

Econord General Press & Assessment 678843648-7 — Homogeneous Ordered Graphs, Metrically Homogeneous Graphs, and Frontmatter

More Information

Homogeneous Ordered Graphs, Metrically Homogeneous Graphs, and Beyond

Volume II: 3-Multi-graphs and 2-Multi-tournaments

This is the second of two volumes by Professor Cherlin presenting the state of the art in the classification of homogeneous structures in binary languages and related problems in the intersection of model theory and combinatorics. Researchers and graduate students in the area will find in these volumes many far-reaching results and interesting new research directions to pursue.

This volume continues the analysis of the first volume to 3-multi-graphs and 3-multi-tournaments, expansions of graphs and tournaments by the addition of a further binary relation. The opening chapter provides an overview of the volume, outlining the relevant results and conjectures. The author applies and extends the results of Volume I to obtain a detailed catalogue of such structures and a second classification conjecture. The book ends with an appendix exploring recent advances and open problems in the theory of homogeneous structures and related subjects.

GREGORY CHERLIN is Distinguished Professor Emeritus at Rutgers University. He has worked on applications of model theory to algebra and combinatorics for half a century, and has published four books and over 100 articles on model theory and its applications.



LECTURE NOTES IN LOGIC

A Publication of The Association for Symbolic Logic

This series serves researchers, teachers, and students in the field of symbolic logic, broadly interpreted. The aim of the series is to bring publications to the logic community with the least possible delay and to provide rapid dissemination of the latest research. Scientific quality is the overriding criterion by which submissions are evaluated.

Editorial Board

Zoé Chatzidakis

DMA, Ecole Normale Supérieure, Paris

Denis Hirschfeldt

Department of Mathematics, University of Chicago

Leon Horsten

Department of Philosophy, Universität Konstanz, Germany

Paul Larson, Managing Editor

Department of Mathematics, Miami University

Paulo Oliva

School of Electronic Engineering and Computer Science, Queen Mary University of London

Martin Otto

Department of Mathematics, Technische Universität Darmstadt, Germany

Slawomir Solecki

Department of Mathematics, Cornell University, New York

More information, including a list of the books in the series, can be found at http://aslonline.org/books/lecture-notes-in-logic/



LECTURE NOTES IN LOGIC 54

Homogeneous Ordered Graphs, Metrically Homogeneous Graphs, and Beyond

Volume II: 3-Multi-graphs and 2-Multi-tournaments

GREGORY CHERLIN

Rutgers University, New Jersey







CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009229487
DOI: 10.1017/9781009229500

Association for Symbolic Logic Richard A. Shore, Publisher Department of Mathematics, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY 14853 http://aslonline.org

© Association for Symbolic Logic 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

 $\label{lem:analytication} A\ catalogue\ record\ for\ this\ publication\ is\ available\ from\ the\ British\ Library.$

ISBN – 2 Volume Set 978-1-009-23018-6 Hardback ISBN – Volume I 978-1-009-22969-2 Hardback ISBN – Volume II 978-1-009-22948-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In memory of George Cherlin, 1924–1992. Enthralled by the beauty of mathematics, ever mindful of its power for good or evil.











CONTENTS

Volume I

Contents		vii
LIST OF TA	ABLES	xv
Abstract	Σ	vii
Preface		xix
Acknowl	.EDGMENTSx	xix
Chapter 1	1. Results	1
1.1.	Introduction	1
1.2.	Fraïssé limits and amalgamation classes	2
1.3.	The classification of countable homogeneous ordered graphs	5
1.4.	The metrically homogeneous catalog	10
1.4.1.	Homogeneous graphs and the graph Γ_1	12
1.4.2.	Finite metrically homogeneous graphs	13
1.4.3.	Tree-like graphs $T_{m,n}$	14
1.4.4.	3-constrained amalgamation classes	15
1.4.5.	Henson constraints and antipodal variants	15
1.4.6.	Generic type	18
1.5.	Part II: 3-constraint (we take up trigonometry)	19
1.6.	Bipartite & infinite diameter cases	25
1.7.	Toward a proof of the classification	27
Chapter 2	2. Methods	31
2.1.	Homogeneous ordered vs. ordered homogeneous	31
2.1.1.	Recognizing the underlying homogeneous graphs	33
2.1.2.	The inductive framework	34
2.2.	3-constrained metrically homogeneous graphs	42
2.3	Paduction theorems	16

