HATE SPEECH IN JAPAN

This book explains the past and present status of hate speech regulations in Japan. The United States and European countries have adopted different approaches to resolve their respective hate speech problems. Both of them, however, continue to confront the dilemma that freedom of speech and anti-racism are fundamental values of human rights. Some scholars criticize the US approach as too protective of freedom of speech, while other scholars criticize the European approach as impermissibly violating that freedom. Compared to these countries, Japan is unique in that it does not criminalize hate speech and hate crime other than in the recently enacted Kawasaki City Ordinance criminalizing some kinds of hate speech. Japan basically relies on a comprehensive set of non-regulative tools to suppress extreme hate speech. This volume analyses Japanese hate speech laws and suggests a unique distinctive model to strike a balance between both core values of democracy.

SHINJI HIGAKI is Associate Professor of Law at Fukuoka University, Japan. He has been a visiting scholar at the U.S.–Asia Law Institute of New York University School of Law and the Peter A. Allard School of Law of the University of British Columbia. He earned his Ph.D. in Law from Doshisha University in 2015. He specializes in constitutional law, particularly freedom of speech. He is the author of numerous works on free speech issues, including Heito Supichi Kisei no Kenpōgakuteki Kōsatsu [A constitutional analysis on hate speech regulation] (Horitsubunkasha, 2017).

YUJI NASU is Professor of Law at Seinan Gakuin University, Japan, where he teaches constitutional and comparative law. His research interests are primarily in freedom of expression, with a particular focus on hate speech and definitional balancing. He has written numerous articles on free speech, which have been published in Japanese periodicals such as Hōgaku Seminā [Legal seminar] or Amerika Hō [American law]. He recently published Heito Supichiho no Hikaku Kenkyū [A comparative study of hate speech laws] (Shinzansha, 2019), analysing the laws of the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada, and Japan.
HATE SPEECH IN JAPAN
The Possibility of a Non-Regulatory Approach

Edited by
SHINJI HIGAKI
Fukuoka University
YUJI NASU
Seinan Gakuin University
CONTENTS

List of Tables  page viii
List of Figures  ix
List of Contributors  x
Acknowledgements  xv
List of Abbreviations  xvii

Introduction  1
YUJI NASU AND SHINJI HIGAKI

PART I  Outline

1 Hate Speech Regulation and Anti-discrimination in Japan  17
ATSUSHI KONDO

2 Freedom of Expression in Japan: The Constitutional Framework of Protection  35
SHIGENORI MATSUI

3 Hate Speech and International Law: The Internalization of International Human Rights in Japan  58
AYAKO HATANO

PART II  History

4 Buraku Discrimination and Hate Speech: Complex Situations of Classical and Contemporary Discrimination in Japan  107
TAKANORI YAMAMOTO

5 The Current Movement of Hate Speech: Focusing on Hate Speech Directed at Korean Residents in Japan  125
RYANGOK KU
vi CONTENTS

6 The Failure of the Human Rights Vindication Bill 151
MASAYOSHI KANEKO

PART III Legal Framework

7 Hate Speech and Criminal Law Frameworks in Japan 167
OSAMU SAKURABA

8 Tort Liability for Hate Speech in Japan 187
KENSUKE KAJIWARA

9 The Frameworks of the Hate Speech Local Ordinances: Efforts and Challenges of Local Governments in Japan 207
HIDEKI NAKAMURA

10 The Legislative Process Leading to the Hate Speech Elimination Act 223
KATSUO YAKURA

11 The Hate Speech Elimination Act: A Legal Analysis 237
SHINJI HIGAKI

PART IV Cases

12 Kyoto Korean Elementary School Case: The Facts 257
IL-SONG NAKAMURA, TRANSLATED BY MANA SATO

13 Kyoto Korean Elementary School Case: A Legal Analysis 295
SHIKI TOMIMASU

14 An Injunction Banning a Xenophobic Group from Demonstrating: Kawasaki Case 324
TORU MORI

PART V Multidisciplinary Debates

15 Free Speech Jurisprudence in Japan: The Influence of Comparative Constitutional Law 341
KEIGO OBA YASHI

16 Japan’s Postcolonial Hate Speech 363
NAOTO HIGUCHI
CONTENTS

17 A Quantitative and Theoretical Investigation of Racism in Japan: A Social Psychological Approach 381
FUMIAKI TAKA

PART VI Current Issues

18 Hate Speech on the Internet 409
KAZUSHI OGURA

19 Hate Groups and the Use of Public Facilities: Striking a Balance between the Right to Assembly and the Interests of Minority Residents 425
YUJI NASU

