

## Recognition Politics

This pioneering work explores a new wave of widely overlooked conflicts that have emerged across the Andean region, coinciding with the implementation of internationally acclaimed indigenous rights. Why are groups that have peacefully cohabited for decades suddenly engaging in hostile and, at times, violent behaviours? What is the link between these conflicts and changes in collective self-identification, claim-making and rent-seeking dynamics? And how, in turn, are these changes driven by broader institutional, legal and policy reforms? By shifting the focus to the ‘post-recognition’, this unique study sets the agenda for a new generation of research on the practical consequences of the employment of ethnic-based rights. To develop the core argument on the links between recognition reforms and ‘recognition conflicts’, Lorenza Fontana draws on extensive empirical material and case studies from three Andean countries – Bolivia, Colombia and Peru – which have been global forerunners in the implementation of recognition politics.

LORENZA B. FONTANA is Associate Professor of International Politics in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. Her research has addressed questions around the ethnic politics of socio-environmental conflicts, the domestic politics of human rights of vulnerable groups and, more recently, the contentious politics of wildfires.

## Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

### General Editor

Kathleen Thelen *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

### Associate Editors

Catherine Boone *London School of Economics*

Thad Dunning *University of California, Berkeley*

Anna Grzymala-Busse *Stanford University*

Torben Iversen *Harvard University*

Stathis Kalyvas *University of Oxford*

Margaret Levi *Stanford University*

Melanie Manion *Duke University*

Helen Milner *Princeton University*

Frances Rosenbluth *Yale University*

Susan Stokes *Yale University*

Tariq Thachil *University of Pennsylvania*

Erik Wibbels *Duke University*

### Series Founder

Peter Lange *Duke University*

### Other Books in the Series

Christopher Adolph, *Bankers, Bureaucrats, and Central Bank Politics: The Myth of Neutrality*

Michael Albertus, *Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform*

Michael Albertus, *Property without Rights: Origins and Consequences of the Property Rights Gap*

Santiago Anria, *When Movements Become Parties: The Bolivian MAS in Comparative Perspective*

Ben W. Ansell, *From the Ballot to the Blackboard: The Redistributive Political Economy of Education*

Ben W. Ansell and Johannes Lindvall, *Inward Conquest: The Political Origins of Modern Public Services*

Ben W. Ansell and David J. Samuels, *Inequality and Democratization: An Elite-Competition Approach*

Ana Arjona, *Rebelocracy: Social Order in the Colombian Civil War*

Leonardo R. Arriola, *Multi-Ethnic Coalitions in Africa: Business Financing of Opposition Election Campaigns*

*Continued after index*

# Recognition Politics

*Indigenous Rights and Ethnic Conflict in the Andes*

LORENZA B. FONTANA

*University of Glasgow*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-009-26553-9 — Recognition Politics  
 Lorenza B. Fontana  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009265539](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009265539)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009265515

© Lorenza B. Fontana 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place  
 without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Fontana, Lorenza B., 1980– author.

TITLE: Recognition politics : indigenous rights and ethnic conflict in the Andes /  
 Lorenza B. Fontana.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University  
 Press, 2023. | SERIES: Cambridge studies in comparative politics | Includes  
 bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022044006 (print) | LCCN 2022044007 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009265539 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009265508 (paperback) |

ISBN 9781009265515 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Indians of South America—Andes Region—Ethnic identity. | Indians of  
 South America—Civil rights—Andes Region. | Identity politics—Andes Region. | Ethnic  
 conflict—Andes Region. | Andes Region—Ethnic relations.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC F2230.I.E84 F66 2023 (print) | LCC F2230.I.E84 (ebook) |

DDC 980/.00498—dc23/eng/20221019

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022044006>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022044007>

ISBN 978-1-009-26553-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
 accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-26553-9 — Recognition Politics  
Lorenza B. Fontana  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*In memory of my mother.*

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	xix
Introduction	I
1 Recognition Conflicts	27
2 Citizenship and Development in the Andes	56
3 Class and Ethnic Shifts	71
4 Recognition for Whom?	95
5 The Physical Boundaries of Identity	123
6 Unsettled Demographies	152
7 Struggles for Inclusion <i>and</i> Exclusion	175
8 Rethinking Recognition: What Are the Implications for Identity Governance?	192
<i>References</i>	209
<i>Index</i>	233

