

Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

Thus the lover of universal life enters into the crowd as though it were an immense reservoir of electrical energy. Or we might liken him to a mirror as vast as the crowd itself; or to a kaleidoscope gifted with consciousness, responding to each one of its movements and reproducing the multiplicity of life and the flickering grace of all the elements of life. He is an 'I' with an insatiable appetite for the 'non-I', at every instant rendering and explaining it in pictures more living than life itself, which is always unstable and fugitive.

- Charles Baudelaire, "The Painter of Modern Life" 1

Poetry is a shifting thing, a chimeric creature of many forms, dimensions, and temporalities, reflective as it is of constantly shifting multiplicities of human life. Its mode of existence is scarcely singular even in one culture or in one period; nor does it answer truly to just one name. We know to see it through bifocals, if not kaleidoscopically. In ancient Greece, as now, poetry was sometimes performed and sometimes inscribed. Yet its performance was a kind of inscribed embodiment, and its written text was encountered as a different mode of performance. There is thus a peculiar unity to the diversity of forms spread between oral performance and inscribed object, an implicit agreement among practitioners (including poets, performers, audiences, and readers) that, however much the form and format adjust, poetry remains a coherent concept even as it faces down the multiplicity of life, the unstable and the fugitive. What did poetry as such offer to its practitioners in ancient Greece? Why was its tradition so carefully maintained?

In this book, I suggest that poetry offers a way to remain in the world – not only by way of declarations of intent or the promotion of remembrance, but also through the durable physicality of its practice. Whether carved in stone or wood, printed onto a page, belted or beat out by a body,

]

¹ I will have more to say on the "unstable and fugitive" below. Baudelaire (1964) 9–10 continues with, "'Any man,' he said one day, in the course of one of those conversations which he illumines with burning glance and evocative gesture, 'any man who is not crushed by one of those griefs whose nature is too real not to monopolize all his capacities, and who can yet be bored in the heart of the multitude, is a blockhead! a blockhead! and I despise him!" Blockheads beware.



2 Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

or humming in the mind, poems are meant to engrave and adhere. Ancient Greek poetry exhibits a particularly acute awareness of change, decay, and the ephemerality inherent in mortality. Yet it couples its presentation of this awareness with an offering of meaningful embodiment through shifting forms that are aligned with, yet subtly manipulative of, mortal time. Poetry, then, might be understood metaphorically as writing on the body, the artform of scarification, for it is in play with both the dynamics of organic change and the intent toward ongoing meaning. Mary N. Roberts has written on this practice as such:

Unlike a canvas or a piece of parchment, the human body conducts a dialogue with its text, rupturing or reinforcing it, but always replying to it. Identity is perpetually negotiated and reconstituted in the process. Body-writing also expresses the ephemeral nature of meaning, for when text is inherently linked to the human body it grows in stature but subsides with age, fading with time.²

The practice of marking the body is a balance of physically effecting identity and implicitly bowing to the ephemerality of human flesh. So is poetry that is in play with performance and text perpetually negotiating time and change, meaning and identity.

Hence, the work of poetry can be thought of as a form of transformative conservation that turns the ephemeral into something that will persist for a longer period. Anthropologists have studied how practices of burial and other rituals around death aim to preserve parts of the body or create an enduring substitute for the person lost. Film theorist André Bazin memorably makes the jump from ritual to art in an essay on photography and film, when he suggests that mummies were humankind's first recorded attempt to conserve human life through craft and to create material immortality. He further asserts that all art, including photography and film, grows out of this gesture:

If the plastic arts were put under psychoanalysis, the practice of embalming the dead might turn out to be a fundamental factor in their creation. The process might reveal that at the origin of painting and sculpture there lies a mummy complex. The religion of ancient Egypt, aimed against death, saw survival as depending on the continued existence of the corporeal body. Thus, by providing a defense against the passage of time it satisfied a basic psychological need in man, for death is but the victory of time. To preserve, artificially, his bodily appearance is to snatch it from the flow of time, to stow it away neatly, so to speak, in the hold of life.³

² Roberts (2011) 69. ³ Bazin (1960) 4.



Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

Ancient poetry does nothing so literal as simply conserving the corporeal, but rather manipulates it in a manner that implies the byproduct of conservation. Moreover, the part of ancient poetry that survives now is almost entirely language abstracted from context. Our ability to appreciate it now despite the loss of its nonlinguistic parts, including music and choreography, suggests not an ethic of memorialization and preservation alone but one of substitution and symbolism, a system that invites conservation, but also desire, mimesis, and change.

The same might be said of the conservation of bodies through mummification. Christina Riggs has shown that the ancient Egyptian practice of embalming the dead has less to do with a fantasy of maintaining sameness than with a practice of measured transformation. She asserts that the modern archaeological and cultural "preoccupation with getting through the wrapping [of bodies] has discounted the significance of the wrapping itself, placing the focus on the internal object rather than the external sheath." Riggs' analysis points to the significance of the *act* of wrapping, as ritual activity that took time, since wrappings could be dozens of layers deep. This act also necessitated a material investment, inasmuch as it required expensive linens and hours of labor. Such costly acts of wrapping drew barriers between the mortal and divine worlds, but also placed both the nonliving and the ritually performing bodies into contact with divinity, and set them apart from the everyday life of the decaying world.

Extending Bazin's metaphor through Riggs' reading of the historical account, I maintain in this book that a similarly conservational, yet transformative, impulse is at the heart of many ancient Greek poetic endeavors, as well as some modern ones. It is to be found not only in the body of the poem, and the poem as body, but also in the complex experiences offered by the activities of embodied engagement with poetry: composing, performing, recording, hearing, remembering, and reading it. Such activities extend too to the discovery and preservation of this poetry, to its reconstruction and interpretation, to the smuggling and stealing of it, even perhaps to the forging of it. And here the metaphor bends back to the literal, to the actual grip of ancient lyric poetry in the history of cartonnage itself – those scraps of papyrus once pulled together in Egypt to wrap bodies into mummies that now serve as sources, as well as alibis, for reconstituted bits and pieces of poetry, a topic that I will explore further in the final chapter of this book. Such are the materials of the medium.

3

⁴ Riggs (2014) 23.



4 Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

The humanities have been in the grip of New Materialism for more than two decades now, but old materialism has been around much longer, originating at least as early as Marxism, psychoanalysis, and feminist thought. Classicists have entered the conversation to uncover the bodies lurking in the thoughts of early philosophers like Democritus, who concocted an early theory of atoms (called sômata, "bodies"), and in tragedy, which brought actual things into the realm of embodied poetry, adding masks, costumes, and props to poetic performance.⁵ This book aims to intervene, or to start its intervention, at an earlier stage of Greek poetic thought, and (in the end) at a later stage in scholarly thought. It stresses the fact that these poems have assumed at least two forms of materiality: one in relation to performing bodies and another as inscribed texts. It explores the intersections in the poems of acknowledgment of their own substance and the matter of mortality. As the book proceeds through the archaic and classical periods of Greek poetry, it considers elements of rhythm and measure, soundplay and wordplay, metaphor and meaning, and the material of the embodied word.

Ancient poetry started from the foundation of meter, as well as vocality, melody, and movement. In their use of sound and rhythm, ancient Greek poems were of a piece with music, which directly affects the sensory perceptions and bodily experience of listeners. Hence, two early words for Greek verse – *epê* (heroic or epic poetry) and *melê* (lyric poetry)⁶ – are both explicitly words that imply musical presence, not to say accompaniment. When poems were also etched into objects, like statues or *stelai* (singular: *stele*), they could affect a permanent adjustment in the topography, an acculturation of space into place and scenery into memory. When impressed in the memory of women and men, poems altered the cadences of the mind and language. When absorbed into a common discourse, they delimited a culture's shared understanding of what might be possible. When poetry succeeded in any of these contexts, it made a material and cultural mark and, in its most triumphant successes, it was

⁵ Cf. Porter (2010) 165–7, 209–12 on Democritus' materialism, and Mueller (2016) and Chaston (2010) on the use and effect of props on the Greek stage. Cf. Telò and Mueller (2018) 2, who note that "[w]hat distinguishes the new materialisms from traditional materialisms (Marxian, Freudian) is the post-humanist foundation of their hermeneutic, ethical, and political concerns, that is, their questioning of anthropocentrism, of the primacy of the human subject." See, in that same volume, Hall (2018) for a trenchant critique of the "'radical' (because dehumanized) ontology of matter," 217, in light of work left undone in the area of Marxism and the classical world.