vii



Beyond Graphs University Press & Assessment 678207069122948-7 — Homogeneous Ordered Graphs, Metrically Homogeneous Graphs, and Frontmatter

viii	Contents		
2.3.1 2.3.2 2.4.	r - r	46 47 48	
Part I.	Homogeneous ordered graphs	40	
1 alt 1.	Tromogeneous ordered graphs		
Снарты		53	
3.1.	Preliminaries	53	
3.2.	The catalog	54	
3.3.	Homogeneous ordered graphs omitting C_3 or C_3	59	
Chapter 4. The generically ordered local order			
4.1.	Statement of the problem	61	
4.2.	Permutations	62	
4.3.	$I_1 \rightarrow C_3$ and $C_3 \rightarrow I_1 \dots$	70	
4.4.	Characterization of the generically ordered local order	77	
Снарте	R 5. ORDERED HOMOGENEOUS GRAPHS: PLAN OF THE PROOF,		
	Propositions I–IX	83	
5.1.	Introduction	83	
5.2.	A simultaneous induction	85	
5.3.	From Propositions I–V to Propositions VI–IX	88	
5.4.	Ramsey theoretic arguments	90	
Снарты	R 6. ORDERED HOMOGENEOUS GRAPHS: PROPOSITION I	95	
6.1.	Proof of Proposition IA	96	
6.2.	Some small configurations	100	
6.3.	Four vertices and two edges	103	
6.4.	An ample ordered 2-graph	107	
6.5.	1-types over \vec{I}_k ; Proposition IB	108	
Снарты	R 7. ORDERED HOMOGENEOUS GRAPHS: PROPOSITION II	113	
7.1.	Closure under $\vec{K}_2 \perp X$		
7.2.	$\mathcal{A}(n)$ and $[\vec{I_1}, \mathcal{A}(n-1)]$		
7.3.	Proof of Proposition II		
Снарты	R 8. ORDERED HOMOGENEOUS GRAPHS: PROPOSITION III	121	
	Ramsey 2-types		
8.2.	An inductive principle		
8.3.	Ramsey 2-types over \vec{K}_2		
8.4.	Proof of Proposition III		
Снарты	R 9. ORDERED HOMOGENEOUS GRAPHS: PROPOSITION IV	139	
9.1.	Introduction		
9.2.	Proof of Proposition IV ₂		



ix
44 51
59
59
63
67
71
79
79
81
83
85
86
89
89
90
91
93
96
06
13
13
15
16
19
19
24
25
31
32
35
36
37
49
63
63



X	Contents	
15.2.	The type of Γ_i	265
15.3.	Local connectivity	
15.4.	Local primitivity	
15.5.	The case of Γ_{δ} bipartite	
15.6.	Theorem 1.7.1 and Proposition 1.7.2	
15.7.	An application	
15.8.	The interpolation property revisited	. 285
CHAPTER :	16. The bipartite case	289
16.1.	Preliminary analysis	. 290
16.2.	Realization of triangles	. 292
16.3.	Embedding lemma: δ even or infinite	
16.4.	Henson constraints: δ finite and odd	. 301
16.5.	A reduction lemma for δ finite and odd	304
16.6.	The embedding lemma for δ odd, finite	. 306
16.7.	Conclusion of the proof	. 311
Chapter :	17. Infinite diameter	. 313
17.1.	Introduction	. 313
17.2.	Toward Theorem 1.6.1	314
17.3.	The cases $K_1 \le 2 \dots$	317
17.4.	General K_1	317
Appendix		
A.1.	Homogeneous multi-orders	. 322
A.2.	Metrically homogeneous graphs	325
A.2.1.	Toward the classification conjecture	. 325
A.2.2.	Canonical completion of partial substructures	. 329
A.2.3.	The twisted automorphism group	. 340
REFERENC	EES FOR VOLUME I	. 345
INDEV		351



