

PROPERTY AND ITS FORMS IN CLASSICAL GERMAN PHILOSOPHY

The theme of property is directly relevant to some of the most divisive social and political issues today, such as wealth inequality and the question of whether governments should limit it by introducing measures that restrict the right to property. Yet what is property? And when seeking to answer this question, do we tend to identify the concept with just one dominant historical form of property? In this book, David James reconstructs the theories of property developed by four key figures in classical German philosophy – Kant, Fichte, Hegel and Marx. He argues that although their theories of property are different, the concept of social recognition plays a crucial role in all of them, and assesses these philosophers' arguments for the specific forms of property they claim should exist in a society that is genuinely committed to the idea of freedom.

DAVID JAMES is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Warwick. His previous publications include *Rousseau and German Idealism: Freedom, Dependence and Necessity* (Cambridge, 2013), and *Practical Necessity, Freedom, and History: From Hobbes to Marx* (2021).

PROPERTY AND ITS
FORMS IN CLASSICAL
GERMAN PHILOSOPHY

DAVID JAMES

University of Warwick



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-28814-9 — Property and its Forms in Classical German Philosophy
David James
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009288149

DOI: 10.1017/9781009288118

© David James 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-28814-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	viii
Introduction	I
1.1 The Mystery of the Right to Property	1
1.2 The Concept of Property and Forms of Property	11
1 Property, Freedom and Enlightenment: Kant's <i>Rechtslehre</i>	14
1.1 Freedom, Equality and Property	14
1.2 Property and Domination	20
1.3 Kant's Justification of the Right to (Private) Property	27
1.4 Property and Enlightenment	40
2 Fichte on Property and Labour	48
2.1 Fichte's Early Theory of Property	48
2.2 The Relation between the Concept of Right and the Concept of Property	56
2.3 Property and Labour	65
2.4 Absolute Property	75
3 Property and Ethical Life: Hegel's System of Right	89
3.1 Property and the Science of Right	89
3.2 Property and Abstract Right	92
3.3 The Embodiment Interpretation of Hegel's Argument for Private Property	95
3.4 The Recognition Interpretation of Hegel's Argument for Private Property	103
3.5 The Integration of Private Property into Ethical Life	110
3.6 Inalienable Property	121
3.7 Ethical Property	125

4	Equality, Exchange Value and Individuality: Marx's Critique of Private Property	139
4.1	Property and Equality	139
4.2	The Origin of the Idea of Equality	147
4.3	Exchange Value and the Idea of Equality	151
4.4	Freedom and the Abolition of Private Property	164
4.5	Communist Property and the Free Development of the Social Individual	174
	Concluding Remark	189
	<i>Bibliography</i>	198
	<i>Index</i>	201

Acknowledgements

I am very grateful for the award of an Alexander von Humboldt Research Fellowship for Experienced Researchers during which most of the first draft of this book was written. I would like to thank Rahel Jaeggi for agreeing to host me at the Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin and for her hospitality during the fellowship. I am also grateful to Bernardo Ferro and two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press for their comments on later drafts of the book. I have benefited from presenting early versions of sections of the book in talks at the University of Vechta; the University of Edinburgh Philosophy Society; the Katholische Privat-Universität Linz; the Faculty of Political Science of the University of Zagreb Summer School in Modern Political Theory held in Grožnjan, Croatia; the ‘An Ethical Modernity? Hegel’s Concept of Ethical Life Today – Its Limits and Potential’ conference organized by the International Network Hegel’s Relevance held in Prague and the University of Zagreb. I would like to thank the organizers of these events for inviting me and the audiences for their comments and questions. Chapter 1 is an extended and substantially revised version of my article ‘Property and Independence in Kant’s *Rechtslehre*’, *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* 24(2) (2016), and sections of Chapter 4 contain revised material from the article ‘Marx’s Genealogy of the Idea of Equality’, *European Journal of Philosophy* 27(4) (2020).

Abbreviations

Writings by Kant

- AA *Kant's gesammelte Schriften*, ed. Königlische Preußische (later Deutsche) Akademie der Wissenschaften (Berlin: Reimer/de Gruyter, 1900–). Cited by volume and page number.
- CPR *Critique of Pure Reason*, ed. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- E 'An Answer to the Question: What Is Enlightenment?', in *Practical Philosophy*, trans. and ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- GMM *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*, in *Practical Philosophy*, trans. and ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- KrV *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, ed. Jens Timmermann (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1998).
- MM *The Metaphysics of Morals*, in *Practical Philosophy*, trans. and ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- TP 'On the Common Saying: That May Be Correct in Theory, but It Is of No Use in Practice', in *Practical Philosophy*, trans. and ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).

Writings by Fichte

- CCS *The Closed Commercial State*, trans. Anthony Curtis Adler (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012).