⁶ Both words are explicitly placed in the plural when denoting poems set to music. The use of the word *poiêsis* for poetry is a relatively late innovation. Cf. Maslov (2009) and Nooter (2019).



Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

a mark that was expected to last for generations, transforming ephemeral experience into lasting substance – much like the processes that aimed to maintain bodies through mummification, even as the bodies transformed into an altered form. This book explores several of the forms of poetic perseverance that were attempted in two sections: one on the body and one on texts.

Aspects of material engagement in Greek poetry and culture have been explored to great effect. Around the turn of the twenty-first century, many of these explorations focused particularly on either orality, writing, or both. Eva Stehle's *Performance and Gender in Ancient Greece: Nondramatic Poetry in Its Setting* reveals the role of the "physicality of body and voice" in nondramatic Greek poetry and Rosalind Thomas' *Literacy and Orality in Ancient Greece* shows the counterbalancing relationship of "oral and written communication techniques" in ancient Greek culture. In a similar vein, Deborah Steiner's *The Tyrant's Writ: Myths and Images of Writing in Ancient Greece* uncovers the narratives and paradigms of writing that work their way through ancient literature, and Andrew Ford's *The Origins of Criticism: Literary Culture and Poetic Theory in Classical Greece* explores the ideas about poetry that could be found in poetry, often discussing the interplay of singing and writing in these texts.

More recently, the work of objects in preserving links to the past has been examined in Homeric poetry by scholars such as Karen Bassi and Jonas Grethlein. Bassi focuses on how the experience of the material and visible worlds is in dialogue with the world of narrative, ¹⁰ while Grethlein looks at numerous ways in which the Greeks conceptualized their past, including through the use of significant objects. Much of his work examines in particular the role played by objects "embedded in the plots" of Homeric epics. ¹¹ In the last few years, classical scholars have engaged deeply with contemporary theory to show how objecthood can be a form of or path to animation and meaning of various kinds. Lilah Grace Canevaro uses the methods offered by various strands of New Materialism to show how attentiveness to things also conjures an awareness of marginalized, or even lost, forms of female agency in Homer. ¹² Amy Lather's recent book, meanwhile, examines the "agentive and affective capacities of things as manifested in their evocations of affects, emotions

5

⁷ Stehle (1997) 3. ⁸ Thomas (1992) 5. ⁹ Steiner (1994) and Ford (2002).

¹⁰ Bassi (2016).

See Grethlein (2008) and (2006), as well as Grethlein (2010) for other textual modes of conceptualizing the past.

¹² Canevaro (2018).



6 Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

and other kinds of human responses" by looking in particular at how the quality of being *poikilia* (many-colored, various, elaborate, changeful) in ancient Greek art and literature reveals a "fluid economy of exchange between minds, bodies and things." Things and bodies, objects and materials, have thus come to the fore of much current work on Greek texts.

My book joins these studies in their attentiveness to both time and things, but views poetry itself as the thing in question, even when the poetry is performed orally. I aim to illuminate the ways that poetry offers techniques of temporality - involving rhythm, duration, presence/the present, history, and futurity - through performing bodies and enduring objects. These poetic interventions help shape ephemeral experience into lasting meaning. To understand how poetic temporality works in terms of performance and in print requires a fulsome sense of how time is itself conceived as entangled with bodies, as Lorenzo Garcia Jr. has discussed in his book *Homeric Durability: Telling Time in the* Iliad. Here Garcia argues that "the subject of the *Iliad* . . . is time itself and the durability of its objects to withstand time's withering flow,"14 and yet his text is vibrantly aware of the diminishing temporality of all things, even the gods themselves. Thus, even the most seemingly durable beings and objects are subjected to the question of what it means to "exist within time." ¹⁵ My book explores the concern about time that we find in Greek poetry from the archaic to the classical eras, while also showing how poetry promises to shape time, to create its rhythms. 16 Indeed, it is out of the concerns of time and its embodied expression that the poetic affordances of physicality, speech, and writing find their motivation and purpose. An underlying facet of this motivation is the concept in Greek poetry of the human body as both a constructed and ever-changing thing, often without the agency of the human in question. ¹⁷ Human bodies can thus seem to exist in a temporality

¹³ Lather (2021) 13, 3. Cf. also Liebert (2017) 63–74 who explores conceptions of the craft of poetry and "Pindar's appeals to *poikilia*... as a ruling aesthetic principle," 64, and LeVen (2013).

