# Contents

Preface xvii

**Preface Summary:** 

Gives a short outline of the book and its aims and addresses some other areas of relevance.

- A Brief Outline of the Book xvii
- The Trajectory of the Book xviii
- Who the Book Is For xviii
- Where the Book Came From xviii
- Language xviii
- Identity and Standpoint xix

Acknowledgements XX

# Introduction

'Classic' and 'Romantic' in Psychiatry 1 1

### **Chapter Summary:**

Introduces and elaborates a distinction between the 'classic' and 'romantic' perspectives. Contextualises the terms using Goethe's idea of 'world literature'. Draws out qualities such as the 'Olympian detachment' of the classic perspective and the temporality, self-awareness and will to action of the romantic perspective with right and left political hues. Explores prototypes both in and out of psychiatry and outlines how the perspectives will be used in the book.

- Introduction
- Clarifying Terms 2
- The Classic Perspective (with Prototypes)
- The Romantic Perspective (with Prototypes) 5 7
- Further Elaborations
- The Psychiatric Context 11

1

- Classic Psychiatry 11
- Romantic Psychiatry 12
- Approach to and Pictures of the Classic–Romantic Relationship 13

x Contents

# Part I – Towards Psychiatric Formulation

# 2 What Is Phenomenology? 17

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Starts with phenomena patients report and discusses the interpretative challenge. Addresses two meanings of phenomenology: one from philosophy and one from descriptive psychopathology in medicine. Discusses the use some romantic psychiatrists have made of philosophical phenomenology to understand 'the worlds' of patients.

- Problems of Interpretation 18
- What Is Phenomenology? 20
- Phenomenology in Philosophy: Husserl, Scheler and Heidegger 20
- Phenomenology in Psychiatry: Signs and Symptoms 23
  - Signs and Symptoms 23
- The World of the Patient 25

# 3 Applying Phenomenology 29

## **Chapter Summary:**

Elaborates the meaning of descriptive psychopathology given by the psychiatrist/philosopher Karl Jaspers. Presents phenomena of 'bizarreness' often taken to indicate the puzzling condition of schizophrenia. Applies philosophical thought experiments to these phenomena drawing on the work of Louis Sass and John Cutting which press beyond Jaspers' understanding of schizophrenia. Gives recommendations on the future of psychiatric phenomenology.

- Jaspers' Psychiatric Phenomenology 29
- Phenomenological Approach to Presentations of Bizarreness 33
- Radical Philosophical Understanding 37
  - Passivity Symptoms 41
  - Second-Personal Feeling in Encounters with People with Schizophrenia (Rümke's Reflections) 41
  - Self-Reference in Judge Schreber's Memoir 42
  - Delusional Misidentification 42
  - The Perplexing Cases 2 and 3 42
- Limits of Radical Philosophical Understanding 43
- The Future of Psychiatric Phenomenology 44

Contents

xi

### 4 Why Classify in Psychiatry?: 'Meddling Intellect' 46

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Presents classification debates in psychiatry historically as a struggle between the classic perspective, which seeks to classify, and the romantic perspective, which rebels against classification. Presents the DSM-III project as an achievement of the classic perspective which resolved one crisis only to bring forth another.

- Origins of Psychiatric Classification 46
- What Is Diagnosis? 49
- Pro and Anti-diagnosis 50
- Crisis in Anti-diagnosis 51
- Reliability Is the Idea! The DSM-III Project 53
- Reliability for What? 58
- Search for the Biological Validity of Categories 59

#### 5 Taming the Classification Mindset 63

#### Chapter Summary:

Presents various reactions to the crisis in the DSM-5 project and how they coalesce around the idea that dimensionality is *the* way to classify mental disorder. This idea is then subject to some historical analysis and recommendations are made about how to balance future debate on classification, drawing upon both the classic and romantic perspectives.

- Crisis in DSM-5
   63
- Dimensions Are the Idea! 64
- Categories Versus Dimensions 65
- Taming the Classification Mindset 70

#### 6 Understanding and Explaining in the Psychiatric Assessment: Two Worlds 72

#### **Chapter Summary:**

A distinction between types of methods (understanding and explanation) that generate different kinds of evidence relevant to the psychiatric assessment is characterised. The distinction is animated with both non-clinical and clinical examples and exercises. Scepticism about the distinction is addressed and three influential systems of psychiatric knowledge which collapse/merge understanding and explanation in different ways are discussed. The argument is made that the distinction (analogous to the romantic/classic distinction) resurfaces and is compelling. However, another challenge becomes important – holism in psychiatric assessment – which the understanding/explanation distinction leaves in an unsatisfactory state.

1	xii	Contents	

- The Distinction Between Understanding and Explanation (with a Non-clinical Exercise) 72
  - Understanding 72
  - Explaining 80
- Understanding and Explanation in a Clinical Exercise 82
- Collapsing the Understanding/Explanation Distinction in Psychiatry
   84
  - The Freudian Solution 84
  - The Cognitive Neuroscience Solution 85
  - The Big Data Science Solution 87
- Reflections
   88

# 7 Case Formulation: Holism in Psychiatry 90

### Chapter Summary:

Traces the history of the biopsychosocial model, the concept of diagnostic hierarchy and the role of 'Verstehen' (or intersubjective meaning grasping) in the psychiatric assessment. All three of these holistic concepts are considered relevant to the practice of case formulation. Responding to challenges aimed at these concepts, it is argued that they can be rethought and defended, and some recommendations are given for a renewed practice of formulation which balances the classic and the romantic perspectives.

