

How Mediation Works

Using conversation analysis to study the interaction between mediators and disputants, this study shows how mediation is used to resolve conflict in small claims and divorce mediation sessions. Angela Garcia explores the techniques mediators use to help disputants tell their stories, make and respond to complaints and accusations, and come up with ideas for resolving the dispute. By analyzing these techniques in their interactional context, she shows how they impact the experience and responses of disputants, and she demonstrates that mediator techniques can empower disputants, maximize disputant autonomy, and display a mediator's neutrality while, in some cases, the organization of talk in mediation may work against these goals. This book is the first to use conversation analysis to study how mediation works and how mediators can best help disputants.

ANGELA CORA GARCIA is Professor of Sociology at Bentley University. She conducts conversation-analytic research on mediation, emergency phone calls to the police, computer-mediated communication, air traffic communication, and political interviews and speeches. She is author of *An Introduction to Interaction: Understanding Talk in Formal and Informal Settings* (2013).

Studies in Interactional Sociolinguistics

Founding Editor

John J. Gumperz (1922–2013)

Editors

Paul Drew, Rebecca Clift, Lorenza Mondada, Marja-Leena Sorjonen

- 1 *Discourse Strategies* John J. Gumperz
- 2 *Language and Social Identity* edited by John J. Gumperz
- 3 *The Social Construction of Literacy* Jenny Cook-Gumperz
- 4 *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage* Penelope Brown and Stephen C. Levinson
- 5 *Discourse Markers* Deborah Schiffrin
- 6 *Talking Voices: Repetition, Dialogue, and Imagery in Conversational Discourse* Deborah Tannen
- 7 *Conducting Interaction: Patterns of Behaviour in Focused Encounters* Adam Kendon
- 8 *Talk at Work: Interaction in Institutional Settings* edited by Paul Drew and John Heritage
- 9 *Grammar in Interaction: Adverbial Clauses in American English Conversations* Cecilia E. Ford
- 10 *Crosstalk and Culture in Sino-American Communication* Linda W. L. Young (with foreword by John J. Gumperz)
- 11 *AIDS Counselling: Institutional Interaction and Clinical Practice* Anssi Peräkylä
- 12 *Prosody in Conversation: Interactional Studies* edited by Elizabeth Couper-Kuhlen and Margret Selting
- 13 *Interaction and Grammar* edited by Elinor Ochs, Emanuel A. Schegloff and Sandra A. Thompson
- 14 *Credibility in Court: Communicative Practices in the Camorra Trials* Marco Jacquemet
- 15 *Interaction and the Development of Mind* A. J. Wootton
- 16 *The News Interview: Journalists and Public Figures on the Air* Steven Clayman and John Heritage
- 17 *Gender and Politeness* Sara Mills
- 18 *Laughter in Interaction* Philip Glenn
- 19 *Matters of Opinion: Talking about Public Issues* Greg Myers
- 20 *Communication in Medical Care: Interaction between Primary Care Physicians and Patients* edited by John Heritage and Douglas Maynard
- 21 *In Other Words: Variation in Reference and Narrative* Deborah Schiffrin
- 22 *Language in Late Modernity: Interaction in an Urban School* Ben Rampton
- 23 *Discourse and Identity* edited by Anna De Fina, Deborah Schiffrin and Michael Bamberg

- 24 *Reporting Talk: Reported Speech in Interaction* edited by Elizabeth Holt and Rebecca Clift
- 25 *The Social Construction of Literacy*, 2nd Edition edited by Jenny Cook-Gumperz
- 26 *Talking Voices*, 2nd Edition by Deborah Tannen
- 27 *Conversation Analysis* edited by Jack Sidnell
- 28 *Impoliteness: Using Language to Cause Offence* Jonathan Culpeper
- 29 *The Morality of Knowledge in Conversation* edited by Tanya Stivers, Lorenza Mondada and Jakob Steensig
- 30 *Conversational Repair and Human Understanding* edited by Makoto Hayashi, Geoffrey Raymond and Jack Sidnell
- 31 *Grammar and Everyday Talk: Building Responsive Actions* by Sandra A. Thompson, Barbara A. Fox and Elizabeth Couper-Kuhlen

How Mediation Works

Resolving Conflict Through Talk

Angela Cora Garcia

Bentley University, Massachusetts



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-009-24498-5 — How Mediation Works: Resolving Conflict Through Talk

Angela Cora Garcia

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009244985

DOI: 10.1017/9781139162548

© Angela Cora Garcia 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Garcia, Angela Cora, author.

Title: How mediation works : resolving conflict through talk / Angela Garcia.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Studies in interactional sociolinguistics | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019003349 (print) | LCCN 2019015694 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781107024274 (Hardback) | ISBN 9781107024274 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Mediation. | Conflict management.