Figures

1.1	Recognition conflicts spectrum	<i>page</i> 28
1.2	Varieties of recognition conflicts	36
1.3	Map of research sites	50
5.1	Map of main land claims and titles in the Apolo Municipality	134
5.2	Map of peasant and indigenous collective land titles and claims in the Cauca Department	143

Tables

1.1	Recognition reforms in Bolivia, Colombia and Peru	<i>page</i> 39
1.2	Contextual features in Bolivia, Colombia and Peru	44
3.1	Class and ethnic shifts: time frames, phases and social actors	76



## Acknowledgements

This book was inspired by a passion and an intuition. When I first landed in Bolivia, it was not to conduct research or to stay any longer than an eleven-month fellowship to work at the United Nations. A week after I arrived in La Paz, on 25 January 2009, an historical referendum approved a new Constitution. Alongside a multitude of Bolivians, *huipallas* (Andean flags) and occasional tourists, I was in the Plaza Murillo that evening to listen to the speech of President Evo Morales. Bolivia was discarding its old republican clothes to become a plurinational state. The new Constitution opened an exciting (and conflictive) time of institutional changes and political reforms. Given my passion for politics, these recent developments offered a good excuse to postpone my return to Europe as well as an excellent topic for my developing PhD project. I spent the following three years trying to adapt to the altitude and enjoying the chaotic charm of La Paz, with field trips to remote regions where my case studies were located. The conflict in Apolo, in North-East Bolivia, which is described in detail in the book, was my first encounter with the complex and changing relationship between land and identity. In a way, I owe the people I met in Apolo, and this conflict, for the inspiration underlying what became a decade-long project. My intuition was that Apolo was not an isolated case. Indeed, I found other similar inter-communal conflicts in Bolivia, which became the core of my PhD dissertation. The next step was to see how far my intuition would travel across countries. It took me five years, a number of trips to Latin America and the generous support of the British Royal Geographical Society and the Sheffield Institute for International Development to gather the rest of the empirical material for this book.

Throughout my fieldwork, my interactions with people have been incredibly rich and rewarding. Without the generosity of the over 200 people I interviewed and their willingness to share their stories, knowledge, thoughts and opinions, this book would not exist. I am particularly grateful to those who had been directly affected or involved in conflicts, for whom talking about it was a potentially painful and challenging experience. These conversations were for me a stark reminder of how these conflicts have real-life consequences for many people, particularly among already poor and marginalised communities, and of the neglect that often surrounds them. This was ultimately what convinced me of the importance of writing this book. I hope my attempt to report, interpret and explain the stories I gathered does them justice and provides some clues on how to improve the chances of fair settlements and peaceful futures for these communities.

Conducting field research in three countries, with limited budget and means, was an exciting and challenging endeavour. Being able to spend over three years in total in these countries was fundamental not only to gather data but also to embed myself in the cultures and politics of the places I visited and called home for some time. All this would not have been possible without the support of friends, colleagues and a network of local contacts that helped my project in many different and fundamental ways: from being crucial informants and network builders, to providing hospitality, to helping me navigate complex logistics in remote locations, to sharing their insights and views on Latin American politics, society and culture. In Bolivia, I am grateful to my colleagues at the United Nations, particularly Isabel Arauco, Santiago Daroca, Cielo Morales, Jonna Lundwall, Andrea Nelli Feroci, Armando Ortuño, Iñigo Retolaza, Eliana Quíroz, Antonella Spada and Yoriko Yasukawa; to Nelly Arista for being so generous to bring me along to many meetings and to introduce me to key informants; to Simona Sansone, Lilia Grosso, Agustín Vásquez, Fernando Molina, Caroline Cotta de Mello Freitas, Gabriel Zeballos, Mariana Bueno, Daniela Sánchez-López for their friendship; to Attilio Aleotti and Silvio Mignano for their institutional and ‘uninstitutional’ support; to Annibale Ferrini and Daniela Leyton for the research assistance; to Alejandro Nató for hosting me as an intern at the Carter Center office in Bolivia. In Peru, I would like to thank Lidia and Ramón Gallardo for making me feel at home in Barranco and Vladimir Gil and Loïc Cecilio for the friendship and intellectual exchange. In Colombia, my gratitude goes to Sara Tufano for the friendship, research assistance and endless and inspiring conversations about Colombian history and politics;

### *Acknowledgements*

xv

to Juan Quiroga for being such a great host in Bogotá; to the researchers at the Pontificia Universidad Javeriana de Cali – particularly Tania Rodríguez and Maria José Rota Aguilar – for sharing their knowledge on inter-ethnic conflicts in the Cauca; to Myriam Mendez-Montalvo, Maca Gómez and Karina Banda for making crucial contacts with local institutions and community leaders; and to Carlos Quesada for sharing his insights and early findings on peasant recognition.