Beyond Graphs University Press & Assessment Graphs, Metrically Homogeneous Graphs, and Frontmatter

	Contents	X1
Volume II		
LIST OF TAE	BLES	xv
Abstract.		kvii
PREFACE TO	VOLUME II	xix
Acknowle	DGMENTS	xiii
18.2. 18.3. 18.3.1. 18.3.2. 18.3.3. 18.3.4. 18.3.5. 18.3.6.	3. Classification problems for small binary languages. Lachlan's classification problem. Standard binary homogeneous structures. Concrete classification problems: overview. Classification problems for small languages. The main 3-constrained homogeneous 3-m.g.'s. The main 3-constrained homogeneous 2-m.t.'s. The story so far: 3-constraint. Homogeneous 3-m.g.s: forbidden triangles, etc. Homogeneous 2-m.t.s: forbidden triangles. The catalog revisited.	1 3 5 7 7 8 9 10 12 12 14
19.2. 19.3. 19.3.1. 19.3.2. 19.3.3. 19.3.4. 19.3.5. 19.3.6. 19.3.7. 19.3.8.	A catalog Triangle constraints The locally degenerate imprimitive case Some general ideas The case $m < \infty$: preliminary analysis Proof that $m = \infty$ Proof that $n = \infty$ The case $m = n = \infty$: structure of $u^p \cap \Gamma_1$ for $u \in \Gamma_2$ The (Γ_1, Γ_2) -type partition Types of \sim -classes in Γ_1 over pairs in Γ_2 Proposition 19.3.44 3-multi-graphs: conclusion	15 16 19 22 23 26 39 46 49 59 63 66 67
20.2. 20.3. 20.3.1. 20.3.2. 20.3.3.	O. IMPRIMITIVE HOMOGENEOUS 2-MULTI-TOURNAMENTS	69 69 70 74 78 84 92 94



xii		Contents	
		Generic type: structure of u^2	
CH	IAPTER 2	1. 3-CONSTRAINED HOMOGENEOUS 2-MULTI-TOURNAMENTS	107
	21.1.	The classification	108
	21.2.	Existence	111
	21.2.1.	The exceptional cases: 7–10	111
	21.2.2.	The structures $\mathbb{S}(n)$ and entries 11 and 12	114
	21.3.	Completeness: the partially ordered case	118
	21.4.	Completeness: no partial orders	
	21.4.1.	Proof of Proposition 21.4.1	
		Proposition 21.4.2	
	21.4.3.	The case of $\mathbb{S}(4)$	136
	21.4.4.	Entry #10	141
		Entry #8	
	21.4.6.	Proof of Proposition 21.4.2	144
		Entry 9: Proposition 21.4.3	
	21.5.	Completeness: the 3-constrained case	156
Сн	IAPTER 22	2. Homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments: forbidden triangli	ES:
		CONCLUSION	
	22.1.	Introduction	
	22.2.	The transitive case	
	22.3.	No definable p.o.: around $\widetilde{\mathbb{S}(3)}$	
	22.3.1.	Notation: 2-multi-tournaments of order 4	
		The triangle types $L_3(1,1,2)$, $L_3(2,2,1)$, $C_3(1,1,2)$, and	
		$C_3(2,2,1)$	162
	22 3 3	Around $\widetilde{\mathbb{S}(3)}$, continued	
		Reduction to cases (a, c)	
		Case (a)	
		Case (c)	
		Proof of Proposition 22.3.1	
	22.4.	Around S(4)	
		Positive constraints	
		A first dichotomy	
		The bad case	
	22.5.	Generalizing Lemma 21.4.25	188
	22.6.	Around entry #8	
	22.7.	Around entry #9	
	22.7.	Forbidden triangles: analysis so far	
	22.9.	2-multi-tournaments: conclusion	
	22.9.1.	Triangle constraints: an overview	
		Triangle constraints: an overview Triangle constraints: the catalog	
	,,,,,,,	111W11510 00110t1W111t0, till OWWIO5	



