

## COURTS THAT MATTER

In *Courts that Matter*, Sandra Botero tackles a crucial question: Can courts advance socioeconomic rights? Using a rigorous comparative study of the impact of socioeconomic rights rulings in Colombia and Argentina, Botero argues that such decisions can be significantly impactful when courts deploy certain monitoring mechanisms and when legally empowered organizations in civil society are engaged in the outcome. The book includes case studies of landmark rulings on environmental, health, housing, and other socioeconomic rights and charts pathways for broader applicability through comparison with rulings by the Supreme Court of India. The book demonstrates how Colombian and Argentine highest tribunals have, at times, successfully configured important new political spaces for the effective pursuit of public policy goals, in conjunction and dialogue with other social and political actors. This title is part of the Flip it Open programme and may also be available Open Access. Check our website Cambridge Core for details.

SANDRA BOTERO is Associate Professor of Political Science at Universidad del Rosario (Bogotá, Colombia). She is the coeditor of *The Limits of Judicialization: From Progress to Backlash in Latin America* (2022).

## COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

### *Series Editors*

Tom Ginsburg *University of Chicago*  
Zachary Elkins *University of Texas at Austin*  
Ran Hirschl *University of Texas at Austin*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

### *Books in the Series*

*The Story of Constitutions: Discovering the We in Us* Wim Voermans

*Democracy Under God: Constitutions, Islam and Human Rights in the Muslim World*  
Dawood Ahmed and Muhammad Zubair Abbasi

*Buddhism and Comparative Constitutional Law* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Ben Schonthal

*Amending America's Unwritten Constitution* Edited by Richard Albert, Ryan C. Williams, and Yaniv Roznai

*Constitutionalism and a Right to Effective Government?* Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Yasmin Dawood

*The Fall of the Arab Spring: Democracy's Challenges and Efforts to Reconstitute the Middle East* Tofigh Maboudi

*Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism: The Italian Case in a Comparative Perspective* Giuseppe Martinico

*Constitutionalism in Context* David S. Law

*The New Fourth Branch: Institutions for Protecting Constitutional Democracy* Mark Tushnet

*The Veil of Participation: Citizens and Political Parties in Constitution-Making Processes*  
Alexander Hudson

*Towering Judges: A Comparative Study of Constitutional Judges* Edited by Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat

*The Constitution of Arbitration* Victor Ferreres Comella

*Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives*  
Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

*From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq

*The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy* Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan

*A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change* Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy, and Shishir Bail

*Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States* Stephan Stohler

*Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis* Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, and Georg Vanberg

*Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions* Eric C. Ip

*Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order* Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer

*The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective* Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

*The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis* Theunis Roux

*Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective* Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

*Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate* Anine Kierulf

*Constituent Assemblies* Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

*The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design* Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

*The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions?* Andrew Arato

*Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution* Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

*Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka* Dian A. H. Shah

*Courts and Democracies in Asia* Po Jen Yap

*Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges* Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet

*Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions* Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofiq Maboudi

*Assessing Constitutional Performance* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

*Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka* Benjamin Schonthal

*Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave* Brian Ray

*Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America* Julio Ríos-Figueroa

*Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosář

*Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea* Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

*Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South* César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco

*Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia* Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

*Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy* Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton

*Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank B. Cross

*International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union* Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel

*Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts* Shai Dothan

*Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia* Edited by Susan H. Williams

*Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century* Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen

*Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser

*Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances* Shubhankar Dam

*Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions* Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg

*Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective* Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

*Comparative Constitutional Design* Edited by Tom Ginsburg

# Courts that Matter

ACTIVISTS, JUDGES, AND THE POLITICS  
OF RIGHTS ENFORCEMENT

**SANDRA BOTERO**

Universidad del Rosario



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-28199-7 — Courts that Matter  
Sandra Botero  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009281997](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009281997)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009281973

