       USA v. Iran 61-2
      VCDR provisions, whether basis in 60-5
    treaty operative provisions, customary law interpretation 57-9
    use, interpretation of 51-9
indigenous peoples
  UN Declaration 354
Iran-US Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations, and Consular Rights 1955
  Article XXI, alleged violations: see Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America
             (Alleged violations of the 1955 Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations and
             Consular Rights) (Preliminary Objections)
Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America (Alleged violations of the
             1955 Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations and Consular Rights)
             (Preliminary Objections) 166-224
  background and facts
    chronology of proceedings 171-6 overview 166-8, 177-81
    submissions of the parties 176-7
  Court ruling
    admissibility of claims and whether abuse of process 193-6
      conduct amounting to abuse of process 193-4
      exceptional circumstances basis for rejection of claim 193, 195-6
      jurisprudence
         Border and Transborder Armed Actions (Nicaragua v. Honduras) 196
         Certain Iranian Assets 169, 170, 195
         Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) 195
        Jadhav (India v. Pakistan) 195
```



```
Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America (Alleged violations of the
1955 Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations and Consular Rights) (Preliminary
Objections) (cont.)
      risk of illegitimate advantage 193, 195-6
    conclusions 186, 193, 196, 201-2
    jurisdiction of court on basis of I-USTA XXI(1)(b)/XXI(1)(d) 196-201
      applicability of preliminary objections at merits stage 198-9 "fissionable materials", measures relating to 197-201
      jurisprudence
         Certain Iranian Assets 200
         Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 201
         Oil Platforms case 199-200
      protection of essential security interests 197-201
    jurisdiction of court ratione materiae 181-93
      overview 181-2
      subject-matter of dispute 182-6
      third country measures 186-93
    overview 168-70
    subject-matter of dispute 182-6
      claims overview 182-4
      jurisprudence
         Fisheries Jurisdiction (Spain v. Canada) 184-5
         Nuclear Tests (Australia v. France) 184
         Nuclear Tests (New Zealand v. France) 184
         Obligation to Negotiate Access to the Pacific Ocean (Bolivia v. Chile) 184-5
         Oil Platforms case 169, 170, 185
         United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 185
      whether dispute concerned interpretation and application of I-USTA 184-5
      whether dispute concerned interpretation and application of JCPOA 185-6
    third country measures 186-93
      categorization of measures 187-8
      compromissory clause impact on JCPOA dispute settlement mechanism 184, 190,
      jurisprudence
         Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) 190
         Oil Platforms case 190
         Ukraine v. Russian Federation 193
      sanctions, reimposition of 187-8
      whether measures were breaches of I-USTA 188-93
  separate declarations and opinions
    Brower, J (separate, partly dissenting opinion) 206-24
      abuse of process
         abuse of rights, concept development from 209-13
         admissibility due to 207-17
         importance in international law 209-15
         interpretation difficulties 216-17
         risk of illegitimate advantage 215-16
      disincentive effects of ruling on state agreement to non-legally binding dispute
             settlement 215-16
      I-USTA XXI(1), interpretation of
         distinctions between paragraphs (a)-(d) 217-19
         "nuclear-related" and "fissionable material" 219-21, 223-4
```



INDEX 691

```
object and purpose of I-USTA 222-4
     "relating" 219-20
    sanctions, alleged violation of treaty by reimposition of 221-2
    VCLT 31, and 222-4
  issues for consideration at merits stage 217-24
  jurisprudence
    August Aerial Incident of 10 1999 (Pakistan v. India) 212
    Ambatielos case 210
    Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
         Genocide case 212
    July Arbitral Award of 31 1989 (Guinea-Bissau v. Senegal) 211
    Avena and Other Mexican Nationals 212-13
    Certain German Interests 209
    Certain Iranian Assets 214-15, 217-18, 223
    Certain Phosphate Lands in Nauru 211-12, 215
    Certain Questions of Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters 213
    Competence of the General Assembly for the Admission of a State to the United
         Nations (Advisory Opinion) 210
    Fisheries Jurisdiction (Spain v. Canada) 210
    Free Zones case 209
    Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) 209,
         213-15
    Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 217, 222
    Oil Platforms case 217-18
    South West Africa cases 210-11
  nuclear-related sanctions
    alleged violation of treaty by reimposition of 221-2
    statements against as form of admission 222
  overview 170-1, 206
Tomka, J (declaration) 202-6
  jurisdiction ratione materiae 204-6
  matters to be decided at merits stage 203-4, 206
  object and purpose of I-USTA 205
  overview 170
  third country measures, interpretation of 202-3
```

Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action 2015 118, 166-7, 170, 179-88, 193-6, 216, 220-1 judicial impartiality

duty to guarantee judicial independence (ACHPR 26) 264