	Contents	xiii
Appendix	B. OPEN PROBLEMS AND SOME RECENT RESULTS	223
B.1.	Model theoretic problems	224
B.1.1.	Structural Ramsey theory and applications	224
B.1.2.	The finite case	228
B.1.3.	Model theoretic simplicity, pseudoplanes	234
B.1.4.	Ternary languages	234
B.1.5.	Finite model prop., finite axiomatizability	237
B.1.6.	Homogenizability	238
B.1.7.	<i>n</i> -Cardinal properties	239
B.1.8.	Partial orders of width <i>n</i> : model companion	240
B.2.	Automorphism groups of homogeneous structures	240
B.2.1.	The abstract group	241
B.2.2.	Dynamical properties	241
B.2.3.	Descriptive set theory and Polish groups	246
B.2.4.	Regular actions	246
B.3.	Algorithmic problems	247
B.3.1.	Constraint satisfaction problems	247
B.3.2.	Decision problems for model companions	248
B.4.	Old chestnuts	251
B.4.1.	Locally finite (semifinite) generalized <i>n</i> -gons	251
B.4.2.	Stable countably categorical groups	252
B.4.3.	Transitivity conditions	252
Referenci	ES FOR VOLUME II	253
INDEX		261





LIST OF TABLES

Table 18.1	Primitive 3-constrained non-degenerate homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments without free amalgamation
Table 21.1	Primitive infinite 3-constrained homogeneous 2-multi-tour-
	naments with no linear order
Table 21.2	3-constrained 2-multi-tournaments: no partial order 126
Table 21.3	Proof of Proposition 21.4.1
Table 22.1	Imprimitive homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments: triangle
	constraints
Table 22.2	Primitive homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments: triangle con-
	straints
Table 22.3	Nondegenerate homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments: non-
	triangle constraints





ABSTRACT

Volume I. Part I: A complete classification of homogeneous ordered graphs is given: up to a change of language each is either a generically ordered homogeneous graph or tournament, or a generic linear extension of a homogeneous partial order.

Part II: A catalog of the currently known metrically homogeneous graphs is given, with proofs of existence and some evidence for the completeness of the catalog. This includes a reduction of the problem to what may be considered the generic case, and some tools for the analysis of the generic case.

Some related developments are discussed in an appendix.

Volume II. Here the impact of the results of Parts I and II and of related work in Amato, Cherlin, and Macpherson [2021] on the classification of homogeneous structures for a language with two anti-symmetric 2-types or with 3 symmetric 2-types is worked out in detail.

An appendix to Volume II discusses some further advances in related areas, and a wide variety of open problems.

An extensive bibliography of related literature and a quick survey of that literature, organized by topic, is given in Cherlin [2021] (see also http://www.cambridge.org/9781009229692).

The method used in Part I of Volume I is due to Alistair Lachlan. The method used in Part II of Volume I and throughout Volume II is a direct application of Fraïssé's theory of amalgamation classes.

2020 Mathematics subject classifications. Primary 03C15. Secondary 03C10, 03C13, 05C12, 05C55, 05C63, 06F99, 20B27.

xvii





PREFACE TO VOLUME II

A comprehensive introduction to both volumes of this work is given in Volume I. We give a briefer introduction to Volume II here.