Garcia (2013) 5. See also Lynn-George (1988) 176 on the "duration and disruptions which constitute" the *Iliad*.

¹⁵ Garcia (2013) 21.

¹⁶ As we will see in the first chapter, time (chronos) is theorized by Aristoxenus in the fourth century as being externally shaped by rhythms; they are not natural to it (e.g., "Time does not itself cut itself [into parts] ... but rather it is necessary for something else to divide it up" – ὁ μὲν χρόνος αὐτὸς αὐτὸν οὐ τέμνει ... ἑτέρου δέ τινος δεῖ τοῦ διαιρήσοντος αὐτὸν [El Rhythm. 2.6]).

Moreover, any "body" that appears in poetry is a "body in art [that] must be distinguished from the flesh and blood it seeks to imitate. In representation the body appears not as itself, but as a sign," Mirzoeff (1995) 3. Here we must distinguish between the literary representation of the body that we find in the text and the historical bodies we understand to have performed, heard, written, or read these texts. This reading of bodies in regard to Greek poetry thus touches on those "in" and beyond the art in question.



Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

/

separate from the will of the people who identify with them, falling into internal disorder, or arrhythmia, or just decay, due to intense emotion, desire, pain, or simply through processes of injury, aging, and death.

Can a body that is constantly changing remain recognizable, individual, identifiable as one's own, or even be understood as a unified whole?¹⁸ Is it still the same one when every part of it has been altered? Plutarch's anecdote on the preservation of Theseus' ship over long centuries through the gradual replacement of each of its parts is an early instantiation of the philosophical problem of the (meta)physics of identity, one already in play in the writing of Heraclitus and Plato; it is sometimes referred to as the Ship of Theseus Puzzle:

The ship in which he sailed with the youths and came back safely, thirty-oared, was preserved by the Athenians until the time of Demetrius of Phalereus. They would strip away the ancient planks of wood but then insert and frame new pieces in their place, with the result that, for philosophers, the ship became a paradigm for an emergent issue of debate among those who thought it was the same ship and those who said it did not remain the same.¹⁹

The question of whether something remains itself even after all of its parts have been exchanged for other parts also applies to the human body, whose ability to grow, heal, and thrive is engineered through the constant activity of cellular replacement, particularly that of its most visible part, the top layer of skin, which is said to regenerate completely every twenty-seven days. Similarly, the supposed ship of Theseus falls apart piece by piece because it is made of organic material: wood.²⁰ The living quality of wood in and as trees allows for growth and survival on a scale that can hardly be imagined by humans at its peak,²¹ but this very quality of animation also renders it vulnerable to decomposition. Living bodies flourish, when they

Nancy (1994) 18 reminds us of the wall between language and bodies at the outset of any attempt at representation, without suggesting that one should stop trying to represent, reach, touch: "What does a word touch, if not a body? But there you have it: How can one get hold of the body? I am already speechless ... Of course, the point is not to suggest that the body is ineffable ... One should not stop speaking about what cannot be said, one should not stop touching its speech and its tongue, pressing it against them."

¹⁹ τὸ δὲ πλοῖον ἐν ῷ μετὰ τῶν ἡιθέων ἔπλευσε καὶ πάλιν ἐσώθη, τὴν τριακόντορον, ἄχρι τῶν Δημητρίου τοῦ Φαληρέως χρόνων διεφύλαττον οἱ Ἀθηναῖοι, τὰ μὲν παλαιὰ τῶν ξύλων ὑφαιροῦντες, ἄλλα δ᾽ ἐμβάλλοντες ἰσχυρὰ καὶ συμπηγνύντες οὔτως, ἄστε καὶ τοῖς φιλοσόφοις εἰς τὸν αὐξόμενον λόγον ἀμφιδοξούμενον παράδειγμα τὸ πλοῖον εἶναι, τῶν μὲν ὡς τὸ αὐτό, τῶν δ᾽ ὡς οὐ τὸ αὐτὸ διαμένοι λεγόντων (Vita Thesei 23.1).