```
liberty and security of person, right to (ECHR 5) administrative practice as violation 478-81 life, right to (ECHR 2/ACHPR 4) administrative practice as violation 474-5, 474-8 alleged killing and shooting 475-6 alleged disappearances 476-7 mandatory death penalty abolition, international law trend 266, 289-91 arbitrariness assessment criteria 262-4 non-material losses related to 272-3
```



692 INDEX

nationality, right to
enforced citizenship 395-8, 411-12, 483-5
nuclear equipment
fissionable materials, interpretation under I-USTA XX1(1) 197-201, 219-21, 223-4

Objection by the Republic of Ecuador to a Decision of the Commission of the South Pacific Regional Fisheries Organisation

background and facts arguments of the parties alternative measures 533-7 failure to address special requirements of developing coastal states 526-7 inconsistency of CMM with international conventions 526-30 procedural validity of the objection 525-6 reserve" treatment in alternative measures 533-4 TAC (Resources), differences from TAC (Applicable Areas) 533-7 unjustifiable discrimination in CMM 530-3 CMM for Chilean Jack mackerel stocks (Trachurus murphyi) CMM 01-2018 520-4 Ecuador's objection to CMM 01-2018 524 history and development, general 514-20 Interim Measures 516 "reserve" stocks, alternative measures 533-7 Review Panel on 515-17 Russian Federation objection 515, 517 sustainability, perceptions of 535-6 Vanuatu objection 523-4, 536, 549 conclusion 505-7 international instruments SPRFMO Commission 514, 537 SPRFMO Convention 513-14, 537 Straddling Fish Stocks Agreement, 1995 513 UNCLOS 513 overview 505 written submissions of the parties 510-13 Court ruling alternative measures obligation to assess whether alternative measures are equivalent in effect 544-7 one-off transfers, validity of 549 "reserve" stocks, interpretation of 546-7 whether measures equivalent in effect to objected measures should be accepted 544 conclusions and recommendations 549-50 costs 550 defined terms 508-9 inconsistency of CMM with international conventions 539-41 guidance on allocation in 1995 Agreement 539-40 incorrect application of SPRFMO Convention 539-40 possible solutions for 548-9 whether exceeding margin of discretion 539-41 procedural history of case 509-13 procedural validity of objections 538-9



INDEX 693

SPRFO (South Pacific Regional Fisheries Organisation) allocation of fishery resources outside margin of discretion 539-41 extraordinary meetings, power of Reserve Panel to convene 547-8 Reserve Panel competence, scope and limitations of 547-8 unjustifiable discrimination allocations to developing states as 544 good faith presumption 543 procedural discrimination 541-4 rejection of proposal in absence as 543-4 substantive discrimination 544

peaceful enjoyment of possessions (ECHR Protocol 1:1), deprivation/interference with

administrative practice 494-5

Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen: see Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (background and facts); Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (Court rulings)

Petersen v. Islamic Republic of İran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (background and facts)

case overview 574-5, 580-2 factual background 582-8 judgment summaries in date order District Court (13 March 2013) 575-7 Court of Appeals (9 July 2014) 577-8 Supreme Court (20 April 2016) 578-80 laws relevant to all motions Executive Order 13599 (2012) 590-2, 613 Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976 (FSIA), by section 588-9 1603 (definition of foreign state) 588-9 1605A (terrorism exception) 588-9 1610 (exceptions to immunity relevant to fulfilment of judgment) 588-9 1611 (central banks) 588, 594 International Emergency Economic Powers Act 1977 (IEEPA) 590 Terrorism Risk Insurance Act 2002 (TRIA) Section 201(a) (terrorist party, definition) 590 Threat Reduction and Syria Human Rights Act 2012Section 502 (interests in blocked assets) 592-4 parties 582

Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (Court rulings)

District Court ruling
blocked assets
central banks 591-2, 609-12
location 612-13
ownership 609-12, 619-21, 626
subject to execution or attachment relevant to fulfilment of judgment 590-2
terrorist parties 590, 610
Central Bank of Iran
blocked assets
ownership of 609-12
subject to execution or attachment 591-2, 613-14
state immunity 588-9, 594, 613-14