List of Abbreviations

ix

- FNR *Foundations of Natural Right*, ed. Frederick Neuhouser, trans. Michael Baur (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- GA *J. G. Fichte – Gesamtausgabe der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, eds. Reinhard Lauth, Erich Fuchs and Hans Gliwitzky (Stuttgart and Bad Canstatt: Frommann-Holzboog, 1962–2012). Cited by series, volume and page number.
- RPP ‘Review of Immanuel Kant, *Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Sketch*’, trans. Daniel Breazeale, *The Philosophical Forum* 32(4) (2001): 311–21.
- SE *The System of Ethics*, trans. and eds. Daniel Breazeale and Günter Zöller (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

Writings by Hegel

- PhG *Phänomenologie des Geistes*, eds. Hans-Friedrich Wessels and Heinrich Clairmont (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1988).
- PR *Grundlinien der Philosophie des Rechts oder Naturrecht und Staatswissenschaft im Grundrisse*, in *Werke*, ed. E. Moldenhauer and K. M. Michel (Suhrkamp: Frankfurt am Main, 1969–1971), Vol. 7. English translation: *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, ed. A. W. Wood, trans. H. B. Nisbet (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991). Cited according to paragraph (§) numbers. R indicates a remark which Hegel himself added to the paragraph, while A indicates an addition derived from student lecture notes. The only exception is the preface, which is cited by the page number of the German edition followed by that of the English translation.
- PR 1819/20 *Philosophie des Rechts. Die Vorlesung von 1819/20 in einer Nachschrift*, ed. Dieter Henrich (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1983).
- PR 1821/22 *Die Philosophie des Rechts. Vorlesung von 1821/22*, ed. Hansgeorg Hoppe (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 2005). Cited by paragraph (§) number.
- PS *Phenomenology of Spirit*, trans. A. V. Miller (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977).

x

List of Abbreviations

- SL *Science of Logic*, trans. A. V. Miller (New York: Humanities Books, 1999).
- WL I *Wissenschaft der Logik I*, in *Werke*, ed. E. Moldenhauer and K. M. Michel (Suhrkamp: Frankfurt am Main, 1969–1971), Vol. 5.

Writings by Marx

- Cap. 1 *Capital: Volume I*, trans. Ben Fowkes (London: Penguin, 1990).
- Cap. 3 *Capital: Volume III*, trans. David Fernbach (London: Penguin, 1991).
- CGP *Critique of the Gotha Programme*, in *Later Political Writings*, ed. and trans. Terrell Carver (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- EB *The Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Bonaparte*, in *Later Political Writings*, ed. and trans. Terrell Carver (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- EJM *Excerpts from James Mill's Elements of Political Economy*, in *Early Writings*, trans. Rodney Livingstone and Gregor Benton (London: Penguin, 1992).
- EPM *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, in *Early Writings*, trans. Rodney Livingstone and Gregor Benton (London: Penguin, 1992).
- G *Grundrisse*, trans. Martin Nicolaus (London: Penguin, 1993).
- GI *The German Ideology*, ed. C. J. Arthur, 2nd edn (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1974).
- JQ 'On the Jewish Question', in *Early Writings*, trans. Rodney Livingstone and Gregor Benton (London: Penguin, 1992).
- MCP *Manifesto of the Communist Party*, in *Later Political Writings*, ed. and trans. Terrell Carver (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- MEGA *Marx-Engels-Gesamtausgabe*, ed. Institut für Marxismus-Leninismus beim Zentralkomitee der Kommunistischen Partei der Sowjetunion and Institut für Marxismus-Leninismus beim Zentralkomitee der Sozialistischen Einheitspartei Deutschlands/Internationale Marx-Engels-Stiftung Amsterdam (Berlin: Dietz Verlag/De

List of Abbreviations

xi

- Gruyter, 1975–). Cited by section, volume and page number.
- MEW *Marx-Engels-Werke*, ed. Institut für Marxismus-Leninismus beim Zentralkomitee der Sozialistischen Einheitspartei Deutschlands (Berlin: Dietz Verlag, 1956–1990). Cited by volume and page number.
- MP *Misère de la philosophie: réponse à la Philosophie de la misère de M. Proudhon* (Paris: A. Frank, 1847).
- MZC ‘Marx Zasulich Correspondence: Letters and Drafts’, in *Late Marx and the Russian Road: Marx and the Peripheries of Capitalism*, ed. Teodor Shanin (London: Verso, 2018).
- PCPE ‘“Preface” to *A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy*’, in *Later Political Writings*, ed. and trans. Terrell Carver (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- PP *The Poverty of Philosophy: Answer to the Philosophy of Poverty by M. Proudhon*, in Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels, *Collected Works*, Vol. 6 (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1976).