CARICATURE AND REALISM IN THE ROMANTIC NOVEL

What was caricature to novelists in the Romantic period? Why does Jane Austen call Mr Dashwood's wife 'a strong caricature of *hims*elf? Why does Mary Shelley describe the body of Frankenstein's creature as 'in proportion', but then 'distorted in its proportions' – and does caricature have anything to do with it? This book answers those questions, shifting our understanding of 'caricature' as a literary-critical term in the decades when 'the English novel' was first defined and canonised as a distinct literary entity. Novels incorporated caricature talk and anti-caricature rhetoric to tell readers what different realisms purported to show them. Recovering the period's concept of caricature, *Caricature and Realism in the Romantic Novel* sheds light on formal realism's self-reflexivity about the 'caricature' of artifice, exaggeration and imagination. This title is part of the Flip it Open Programme and may also be available on Open Access. Check our website Cambridge Core for details.

OLIVIA FERGUSON is a library worker, editorial consultant and writer based in North East Scotland. She has degrees in literature and linguistics from McGill University, the University of Victoria and the University of Edinburgh. She has published research articles in *Studies in Romanticism, Persuasions On-Line, Notes and Queries* and *Gothic Studies*, and has a chapter in the forthcoming *Edinburgh Companion to Jane Austen and the Arts*. Ferguson was a research fellow at the Institute of Advanced Studies in the Humanities, University of Edinburgh, from 2018 to 2019, and was Lecturer in Romanticism at Birkbeck College, University of London, from 2019 to 2020.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN ROMANTICISM

Founding Editor Marilyn Butler, University of Oxford

General Editor James Chandler, University of Chicago

Editorial Board Claire Connolly, University College Cork Paul Hamilton, University of London Claudia Johnson, Princeton University Essaka Joshua, University of Notre Dame Nigel Leask, University of Glasgow Alan Liu, University of California, Santa Barbara Deidre Lynch, Harvard University Jerome McGann, University of Virginia David Simpson, University of California, Davis

This series aims to foster the best new work in one of the most challenging fields within English literary studies. From the early 1780s to the early 1830s, a formidable array of talented men and women took to literary composition, not just in poetry, which some of them famously transformed, but in many modes of writing. The expansion of publishing created new opportunities for writers, and the political stakes of what they wrote were raised again by what Wordsworth called those 'great national events' that were 'almost daily taking place': the French Revolution, the Napoleonic and American wars, urbanization, industrialization, religious revival, an expanded empire abroad, and the reform movement at home. This was an enormous ambition, even when it pretended otherwise. The relations between science, philosophy, religion, and literature were reworked in texts such as Frankenstein and Biographia Literaria; gender relations in A Vindication of the Rights of Woman and Don Juan; journalism by Cobbett and Hazlitt; and poetic form, content, and style by the Lake School and the Cockney School. Outside Shakespeare studies, probably no body of writing has produced such a wealth of commentary or done so much to shape the responses of modern criticism. This indeed is the period that saw the emergence of those notions of literature and of literary history, especially national literary history, on which modern scholarship in English has been founded.

The categories produced by Romanticism have also been challenged by recent historicist arguments. The task of the series is to engage both with a challenging corpus of Romantic writings and with the changing field of criticism they have helped to shape. As with other literary series published by Cambridge University Press, this one will represent the work of both younger and more established scholars on either side of the Atlantic and elsewhere.

See the end of the book for a complete list of published titles.

CARICATURE AND REALISM IN THE ROMANTIC NOVEL

OLIVIA FERGUSON





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, v1C 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009274265

DOI: 10.1017/9781009274227

© Olivia Ferguson 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009274227 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009274227

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-009-27426-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-27424-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Preface	<i>page</i> vii
Acknowledgements	ix
PART I CARICATURE TALK	
1 Defining Caricature	3
2 Denying Caricature	28
3 Caricature Talk and the <i>Spectator</i>	50
PART II NOVEL CARICATURES	
Caricature Talk and Characterisation Technique	91
4 Jane Austen and Anti-caricature	93
5 Walter Scott and Historical Caricatures	126
6 Mary Shelley, Flesh-Caricature and Horrid Realism	169
A.C. I	
Afterword	204
Notes	207
Bibliography	233
Index	255

v

Preface

What was caricature to novelists in the Romantic period? Why is Mr Dashwood's wife 'a strong caricature of *himself* in *Sense and Sensibility*? Why does *The Heart of Mid-Lothian* imagine that its detailed account of eighteenth-century Edinburgh might 'serve as an illustration of Kay's caricatures'? Why is the body of Frankenstein's creature 'in proportion', but then 'distorted in its proportions' – and does caricature have anything to do with it? This book answers those questions, and shifts our understanding of *caricature* as a critical term for literature in the decades when 'the English novel' was defined and canonised as a distinct literary entity.