```
Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (Court rulings) (cont.)
    constitutional conflicts 621-5
      bills of attainder and ex post facto law 622-3
      separation of powers 621-2
      unconstitutional taking of protected property 623-5
    Court conclusions 627-8
    definitions
      financial assets 593
      foreign state 589
      Iran 593
    Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976 (FSIA)
      central banks immunity 588, 594, 606, 613-14, 620, 626
      conflict of laws 613
      definition of foreign state 588-9
      exceptions to immunity relevant to fulfilment of judgment 588-9, 626-7
      interests in blocked assets 622-3
      location of blocked assets 612
      terrorism exception 588-9
    I-USTA obligations
      subject matter jurisdiction 613
    Iran Threat Reduction and Syria Human Rights Act 2012 (22 USC 8772)
      interests in blocked assets 592-4, 613
      unconstitutional taking of assets 624-5
    jurisdiction due process requirements
      minimum contacts 599-600, 603, 605
        Burger King v. Rudzewicz 599
        Eskofot v. E.I. Du Pont De Nemours 599-600
        International Shoe Co. v. Washington 599, 603
         Worldwide Volkswagen v. Woodson 599
      reasonableness 600, 603, 605
        Asahi Metal Indus. Co. v. Superior Court 600, 603, 605
        Chloe v. Queen Bee of Beverly Hills 600
        Kernan v. Kurz-Hastings 600
        MacDermid v. Deiter 600
    motions of parties: Bland Group motion for execution 626-7
      Estate of Steven Bland v. Islamic Republic of Iran 626-7
      Ferrostaal Metals v. S.S. Lash Pacifico 627
      Gadsby & Hannah v. Romania 627
    motions of parties: Defendants' motions to dismiss
      Bank Markazi
        ownership of blocked assets 609-12
        political question, judicial authority to decide on 607-9
        standard of review for personal jurisdiction 606
        subject matter jurisdiction 606-7
      Clearstream and UBAE
        due process factors 599-600, 603-5
        general jurisdiction under CPLR 301 595, 604-5
        minimum contacts necessary for domestic law jurisdiction 599-600
        reasonableness 600
        specific jurisdiction under CPLR 302(a)(1) 595-8, 600-2, 605
        standard of review for personal jurisdiction 594-5
        statutory jurisdiction under FRCP 4(k)(1)(A) 595
        statutory jurisdiction under FRCP 4(k)(2) 598-600, 602-4
```



INDEX 695

motions of parties: Defendant's motion to vacate restraints background and procedural history 614-16 political question argument 616-17 motions of parties: Plaintiff's motion for partial summary judgment arguments against turnover 625-6 constitutional arguments 621-5 bills of attainder and ex post facto law 622-3 separation of powers 621-2 unconstitutional taking of protected property 623-5 constitutional arguments—jurisprudence Axel Johnson v. Arthur Andersen 622 City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center 625 Consol. Edison v. Pataki 622 Hausler II 624 In re 650 Fifth Ave. and Related Props 625 Kelo v. City of New London 624 Lucas v. S.C. Coastal Council 623, 624 Nixon v. Adm'r of Gen. Svcs 622 Penn Central Transport Co. v. NY 624 legal standard for summary judgment 618-19 Anderson v. Liberty Lobby 618-19 Celotex Corp. v. Catrett 618 Gallo v. Prudential Residential Servs., Ltd 619 Grady v. Affiliated Cent., Inc. 619 Jaramillo v. Weyerhauser 619 Libraire v. Kaplan 619 W. World Ins. Co. v. Stack Oil 619 overview 617-18 ownership of blocked assets 619-21, 626 Exp.-Imp. Bank of US v. Asia Pulp & Paper Co. 620 Lippe v. Genlyte Group 620 personal jurisdiction general jurisdiction under CPLR 301 595, 604-5 'continuous, permanent, and substantial activity" 595 "doing business" 595, 604-5 general jurisdiction under CPLR 301—jurisprudence Gallelli v. Crown Imports 595 Gelfand v. Tanner Motor Tours 604 Hoffritz for Cutlery v. Amajac 595, 605 United Mobile Technologies v. Pegaso PCS 595 specific jurisdiction under CPLR 302(a)(1) 595-8, 600-2, 605 correspondent bank accounts 596-8 "transacting business" 595-7, 601-2, 605 specific jurisdiction under CPLR 302(a)(1)—jurisprudence Amigo Foods v. Marine Midland Bank 597 Banco Ambrosiano v. Artoc Bank & Trust 597 Best Van Lines v. Walker 596, 597 Burger King v. Rudzewicz 596 Deutsche Bank Sec., Inc. v. Montana Bd. of Invs. 596 Ehrlich-Bober & Co. v. Univ. of Houston 597 Indosuez International Finance v. National Reserve Bank 597 Kreutter v. McFadden Oil Corp. 602 Licci ex rel. Licci v. Lebanese Canadian Bank 596-8, 605



```
Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (Court rulings) (cont.)
      standard of review 594-5, 606
burden of proof 594, 606
         legal or factual sufficiency challenges 606
      standard of review—jurisprudence
         APWU v. Potter 606
         Arar v. Ashcroft 606
         Chloe v. Queen Bee of Beverly Hills 595
         Flores v. Southern Peru Copper Corp. 606
         Grand Rivers Enters. Six Nations, Ltd. v. Pryor 595
         Klinghoffer v. S.N.C. Achille Lauro 594
         Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife 606
         MacDermid Inc. v. Deiter 594
         Makarova v. USA 606
         Nat. Union Fire Ins. Co. of Pittsburgh v. BP Amoco 606
      statutory jurisdiction under FRCP 4(k)(1)(A) 595
      statutory jurisdiction under FRCP 4(k)(2) 598-600, 602-4
         Catlin Ins. Co. (UK) Ltd. v. Bernuth Lines 599
         Porina v. Marward Shipping Co. 599
      subject matter jurisdiction 606-7
         applicability of EO 13599 609, 614
         applicability of TRIA and FSIA 610-11
         central bank immunity 613-14
         EU blocking regime, implications of 607-8
         extraterritoriality argument 612-13
         I-USTA treaty obligations, and 613
         location of blocked assets 612-13
         "notwithstanding" clause 592-3, 613-14
         ownership of blocked assets 609-12
         political questions, judicial authority to decide on 607-9, 616-17
      subject matter jurisdiction—jurisprudence
         767 Third Ave. Assocs. v. Consulate Gen. of Socialist Fed. Republic of Yugoslavia
         Aurelius Capital Partners, LP v. Republic of Argentina 613
         Baker v. Carr 608
         Bank of Tokyo-Mitsubishi, UFJ, Ltd. New York Branch v. Peterson 612
         Calderon-Cardona v. JPMorgan Chase Bank 611
         Cisneros v. Alpine Ridge Group 614
Hausler I 611-12
         Hausler II 611-12
         Levin v. Bank of NY 611-12
         Shipping Corp. of India Ltd. v. Jaldhi Overseas Pte Ltd. 611
         Vimar Seguros y Reaseguros, S.A. v. M/V Sky Reefer 614
         Weinstein v. Islamic Republic of Iran 613
         Zivotofsky ex rel. Zivotofsky v. Clinton 607
    political question argument
      judgments in relation to acts of terrorism 609
      jurisdiction to decide on 607-9, 616-17
      statutory intention 609
    state immunity
      central banks 588-9, 594, 613-14
      exceptions to immunity 588-9
      "foreign state" 589
```