 $^{^{20}\,}$ Cf. Aristotle, De generatione et corruptione 320a2–10.

²¹ Giaimo (2020) documents the inability of humans even to know the age or location of the world's oldest trees, allowing that the question of whether some trees could be "immortal" is still unanswered.



8 Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

do, only through constant minute fatalities and regenerations. These processes of little deaths and rebirths mean that some degree of nonidentity is present and intrinsic to every organic – and many a nonorganic – body.

The remainder of this introduction explores the concept of the paradoxically changing yet singular body, one that I argue is foundational to the archaic Greek sense of time and poetry's imbrication with temporal existence. We will see that time - chronos - was not conceived as an eternal. universal truth - there is no Coordinated Universal Time in ancient Greek thought - but as a conditional facet of embodiment. Hermann Fränkel has defined chronos in the Homer world as "empty time" - periods of nonoccurrence – and Simon Goldhill describes it as "the deadness of mere passing." 22 In this light, one might gloss *chronos* further as the extended inactivity of the body, a state not unlike that of the (mostly) disembodied shades in the Underworld seen in Odyssey 11. In a later phase of Greek thought, as exemplified by philosophical prose, the question of what time (chronos) is, or simply whether it exists, is answered by Aristotle in terms of the human "soul" (psuchê) or cognitive function. Motion (kinêsis) could exist without the presence of consciousness, but time must in principle be countable, and thus there must exist minds that could conceivably count, in accordance with which time can exist too.²³ Where Aristotle de-emphasizes the role of the body as experiencing movement and change, however, the poets (as thinkers) of earlier centuries make it central to their understanding of time. Indeed, character, selfhood, bodies, and temporalities are all interwoven into a fabric made orderly, when it is, by poetry, song, and dance. The specific problem of embodied time that requires the intervention of poetry can be iconized by the word ephemerality, a Greek coinage that accounts for an important aspect of the mentality that underlies the materiality of poetic practice.

My definition of "ephemeral" is capacious, for it aims to encompass both its traditional meanings in English ("short-lived," "transitory") and the connotations the Greek term *ephêmeros* derived from its various literary contexts, as discussed below. From the Greek standpoint, the word contains multitudes, including fragility, changeability, contingency, and the ever-present implication of encroaching mortality. Ephemerality, in other words, is a present state of forthcoming disintegration, dissolution, and loss. Though it is itself a concept of longstanding age (and indeed the age of

See Fränkel (1960) 1–22 and Goldhill (2022) 47. Cf. Austin (1975) 85, who writes on time in Homeric epic: "Time is not an abstract, homogenous continuum but subjective experience, though not, for that reason, private confusion." See Bakker (2002) 28 on how *kleos* defines *chronos* by contrast: *chronos* happens when the possibility to attain *kleos* is "stalled."

²³ Aristotle, *Physics* 223a.



Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

9

ephemerality is one of the offerings promised by this book), it suggests the imminent presence of nonexistence. Hence Charles Baudelaire's famous pronouncement on modernity in an essay published on a painter in 1863: "by 'modernity' I mean the ephemeral, the fugitive, the contingent, the half of art whose other half is the eternal and the immutable." While I aim to show that ephemerality is as much an ancient idea as a marker of modernity, ²⁵ I am keen also to take up Baudelaire's sense that the "ephemeral, the fugitive, the contingent" aspects of art (and life) are met in turn by practices that aim for durability and endurance, if not eternity and immutability.

