The Sacraments of the Law and the Law of the Sacraments

'Sacramentality' can serve as a category that helps to understand the performative power of religious and legal rituals. Through the analysis of 'sacraments', we can observe how law uses sacramentality to change reality through performative action, and how religion uses law to organise religious rituals, including sacraments. The study of sacramental action thus shows how law and religion intertwine to produce legal, spiritual, and other social effects. In this volume, Judith Hahn explores this interplay by interpreting the Catholic sacraments as examples of sacro-legal symbols that draw on the sacramental functioning of the law to provide both spiritual and legal goods to church members. By focusing on sacro-legal symbols from the perspective of sacramental theology, legal studies, ritual theory, symbol theory, and speech act theory, Hahn's study reveals how law and religion work hand in hand to shape our social reality.

Judith Hahn is Professor of Canon Law in the Faculty of Catholic Theology, University of Bonn. A theologian and canonist, she is the author of *Church Law in Modernity* (Cambridge University Press, 2019), *Foundations of a Sociology of Canon Law* (Springer, 2022), and *The Language of Canon Law* (Oxford University Press, 2023).

The Sacraments of the Law and the Law of the Sacraments

JUDITH HAHN University of Bonn





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009330169

DOI: 10.1017/9781009330138

© Judith Hahn 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Hahn, Judith, 1978– author. TITLE: The sacraments of the law and the law of the sacraments / Judith Hahn, University of Bonn, Germany. DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023003294 (print) | LCCN 2023003295 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009330169 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009330138 (ebook) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Sacraments (Canon law)

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KBU3075 .H34 2023 (print) | LCC KBU3075 (ebook) | DDC 262.9/33-dc23/eng/20230517

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023003294

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023003295

ISBN 978-1-009-33016-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

The cover image shows a plate by an unknown Italian artist depicting Gaius Popilius Laenas before the King of Syria, dated circa 1545.

The reproduction of this image was kindly granted by the Art Gallery of New South Wales.

Contents

Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii
Ι	Introduction	I
1	Sacraments in Law and Religion 1.1 Catholicism and Sacramentality 1.2 Symbols and Sacraments	14 14 30
1	1.3 Terminological Clarifications 1.4 Summary	50 51 72
2 2 2 2	The Ritual Frame of Sacraments 2.1 Understanding Ritual 2.2 Indexical and Canonical Rituals 2.3 Functioning and Effectiveness 2.4 The Language of Ritual 2.5 Summary	73 73 91 103 118 130
3 S 3 3 3 3	Sacramental Change in Status Sa.1 Taxonomic Ambiguousness S.2 Spiritual and Legal Change S.3 Creating Intermediary States S.4 Unmaking Personhood S.5 Summary	132 132 136 152 158 161
4	Sacraments as Speech Acts 4.1 Understanding Speech Acts 4.2 Speech Acts of the Law 4.3 Catholic Sacramental Speech 4.4 Summary Conclusion	163 163 188 205 256 260
Bibliography		271
Index		287

Acknowledgements

I can hardly mention all those to whom I owe thanks for their support and inspiration, but would like to name at least some individuals who were of tremendous help before, during, and after the writing process. First, I would like to thank all those scholars who inspired me to take a closer look at the sacraments, liturgy, and Catholic worship. Having had a particular dislike for liturgical studies during my undergraduate years in theology, these matters did not naturally kindle my academic interest. But my ignorance was certainly challenged when I took a liturgy class at Heythrop College in 1999–2000 consisting of postgraduates who, apart from being part-time students, were mostly full-time Anglican ministers. This group of female and male clergy discussing liturgical issues in the light of their own liturgical routines and experiences were in sharp contrast to those dry liturgy classes back at my German university. Over the last couple of years, I have been lucky enough to meet other inspiring liturgists and scholars of the liturgy. I would like to mention liturgical scholar James Dallen, who generously contributed his insights on individual and collective dimensions of liturgical action to our 2016 conference on penitence and punishment and to our conference volume Mercy and Justice.¹ Gerard Moore, principal of the BBI – The Australian Institute of Theological Education, encouraged me to continue my project of writing this book during a visit to the BBI in 2019. I am grateful to Stephan Winter with whom I share a profound interest in understanding

¹ See James Dallen, 'The Reconciling Community: The Rite of Penance, Past and Present', in Hahn, Judith/Werner, Gunda, eds., *Mercy and Justice: A Challenge for Contemporary Theology* (Brill's Studies in Catholic Theology 9), Leiden, Brill, 2020, 27–44.

viii

Acknowledgements

the liturgy as a source of normativity; his thoughts on this issue have provided me with many hints for further study which I followed up when revising this manuscript for publication. Andreas Odenthal was so kind as to read the manuscript of this book and to share his insights on my considerations; I am indebted to him for suggesting numerous revisions and additions that I made before submitting the manuscript for publication. Benedikt Kranemann invited me to present my thoughts at one of his lecture series in 2021. Many other scholars deserve mention as well, such as those of the international research network 'Theology, Performance & Politics', which welcomed me as a guest in their interactive and digital workshop in October 2020. I have also presented some aspects of my study in different online talks over the past two years: at the interdisciplinary conference on coincidence ('Zufall') at the University of Regensburg in March 2021, the General Conference of the International Law and Language Association at the University of Alicante in September 2021, in the course of the Law, Theology & Culture seminar series of Lund University in November 2021, and at the Final Conference of the Käte Hamburger Center 'Law as Culture' in Bonn in May 2022. These events were essential for discussing my research with scholars from various disciplines, and they also helped me to verify that my chosen strategy for studying the connection between the law and the sacraments made some sense to other scholars within an interdisciplinary framework.

I am now a member of the Faculty of Catholic Theology at the University of Bonn and was a member of the Faculty of Catholic Theology at Ruhr University Bochum when writing this book. With regard to both faculties, I have been fortunate to be part of an inspiring college of theological scholars. I am grateful to my colleagues for their support and for the community spirit in both houses. I particularly want to mention Bernhard Grümme, who was so kind as to read a rough draft of this study at an early stage and shared some valuable criticism with me. I would also like to thank Andrea Hartwig, who handled the administrative affairs of my chair in Bochum during the time I was writing this book, as well as Catherina Janssen and Carina Bekemeier, who supported my study by procuring the literature I needed. As always, I am most grateful to Robert John Murphy for his indispensable help in carefully proofreading my manuscript.

My special thanks go to the staff of Thomas More Law School of the Australian Catholic University who were so generous in hosting me in 2019–2020 as a visiting scholar. During this time, I was able to compose a huge chunk of this book, something which was extremely

Acknowledgements

helpful and expedited my writing process tremendously. My gratitude goes to all members of staff, who received me most welcomingly and hospitably. I want to mention Roque Reynolds, the then dean of the Thomas More Law School, May Fong Cheong, acting deputy head of the school, and Jennifer Downey, head and expert of all administrative matters. More than they can know, listening and talking to legal scholars Brendon Murphy and Dominic Cudmore enabled me to grasp at least the basic structures of common law, for which I am very grateful. My special thanks go to the team at the Australian Catholic University's then brand-new Canon Law Centre, to Michele Riondino, founding director of the centre, and Jessica Slater, who smoothly handled all of the centre's administrative matters when the endeavour commenced. My gratitude also extends to Polly Brennan, who provided the wonderful space and shelter for my out-of-office time, including magnificent views of the Sydney Harbour Bridge and Opera House. Great views are useless without great company. I am most grateful to Thomas for being good company, even during those times when writing a book makes me cranky.

ix