Literary scholarship has often taken 'caricature' to be the disreputable doppelgänger of 'character', and caricaturing as the antithesis of good characterisation. 'Caricature', its conceptual difficulty left unexamined, has long been used as a critical tool for debating the relative quality of fictive characters. However, caricature has historically played a more complex role alongside character – both in fiction readers' understandings of fictive character, literary form and literary realism, and in realism's intensified self-consciousness about using 'the real' to amuse, charm and shock readers in new ways. Novelists in the Romantic period incorporate concepts of caricature rhetoric with characterisation technique, in order to 'tell' readers what different realisms are purporting to 'show' them. Meanwhile, in Romantic character criticism, caricature talk involves and generates readers' knowledge and feelings about fictive characters as 'realist' writing.

Part I, 'Caricature Talk', collates source material from periodicals, newspapers, books and dictionaries to establish the full scope of caricature's significance for literature and letters in the Romantic period. In Chapters I and 2, by comparing the ways in which the word 'caricature' was used, I recover meanings lying outside notions of caricature as either 'a satirical representation' or 'a humorous portrait', extricate the Romantic period's understanding of textual caricature from the contemporary genres

vii

viii

Preface

of single-sheet caricature prints and *ritratti carichi*, and explain the relation of prosopographic textual caricature to fictive textual caricature. The primary purpose of Chapters 2 and 3 is to trace a central thread in the criticism and writing of the Romantic novel, a grouping of vocabulary, concepts and rhetoric about textual exaggeration that I call 'caricature talk'. To illustrate caricature talk, Chapter 3 analyses key passages from *The Spectator* (1711–12) and its critical reception between the 1770s and the 1820s. I suggest that the caricature talk that features in the critical recognition and writing of the Romantic novel derived key topics of interest – diversion, originality and realism – from the *Spectator* and other humorous character-driven periodicals of the early eighteenth century; and I show how anti-caricature rhetoric became conventionalised in essays that sought to explain and promote the appeal of Addison and Steele's character Sir Roger de Coverley.

Part II, 'Novel Caricatures', opens with a note on the question of textual caricature having a formal existence in the Romantic novel. If Part I has shown that *concepts* of caricature are important to the novel, might Part II show how techniques of caricature were used by novelists? I argue that different novelistic realisms incorporate specific meanings and usages of 'caricature' from among the range discussed in Chapters 1 and 2, in telling readers the significance and effects of characterisation techniques that purport to show real minds and bodies. Each chapter describes how a single writer's oeuvre engages with concepts of caricature in unique ways - but since I focus on three writers now considered so definitive of different strains of realist prose fiction, I hope that my reader will find some generalisable insights: to the comic, moralist and contemporary from Austen, to the 'compendious' and historical for Scott, and to 'body horror' from Shelley. Several themes converge and diverge between chapters, and there is no chronological or conceptual narrative implied by my ordering of the chapters. For example, Chapters 4 and 5 both discuss how novelists use anticaricature rhetoric in their novels; all chapters discuss realism's habilitation of 'explained caricatures'; and all chapters engage with realism's forced grotesquing of deviant bodies, as enabled by social critique's literalisation of caricature into flesh - fat bodies in Austen's novels, dwarfism in Scott's and Shelley's fiction, and dead and 'straight-laced bodies' in Frankenstein.

This is a history of literature's caricature, which cannot be taken in at one glance, or encapsulated in a sentence. Starting with the dictionaries in which the Romantic-period reader might have sought a deeper understanding of *caricatúra*, I build a picture of a literary 'caricature' that branched and varied, yet retained definition.

Acknowledgements

I acknowledge the generous support of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the Wolfson Foundation, and the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities (IASH) at the University of Edinburgh, which funded the PhD and postdoctoral research on which this project is based.

I am grateful for permission to include content from work published elsewhere. Passages from my chapter 'Jane Austen and Caricature' in the forthcoming *Edinburgh Companion to Jane Austen and the Arts* (eds. Joe Bray and Hannah Moss) and from my article 'Walter Scott and the Future of Caricature in the Novel' (published in *Studies in Romanticism* in 2021) reappear, in revised form, in Chapters 4 and 5 respectively. Full citations of these works are included in the bibliography.

Thanks to my supervisors and supporters at the University of Edinburgh, particularly Penny Fielding and Bob Irvine. Thanks to the team at IASH, and to the staff at the National Library of Scotland.

Thank you to the Department of English at the University of Victoria for your teaching and mentorship. I gratefully acknowledge the entrance scholarship that allowed me to pursue a Master's degree, and the support of the Hugh Campbell and Marion Alice Small Fund for Scottish Studies.

Thanks to those who have offered insightful and kindly helpful comments on my PhD and journal articles: Freya Johnston, Rebecca Tierney-Hynes, David Stewart and the peer reviewers for *Studies in Romanticism*. Thanks to the two peer reviewers for Cambridge University Press who read the draft of my monograph and inspired me to make it better than it was.

Much of this book was rewritten several times between 2019 and 2022. I give my most personal thanks to those who have imparted moral support above and beyond any professional commitments, at crucial times over the last four years – particularly Mike Bintley, Rebecca Tierney-Hynes, Katie Halsey and Georgina Barker.