While developing my career as a social scientist, I soon realised that the research process, at least for the kind of research I do, goes in waves. There are the big exceptional waves, which come with the time in the field: it is hectic and exciting and exhausting. Time to think is limited, and it is mostly action and a lot of logistics on how to get from one place to another chasing the next interviewee (the hours I spent in various means of transport – from taxis to buses to the backs of unstable and crowded trucks to even a poor skinny horse one time – is probably more than the time it took me to write the first draft of this book). Once back in the office, there are long, solitary and quiet periods to work through the material, let it sediment, read some more and eventually face the blank page. This is like the toing-and-froing of the backwash upon the shoreline. It takes time, and a natural inclination towards self-discipline, to learn to enjoy it. Unlike fieldwork, it is predictable. You trust the next wave will brush up the shore at the same rhythm, but the repetition can become boring, obsessive and even frightening at times.

I was lucky enough to find some perfect retreats to face the post-fieldwork backwash, gather my thoughts and write: first at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales in Paris, where Yvon Le Bot kindly hosted me at the Centre d'Analyse et d'Intervention Sociologiques for the final year of my PhD; and then, right when I was ready to turn this project into a book, a European Commission-funded Marie Skłodowska-Curie Fellowship (655710) that brought me to Harvard University for two years. The Weatherhead Centre for International Affairs (WCFIA) and the WCFIA Scholar Program represented an ideal environment for my project. My thanks go to Beth Simmons, Kathryn Sikkink and Michèle Lamont for their mentorship and support. The seminar series at the WCFIA and the David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies constituted inspiring breaks during my writing retreat in combination with the entertaining and caffeinated company of my colleagues, particularly Darja Djordjevic, Sophie Lemièr, Eva Østergaard-Nielsen and Mireille Paquet. The Research Cluster on Comparative Inequalities and Inclusion was not only an intellectually stimulating venue but also a

nurturing environment for friendly and supportive exchange throughout my fellowship.

As my research and writing unfolded, I had the opportunity to present some of the book's key arguments and empirical cases at conferences, seminars and workshops at the European Commission's Joint Research Centre at Ispra; Edinburgh University; Fundação Escola de Sociologia e Política de São Paulo; Harvard University; Newcastle University; New York University in Paris; Northumbria University; Open University; University of Cape Town; Universidad de Córdoba; University of Oxford; University of Sheffield; University of Sussex; University of York and Universidad Mayor de San Simón. Papers related to this research were presented at the Latin American Studies Association conference, Royal Geographical Society congress, ISS-CEDLA conference, International Political Science Association conference, conference of the Italian Association of Political Science, IPSA-ECPR joint conference, Northern Latin American Network conference, II Jornadas Internacionales de Problemas Latinoamericanos, II Jornadas de Jóvenes Americanistas and III Jornadas Andino-Mesoamericanas. My thanks to all the conveners, discussants and participants as these were all opportunities to refine my arguments and crystallise some of the ideas presented in these pages.

The book in its current form owes a great deal to the incredibly insightful and critical comments in the framework of a book workshop hosted by the WCFIA at Harvard University. I am indebted to Candelaria Garay, Alisha Holland, Jean Jackson, Ronald Niezen, Mireille Paquet and Prerna Singh. Their thorough engagement with the book's arguments and empirics and their generosity in sharing suggestions and ideas were crucial for transforming an early version of the manuscript into a publishable piece of research. I am deeply grateful to former WCFIA director Michèle Lamont for hosting the workshop and, more importantly, for believing in this project and for her tireless support and encouragement over the years.