```
Iranian assets subject to blocking orders 591-2
    legal proceedings seeking attachment to fulfil judgment 588
  state immunity—jurisprudence
    First Nat'l City Bank v. Banco Para el Comercio Exterior de Cuba 588
    Hercaire Intl, Inc. v. Argentina 588
    Hester Int'l Corp v. Federal Republic of Nigeria 588
    NML Capital, Ltd. v. Banco Central de la República Argentina 589
    Verlinden B.V. v. Cent. Bank of Nigeria 588
    summary 575-7
  terrorism
    blocked assets
      ownership 610
      subject to execution or attachment 590
    exception to state immunity 588-9
    "terrorist party" 590
  Terrorist Risk Immunity Act (TRIA)
    central banks immunity 613
    interests in blocked assets 623-4
    terrorist exception to immunity 590, 613
Court of Appeals ruling
  background 628-30
  blocked assets
    central banks immunity 630
    fair and equitable treatment 631-2
    ownership 630
    whether taking in violation of treaty obligations 631-2
  constitutionality of statute
    conflicts with I-USTA 630-2
    separation of powers 632-4
  I-USTA violations
    anti-suit injunction 634-5
      Karaha Bodas Co. v. Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara
           635
      Kraebel v. N.Y. City Dep't of Hous. Pres. & Dev. 635
      Peterson v. Islamic Republic of Iran 635
    separation of powers 632-4
      Axel Johnson v. Arthur Andersen 632-4
      Robertson v. Seattle Audubon Society 632-4
       United States v. Klein 632-3
    takings clause 634
      E. Enters v. Apfel 634
      Weinstein v. Islamic Republic of Iran 634
    treatment of Iranian companies 631-2
    turnover of assets provisions 630-2
      McKesson Corp. v. Islamic Republic of Iran 631
      Sumitomo Shoji America, Inc. v. Avagliano 631
      United States v. Yousef 631
       Weinstein v. Islamic Republic of Iran 631
       Whitney v. Robertson 631
  subject matter jurisdiction 630
    Padilla v. Maersk Line, Ltd. 630
    Swarna v. Al-Awadi 630
    United States v. Stewart 630
```



```
Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen (Court rulings) (cont.)
  Supreme Court, principal ruling
    post-judgment execution of assets provisions
      blocking regimes 637-8
      central bank immunity 637
      determination of status of assets 638-9
      overview 635-6
      ownership of blocked assets 642
      purpose 637-8
      terrorism exception 636-7
      whether violation of separation of powers doctrine 636-7
    respondent enforcement proceedings 639-43
    separation of powers doctrine 643-5
      congressional authority regarding foreign affairs 650-1
      congressional authority to impose on judicial power 644-8
      general applicability of laws to single or small groups of subjects 649
      overview 643
      retroactive application of legislation, restrictions on 632, 643, 645-7
      state immunity, recognition of case-specific determinations 650-1
      whether claims were independent of original actions 648
      whether retroactive statutory provisions were unfair 645-7
    separation of powers doctrine—jurisprudence
       The Clinton Bridge 649
      Dames & Moore v. Regan 650
      Ex parte Peru 650
      Landgraf v. USI Film Products 645-6
      Mackey v. Lanier Collection Agency & Service 648
      Marbury v. Madison 643
      Miller v. French 651
      National Coalition To Save Our Mall v. Norton 649
      Nixon v. Administrator of General Services 649
      Pennsylvania v. Wheeling & Belmont Bridge 649
      Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm 643, 646, 649
Pope v. United States 647, 649
      Regional Rail Reorganization Act Cases 649
      Republic of Austria v. Altmann 650
      Republic of Iraq v. Beatty 650-1
      Republic of Mexico v. Hoffman 650
      Robertson v. Seattle Audubon Society 644-5, 647, 648
      SeaRiver Maritime Financial Holdings, Inc. v. Mineta 649
      United States v. Klein 644-5
      United States v. Padelford 644
      United States v. Schooner Peggy 645, 647
       Verlinden B.V. v. Central Bank of Nigeria 650
      Zivotofsky v. Kerry 650
  Supreme Court, dissenting opinion of Roberts, J and Sotomayor, J
    separation of powers doctrine
      constitutional principle, development 652-5
      judicial powers 655
      legislative retroactivity, restrictions on 655, 658
      whether statutory provisions an unconstitutional interference in judicial function
             655-60
```



INDEX 699

```
whether statutory provisions in violation of state immunity 660-2
separation of powers doctrine—jurisprudence
  American Ins. Assn. v. Garamendi 661
  Bond v. US 652
  Chicago & Southern Air Lines v. Waterman S.S. Corp 655
  Commodity Futures Trading Comm'n v. Schor 652
  Dames & Moore v. Regan 661-2
  First Nat. City Bank v. Banco Para el Comercio Exterior de Cuba 656
  Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight 657
  INS v. Chadha 658-9
  McCulloch v. Maryland 660
  Medellín v. Texas 662
  Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm 652-5, 657, 658
  Robertson v. Seattle Audubon Society 660
  Smith v. Allwright 661
  Stern v. Marshall 651
  United States v. Klein 657-8, 662
  United States v. Padelford 657
  United States v. Schooner Peggy 658-9
  Verlinden B.V. v. Central Bank of Nigeria 661
  Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co v. Sawyer 660
```

Rajabu and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania (Merits and Reparations) 238-91 background and facts

