## ORTHOGRAPHIC TRADITIONS AND THE SUB-ELITE IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

This book makes use of digital corpora to give in-depth details of the history and development of the spelling of Latin. It focusses on sub-elite texts in the Roman empire and reveals that sophisticated education in this area was not restricted to those at the top of society. Nicholas Zair studies the history of particular orthographic features and traces their usage in a range of texts which give insight into everyday writers of Latin, including scribes and soldiers at Vindolanda, slaves at Pompeii, members of the Praetorian Guard and writers of curse tablets. In doing so, he problematises the use of 'old-fashioned' spelling in dating inscriptions, provides important new information on sound change in Latin and shows how much can be gained from a detailed sociolinguistic analysis of ancient texts.

NICHOLAS ZAIR is Senior Lecturer in Classics (Classical Linguistics and Comparative Philology) at the University of Cambridge and Fellow in Classics and Linguistics at Peterhouse. He recently held a Pro Futura Scientia Fellowship at SCAS (Uppsala) and CRASSH (Cambridge). He is also the author of *The Reflexes of the Proto-Indo-European Laryngeals in Celtic* (2012) and *Oscan in the Greek Alphabet* (Cambridge, 2016), and co-editor of *Migration, Mobility and Language Contact in and around the Ancient Mediterranean* (Cambridge, 2020).

### CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL STUDIES

General editors

J. P. T. CLACKSON, W. M. BEARD, G. BETEGH, R. L. HUNTER, M. J. MILLETT, S. P. OAKLEY, R. G. OSBORNE, C. VOUT, T. J. G. WHITMARSH

# ORTHOGRAPHIC TRADITIONS AND THE SUB-ELITE IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

NICHOLAS ZAIR University of Cambridge





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009327664

DOI: 10.1017/9781009327633

© Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009327633 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties.

Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009327633

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-009-32766-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-32767-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Don't write naughty words on walls if you can't spell.

Tom Lehrer, 'Be prepared'

## CONTENTS

List of Figures	page x
List of Tables	xi
Foreword	xiii
Note on the Text	xiv
List of Abbreviations	xvi
Printed Works	xvi
Online Resources	xviii
1 Introduction	I
What This Book Is About	I
Sub-elite Education in Literacy	3
Defining 'Old-fashioned' Spelling	10
Standard and Non-standard Spelling	15
Structure of the Book	18
Methodology	19
Scribes, Writers and Authors	19
Finding and Counting Old-fashioned Spelling	21
The Sub-elite Corpora	26
The Tablets of the Sulpicii (TPSulp.)	28
The Tablets of Caecilius Jucundus (CIL 4.3340)	30
The Tablets from Herculaneum (TH <sup>2</sup> )	31
The Tablets from London (WT)	31
The Vindonissa Tablets (T. Vindon.)	32
The Vindolanda Tablets (Tab. Vindol.)	32
The Bu Njem Ostraca (O. BuNjem)	33
Papyrus and Parchment from Dura Europos (P. Dura)	34
Graffiti from the Paedagogium	34
Curse Tablets (Kropp)	35
Letters (CEL)	35
Funerary Inscriptions from the Isola Sacra (IS)	36
Writers on Language	37
A Sketch of the Latin Vowel System through Time	39

#### Contents

### Part I: Old-fashioned Spellings

2	<ai> for /ae/</ai>	47
3	<ei> and <e> for /i:/ <ei> for /i:/ <e> for /i:/</e></ei></e></ei>	50 50 57
4	<o> for /u/</o>	65
5	<o> for /u:/</o>	74
6	Alternation of <u> and <i> /u/ and /i/ in Initial Syllables after /l/ and before a Labial /u/ and /i/ in Medial Syllables before a Labial</i></u>	75 75 82
7	<uo> for /we/ before a Coronal</uo>	106
8	<uo> and <uu> for /wu/ and /uu/, and <quo> and <quu> for /k<sup>w</sup>u/</quu></quo></uu></uo>	109
9	Double Letters to Write Long Vowels	129
10	<c> for /g/</c>	132
ΙI	<ii> for /jj/</ii>	134
12	<k> before /a(:)/ and <q> before /u(:)/ <k> before /a(:)/ <q> before /u(:)/</q></k></q></k>	138 144 158
13	<qu> for /k/ before Back Vowels</qu>	165
14	<xs> for /ks/</xs>	169
15	Geminates and Singletons <ss> and <s> <ll> and <l> Singletons for Geminate Consonants after Original Long Vowels</l></ll></s></ss>	182 182 192 199
16	spepondi	202
17	<i>popl-</i> and <i>pupl-</i> for <i>publ-</i>	203