In Volume I we considered two classification problems, the classification of the homogeneous ordered graphs and the classification of metrically homogeneous graphs, in Parts I and II respectively. We gave a full solution to the first problem and provided an explicit catalog and conjecture, a body of relevant theory, and some applications in Part II. Additional work in Amato, Cherlin, and Macpherson [2021] confirms the conjecture in diameter 3 and further discussion of the prospects for the general case is found in the appendix to Volume I.

As we explained in the preface to Volume I, the work in that volume together with the work in diameter 3 casts some light on the classification of the homogeneous structures with two pairs of anti-symmetric 2-types or with 3 symmetric 2-types, which we call 2-multi-tournaments or 3-multi-graphs, respectively. The task of the present volume is to see where exactly these results leave us, with respect to the broader problems. Clarifying this point requires us to undertake some further substantial explorations, some of which might be considered logically prior to the material of Volume I, from the point of view of a systematic study.

Recall that we work throughout with amalgamation classes in accordance with the Fraïssé theory, which amounts to characterizing homogeneous structures by their forbidden substructures. We call a homogeneous structure 3-constrained if the minimal forbidden substructures have order at most 3. In dealing with explicit classification problems for binary relational languages, leaving aside the specialized techniques useful for some particular classes (such as finite structures), the general approach to making a catalog (potential classification) of homogeneous structures and investigating its completeness is the following.

- 1. Classify the 3-constrained homogeneous structures of the desired type.
- 2. Show that, with few exceptions, the triangle constraints in any homogenous structure of the desired type agree with the triangle constraints in some 3-constrained structure.

xix



XX

PREFACE TO VOLUME II

- 3. In all cases for which the triangle constraints are inconsistent with free amalgamation, classify the resulting structures, which are considered to be of exceptional type from the point of view of the general problem.
- 4. In the remaining case, show, again with few exceptions, that the remaining homogeneous structures are associated with free amalgamation classes.

If this last step ever breaks down—as well it might—we should see something distinctly new appearing. However our focus now is on the first three steps.

The first step was actually carried out in Cherlin [1998], with computer assistance. In the case of 2-multi-tournaments we have to redo this by an explicit argument in order to prepare the way properly for step (2).

One notices that the work carried out in Part I of Volume I and in Amato, Cherlin, and Macpherson [2021] bears specifically on instances of step (3) in each of the two contexts, and that there are indeed some other points that have to be addressed in order to draw definite conclusions as to where the broader classification stands.

This explains why we felt the present volume was necessary. We had thought it would be a supplementary third part to the two parts of Volume I, but discovered that there was a great deal of unfinished business still to be taken care of to bring this to a satisfactory state.

What was achieved, and how, will be described in considerable detail in Chapter 18 (we continue the numbering of chapters, and of open problems, from Volume I). Here we give an overview.

The results for homogeneous 3-multi-graphs are quite satisfactory. They occupy Chapter 19, and are summarized in §19.4. We find that an unknown homogeneous 3-multigraph must be infinite and primitive, and the only forbidden triangles are monochromatic (mainly due to the classification theorem of Amato, Cherlin, and Macpherson [2021], as well as prior classifications in finite and imprimitive cases). These constraints must also be compatible with free amalgamation. With this as a point of departure one may expect, or in any case hope, to find that what remains are in fact free amalgamation classes. At that stage, the powerful classical methods of Lachlan and Woodrow may well become relevant.

On the other hand, in the case of 2-multi-tournaments, we find we have a good deal more work to do. At the end of our analysis four very recalcitrant cases remain, which do not correspond to 3-constrained examples and therefore should, conjecturally, be eliminated.

To begin with, there is no prior classification of homogeneous 2-multitournaments in the imprimitive case, so we supply one in Chapter 20. Then we give a proof of the classification of the 3-constrained homogeneous 2-multitournaments (Chapter 21). This is needed because we require more than the resulting list of examples—we need to understand why there are no other examples under the strong assumption of 3-constraint. The next challenge



PREFACE TO VOLUME II

xxi

is to reach the same conclusion concerning triangle constraints under the assumption of homogeneity alone.