```
allegations 238-9, 244-6
  conclusion 239-341
  jurisdiction and admissibility claims 246-7
  overview 238-9, 243-4
  parties 243
  separate opinions 241
  subject of application 243-4
  submission of the parties
Applicants 245-6
    Respondent State 246-7
  summary of procedure before the Court 244-5
Court ruling
  admissibility of application
    compliance conditions, general 250-1
    conditions not in contention between parties 254
    failure to file application within reasonable time 240, 250, 252-4
    non-exhaustion of local remedies 239-40, 250-2
  admissibility of application—jurisprudence Alex Thomas v. Tanzania 251
    Michael Majuru v. Zimbabwe 252-3
  alleged violation of rights
    failure to abolish death penalty as violation of Charter 267-8
    failure to recognize rights 239, 267-8
    mandatory death penalty as violation of right to life 239, 240, 261-7
    mandatory death penalty constituting torture and inhuman and degrading
           treatment 240, 266-7
    non-exhaustion of local remedies 250
```



```
Rajabu and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania (Merits and Reparations) (cont.)
      right to be heard 257-60
      right to be heard by competent court 239-40, 260-1
      right to be tried within reasonable time 240, 250, 255-7
      right to dignity 239, 265-6
      right to fair trial 239-40, 254-61
      right to life 239, 240, 261-7
    conclusions 276-8
    costs 276
    jurisdiction of Court 239
      claims of Respondent State 246-7
      general aspects 250
      material jurisdiction, Rules of Court 247
      objection on basis of appellate jurisdiction 247-9
      objection on basis that Court is acting as court of first instance 249
      protection of rights, international law obligations 248-9
    jurisdiction of Court—jurisprudence
      Alex Thomas v. Tanzania 248
      Ernest Francis Mtingwi v. Malawi 248
    mandatory death penalty
      domestic provisions, arbitrariness assessment criteria 262-5
      failure to abolish as violation of Charter 267-8
      moral prejudice and psychological suffering, compensation for 240, 272-3
      non-material losses relating to 272-3
      right to dignity, and 267
      violation of right to life, as 216-67, 239, 240
      whether constitutes torture and inhuman and degrading treatment 240, 266-7
    mandatory death penalty—jurisprudence

Eversley Thompson v. St. Vincent & the Grenadines 263
      Forum of Conscience v. Sierra Leone 263
      Hilaire, Constantine & Benjamin v. Trinidad & Tobago 263-4
      Interights (on behalf of Bosch) v. Botswana 262
      International Pen (Ken Saro-Wiwa) v. Nigeria 262-3
    overview 239-41
    reparations
      basis for 268-9
      costs of domestic proceeding 271
      death penalty, non-material losses relating to 272-3
      loss of income 271
      losses incurred by family members 273
      non-pecuniary reparations 273-6
      non-repetition 275-6
      pecuniary reparations 270-3
      publication of judgment 275-6
      purpose of 270
      responsibility and causation, establishment of 269-70
      restitution 273-5
    reparations—jurisprudence
       Lucien Ikili Rashidi v. Tanzania 275
      Soering v. UK 272-3
    right to dignity 239, 265-6
    right to fair trial 239-40, 254-61
      evidence used in domestic proceedings 258-60
      preliminary hearings and trial, whether heard before same judge or magistrate 260-1
```



