AMENDING AMERICA'S UNWRITTEN CONSTITUTION

It is well known that the US Constitution has been amended twenty-seven times since its creation in 1787, but that number does not reflect the true extent of constitutional change in America. Although the Constitution is globally recognized as a written text, it consists also of unwritten rules and principles that are just as important, such as precedents, customs, traditions, norms, presuppositions, and more. These, too, have been amended, but how does that process work? In this book, leading scholars of law, history, philosophy, and political science consider the many theoretical, conceptual, and practical dimensions of what it means to amend America's 'unwritten Constitution': how to change the rules, who may legitimately do it, why leaders may find it politically expedient to enact written instead of unwritten amendments, and whether anything is lost by changing the constitution without a codified constitutional amendment.

Richard Albert is the William Stamps Farish Professor in Law, Professor of Government, and Director of Constitutional Studies at the University of Texas at Austin.

Ryan C. Williams is a Associate Professor of Law at Boston College Law School.

Yaniv Roznai is an Associate Professor at the Harry Radzyner Law School, Reichman University (IDC Herzliya).

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg University of Chicago Zachary Elkins University of Texas at Austin Ran Hirschl University of Texas at Austin

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

Amending America's Unwritten Constitution Edited by Richard Albert, Ryan C. Williams and Yaniv Roznai

Constitutionalism and a Right to Effective Government? Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Yasmin Dawood

The Fall of the Arab Spring: Democracy's Challenges and Efforts to Reconstitute the Middle East Tofigh Maboudi

Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism: The Italian Case in a Comparative Perspective Giuseppe Martinico

Constitutionalism in Context David S. Law

The New Fourth Branch: Institutions for Protecting Constitutional Democracy Mark Tushnet

The Veil of Participation: Citizens and Political Parties in Constitution-Making Processes Alexander Hudson

Towering Judges: A *Comparative Study of Constitutional Judges* Edited by Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat

The Constitution of Arbitration Victor Ferreres Comella

Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq

The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan

A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy, and Shishir Bail

Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States Stephan Stohler

Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, and Georg Vanberg

Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions Eric C. Ip

Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer

The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis Theunis Roux Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate Anine Kierulf

Constituent Assemblies Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions? Andrew Arato

Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka Dian A. H. Shah

Courts and Democracies in Asia Po Jen Yap

Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet

Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

Assessing Constitutional Performance Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka Benjamin Schonthal

Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave Brian Ray

Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America Julio Ríos-Figueroa

Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies David Kosař

Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco

Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton Constitutions and Religious Freedom Frank B. Cross International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia Edited by Susan H. Williams

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser *Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances* Shubhankar Dam

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

Comparative Constitutional Design Edited by Tom Ginsburg

Amending America's Unwritten Constitution

Edited by

RICHARD ALBERT

The University of Texas at Austin

RYAN C. WILLIAMS

Boston College, Massachusetts

YANIV ROZNAI

Harry Radzyner Law School, Reichman University (IDC Herzliya)



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009246835 DOI: 10.1017/9781009246811

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-24683-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Contributors	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments	
Introduction: A Return to Constitutional Basics: Amendment, Constitution, and Writtenness Richard Albert, Yaniv Roznai, and Ryan C. Williams	1
1 The Unwritten Constitutions of the United States Mark A. Graber	25
2 Enumerating Amendments Sanford Levinson	57
3 Change Is the Only Constant: Unwritten Amendments and the Courts Carolyn Shapiro	73
4 The Role of the People in Unwritten Amendments Emily Zackin	91
5 Unwritten State Constitutions? In Search of Constitutional Communities <i>Miriam Seifter</i>	105
6 State Constitutions and the Interaction between Formal Amendment and Unwritten Commitments Jonathan L. Marshfield	121
7 The Drive for a National Popular Vote for the Presidence A Case Study in Amending the Unwritten Constitution Vikram David Amar	y: 147

viii	Contents	
8	The Trump Presidency, the Racial Realignment, and the Future of Constitutional Norms <i>Neil S. Siegel</i>	169
9	Amending an Unwritten Constitution: Comparative Perspectives <i>Mark Tushnet</i>	203
10	The Unwritten Foundations of (All) Written Constitutions Frederick Schauer	217
Inde	ex	235

Contributors

Richard Albert is the William Stamps Farish Professor in Law, Professor of Government, and Director of Constitutional Studies at the University of Texas at Austin.

Vikram David Amar is Dean and Iwan Foundation Professor of Law at the University of Illinois, College of Law.

Mark A. Graber is the University System of Maryland Regents Professor at the University of Maryland Francis King Carey School of Law.

Sanford Levinson holds the W. St. John Garwood and W. St. John Garwood, Jr., Centennial Chair in Law and is Professor of Government at the University of Texas at Austin.

Jonathan L. Marshfield is Associate Professor of Law at the University of Florida Levin College of Law.

Yaniv Roznai is Associate Professor at the Harry Radzyner Law School, Reichman University (IDC Herzliya).

Frederick Schauer is a David and Mary Harrison Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of Virginia.

Miriam Seifter is Associate Professor of Law, Co-Director of the State Democracy Research Initiative, and Rowe Faculty Fellow in Regulatory Law at the University of Wisconsin Law School.

Carolyn Shapiro is Professor of Law, founder and Co-Director of the Institute on the Supreme Court of the United States, and Associate Dean for Academic Administration and Strategic Initiatives at Chicago-Kent College of Law.

Neil S. Siegel is the David W. Ichel Professor of Law and Professor of Political Science at Duke Law School.

х

List of Contributors

Mark Tushnet is the William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law, Emeritus, at Harvard Law School.

Ryan C. Williams is Associate Professor of Law at Boston College Law School.

Emily Zackin is Associate Professor and Director of Graduate Studies in the Department of Political Science at Johns Hopkins University.

Acknowledgments

A few years ago, a group of sixty scholars gathered on the beautiful campus of Boston College to discuss how unwritten constitutional norms and conventions in the United States can and do change. Over two days of debate and discussion, conference participants expanded our theoretical and practical understanding of what it means to "amend" America's "unwritten constitution," how the "unwritten constitution" can be amended if at all, and who the relevant constitutional actors are in catalyzing and concretizing these changes.

The highlights of the conference were the keynote lectures delivered by the contributors to this book. Their lectures have since been written as chapters and revised in light of comments and conversation at this productive gathering. We are proud to share these texts with the world; we know they will be of great interest to scholars in the field of constitutional change and beyond.

We wish to recognize several people for their help in making this project a success. We are especially grateful for the generous grant from the Institute for the Liberal Arts at Boston College to host this conference. We thank Mary Crane, Director of the Institute.

At the Center for Centers at Boston College, we thank Shaylonda Barton, Gaurie Pandey, and Stephanie Querzoli. And at the University of Texas at Austin, we thank Trish Do.

We are also grateful to Shachar Friedman, Eyal Mann, Gal Maor, Noam Mizrahi, and Yuval Ram for their assistance in preparing the index for this book.