viii

#### Contents

## Part II: Apices and i-longa

18	Apices and i-longa: Introduction	207
19	Apices and i-longa in the Isola Sacra Inscriptions	215
20	Apices in the Vindolanda Tablets	226
2 I	Apices in the Tablets of the Sulpicii	239
22	<i>Apex</i> Use in the Vindolanda and TPSulp. Tablets in Comparison	245
23	Apices in the Tablets from Herculaneum	250
24	<i>i-longa</i> in the Tablets of the Sulpicii and the Tablets from Herculaneum	251
25	Conclusions Old-Fashioned Spelling? Problems and Different Histories Optional Spellings and Sub-elite Education The Education of Scribes and Stonemasons Optional Spellings: Evidence for Sound Change	258 258 262 271 276
Appe	endix: <uo> and <uu> in Catullus</uu></uo>	280
Bibliography		283
Index		295

# FIGURES

I	Early Latin vowels	page 39
2	Early Latin diphthongs	39
3	Latin vowels	41
4	Latin diphthongs	42

# TABLES

Ι	<ei> in the curse tablets, undated and first to</ei>	page 55
	fourth (or fifth) century AD	
2	<o> for /u/ in the curse tablets</o>	68
3	lub- and lib- in inscriptions (omitting forms of liber	<i>is</i> 77
	from AD 100)	
4	clupeus and clipeus	80
5	<u> and <i> in some second century BC inscription</i></u>	is 84
6	Words with <u> spellings in the third and second</u>	86
	centuries BC	
7	<u> and <i> in superlatives in <i>-imus</i></i></u>	98
8	monumentum and monimentum in the Isola Sacra	103
	inscriptions	
9	contubernalis and contibernalis in the Vindolanda	104
	tablets	
10	<uo> and <uu> 100–50 BC</uu></uo>	III
ΙI	<uo> and <uu> spellings at Vindolanda</uu></uo>	124
12	<uo> and <uu> in the Caecilius Jucundus tablets</uu></uo>	126
13	<c> for <g> in the Isola Sacra inscriptions</g></c>	133
14	Inscriptional spellings with <k> and <c></c></k>	148
15	<k> spellings in the Vindolanda tablets</k>	151
16	<k> in the Isola Sacra inscriptions</k>	155
17	<q> and <c> before <u> in the Claudius Tiberianus</u></c></q>	162
	letters	
18	<q> before <u> in the curse tablets</u></q>	163
19	<xs> at Vindolanda</xs>	171
20	<xs> and <x> in the London tablets</x></xs>	174
2 I	<xs> and <x> in <i>dixit</i> in the Caecilius Jucundus</x></xs>	176
	tablets	
22	<xs> and <x> in other words in the Caecilius</x></xs>	177
	Jucundus tablets	

#### List of Tables

23	Use of $\langle xs \rangle$ and $\langle x \rangle$ by scribes and others in the	179
	Caecilius Jucundus tablets	
24	<xs> in the curse tablets</xs>	180
25	<ss> at Vindolanda</ss>	184
26	<ss> and <s> in the tablets of the Sulpicii</s></ss>	188
27	Unetymological <ss> for /s/ in the curse tablets</ss>	190
28	<ss> and <s> in the London tablets</s></ss>	192
29	<li>and <l> in the tablets of the Sulpicii</l></li>	194
30	millia and milia in the Caecilius Jucundus tablets	197
31	Apices in the Isola Sacra inscriptions	216
32	<i>i-longa</i> on short /i/ in the Isola Sacra inscriptions	220
33	<i>i-longa</i> on long /i:/ in the Isola Sacra inscriptions	22 I
34	<i>i-longa</i> on /j/ in the Isola Sacra inscriptions	222
35	Apices in the Vindolanda tablets	227
36	Distribution of <i>apices</i> in the Vindolanda tablets	232
37	Apices on vowels in non-final syllables at	234
	Vindolanda	
38	Apices in the tablets of the Sulpicii	240
39	Distribution of <i>apices</i> by vowels and diphthongs	242
	in the tablets of the Sulpicii	
40	Apices in different corpora	246
4I	Use of $\langle i \rangle$ for $/i$ :/ in the tablets of the Sulpicii	254
42	Use of $\langle i \rangle$ for $/j/$ in the tablets of the Sulpicii	254
43	Use of $\langle i \rangle$ for $/i/$ in the tablets of the Sulpicii	254
44	Use of <i>in</i> and <i>in</i> by following segment in the tablets	255
••	of the Sulpicii	00
45	Use of <i>in</i> and <i>in</i> according to the case of its	256
10	complement in the tablets of the Sulpicii	U
46	Possible cases of <uo> and <quo> in the archetype</quo></uo>	281
•	of Catullus	