Classification: LCC HM1126 (ebook) | LCC HM1126 .G36 2019 (print) |

DDC 303.6/9—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019003349>

ISBN 978-1-107-02427-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-24498-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To the loving memory of my father, Angel Antonio Garcia, an immigrant to the United States of America. He was a kind and gentle man who devoted his life to his family and his work.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xiii</i>
1 Introduction: Approaches to Mediation	1
Roots and Varieties of Mediation	2
Facilitative Mediation	5
Narrative Mediation	6
Transformative Mediation	6
Previous Research on Mediation	8
Interactional Approaches to the Study of Mediation	11
Theoretical Perspective and Analytical Approach	14
The Research Settings	16
The West Coast Data	17
Data Collection	18
Recording Equipment	19
Midwest Small Claims Mediation Data	19
The Setting	20
The Organization of the Hearings	21
Midwest Divorce and Family Mediation Data	21
Access to the Setting	22
Data Collection Procedure	22
Equipment and Recording	22
Data Preparation	23
Recent Examples of Mediation	23
Training and Experience as a Volunteer Mediator	24
Chapter Summaries	24
2 The Interactional Organization of Mediation	29
Mediation Session Openings	29
Small Claims Mediation Session Openings	30
Divorce Mediation Session Openings	33
Summary	36
The Turn-Taking System of Mediation	36
The Participation Framework of Mediation	44
Nonproblematic Disputant Intrusions	46
Error Repair	46
Sentence Completion	47
Brief Oppositional Utterances	48
	ix

x	Contents	
	Information-Seeking Questions	49
	Provision of Relevant Information	50
	The Interactional Organization of Divorce Mediation Sessions	51
	The Hybrid Mediation Format	51
	The Interactional Impact of Multiple Sessions	55
	Discussion and Conclusions	58
3	Minimizing and Managing Argumentative Talk in Mediation	60
	Disputing in Ordinary Conversation	61
	Minimizing and Managing Arguing in Mediation	63
	The Separation of Accusations and Denials	63
	Selective Responses to Accusations	66
	The Formulation of Accusations and Denials	67
	Third Person Attributions of Blame	68
	Elision of Agent	68
	Displacement of Agent	69
	Mitigating Accusations	70
	Summary	70
	Disputant Direct Address and the Emergence of Arguing	71
	Disputant Self-Exit from Brief Argumentative Exchanges	71
	Mediator-Assisted Exit	73
	Mediator Responses to Emerging Arguments	77
	Minimal Responses and Topic Shifts	78
	Strategic Interruptions, Questions, and Sanctions	80
	Deflection from Arguing by Focusing on Facts	82
	Stepwise Departures from Mediation Format to Arguing	83
	Discussion and Conclusions	88
4	Disputants' Opening Statements and Persuasive Arguments in Mediation	89
	Soliciting the First Disputant's Opening Statement	90
	Soliciting Disputants' Opening Statements in Small Claims Mediation	90
	Soliciting Disputants' Opening Statements in Divorce Mediation	92
	Summary	93
	Facilitating Disputants' Opening Statements	94
	Opening Statements with Minimal Mediator Intervention	94
	Opening Statements with Mediator Facilitation	96
	Summary	99
	Constructing Strong Opening Statements	99
	Stories or Narratives	100
	Quotes and Reported Speech	101
	Moral Claims	102
	Preemptive Moves	104
	Soliciting the Second Disputant's Opening Statement	107
	The Interactional Consequences of Going Second	111
	Discussion and Conclusions	117
5	Mediator Representation of Disputants' Positions	120
	Paraphrases, Summaries, and Upshots	122
	Refocusing or Redirecting the Discussion	122
	Articulating the Main Point of a Story	123

Contents	xi
Articulating the Main Areas of Disagreement	124
Highlighting Common Ground	126
Using Summaries to Serve as an Intermediary	130
“Revoicing”: Mediator Representation in Direct Exchanges with Opposing Disputants	132
Mediator “Replacement” of the Opposing Disputant	136
Replacement in Small Claims Mediation	136
Replacement in Divorce Mediation	138
Implications of Replacement for Dispute Resolution	141
Replacement and Disputant Autonomy	141
Replacement and Implications for Fairness	143
Discussion and Conclusions	147
6 Soliciting Proposals for Resolution of the Dispute	150
General Solicits of Disputant Proposals	150
Specific Solicits of Disputant Proposals	152
Specific Solicits of New Suggestions	152
Narrowing the Range of a Proposal Solicit	153
Soliciting Elaboration of an Existing Proposal	154
Specific Solicits with Candidate Suggestions	155
Summary	155
Resisting Mediator Solicits	156
Resisting Solicits by Claiming Not to Have a Proposal	157
Resisting Mediator Solicits by Passing on the Opportunity	158
Resisting Mediator Solicits with Silence	158
Resisting Mediator Solicits with Talk on Other Issues	160
Summary	164
Pursuing Proposals and Recycling Proposal Solicits	164
Proposal Solicitation in Divorce Mediation	167
Discussion and Conclusions	171
7 Producing Ideas for Resolution of the Dispute	173
Disputants’ Ideas for Resolution as “Position Reports”	174
Mediator’s Ideas for Resolution as “Suggestions”	177
Information-Seeking Questions as Mediator Proposals	178
Mitigated Proposals	180
Footing Shifts	181
Mediator Proposals and the Display of Neutrality	183
Proposal Production in Divorce Mediation	185
Proposal Generation in Hybrid Exchanges	186
Joking Proposals	191
Discussion and Conclusions	194
8 Mediator Teamwork	197
Failure of Alignment between Co-mediators	199
Activity Misalignment	199
Transition from the Discussion Stage to the Solution-Generation Stage	200
Transition from the Discussion Phase to Individual Caucuses	201
Substantive Misalignment	203
Interactional Misalignment	205
Summary	208