Here a lengthy analysis of the possible patterns of forbidden triangles leads to the identification of four potentially exceptional cases, not corresponding to 3-constrained structures, but not yet ruled out. See Proposition 22.1.1 and §22.8, as well as §22.9.1.

If one uses explicit amalgamation arguments as we do here, one finds that the exceptional cases are the ones for which every amalgamation diagram on five points can be completed, but not every such diagram on six points can be. In all other cases one can use a series of amalgamation diagrams of order at most five to carry out the analysis; these have factors of order four which while compatible with the triangle constraints may or may not embed in the given structure, but in all cases one arrives eventually at a contradiction.

Leaving aside these four delicate cases—that is, moving on to step (3) of our plan—and returning to the patterns of forbidden triangles which *do correspond* to a 3-constrained class without free amalgamation, and which are *not already covered by Part I*: these are the seven examples shown in Table 21.1, under Groups III and IV, labeled 6–12 (as part of a longer list given earlier).

Now Proposition 22.4.1 gives the classification of the homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments falling under case #12 in Table 21.1. So in order to reach what one may consider the generic case of the classification problem for homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments, one must not only eliminate the four exotic patterns of forbidden triangles already identified, but complete six additional classification problems defined by patterns of forbidden triangles which correspond to 3-constrained homogeneous 2-multi-tournaments. We have not assessed the complexity of these problems. The ones treated in Part I of Volume I were complex, the one just mentioned as case #12 is relatively straightforward, and the rest deserve further study.

Princeton, August 2021





ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful to Lionel Nguyen Van Thé for raising the question treated in Part I of Volume I in summer 2012. This did not strike me immediately as a reasonable question, but my inability to articulate a concrete objection soon forced me to take it seriously. I am also grateful to Miodag Sokić for drawing my attention to the article by Dolinka and Mašulović [2012] in Fall 2013.

With regard to the material of Part II of Volume I, I first encountered the problem of classifying countable metrically homogeneous graphs in Moss [1992], then found the discussion in Cameron [1998] very stimulating, and found evidence in Kechris, Pestov, and Todorcevic [2005] that the problem was natural from several other points of view.

Much of my fascination with the classification of homogeneous structures can be traced back to Alistair Lachlan. I have long enjoyed his understated enthusiasm, his gift for turning examples into theories, and his fearlessness.

In the course of preparing this text, remarks by Dugald Macpherson on the content and Jan Hubička on the literature were very helpful.

Lately Braunfeld, Coulson, Evans, Hubička, Konečný, Nešetřil, and Simon have been among those who have complicated my life by telling me interesting things outside the scope of the monograph that nonetheless deserved mention here and there. A good deal of that found its way into the appendix to Volume I. That list could be longer, but one has to stop somewhere.

I greatly appreciate the careful work done by a number of anonymous referees, as should the reader. (This applies with particular force to Volume II.)

For that matter, I also appreciate the work done by an anonymous referee on Amato, Cherlin, and Macpherson [2021] and the impetus provided to us jointly to reflect further on the path forward with regard to the classification of metrically homogeneous graphs.

I thank Stewart Cherlin for editing the family photographs used as a frontispiece to be suitable for reproduction in black and white.

And I take this opportunity to acknowledge, for once, my lifelong debt to Donald Knuth for the years he took off to make TEX work.

xxiii



xxiv

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Amélie and Grégoire provided regular and varied distractions; le petit Nicolas came in at the end with music and dance. S. L. Huang was a source of additional entertainment. Christiane and Rufus provided their famous hospitality, and Chantal kept it all together.

Research supported by the Hausdorff Institute for Mathematics, Bonn, Fall 2013 and again in Fall 2018, and by a series of grants from the NSF, including DMS-1362974.