## FOREWORD

This book was written with – and could not possibly have been without – the support of a Pro Futura Scientia Scholarship held at the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities at Cambridge and the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study in Uppsala, funded by Stiftelsen Riksbankens Jubileumsfond. The staff at both institutions contributed hugely to the work I did there.

My thanks are owed to the following people, who helped me in ways great or small: Jim Adams, Moreed Arbabzadah, David Butterfield, Felice Costabile, Robrecht Decorte, Wolfgang de Melo, Emmanuel Dupraz, Benjamin Fortson IV, Marco Mancini, Alex Mullen, Philomen Probert, Giulia Sarullo, Rosanna Sornicola; and the attendees at seminars at SCAS and the Department of Archaeology and Ancient History at Uppsala University, the Faculty of Classics in Cambridge and at the conference on Writing Conventions and Pragmatic Perspectives at the Université Libre de Bruxelles. No doubt I have forgotten many others. Particular gratitude goes to James Clackson, Katherine McDonald, and Stephen Oakley, all of whom read drafts of the whole thing and provided comments and advice, and to Victoria Fendel, who provided essential research assistance.

Andrea Scheibler (Scheibler Editorial) made sure the bibliography had all the right things in it and saved me from a number of mistakes. Michael Sharp, Katie Idle, Liz Davey of Cambridge University Press, and Lesley Hay of Hay Editorial provided a smooth path to publication.

Rachele De Felice and Kitty Zair ignored the book as best they could, but they get thanked anyway.

xiii

## NOTE ON THE TEXT

This book uses the standard conventions of epigraphy, phonology and phonetics, and Indo-European linguistics. Unfortunately, these to some extent overlap so that the same symbols may be used for more than one purpose; in other cases the 'same' element may be represented in more than one way. I draw attention to this here, in the hope of avoiding confusion for the reader: which convention applies should in every case be clear from context.

Where inscriptional forms are being represented, [] surround missing letters, {} surround letters engraved in error, <> surround letters supplied by the editors to replace those omitted or engraved in error, and () enclose the expansion of an abbreviation.

In quoted editions of literary texts, [] surround parts of the text that should be removed and <> a portion of text supplied by the editor.

When individual graphemes are being discussed, they are enclosed within  $\langle \rangle$  (graphemes from the Latin alphabet are not italicised when between angled brackets); on the rare occasions when the actual symbol used for the grapheme is being discussed, this is not enclosed within angled brackets.

Phonemes and sequences of phonemes are enclosed within // and phones within [] (phonetic transcription is as broad as possible). Phonemes and phones are represented according to the conventions of the IPA alphabet, as laid out in the IPA Handbook (The International Phonetic Association 1999). Reconstructed forms are preceded by an asterisk \*,<sup>I</sup> and use the standard orthography of historical linguistic and Indo-Europeanist literature. There are three discrepancies between the two that I flag up here. The first is that the labiovelar and palatal approximants (glides) written /w/ and /j/ ([w] and [j]) respectively in the IPA are written \*- $u_{-}$  and \*- $i_{-}$  in

<sup>1</sup> And a form which should not be reconstructed is preceded by  $\times$ .

xiv

### Note on the Text

reconstructions; as the second element of tautosyllabic diphthongs, these are written /u/ and /i/ in phonemic/phonetic representation (e.g. /ai/ [ai]), but as \*-u- and \*-i- in reconstructions (e.g. \*-ai-). The second is that the vowels of the Latin phoneme system that derive from Proto-Indo-European \*e and \*o are represented as / $\epsilon$ / and / $\sigma$ / respectively. The third is that long vowels in Latin words and reconstructions are marked by use of a macron, thus:  $n\bar{\sigma}tum$ ; in the IPA they are marked by use of the symbol :, thus: / $n\sigma$ :tum/. I mark long (and, where occasionally relevant, short) vowels in Latin words are not marked when quoting actual forms found in inscriptions or other texts, nor when I am using a Latin word borrowed into English.