20 Hate Speech in the Mass Media: A Dispute over Broadcasting in Japan 456
SHINJI UOZUMI

Appendix A A Chronology of Events and Legislation Related to Hate Speech in Japan 474
Appendix B Lists of Japanese Acts, Bills, Ordinances, and Other Materials 489
Index 497
TABLES

1.1 Anti-discrimination page 31
1.2 Scope of national anti-discrimination law 33
17.1 Codes applied to various Korean-relevant tweets 391
20.1 A timeline of the News Joshi dispute 466
FIGURES

4.1 Comparing the characteristics and categorization of minority groups  page 114
4.2 Classification based on form of Buraku discrimination  116
16.1 Possible victims of hate speech in newspapers  364
16.2 Triad model of ethnic conflict  368
16.3 Shifting interests of right-wingers  375
16.4 Respective frequencies of appearance of countries  376
16.5 Proportion of history-related articles  377
CONTRIBUTORS

AYAKO HATANO is a doctoral researcher at the University of Tokyo, Japan, with a research interest in the internalization of international law. She was a visiting scholar at the U.S.–Asia Law Institute of New York University School of Law. Her recent work includes ‘Can Strategic Human Rights Litigation Complement Social Movements? A Case Study of the Movement against Racism and Hate Speech in Japan’, in Myungkoo Kang (ed.), Hate Speech in Asia and Europe: Beyond Hate and Fear (Routledge, 2020).

SHINJI HIGAKI is Associate Professor of Law at Fukuoka University, Japan. He specializes in constitutional law, particularly in freedom of speech. He is the author of numerous works on hate speech, hate crime, critical race theory, and free speech issues in the Roberts Court of the Supreme Court of the United States, including Heito Supich Kisei no Kenpōgakuteki Kōsatsu [A constitutional analysis of hate speech regulation] (Horitsu Bunkasha, 2017).

NAOTO HIGUCHI is Professor of Sociology at Waseda University, Japan. His recent works include Japan’s Ultra-Right (Trans Pacific Press, 2016) and ‘The Radical Right in Japan’, in Jens Rydgren (ed.), The Oxford Handbook of the Radical Right (Oxford University Press, 2018) as well as ‘The “Pro-Establishment” Radical Right’, in David Chiavacci, Simona Grano, and Julia Obinger (eds.), Civil Society and the State in Democratic East Asia: Between Entanglement and Contention in Post High Growth (Amsterdam University Press, 2020).

KENSUKE KAJIWARA is Associate Professor of Constitutional Law at Kyushu University, Japan. He has written many articles on free speech issues. Those relevant to the subject matter of this volume include ‘Heito Supichi Gainen no Gaien to Naihō ni Kansuru Ichikōsatsu’ [‘The intention and extension of the concept of hate speech’] (2015) 27
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

MasaYoshi Kaneko is Professor of Law at Hosei University, Japan. He specializes in constitutional law and human rights policy, particularly in national and local administrative human rights systems such as national human rights institutions. He has authored numerous articles and other contributions, including ‘Kyūsai no Gainen’ [‘Concept of remedy’], in Kiyoshi Hamakawa, Kaoru Inaba, and Kosuke Nishida (eds.), Gyōsei no Kōzōhenyō to Kenrihogouisutem [Change of administrative structure and system to remedy rights] (Nihon Hyoronsha, 2019).

Atsushi Kondo is Professor of Constitutional Law at Meijo University, Japan, and Director of the Japan Association for Migration Policy Studies. He has been a visiting fellow at Stockholm University, the University of Oxford, and Harvard Law School. He has authored and edited several books, including Citizenship in a Global World (Palgrave Macmillan, 2001), New Concept of Citizenship (CEIFO Stockholm University, 2003), Migration and Globalization (Akashi Shoten, 2008), and Migration Policies in Asia (Sage, 2020).

RyanGok Ku is a third-generation Korean Japanese attorney: a human rights lawyer based in Osaka. She specializes in providing legal services to foreigners and foreign companies, including business, immigration, labour, and family law. From 2009 to 2014, she served as a lead counsel on a prominent case relating to hate speech against a Korean school in Japan (Kyoto Korean Elementary School case). She got her LL.M. in international human rights law in 2019 from the University of Essex, UK.

Shigenori Matsui is Professor at the Peter A. Allard School of Law, the University of British Columbia, Canada. He holds an LL.B., LL.M., and L.L.D. from Kyoto University and a J.S.D. from Stanford University. He is a well-known expert in the fields of constitutional law, mass media law, and internet law, and is the author of many books and articles, including The Constitution of Japan: A Contextual Analysis (Hart, 2011).

Toru Mori is Professor of Law at Kyoto University, Japan. He was formerly a scholarship researcher at the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation (2006–07) at Frankfurt University. He is the author of.


© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS


Hideki Nakamura is Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of Kitakyushu, Japan. He has written numerous articles and book chapters on public law, specifically on local ordinances and on media law. He has recently published two influential articles on local government hate speech regulations in Hōgaku Seminā [Legal seminar]. He was a member of the panel that examined the Tottori Prefectural Ordinance on Human Rights Protection, which attempted to regulate hate speech.

Il-song Nakamura is a freelance journalist. His work focuses on Korean residents in Japan, migrant workers, and the death penalty. His reportage on the Kyoto Korean Elementary School case, Rupo: Kyoto Chōsen Gakkō Shūgeki Jiken [Reportage: the Kyoto Korean School case] (Iwanami Shoten, 2014), is one of the most influential works on hate speech in Japan. He is also the author of Rupo: Shisō to Shiteno Chōsen Seki [Reportage: Korean nationality as an idea] (Iwanami Shoten, 2017).

Yuji Nasu is Professor of Law at Seinan Gakuin University, Japan, where he mainly teaches constitutional law. He is an expert on hate speech law. He has published Heito Supichihō no Hikaku Kenkyū [A comparative study of hate speech laws] (Shinzansha, 2019), analysing the laws of the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada, and Japan.

Keigo Obayashi is Professor of Law at Chiba University Law School, Japan. He teaches constitutional law and public law, and is one of the most prolific law authors in Japan. His works include Amerika Kenpō to Shikkō Tokken: Kenryoku Bunritsu Genri no Dōtai [Executive privileges in the US Constitution: the dynamics of the separation of powers principle] (Seibundo, 2008) and Kenpō to Risuku [The Constitution and risks] (Kobundo, 2015). His research interests are constitutional order, judicial review, and freedom of speech.

Kazushi Ogura is Professor of Law at Otaru University of Commerce, Japan. He is a scholar of and teaches constitutional law, in addition to
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Osamu Sakuraba is Associate Professor of Criminal Law at Yamaguchi University, Japan. He is known to be an expert on hate speech, having written numerous articles and book chapters on the theme. He is the author of Doitsu ni Okeru Minshūsendōzai to Kako no Kokufuku [The prohibition of incitement to hatred and the struggle to overcome the past in Germany] (Fukumura Shuppan, 2012) and the co-author of Heito Supichi no Hōteki Kenkyū [A legal study of hate speech] (Horitsu Bunkasha, 2014).

Fumiaki Taka is a lecturer at Kanagawa University, Japan. He is a social psychologist who obtained a Ph.D. in psychology from the University of Tokyo and who has studied racism against Zainichi Koreans (Korean residents in Japan). His book, Reishizumu o Kaibosu: Zainichi Korian eno Henken to Intānetto [The anatomy of racism: prejudice against Zainichi Koreans in the age of the Internet] (Keiso Shobo, 2015), which investigated this issue empirically, was ground-breaking in Japanese psychology and other relevant fields.

Shiki Tomimasu is an attorney who acted as a lead counsel in the Kyoto Korean Elementary School case. He has outlined his legal analysis of that experience in practice, combined with his experience of the Tokushima case, in articles such as ‘Heito Supich Jian ni Okeru Fuhōkōihō Tempo Baishō Hōri no Ninu Yakuwari no Saihyōka’ [‘A re-evaluation of the role played by compensatory principle of torts law on hate speech cases’] (2018) 61 Kanazawa Hōgaku [Kanazawa law review] 199.

Shinji Uozumi is Associate Professor at Kansai Gaidai University, Japan. He served as an organizer of the Media Law/Ethics Research Division at the Japan Society for Studies in Journalism and Mass Communication, and facilitated a workshop about the Osaka City Ordinance against Hate Speech. His recent publication is ‘Split Decision in the 51st Year of the U.S. Public Access TV: Manhattan
**LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS**


**KATSUO YAKURA** is a member of the Upper House of Japan. He was elected from Saitama District in 2013 and is currently serving his second term. He belongs to Komeito, one of the ruling coalition parties in Japan. He is one of the leading drafters of the Hate Speech Elimination Act and co-authored its commentary, *Heito Supichi Kaishōhō: Seiritsu no Keii to Kihontekina Kangaekata* [The Hate Speech Elimination Act: its history and basic idea] (Daiichi Hoki, 2016).