```
right to be heard 240, 257-60
      right to be heard by competent court 239-40, 260-1
      right to be tried within reasonable time 240, 250, 255-7
       visual identification 258-60
    right to life 239, 240, 261-6
      mandatory death penalty as violation of 239, 240, 261-7
  separate opinion (Bensaoula, J)
    objections, admissibility of
       failure to file application within reasonable time 281-2
      jurisdiction of appellate judges before national courts 280-1
       non-exhaustion of local remedies 278-80
    overview 241, 278
  separate opinion (Tchikaya, J)
    mandatory death penalty
      ACHPR 4, interpretative conflicts with 288-91
      criticism of principal ruling on 282-3, 287, 290
      reparations for 286-7
      status of death penalty in international law, conflicts with compulsory sentences
             283-7
    mandatory death penalty—jurisprudence
       Eddie Johnson Dexter case 284
    Eversley Thompson v. St. Vincent and the Grenadines 286-7 overview 241
religious freedom (ECHR 9)
  administrative practice as violation 488-90
Security Council Resolutions (UNSCRs) by number and year
  1696 (2006) (Iran's nuclear programme) 178-9
  1737 (2006) (Iran sanctions) 178-9
  2231 (2015) (Iran nuclear issue) 179
separation of powers: see also judicial impartiality
  domestic authority to make laws relating to foreign affairs: see Petersen v. Islamic Republic
             of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen
  US doctrine
    constitutional principle, development 652-5
    judicial powers 655
    legislative retroactivity, restrictions on 655, 658
    whether statutory provisions an unconstitutional interference in judicial function
             655-60
    whether statutory provisions in violation of state immunity 660-2
standard of proof
  assessment of evidence, principles for 428-30
  extraterritorial jurisdiction (ECHR 1), exceptional circumstances 451
  jurisdictional issues 432-3
state immunity
  central banks: see Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen
  expropriation of property
    domestic takings rule
      property belonging to country's own nationals, applicability to 670, 675
      statutory intention 665, 668-70, 675
      whether violation of human rights law 664-5, 670-4
      whether violation of international law 664, 667-70, 676
      whether violation of international law of expropriation 667, 671, 676
```



> 702 **INDEX**

state immunity (cont.) domestic takings rule—jurisprudence Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Farr 670 Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino 668-70, 673 F. Palicio y Compañía, S.A. v. Brush 670 Gudmundsson v. Iceland 669 Malewicz v. Amsterdam 674-5 Republic of Austria v. Altmann 670, 672, 675 sovereign functions performed within employment duties at US air base 571-2 terrorism as exception to: see Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen State Immunity Act 1978 (UK) (SIA) by section 1(1) (general immunity from jurisdiction) 563, 564 4 (contracts of employment) 564 16(2) (excluded matters) 564-7 state immunity, applicable law conditions of employment 557, 563-4 CIL, and 568-70 excluded matters 564-7 general provisions 563-4 unfair dismissal, jurisdiction of employment tribunal: see Chambers v. United States (jurisdiction of employment tribunal) state responsibility for acts of private persons or groups directed or controlled by State (ILC(SR) 8) 438

state responsibility for compensation for internationally wrongful acts (ILC(SR) 36)

state responsibility for satisfaction for injury caused by internationally wrongful acts (ILC(SR) 37) 148

Straddling Fish Stocks Agreement, 1995

inconsistency of SPRFMO CMM stock allocation measures with 539-40

terrorism

blocked assets ownership 610

subject to execution or attachment 590

damages awarded to victims of state-sponsored terrorism: see Petersen v. Islamic Republic of Iran/Bank Markazi v. Petersen

state immunity exception 588-9 "terrorist party" 590

torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment (ECHR 3/ACHPR 5)

administrative practice as violation 478-81

mandatory death penalty as 240, 266-7

treaty interpretation

diplomatic status of premises of the mission: see Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France) (Merits)

Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea): see Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (Court ruling); Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (background and facts)

Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (background and facts)

applications and procedure 314-17

case law of the ICJ

Advisory Opinion on the Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons 385 Application of the ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation) 386-7



> INDEX 703

Corfu Channel case 384

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory

Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 384, 385-6 Office of the Prosecutor, ICJ, Report on Preliminary Examination Activities 2019 387-8

United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 384-5, 386 complaints (summary) 420-2

overview of facts 293-6

relevant legal framework

bilateral agreements

Agreement between Russian Federation and Ukraine on the parameters of the division of the Black Sea Fleet of 28 May 1997 378-9

Agreement between Russian Federation and Ukraine on the presence of the Black Sea Fleet of the Russian Federation on the territory of Ukraine of 21 April

Agreement between Russian Federation and Ukraine on the status and conditions of the presence of the Black Sea Fleet of the Russian Federation on the territory of Ukraine of 28 May 1997 376-8

Treaty between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Crimea on the accession of the ARC to the Russian Federation and the formation of new constituent entities of the Federation 2014 (Accession Treaty) 379-80

Treaty on Friendship, Cooperation and Partnership between Ukraine and the Russian Federation 1997 374-6

domestic law

Constitution of Ukraine 370-3

Federal Law of the Russian Federation terminating the Agreements on the presence of the Black Sea Fleet of the Russian Federation on the territory of Ukraine (No 38-FZ) 374

Resolution on the use of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation on the territory of Ukraine (No 48-SF) 374

multilateral texts

Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe Decision regarding the situation in Ukraine of 2 April 2014 (CM/Del/Dec(2014)1196/1.8) 383

Council of Europe Resolution 1988 (2014) on recent developments in Ukraine: threats to the functioning of democratic institutions 382-3

Council of Europe Resolution 2133 (2016) on legal remedies for human rights violations on the Ukrainian territories outside the control of Ukrainian authorities 383

Council of the European Union Decision concerning restrictive measures in respect of actions undermining or threatening the territorial integrity, sovereignty and independence of Ukraine of 17 March 2014 (2014/145/CFSP) 384

Memorandum on security assurances in connection with Ukraine's accession to the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons, 5 December 1994 380-1 UNGA Resolution 68/262 on the territorial integrity of Ukraine 381

UNGA Resolution 71/205 on the situation of human rights on the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol 381-2

other materials: reports of intergovernmental organizations

Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe: Report following the Commissioner's Mission in Kyiv, Moscow and Crimea (2014) 408-13 access to international humanitarian and human rights organizations 412-13 citizenship-related issues 411-12

overview 408

"self-defence" forces, status of 410-11



