

The Trolley Problem

The Trolley Problem is one of the most intensively discussed and controversial puzzles in contemporary moral philosophy. Over the last half-century, it has also become something of a cultural phenomenon, having been the subject of scientific experiments, online polls, television programs, computer games, and several popular books. This volume offers newly written chapters on a range of topics including the formulation of the Trolley Problem and its standard variations; the evaluation of different forms of moral theory; the neuroscience and social psychology of moral behavior; and the application of thought experiments to moral dilemmas in real life. The chapters are written by leading experts on moral theory, applied philosophy, neuroscience, and social psychology, and include several authors who have set the terms of the ongoing debates. The volume will be valuable for students and scholars working on any aspect of the Trolley Problem and its intellectual significance.

Hallvard Lillehammer is Professor of Philosophy in the School of Social Sciences, History and Philosophy at Birkbeck, University of London. He is the author of *Companions in Guilt: Arguments for Ethical Objectivity* (2007).

Classic Philosophical Arguments

Over the centuries, a number of individual arguments have formed a crucial part of philosophical enquiry. The volumes in this series examine these arguments, looking at the ramifications and applications which they have come to have, the challenges which they have encountered, and the ways in which they have stood the test of time.

Titles in the series

The Prisoner's Dilemma

Edited by Martin Peterson

The Original Position

Edited by Timothy Hinton

The Brain in a Vat

Edited by Sanford C. Goldberg

Pascal's Wager

Edited by Paul Bartha and Lawrence Pasternack

Ontological Arguments

Edited by Graham Oppy

Newcomb's Problem

Edited by Arif Ahmed

The Gettier Problem

Edited by Stephen Hetherington

The Naturalistic Fallacy

Edited by Neil Sinclair

The Sorites Paradox

Edited by Sergi Oms and Elia Zardini

The Knowledge Argument

Edited by Sam Coleman

The Trolley Problem

Edited by Hallvard Lillehammer

The Trolley Problem

Edited by
Hallvard Lillehammer
Birkbeck, University of London



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009255622

DOI: 10.1017/9781009255615

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Lillehammer, Hallvard, 1970- editor.

Title: The trolley problem / edited by Hallvard Lillehammer, Birkbeck, University of London.

Description: Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Series: Classic philosophical arguments |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022041535 (print) | LCCN 2022041536 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009255622 (hardback)

| ISBN 9781009255592 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009255615 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Consequentialism (Ethics) | Double effect (Ethics) | Decision making—Moral and ethical aspects. | Responsibility.

Classification: LCC BJ1500.C63 T76 2022 (print) | LCC BJ1500.C63 (ebook) | DDC 171/.5—dc23/eng/20220919

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022041535>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022041536>

ISBN 978-1-009-25562-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-25559-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of tables	<i>page</i> vii
List of contributors	viii
Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	1
Hallvard Lillehammer	
1 Keeping track of your trolleys: Origins and destinations	7
Hallvard Lillehammer	
2 Shunted trolleys and other diversions: Solving Thomson's puzzles	25
William J. FitzPatrick	
3 Must we turn the trolley?	42
Peter A. Graham	
4 Non-consequentialism in light of the trolley problem	59
F. M. Kamm	
5 Non-consequentialist principles under conditions of uncertainty: A framework	79
Dana Kay Nelkin and Samuel C. Rickless	
6 The trolley problem and the doing/allowing distinction	101
Fiona Woollard	
7 Virtue ethics and the trolley problem	116
Liezl van Zyl	
8 Trolley dilemmas from the philosopher's armchair to the psychologist's lab	134
Guy Kahane and Jim A. C. Everett	
9 Trolleyology: what it is, why it matters, what it's taught us, and how it's been misunderstood	158
Joshua D. Greene	

vi Contents

10	Cross-cultural responses to trolley problems and their implications for moral philosophy or: How I learned to stop worrying and love (constructivist) relativism Natalie Gold	182
11	Ethical accident algorithms for autonomous vehicles and the trolley problem: Three philosophical disputes Sven Nyholm	211
12	A new trolley problem? Ezio Di Nucci	231
	Bibliography	244
	Index	264

Tables

10.1 Inclusion and exclusion criteria	<i>page</i> 185
10.2 Comparison of moral judgments in Bystander and Footbridge within non-Western cultures	186
10.3 Cross-cultural comparisons: comparing the same scenario across two or more cultures	189

Contributors

Ezio Di Nucci is Professor of Bioethics and Director of the Centre for Medical Science and Technology Studies at the University of Copenhagen.

Jim A. C. Everett is Senior Lecturer in Psychology at the University of Kent.

William J. FitzPatrick is the Gideon Webster Burbank Professor of Intellectual and Moral Philosophy at the University of Rochester.

Natalie Gold is Senior Director at the Behavioural Practice Kantar Public UK and Visiting Professor in Practice at the London School of Economics.

Peter A. Graham is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts Amherst.

Joshua D. Greene is Professor of Psychology and a member of the Center for Brain Science faculty at Harvard University.

Guy Kahane is Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Oxford, and Fellow and Tutor in Philosophy at Pembroke College, Oxford.

F. M. Kamm is the Henry Rutgers University Professor of Philosophy and Distinguished Professor of Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, Rutgers University.

Hallvard Lillehammer is Professor of Philosophy in the School of Social Sciences, History and Philosophy at Birkbeck, University of London.

Dana Kay Nelkin is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California San Diego, and Affiliate Professor at the University of San Diego School of Law.

Sven Nyholm is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Utrecht University.

Samuel C. Rickless is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California San Diego, and Affiliate Professor at the University of San Diego School of Law.

Fiona Woollard is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Southampton.

Liezl van Zyl is Associate Professor in Philosophy at the University of Waikato.

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to Hilary Gaskin and Cambridge University Press for giving me the opportunity to work on this project. I am grateful to all the authors for the commitment and professionalism shown in writing their excellent contributions during what for many has been an unprecedentedly challenging period. I am also grateful to Alejandra Peña Lesmes for vital and ongoing support, often across large distances. Finally, I am grateful to the late Peter Lipton, with whom for seven years until his death in 2007 I spent long days at the end of Michaelmas term discussing “the trolley car” with prospective undergraduates in H6, inner right, of the Gibbs Building, King’s College.

At the point of its inception, this volume was meant to start with a chapter by Judith Jarvis Thomson, who passed away in November 2020. The frequency with which Thomson’s work appears during the course of this volume is a tribute to the continuing influence of her contributions to moral philosophy.