**TAKANORI YAMAMOTO** is Associate Professor of Social and Human Studies at Shizuoka University, Japan. He is co-editor of *Ima Buraku Mondai o Kataru* [Talking about the Buraku problem] (Seikatsu Shoin, 2019) and *Jūmin Undō to Gyōsei Kenryoku no Esunogurafi: Sabetsu to Jūmin Syutai o meguru Kyoto ron* [An ethnography of residents’ movements and administrative power: Kyoto studies on social discrimination and the subject of residents] (Koyo Shobo, 2020).
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project was conceived around spring 2017, when one of the editors, Shinji Higaki, was a visiting scholar at the U.S.–Asia Law Institute of the New York University (NYU) School of Law. Professor Jerome A. Cohen of the School recommended that Higaki translate his book Heito Supich Kisei no Kenpōgakuteki Kōsatsu [A constitutional analysis of hate speech regulation] (Horitsu Bunkasha, 2017), which had been published in Japan a few months earlier. Higaki, however, preferred to publish an entirely new book in English that would focus on Japanese hate speech law. Although many works had been published on this theme in Japan, especially after an upsurge in hate demonstrations in the late 2000s, no such book had been published in English and it is anticipated that this volume will be the first. It was Professor Frank Upham of NYU School of Law who introduced Higaki to Joe Ng of Cambridge University Press, while the School’s Professor Jeremy Waldron kindly oversaw the book proposal and provided valuable advice. We sincerely appreciate the encouragement that these professors gave us to publish this book.

After consulting with Joe, we submitted our book proposal and sample chapters for peer review. Three anonymous referees provided detailed and thought-provoking critique, contributing to the clarification and refinement of our project. We are deeply grateful to them. The staff of Cambridge University Press tolerantly took charge of this endeavour from the outset; this book would not have materialized without Joe’s assistance in particular at the early stages. We truly appreciate his understanding of the significance of our project. During the editing process, Gemma Smith was particularly helpful, doing a masterly job of arranging the entire composition of and proposing a fine cover design for this book, and we are much obliged to Joe and Gemma for their brilliant work. We are also grateful to Vanessa Plaister and Subathra Manogaran for refining this book at the later stages of editing.

We invited reputable scholars, attorneys, a journalist, and a statesman notable for their work on hate speech in Japan to contribute chapters to

xv
xvi ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

this volume; we are indebted to their collaboration. We are also beholden to scholars, journalists, editors, and attorneys who did not participate directly in this project, but who provided continuous support for our research activities. Their innovative ideas became valuable contributions to various parts of this book.

* The publication of this book was supported by the Suntory Foundation’s Overseas Publication Grant Program.
# ABBREVIATIONS

| AEDB | Act for Eliminating Discrimination against Buraku |
| ARP  | Anti-Racism Project                             |
| BBS  | bulletin board service                          |
| BCYP | Broadcast Committee for Youth Programming (BPO) |
| BPO  | Broadcasting Ethics and Programme Improvement Organization |
| BRC  | Broadcast and Human Rights/Other Related Rights Committee (BPO) |
| CERD | Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UN) |
| CIBE | Committee for the Investigation of Broadcasting Ethics (BPO) |
| CPPCG| Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (UN) |
| CRC  | Convention on the Rights of the Child (UN)     |
| DPJ  | Democratic Party of Japan                      |
| ERD Net | Network for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination Japan |
| FCC  | Federal Communications Commission (US)         |
| G7   | Group of Seven                                 |
| GHQ  | General Headquarters                           |
| HRB  | Human Rights Bureau                            |
| HRC  | Human Rights Commission                        |
| HSEA | Hate Speech Elimination Act                    |
| ICCPR| International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (UN) |
| ICERD| International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (UN) |
| IMADR| International Movement against Discrimination and Racism |
| IT   | information technology                         |
| JBA  | Japan Commercial Broadcasters Association      |
| JRU  | Japan Confederation of Railway Workers’ Union  |
| KKK  | Ku Klux Klan                                   |
| Komei PT | Project Team to Deal with Hate Speech Problems of Komei Party |
| LDP  | Liberal Democratic Party                       |
| LGBTQ+ | lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer/questioning and others |
| LRA  | less restrictive alternative                   |
| MBS  | Mainichi Broadcasting System                   |
| MEXT | Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology |

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment
www.cambridge.org
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

MIC  Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications
MIPEX  Migrant Integration Policy Index
MOJ  Ministry of Justice
MPT  Ministry of Post and Telecommunications
MXTV  Tokyo Metropolitan TV
NGO  non-governmental organization
NHK  Japan Broadcasting Corporation
NHRIs  national human rights institutions
Norikoe Net  Heito Supi chi to Reishizumu o Norikoeru Kokusai Nettowāku ('International Network to Overcome Hate Speech and Racism')
PTSD  post-traumatic stress disorder
RWA  right-wing authoritarianism
SCAP  Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers
SDO  social dominance orientation
SEM  structural equation modelling
SNS  social network services
TBA  Tokyo Bar Association
TBS  Tokyo Broadcasting System
UDHR  Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UN  United Nations
UNESCO  United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UPR  Universal Periodic Review
URL  uniform resource locator
Zaitokukai  Zainichi Tokken o Yurusanai Shimin no Kai ('Association of Citizens against the Special Privileges of Korean Residents in Japan')