xii	Contents	
	Creating and Displaying Mediator Alignment	209
	Displaying Alignment through Silence	209
	Mediator Teamwork through Explicit Negotiation	210
	Mediator Teamwork through Expressing Agreement	211
	Mediation Teamwork through Paraphrasing	213
	Mediator Teamwork through Sentence Completion	214
	Mediator Teamwork through “And-Prefaces”	216
	Mediator Teamwork through Complementary Actions	219
	Discussion and Conclusions	222
9	Autonomy, Empowerment, and Neutrality in Divorce and Small Claims Mediation	224
	Summary of Findings	225
	The Speech Exchange System of Mediation	225
	Managing and Minimizing Arguing in Mediation	227
	Mediator Solicitation and Facilitation of Disputants’ Opening Statements	229
	Mediator Representation of Disputants’ Positions	230
	Facilitating the Solution-Generation Process	233
	Proposal Production and Disputant Autonomy	235
	Proposal Generation in Divorce Mediation	237
	Mediator Teamwork	238
	Implications for Mediation Practice	240
	Recommendations for Mediators and Disputants	240
	Recommendations for Mediation Procedures and Processes	242
	Redesign the Solicitation of Opening Statements	242
	Utilize the Co-mediation Model	243
	Design the Proposal-Generation Process to Maximize Brainstorming	243
	Mimic the Multiple-Sessions Model of Divorce Mediation	243
	Suggestions for Further Research	244
	Comparing Different Types of Mediation	244
	The Need for Cross-Cultural Comparisons	245
	Conversation-Analytic Research on Caucuses in Mediation	245
	Improving Access to Data	246
	<i>Appendix: Transcription Symbols</i>	248
	<i>References</i>	249
	<i>Index</i>	269

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the mediators and mediation clients from the three mediation programs studied in this book. These mediation clients and mediators agreed to participate in this project and allowed me to videotape their mediation sessions. I would also like to thank the research assistants who did an outstanding job transcribing data when they were graduate students at the University of Cincinnati: Jennifer Baker Jacobs and Brent Shannon.

Some of the chapters in this book were based in part on previously published research articles. These articles analyzed only parts of the data sets, and in this book, the analysis has been expanded to include all of the data sets. Parts of the analysis in Chapters 2 and 3 are based on my 1991 paper in the *American Sociological Review* (“Dispute resolution without disputing: How the interactional organization of mediation hearings minimizes argument”). Part of the analysis in Chapter 5 is based on my 1995 paper in the *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare* (“The problematics of representation in community mediation hearings: Implications for mediation practice”). Parts of the analysis in Chapters 6 and 7 were based on two papers in *Discourse & Society* (2000, “Negotiating negotiation: The collaborative production of resolution in small claims mediation hearings,” and 1997, “Interactional constraints on proposal generation in mediation hearings: A preliminary investigation”).

The people who taught me conversation analysis were wonderful teachers and inspired me to study and teach this topic: Janet Tallman at Hampshire College, Candace West at the University of California, Santa Cruz, and Don H. Zimmerman at the University of California, Santa Barbara. They set me on a path of researching and teaching conversation analysis that prepared me for the task of writing this book.

I would like to thank the National Science Foundation for a research grant that provided the funding for the collection of two of the data sets analyzed in this book (Law and Social Sciences program, grant SBR-9411224). I would like to thank Bentley University for a sabbatical during which much of the

xiv Acknowledgments

work for this book was done. My editor at Cambridge University Press, Paul Drew, has been so helpful with editing, suggestions, and advice as I put this book together; I can't thank him enough. His input has greatly improved this book. Thanks also to commissioning editor Helen Barton, to Holly Monteith for copyediting the manuscript, and to Alexandra Nickerson for creating the index.