After my time at Harvard, I moved back to the UK to take up a permanent position at Newcastle University. Here I met colleagues and friends who provided an amazing intellectual and support network, which pushed me through a challenging time coinciding with the processes of review and revision of the book's manuscript. My thanks go in particular to Laura Routley, Derek Bell, Valentina Feklyunina, Maarja Luhiste, Tony Zito, Una McGahern, Jemima Repo, Sorana Jude, Diana Burlacu, Andrew Walton, Rosario Aguilar, Alistair Clark and Sebastian Popa.

*Acknowledgements*

xvii

My editors at Cambridge University Press, first Sara Daskow and then Rachel Blaifeder, have been a professional and supportive presence since the initial book submission. Two anonymous reviewers provided detailed comments and suggestions that helped me improve the book's clarity and structure. I would like to thank Simon Davies for copyediting and Rohan Bolton for indexing the manuscript. I am grateful to the Fundación Tierra in Bolivia and the Instituto de Estudios Interculturales at the Pontificia Universidad Javeriana de Cali for granting permission to use maps and shape files for the book's figures, and to Iain McNicol and Kyle Dexter for producing some of the maps.

During the process of writing this book, I have incurred many intellectual debts with friends and colleagues who have nurtured inspiring conversations over the years and offered insightful and critical comments to an early version of book chapters and related articles. I thank, in particular, Arun Agrawal, Tony Bebbington, Francesco Bogliacino, Stefan Collignon, Johan Crabtree, Cecilie Dyngeland, Hervé do Alto, Sofia Donoso, Veronica Herrera, Denise Humphreys Bebbington, Margo Huxley, Sue Iamamoto, Pablo Lapeña, Roberto Laserna, Steve Levitsky, Matias López, Fernando Mayorga, Danilo Martuccelli, John-Andrew McNeish, Angelo Miramonti, Fernando Molina, Jojo Nem Singh, Johan Oldekop, Huáscar Pacheco, Tom Perreault, Christopher Raiche, Thiago Rodrigues, Federico Rossi, Luana Russo, Davide Sparti, Pablo Stefanoni and Agustín Vásquez.

Deep gratitude goes to Jean Grugel for being an outstanding mentor since I first met her when I arrived at the University of Sheffield, soon after my PhD. By considering me a fellow academic, she gave me the courage and confidence to try and become one. Many of the ideas developed in this book are grounded on the fruitful conversations and joint research we entertained over the years.

Acknowledgements are mostly a way to say thank you. However, they are also an insight on the journey behind these pages. As such, they might also hide less rosy stories. There are what some might consider egregious omissions in these pages. These are not oversights. I have omitted the names of people and institutions that have, particularly at the very start of this journey, hindered my chances to become a researcher and of producing this work, by corroding my self-esteem, through power abuse, harassment, negligence and a lack of accountability and professional ethics. This book and my career were possible in spite of them. I am grateful to the #MeToo movement for helping me find words to start elaborating my traumas and for giving me some hope that academia will be a better, safer

and fairer place for the next generation of fellow female students and researchers.

On a more personal – and positive – note, I would like to acknowledge the support of some of my dearest and long-lasting friends. Thanks for welcoming me back every time all my moving around made me feel dizzy and when I am in need of a solid ground to stand still and rest: Betta Astori, Ilaria Franco, Lele Bosticco, Manu Dinunno, Patrizio Anisio, Silvia Ottone, Claudia Mazzá, ‘il Comitato’, le ‘famiglie’ di Cascinetta e Lignod.

This research journey spanned over a decade. It started with grief and loss and is ending with a new family and two new lives. I dedicate this book to my mother, Giuse Verri, who died too young when I was preparing for my first trip to Bolivia. As a primary school teacher, her passion for education and her commitment to my early learning laid the grounds for my own academic interest and trajectory. My father, Gabriele Fontana, and grandmother, Giovanna Gamaggio, cheered me in the most difficult times. Even if they eventually gave up on asking what it is that I ‘do for a living exactly’, they were a source of tireless and unconditional support throughout the years.

In the middle of the book’s journey, I met my partner, Kyle Dexter. His intellectual curiosity, open mindedness, stimulating comments and irreverent defiance contributed to making this book, and our dinner conversations, more compelling and entertaining. Our common passion for Latin America brought us a long way, although we are still figuring out how we can work in the same place if I study social communities made of people, and he studies plants where there are no people. While we worked on this dilemma, we welcomed Liam and Gabo. Without Kyle’s unconditional support and firm commitment to an equal partnership and distribution of care and domestic responsibilities, this book would not likely have materialised. The book would have certainly seen the light earlier without the new family additions, yet I would have missed out on the most exciting, intense, if exhausting, years of our lives.