© Sandra Botero 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-009-28199-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i>                                     | <i>page</i> ix |
| <i>List of Tables</i>                                      | xi             |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                     | xiii           |
| <b>1 Introduction</b>                                      | 1              |
| 1.1 The Argument in Brief                                  | 4              |
| 1.2 Contributions  | 6              |
| 1.3 Plan Ahead   | 9              |
| <b>2 Coproducing Judicial Impact</b>                       | 12             |
| 2.1 Conceptualizing and Measuring Judicial Impact          | 12             |
| 2.2 Causation  | 18             |
| 2.3 Beyond Direct and Indirect Effects                     | 19             |
| 2.4 Explaining Judicial Impact                             | 20             |
| 2.5 The Argument   | 22             |
| 2.6 Research Strategy                                      | 31             |
| <b>3 Collaborative Oversight Arenas</b>                    | 44             |
| 3.1 Introduction   | 44             |
| 3.2 Environmental Rights: <i>Causa Mendoza</i> (Argentina) | 47             |
| 3.3 Right to Health: T-760 (Colombia)                      | 61             |
| 3.4 Alternative Explanations                               | 79             |
| 3.5 Conclusions  | 82             |

|          |  |     |
|----------|--|-----|
| <b>4</b> | <b>Assessing the Effects of Monitoring Mechanisms and Legal Constituencies</b> | 85  |
| 4.1      | Introduction   | 85  |
| 4.2      | Cases with Dense Legal Constituencies and No Monitoring Mechanisms             | 86  |
| 4.3      | Cases with Monitoring Mechanisms   | 107 |
| 4.4      | Conclusions: The Four Cases in Comparative Perspective                         | 127 |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Low Impact Cases</b>  | 129 |
| 5.1      | Introduction   | 129 |
| 5.2      | Rights to Food and Health: <i>Causa Chaco</i> (Argentina)                      | 130 |
| 5.3      | Environmental Rights: T-231 (Colombia)   | 137 |
| 5.4      | Conclusions: Learning from <i>Chaco</i> and T-231                              | 142 |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Collaborative Monitoring in India</b>                                       | 145 |
| 6.1      | Right to Food Case   | 147 |
| 6.2      | Delhi Vehicular Pollution Case   | 154 |
| 6.3      | Conclusions  | 163 |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Conclusions</b>   | 168 |
| 7.1      | Can Courts Advance Rights?   | 168 |
| 7.2      | Cross-Regional Lessons   | 176 |
| 7.3      | Refinements to My Theory   | 177 |
| 7.4      | Crafting Impact through Collaboration  | 178 |
| 7.5      | Responding to the Critics of Judicial Intervention in SER                      | 181 |
| 7.6      | Judicial Power   | 183 |
|          | <i>Appendices</i>  | 187 |
|          | <i>References</i>  | 193 |
|          | <i>Index</i>   | 207 |



## Figures

|     |   |                |
|-----|---|----------------|
| 2.1 | Conceptual scheme for judicial impact                                 | <i>page</i> 13 |
| 2.2 | Court-promoted monitoring   | 24             |
| 2.3 | Authority and independence in the Argentine and Colombian high courts | 36             |
| 2.4 | Scope of challenge  | 39             |
| 2.5 | Scope of challenge for rulings under study                            | 39             |
| 3.1 | Monthly printed news coverage of El Riachuelo                         | 61             |
| 3.2 | Total number of health tutelas in Colombia                            | 69             |
| 3.3 | Growth rate for all tutelas and for health tutelas                    | 70             |
| 4.1 | Detainees in police stations (Buenos Aires Province)                  | 92             |
| 4.2 | Rulings on UPAC by the constitutional court                           | 100            |
| 4.3 | Mortgage loans 1995–2005  | 103            |
| 4.4 | Puerto Brisa, Colombia  | 117            |
| 5.1 | Map of Chaco and El Impenetrable, Argentina                           | 131            |
| 5.2 | Cúcuta, Colombia  | 138            |

## Tables

|  |        |
|--|--------|
| 1.1 Cases under study and expectations                                 | page 9 |
| 2.1 Characterizing legal constituencies                                | 27     |
| 2.2 Main cases under study   | 32     |
| 3.1 Summary of impact for <i>Causa Mendoza</i>                         | 48     |
| 3.2 Characteristics of the legal constituency for <i>Causa Mendoza</i> | 56     |
| 3.3 Summary of impact for T-760  | 62     |
| 3.4 Legal constituency for T-760                                       | 71     |
| 4.1 Summary of impact dimensions for <i>Causa Verbitsky</i>            | 89     |
| 4.2 Summary of impact dimensions for C-383                             | 99     |
| 4.3 Summary of impact dimensions for <i>Badaro</i>                     | 110    |
| 4.4 Summary of impact dimensions for T-547                             | 118    |
| 5.1 Summary of impact dimensions for <i>Chaco</i>                      | 133    |
| 5.2 Summary of impact dimensions for T-231                             | 139    |
| 7.1 Cases and observed impact  | 170    |

## Acknowledgments

This book was made possible by the generosity and support of my family, loved ones, friends, colleagues, interviewees, activists, lawyers, judges, politicians, several institutions, and strangers who went the extra mile. Though all errors and omissions are my own, I am immensely grateful for the many small and big ways in which people, and forces beyond my control – like health scares, international moves, and professional challenges – contributed to making this volume a reality. Writing it was a humbling experience that left me with even more questions, and with the certainty that it is merely the starting point for more conversations.