```
Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (background and facts) (cont.)
        situation of minorities 408-10
        suppression of the media 410
      Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights: Report on the situation
            of human rights in the temporarily occupied Autonomous Republic of
            Crimea (2017) 391-407
        conclusion and recommendations 407-8
        freedom of movement 402
        freedom of opinion, expression and media 404-5
        freedom of peaceful assembly 403-4
        freedom of thought, conscience and religion 402-3
        general summary 392-4
        HRMMU mission mandate and activities 394-5
        population data and movements 395
        property rights 405-6
        right to education in native language 406-7
        right to life 398-9
        right to nationality 395-8
        right to physical and mental integrity 399-400
        right to private and family life 400-1
        rights of detainees and transfer of prisoners 401-2
      OSČE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights/OSCE High
            Commissioner on National Minorities: Human Rights Assessment in
            Ukraine (12 May 2014) 413-14
      OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights/OSCE High
            Commissioner on National Minorities: Report on Human Rights
            Assessment Mission on Crimea (17 September 2015) 414-15
      UN Committee against Torture (28 August 2018) 390-1
      UN Human Rights Committee (28 April 2015) 389-90
    other materials: reports of non-governmental organizations
      Amnesty International: "One Year On: Violations of the Rights to Freedom of
            Expression, Assembly and Association in Crimea" (2015)
        abductions and impunity 417-18
        freedom of assembly 418-19
        freedom of expression and suppression of the media 418
        harassment and detention of activists 419
        summary 416-17
        suppression of religious freedom 420
      Human Rights Watch: "Rights in Retreat: Abuses in Crimea" (November 2014)
            415-16
  submissions of parties
    applicant Government
      alleged violation of the Convention
        acts of suppression and repression 342, 346
        automatic imposition of Russian citizenship 350-1
        disappearances 342-3, 347-8
        first phase (17 February-21 March 2014) 342-8
        freedom of movement restrictions 353-4
        illegal searches of private property 352, 353
        religious suppression 346, 352
        second phase (after 21 March 2014) 348-55
        seizure and nationalization of private property 353
```



```
suppression of education 354-5
        suppression of the media 346-9, 352-3, 355
        torture and unlawful detention 342-50
        transfer of convicts to Russian territory 350
      evidence of effective control
        annexation of Crimea and referendum 335-6
        background 326-8
        chronological list of troop movements and deployment of military equipment in
             Crimea 336-42
        consolidation of control over Crimea (1-16 March 2014) 333-5
        immediate aftermath of invasion 331-3
        seizure of control over Crimea (26-27 February 2014) 328-31
      evidentiary material
        CCTV footage and other visual materials 326
        official documents from Ukrainian national authorities 320-3
        other documents 323-6
        witness statements 318-20
    respondent Government
      alleged incidents, responses to 367-70
      effective control, evidence of 364-7
      evidentiary material
        Crimean documents 357-8
        international materials 357
        media articles and videos 358-9
        official documents from Russian national authorities 356
        official documents from Ukrainian national authorities 357
      factual background 359-62
      investigations and other measures undertaken to comply with Convention
             obligations 367-8
      referendum, developments leading up to and aftermath 362-7
Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (Court ruling)
 administrative practice, admissibility of complaints
    general remarks regarding evidence
      applicant Government submissions 468-9
      Court's assessment 469-73
      jurisprudence
        El-Masri 470
        Hirsi Jamaa v. Italy 470
Ireland v. UK 470
        JK v. Sweden 471
        Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 471-2
        MSS v. Belgium and Greece 470
        NA v. UK 470
        Saadi v. Italy 470
        Sufi and Emli v. UK 471
      respondent Government submissions 466-8
 administrative practice, general meaning of "administrative practice" 430-1
      official tolerance 431
      repetition of acts 431
    rule on exhaustion of domestic remedies, applicability 431
    standard of proof 430-2
```



```
Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (Court ruling) (cont.)
  administrative practice, prima facie evidence of alleged violations
    alleged lack of effective investigation
      Court's assessment 477-8
      parties' submissions 477
    freedom from discrimination (ECHR 14) 499
      Court's assessment 499-501
      parties' submissions 499
    freedom from torture and inhuman or degrading treatment (ECHR 3)
      applicant Government's submissions 478-9
      Court's assessment 480-1
      respondent Government's submissions 479
    freedom of expression (ECHR 10) 490
      apprehension and intimidation of, and seizure of material from international
             journalists
        Court's assessment 492
        parties' submissions 491-2
      suppression of non-Russian media
        Court's assessment 491
        parties' submissions 490-1
    freedom of movement (ECHR Protocol No 4(2)) 497-8
      Court's assessment 498-9
      parties' submissions 498
    freedom of religion (ECHR 9) 488-9
      Court's assessment 488-90
      parties' submissions 488
    right to education in native language (ECHR Protocol No 1(2)) 495
      Court's assessment 496-7
      parties' submissions 495-6
    right to fair trial (ECHR 6)
      Court's assessment 481-2
      parties' submissions 481
    right to liberty (ECHR 5)
      applicant Government's submissions 478-9
      Court's assessment 480-1
      respondent Government's submissions 479
    right to peaceful assembly (ECHR 11) 492-3
      Court's assessment 493-4
      parties' submissions 493
    right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions (ECHR Protocol No 1(1)) 494
      Court's assessment 494-5
      jurisprudence
        Everest Estate v. Russian Federation 495
        Public Joint Stock Company "State Savings Bank of Ukraine" (JSC Oschadbank)
             v. Russian Federation 495
      parties' submissions 494
    right to respect for private and family life (ECHR 8)
      overview 482-3
      arbitrary raids of private dwelling houses
        Court's assessment 487
        parties' submissions 486-7
```