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AA	affirmative action
ACIT	Asociación Campesina del Municipio de Inzá (Peasant Association of the Inzá Municipality)
AIDSESP	Asociación Interétnica de Desarrollo de la Selva Peruana (Association for the Development of the Peruvian Rainforest)
AIOC	Autonomía Indígena Originaria Campesina (Indigenous Native Peasant Autonomy)
ANUC	Asociación Nacional de Usuarios Campesinos (National Association of Peasant Users)
ANZORC	Asociación Nacional de Zonas de Reserva Campesina (National Association of the Peasant Reserve Zones)
APCOB	Apoyo Para el Campesino Indígena del Oriente Boliviano (Support for the Indigenous Peasant of the Bolivian East)
APG	Asamblea del Pueblo Guaraní (Guaraní People’s Assembly)
ASCAMCAT	Asociación Campesina del Catatumbo (Peasant Association of the Catatumbo)
CART	Central Ashaninka De Rio Tambo (Ashaninka Council of the Rio Tambo)
CCP	Confederación Campesina del Perú (Peasant Confederation of Peru)
CIDOB	Confederación de Pueblos Indígenas de Bolivia (Confederation of Indigenous Peoples of Bolivia)

xx	<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>
CIPLA	Central Indígena del Pueblo Leco (Indigenous Council of the Leco People)
CNA	Confederación Nacional Agraria (National Agrarian Confederation)
CONACAMI	Confederación Nacional de Comunidades del Perú Afectadas por la Minería (National Confederation of Communities Adversely Affected by Mining)
CONAIE	Confederación de Nacionalidades Indígenas del Ecuador (Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador)
CONAMAQ	Consejo Nacional of Ayllus y Markas del Qullasuyu (National Council of Ayllus and Markas of the Qullasuyu)
CONAP	Confederación de Nacionalidades Amazónicas del Perú (Confederation of Amazonian Nationalities of Peru)
CRIC	Consejo Regional Indígena del Cauca (Regional Indigenous Council of the Cauca)
CSCIB	Confederación Sindical de Comunidades Interculturales de Bolivia (Syndicalist Confederation of Intercultural Communities of Bolivia)
CSUTCB	Confederación Única de Trabajadores Campesinos de Bolivia (Unified Confederation of Peasant Workers of Bolivia)
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia)
FPIC	Free Prior and Informed Consent/Consultation
FSUTC-FT	Federación de Campesinos de la Provincia Franz Tamayo (Peasant Federation of the Franz Tamayo Province)
IBE	intercultural bilingual education
ILO	International Labour Organization
INCODER	Instituto Colombiano para el Desarrollo Rural (Colombian Institute for Rural Development)
INE	Instituto Nacional de Estadística (National Institute of Statistics)
INRA	Instituto Nacional de Reforma Agraria (National Institute of Agrarian Reform)
IWGIA	International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs
MNR	Movimiento Nacional Revolucionario (National Revolutionary Movement)



*List of Acronyms and Abbreviations* xxi

ONAMIAP	Organización Nacional de Mujeres Indígenas Andinas y Amazónicas del Perú (National Organisation of Andean and Amazonic Indigenous Women of Peru)
ONIC	Organización Nacional Indígena de Colombia (National Indigenous Organisation of Colombia)
TAN	Tribunal Nacional Agrario (National Agrarian Tribunal)
TCO	Tierra Comunitaria de Origen (Native Communal Land)
TIOC	Territorio Indígena Originario Campesino (Indigenous Native Peasant Territory)
TIPNIS	Territorio Indígena and Parque Nacional Isiboro Sécore (Isiboro Sécore Indigenous Territory and National Park)
UN	United Nations
UNCA	Unión de Comunidades Aymaras (Union of Aymara Communities)
UN-REDD	United Nations Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
VAIPO	Vice-Ministerio de Asuntos Indígenas y Pueblos Originarios (Vice-Ministry of Indigenous Issues and Native Peoples)
VRAEM	Valles de los Ríos Apurímac, Ene y Mantaro (Valleys of the Apurímac, Ene and Mantaro Rivers)
ZRC	Zona de Reserva Campesina (Peasant Reserve Zone)