- The Biopsychosocial Model 91
- The Causal Nexus: The Connections Between Phenomena 97
- The Diagnostic Hierarchy 98
- Verstehen Psychiatry: Meaning 102
- What Is Formulation? 104

# Part II – Psychiatry and Ethics

# 8 Suicide: Social Entanglement 107

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Considers suicide (or intentional self-killing) both from the perspective of psychiatry, where it affords risk formulation, and from the perspective of self-determination, where, increasingly, it is viewed in terms of a human right. Maps the imbalances in both mental disorderonly and autonomy-only views of suicide and the deep complexities of policy-making in this area as society thinks anew. Some recommendations are made about calibrating suicide risk formulation and deliberating assisted suicide.

Contents xiii

- Part 1 Suicide and Mental Disorder 108
  - Suicide Risk 109
  - Predicting the Suicide of an Individual 111
  - Zero Suicide 112
  - Suicide Risk Formulation 112
- Part 2 Suicide and Freedom 113
  - Assisted Dying/Suicide 114
  - Suicide Out of Psychiatric Context 116
- Entanglement and Policy Dilemmas 118

### 9 Mental Capacity: Mental Disorder/Disability and Freedom 121

#### Chapter Summary:

Introduces the concept of mental capacity as a key meeting point between human freedom and mental disorder/disability. Discusses the emergence of a functional idea of mental capacity, away from a status or outcome test. Gives an account of how the functional idea has been operationalised in mainly US–UK law and field tested in cases before a specialised court in England. Views this process as a classic one involving the public use of reason within a parliamentary democracy. Shows that an important romantic concern about the functional test (namely, that it overlooks the emotional or valuational aspects of human nature with an intellectual bias) is ameliorated. Introduces ongoing capacity debates, which are developed further in Chapter 10.

- Freedom 121
- Mental Disorder/Disability and Freedom 122
- The Pushback 123
- Status and Outcome 125
- Mental Capacity for What? (The Functional Idea) 126
- Intellectual Bias? 128
- Public Use of Reason 131

### 10 Mental Capacity: Imagining the Future 133

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Continues the discussion of mental capacity with expansion of the debates brought by the romantic perspective. Presents the political demand for radical equality coming from left romanticism, with its wild 'abolitionist' agenda on the one hand, and a seeding of some new social approaches to capacity assessment on the other. A deeper inquiry into mental capacity and mood disorder using romantic ideas of temporality is presented as additional stimulus for the evolution of mental capacity. Some characteristics of mental capacity that fit it to a 'super concept' are explained which may guide future interdisciplinary research and teaching.

Т

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-21253-3 — Psychiatry and Human Nature Gareth S. Owen Table of Contents More Information

xiv
-----

- The Demand for Radical Equality 133
- Progressive Realisation of Universal Legal Capacity 136
- Mood and Future 137
- Romantic Mental Capacity Assessment 143
- Mental Capacity As a 'Superconcept' 143

### 11 Treatment with and without Mutuality: Care Relationships 145

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Addresses the doctor-patient relationship in the context of historical and current considerations of psychiatric authority as well as patient self-determination and loss of mental capacity. Develops a model of the doctor-patient relationship in terms of mental capacity and identifies associated negative and positive psychological processes. Views change and adaptability as both realities and sources of hope. Suggests that the pre-modern Hippocratic relationship is now unworkable and that the doctor-patient relationship in the modern state is out of equilibrium whilst still at the heart of care. Recommends that better understanding the doctor-patient relationship within the modern state is a priority for psychiatric ethics.

- Paternalism and Benevolent Authority 145
- Power Imbalance: Radical Views 147
- Shared Decision-Making: Choice and Voice 149
- The Challenge of Severe Mental Illness 152
- Models of the Psychiatrist–Patient Relationship 157
- Change and Adaptability 160
- Challenges of the Doctor–Patient Relationship 161

# Conclusion

#### 12 Psychiatry and Human Nature 164

#### **Chapter Summary:**

Urges psychiatry to get back to human nature because the concept, together with the idea of human freedom and classic and romantic perspectives, is required to calibrate the normal and the pathological in psychiatry. Highlights balance by showing how 'sickly' (Goethe) pictures of human nature and human freedom have adverse effects on psychiatry, including its interface with political life. Revisits the classic and romantic perspectives, considering them in and out of balance in different ways. Distils a tripartite picture of the relationships between human nature, human freedom and mental disorder relevant to future research and teaching on psychiatric formulation and psychiatric ethics.

	Contents	X۱
• Calibrating the Normal and the Pathological 165		
Ideas of Human Nature: Steering from Sickly Pictures 165		
Concepts of Human Freedom: Avoiding Sickly Pictures 168		
Classic and Romantic In and Out of Balance 170		
• The Organism As a Condition for World-Openness 171		
<ul> <li>Balancing Right and Left Romanticism 173</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>Parliaments as a Condition for Political Balance 174</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>Universities In and Out of Balance 176</li> </ul>		
• Recapitulation and Some Thoughts for the Future of Psychia	try 178	
	,	
Index 181		