In the chapters that follow, I suggest that the ancient Greek poets invented and employed a number of terms, tropes, and figures in order to offer a series of consolations for the problem of ephemerality that they so persistently posed. The ongoing, embodied presence of poetry is, in essence, a reply to the question that ephemerality asks. But why did the Greeks not simply (as has often been argued) assert faith in the eternal, in the form of memory, *kleos*, monumentality, or even just the turning of generations? Of course, such assertions exist in Greek poetry, but from their earliest instantiations, they are challenged as inadequate (see *Iliad* 9). Nor will the same terms, tropes, and figures work forever. Poetic change, indeed, parallels the movements of technology that we see in our own present, its rushing forth, ever impatient, hungry, and unsatisfied. So, too, as each model of poetry became known, familiar, and even stale, a new poetic technology rose up to extend its life: poetic engagement raced onward, replying to the same problem with evershifting answers and techniques. Accordingly, each chapter of this book

- Baudelaire (1964) 13. ("La modernité, c'est le transitoire, le fugitif, le contingent, la moitié de l'art, dont l'autre moitié est l'éternel et l'immuable.") Baudelaire seeks to demonstrate, in general, that there is an essential duality to the temporality of art. The focus of his discussion at this point in the essay is on the portrayal by lesser painters of their subjects in old-fashioned, rather than modern, clothing, and the lack of wisdom in this choice.
- Nor would Baudelaire have disagreed, for his point is that "modernité" is the fleeting aspect of well-wrought art and that this is true for "old masters" as well as contemporary painters: "Il y a eu une modernité pour chaque peintre ancien." In the current phase of modernity, our ephemerality as humans might best be understood in ecological terms, as we come to understand that the planet may well continue on without us in the relatively near future.
- The literature on this assertion and the challenges posed to it is vast, but Lynn-George (1988) 153 offers a representative view: "The *Iliad* affirms the power of poetry to confer *kleos*. From this position immortal fame is a possibility in poetry, the hero's certainty of recompense for the sacrifice of life; premature death is balanced by the promise of a form of immortal life. It might also be stated that the *Iliad*'s power as poetry was to unsettle this very definition of its function."
- ²⁷ If this book traces a kind of "development," it is a form of development internal to the practices and materials of poetry, not one in accordance with social history, let alone the idea of "progress" to an immortal soul a turn toward fiction that comes in lockstep with a shift toward prose.



10 Introduction: Ephemerality and Endurance in Ancient Greek Poetry

examines a starkly different and, at its moment, new method of poetic engagement. What connects the methods of Homer, Archilochus, Sappho, Simonides, Pindar, Aeschylus, and Timotheus is not a uniform approach to the materials of the body, the written word, or even poetry itself, but is rather an abiding awareness of the ephemerality of human life and a sense that poems offer resources in the face of this instability and transience. This poetry exists, then, in a kind of relay race, with each runner passing the baton to the next, as each poem frames itself as an attempt – a losing one, inevitably – to outstrip the effects of time.

Changing Bodies in Homeric Texts

The first artifact of humankind is the human body itself. Though the body is the source and locus of loss and decay, it is also from its capabilities that consolations for its own ephemerality are first found. The Homeric epics present bodies as both coherent and changeable, particularly through the articulation of the word demas, which translates in English as "bodily frame," or just "body." Jenny Strauss Clay has written that demas is used to designate the "human build or bodily frame," as opposed to its appearance (eidos) or its development (phuê). Demas, she asserts, is "static and tectonic," 28 but this is not quite so, or not so for more than a moment. Tracing the use of demas in Homer reveals both how bodies were imagined as moving through the world, how they were perceived, and how the internality of the heroes was experienced.²⁹ It is possible to get a fair idea of the range of uses for *demas*, for it appears several dozen times in varying contexts in Homeric texts and allows entry into its connotations by way of its connection to the verb demô, meaning "build." Even just from this derivation, we can start to see how demas designates something constructed, an object of a kind.³⁰ It is the object that is the human body. Yet, though an object, it is hardly static. In fact, it is often found to refer to bodies at instances of transformation, as I explore below.

Moreover, the *demas* shows us the body as an object of perception, which is to say in relation to the one who sees it, expressing a phenomenological truth about inhabiting one's own body, namely that, "[k]nowing oneself is to

²⁸ Clay (1974) 129-30.

²⁹ Holmes (2010) suggests that archaic people's main method of interacting with (their) bodies is through sight or, in many cases, a lack of sight. I believe that hearing and other forms of sensory engagement are more significant than her account suggests.

³⁰ LSJ s.v. The word domos, for "house," is a further cognate. By contrast, sôma appears only eight times. Its derivation is unknown.