```
transfer of convicts to the territory of the Russian Federation
       Court's assessment 485-6
       parties' submissions 485
    unlawful automatic imposition of Russian citizenship
       Court's assessment 484-5
       parties' submissions 483
    unlawful automatic imposition of Russian citizenship—jurisprudence
       Alpeyeva and Dzhalagoniya v. Russia 484
       Genovese v. Malta 484
       K2 v. UK 484
       Karassev v. Finland 484
       Riener v. Bulgaria 484
       Slivenko v. Latvia 484
  right to life (ECHR 2) 474-8
    alleged substantive violations
       Court's assessment as to alleged disappearances 476-7
       Court's assessment as to alleged killing and shooting 475-6
parties' submissions 474-5 alleged lack of genuine application
  Court's assessment 435-7
  jurisprudence
    Advisory Opinion in Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons 436
Cyprus v. Turkey 434, 435
    Greek case 434, 435
    Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 436
     Turkish case 435
  parties' submissions 434
  relevance of political implications of claims to Court jurisdiction 435-6
Court conclusions 501-3
evidence
  burden of proof: jurisprudence
    Al Nashiri v. Romania 429
    Baka v. Hungary 428-9
    Creangă v. Romania 429
    El-Masri v. former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia 429
    Georgia v. Russia 429, 430
    Hassan v. UK 429
Ireland v. UK 429
    Nolan and K. v. Russia 428
  jurisdiction of Court 423-6
  jurisprudence
    Application of the ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation) 425
    Preliminary Objections of the Russian Federation in respect of the Dispute concerning
           Coastal State Rights in the Black Sea, Sea of Azov, and Kerch Strait between
           Ukraine and the Russian Federation 425-6
  object of case before Court 423-6
  overview of ruling 296-305
  principles of assessment of evidence
    burden of proof 428-30
    Court's assessment 428-33
    exhaustion of domestic remedies, evidentiary threshold 431-2
```



```
Ukraine v. Russia (Re Crimea) (Court ruling) (cont.)
      parties' submissions 427-8
      standard of proof as to alleged existence of administrative practice 430-2
      standard of proof as to jurisdictional issues 432-3
    scope of complaint before Court 426-7
    standard of proof: jurisprudence
Al-Skeini v. UK 433
      Cyprus v. Turkey 431, 433
Georgia v. Russia 430-1, 432
      Greek case 430
      Ilaşcu and Others v. Moldova and Russia 433
      Ireland v. UK 430-1
      Loizidou v. Turkey 433
      Turkish case 430-1
    types of evidence examined 427
  exhaustion of domestic remedies
    Court's assessment
      applicability of exhaustion rule 431, 464-5
      evidentiary threshold 431-2, 465-6
      jurisprudence
         Application of the ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russia) 464-5
         Cyprus v. Turkey 464
         Georgia v. Russia 464
         Ireland v. UK 464
    parties' submissions
      applicant Government 463-4
      respondent Government 462-3
  jurisdiction of the respondent State regarding events complained of by applicant
             Government (ECHR 1)
    Court's assessment
      application to present case
         conclusion 461
         Court competence—jurisprudence
           Al-Skeini 460
           Application of the ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation) 458
           Assanidze v. Georgia 460
           Banković and Others 460
           Everest Estate v. Russian Federation 458
           Gentilhomme and Others v. France 459-60
           Loizidou v. Turkey 461
           Public Joint Stock Company "State Savings Bank of Ukraine" (JSC Oschadbank)
             v. Russian Federation 458-9
         effective control of Crimea
           Black Sea Fleet Agreement provisions for military presence 451-2, 454-5
           conduct of respondent state military presence 455-7
           strength of respondent state military presence 452-5
         effective control—jurisprudence
           Al-Skeini 450, 457
Cyprus v. Turkey 450
           Georgia v. Russia 450-1
           Jaloud v. Netherlands 450
           Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 457
```



```
period between 27 February and 18 March 2014 449-58
           compatibility ratione loci with Convention provisions 449-51
           effective control 450-8
           standard of proof for exceptional circumstances for exercise of extraterritorial
             jurisdiction 451
           test for 450-1
         period following 18 March 2014 449, 458-61
           applicable domestic law 459-61
           Court competence 458-60
           effective control 458, 461
           recognition of change to territorial integrity of Ukraine 460-1
           responsibility for actions within jurisdiction 461
           state's jurisdictional competence under PIL 460-1
         "state agent authority" principle 461
      general principles relevant to 446
        effective control over an area 448-9
        state agent authority and control 446-8
         territorial principle 446
      general principles relevant to: jurisprudence
        Assanidze v. Georgia 446
         Banković and Others 446-8
         Cyprus v. Turkey 448
         Drozd and Janousek v. France and Spain 447
         Gentilhomme and Others v. France 447
        Ilaşcu and Others v. Moldova and Russia 446, 448-9
        Issa v. Turkey 447
         Loizidou v. Turkey 447, 448-9
        M. v. Denmark 447
        Medvedyev v. France 448
         Öcalan v. Turkey 447
         Soering v. UK 446
        X. v. Germany 447
        X. v. UK 447
X. and Y. v. Switzerland 447
    parties' submissions
      applicant government 441-4
      jurisprudence
        Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
             Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro) 438
         Banković and Others v. Belgium and Others 445
        Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua 438
      respondent government
        effective control 437-41
         sovereign entitlement to extend jurisdiction beyond national territory 437
      third-party intervener submissions (McGill Centre for Human Rights and Legal
             Pluralism) 444-5
  scope of case 422
    background events, relevance of 423-4
Court conclusions 501-3
UNCLOS (1982) and related agreements, interpretation
  inconsistency of SPRFMO CMM 539-41
    guidance on allocation in 1995 Agreement 539-40
    incorrect application of SPRFMO Convention 539-40
```



710 INDEX

UNCLOS (1982) and related agreements, interpretation (cont.) possible solutions for 548-9 whether exceeding margin of discretion 539-41

Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations 1961 historical background 100-4 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 1969 Article 31(3)(b) (general interpretation) 223-4