*Courts That Matter* started out as my doctoral dissertation at the Department of Political Science, University of Notre Dame. I am grateful to the National Science Foundation (NSF) and the Social Science Research Council (SSRC) for funding the research. I was fortunate to receive a Doctoral Dissertation Research Improvement Grant and an SSRC Mellon International Dissertation Research Fellowship, which allowed me to conduct exactly the kind of fieldwork I had envisioned. The Kellogg Institute for International Studies at Notre Dame was my academic home throughout graduate school: The Kellogg and its amazing staff nourished a vibrant scholarly community and supported me in countless ways. The Center for Asian Studies at Willamette University generously provided a grant to fund a trip to New Delhi, India. The trip was crucial for expanding my horizons and my thinking about the role of courts in rights enforcement beyond Latin America. Thanks to all the people in Colombia, Argentina, and India who patiently or hurriedly put up with my questions, helped me find information, allowed me to observe and learn from their lives and work, and shared their insights and experiences with me. I am especially grateful to Paola Bergallo, Julio Gaitán, and Mario Hernández for opening many doors as I was trying to navigate unfamiliar territories. Anuj Bhuiwalia, Varun Gauri, and Jinee Lokaneeta were very helpful as I was planning to visit India. I cannot begin to do justice to India or its judiciary in the pages that I dedicate to it here, but as a Latin American, I was astounded by the

many parallels and the divergences I glimpsed. Visiting New Delhi, meeting some of its people, and having the opportunity to learn about India touched me deeply.

My dissertation committee – Daniel Brinks, Scott Mainwaring, and Michael Coppedge – provided unwavering support and incisive comments that pushed me beyond my limits. The book took shape slowly over several years and was forged by many exchanges with two scholars who have had a huge influence on my work: Daniel Brinks and Ezequiel Gonzalez-Ocantos. I am grateful to Dan for his generosity and his guidance, and to Ezequiel for his patience and his willingness to help me dig myself out of academic holes. Others provided very useful feedback at different points of the writing process: Thanks to my colleagues at Notre Dame who read different versions, fellow panelists at the Law and Society Association and Latin American Studies Association congresses over the years, constructive reviewers, as well as Juan Diego Prieto, Silvia Otero Bahamón, Nathalia Sandoval, and Benjamín García Holgado.

This book will appear as part of a Cambridge University Press series, inclusion in which I thought I could only dream about. Thanks to the editors, and particularly Ran Hirschl, for welcoming this book. Ran's encouragement and input helped me get unstuck and see my work in a different way at a crucial moment. Matt Gallaway and Jadyne Fauconier-Herry at Cambridge University Press were a pleasure to work with throughout the editorial process. Vicky De Negri saved the day with her expertise and kindness. Thanks to David Goyes for helping me map.

I have crossed paths with dear friends whose example and companionship have challenged, inspired, and sustained me at different points in this journey: Juan Albarracín, Nestor Castañeda, Manuela Fernández, Laura Gamboa, Victor Hernández, Allison Hobgood, Álvaro Hofflinger, Esteban Manteca, Michael Niño, Silvia Otero Bahamón, Nara Pavão, Jason Ruiz, Cayla Skillin-Brauchle, Lucia Tiscornia, and, most definitively, the WOL.

This book and the project from which it emerged developed as I moved several times across the United States and then back home to Bogotá, Colombia. Throughout this voyage, whether near or far, my family was always there. My parents Maria Eugenia and Hector, my sisters Carolina and Andrea, my nieces, and my other close relatives are the light that never goes out. I am deeply grateful to and for Santi, for bringing laughter, love, lentils, and joy into my life – and for his undying belief that I can and I will, even when I fear in my bones I cannot.