Given that much of this book is devoted to counting particular spelling features, I have preferred to use numerals rather than words even in running text, since this makes it easier to quickly identify the key information in the text.

# ABBREVIATIONS

## **Printed Works**

AE	L'Année Epigraphique
CEL	Cugusi, Paulo (1992–2002). Corpus
	Epistularum Latinarum Papyris Tabulis
	Ostracis Servatarum. Florence, Edizioni
	Gonnelli
CIL	Mommsen, Theodor et al. (1863–). Corpus
	Inscriptionum Latinarum. Berlin: George
	Reimer and Walter De Gruyter
GL	Keil, Heinrich (1855–80). Grammatici Latini.
	Volumes 1–7. Leipzig: Teubner. Reprint (2009).
	Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
ICUR	Inscriptiones Christianae Urbis Romae. Nova
	series
IEW	Julius Pokorny (1959). Indogermanisches ety-
	mologisches Wörterbuch. Bern and Munich:
	Francke Verlag
ILA	Cagnat, René, Alfred Merlin and Louis
	Chatelain (1923). Inscriptions latines
	d'Afrique (Tripolitaine, Tunisie, Maroc). Paris:
	Éditions Ernest Leroux
ILCV	Diehl, Ernst (1925–31). Inscriptiones Latinae
	Christianae Veteres. Berlin: Weidmann
IS	Helttula, Anne (2007). Le iscrizioni sepolcrali
	latine nell'Isola sacra. Rome: Institutum
	Romanum Finlandiae
Kropp	Kropp, Amina (2008). Defixiones. Ein aktuelles
	Corpus lateinischer Fluchtafeln. Speyer:
	Kartoffeldruck-Verlag

xvi

List of Abbreviations

O. BuNjem	Marichal, Robert (1992). <i>Les ostraca de Bu</i> <i>Njem</i> . Tripoli: Grande Jamahira Arabe,
OLD	Libyenne, Populaire et Socialiste Glare, P. G. W. (ed.) (2012). <i>Oxford Latin</i> <i>Dictionary</i> . Second edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press
P. Dura	Welles, C. Bradford, Robert O. Fink and J. Frank Gilliam (1959). <i>The Excavations at</i> <i>Dura-Europos Conducted by Yale University</i> <i>and the French Academy of Inscriptions and</i> <i>Letters, Final Report V, Part I, The</i> <i>Parchments and Papyri</i> . New Haven, CT: Yale University Press
P. Mich. VIII	Youtie, Herbert C. and John G. Winter (1951). Michigan Papyri VIII. Papyri and Ostraca from Karanis. Second Series. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press
Tab. Vindol.	<ul> <li>Bowman, Alan K. and J. David Thomas (1983). <i>Vindolanda: The Latin Writing Tablets.</i></li> <li>London: Society for the Promotion of Roman Studies</li> <li>Bowman, Alan K. and J. David Thomas (1994). <i>The Vindolanda Writing Tablets (Tabulae Vindolandenses II)</i>. London: British Museum Press</li> <li>Bowman, Alan K. and J. David Thomas (2003). <i>The Vindolanda Writing Tablets (Tabulae Vindolandenses III)</i>. London: British Museum Press</li> <li>Bowman, Alan K. and J. David Thomas (2003). <i>The Vindolanda Writing Tablets (Tabulae Vindolandenses III)</i>. London: British Museum Press</li> <li>Bowman, A. K., J. D. Thomas and R. S. O. Tomlin (2010). The Vindolanda writing-tablets (<i>Tabulae Vindolandenses</i> IV, Part 1). <i>Britannia</i> 41, 187–224</li> <li>Bowman, A. K., J. D. Thomas and R. S. O. Tomlin (2011). The Vindolanda writing-tablets (<i>Tabulae Vindolandenses</i> IV, Part 2). <i>Britannia</i> 42, 113–44</li> </ul>

xvii