THE ORIGINS OF KANT'S AESTHETICS

Organized around eight themes central to aesthetic theory today, this book examines the sources and development of Kant's aesthetics by mining his publications, correspondence, handwritten notes, and university lectures. Each chapter explores one of the following themes: aesthetic judgment and normativity, formal beauty, conceptual beauty, artistic creativity or genius, the fine arts, the sublime, ugliness and disgust, and humor. Robert Clewis considers how Kant's thought was shaped by authors such as Christian Wolff, Alexander Baumgarten, Georg Meier, Moses Mendelssohn, Johann Sulzer, Johann Herder, Francis Hutcheson, David Hume, Edmund Burke, Henry Home, Charles Batteux, Jean-Jacques Rousseau, and Voltaire. His study uncovers and illuminates the complex development of Kant's aesthetic theory and will be useful to advanced students and scholars in fields across the humanities and studies of the arts.

ROBERT R. CLEWIS is the author of *The Kantian Sublime and the Revelation of Freedom* (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and *Kant's Humorous Writings: An Illustrated Guide* (2020) and the editor of *Reading Kant's Lectures* (2015) and *The Sublime Reader* (2019).

THE ORIGINS OF KANT'S AESTHETICS

ROBERT R. CLEWIS Gwynedd Mercy University





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009209427

DOI: 10.1017/9781009209403

© Robert R. Clewis 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Clewis, Robert R., 1977– author. TITLE: The origins of Kant's aesthetics / Robert R. Clewis. DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022029795 (print) | LCCN 2022029796 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009209427 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009209434 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009209403 (epub) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804 | Aesthetics. | Philosophy, German–18th century CLASSIFICATION: LCC B2799.A4 c54 2023 (print) | LCC B2799.A4 (ebook) | DDC 111/.85–dc23/eng/20221021 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022029796

ISBN 978-1-009-20942-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

In memory of Chester McConnell Thompson

CONTENTS

List of Figures viii Acknowledgments ix A Note on Citations xii List of Abbreviations xiii Introduction 1 PART I Aesthetic Judgment and Beauty 21 On Rules of Taste 23 1 2 Beauty Free 51 **Beauty Grounded** 70 3 Genius and the Fine Arts PART II 101 Genius, Thick and Thin 4 103 Classifying the Fine Arts 129 5 PART III Negative and Positive States 149 6 Meet the Sublime Now: It's a Negative Pleasure 151 7 Ugliness and Disgust: Disagreeable Sensations 179 Playing with Humor 8 211 **Closing Reflections** 241 Bibliography 243 Index 258

FIGURES

- 5.1 Classification of the arts 131
- 8.1 The aesthetic arts 224

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful for the permission to use passages or sections (revised and adapted) from the following publications:

Chapter 1: Robert R. Clewis, "The Sources and Development of Kant's Views on Aesthetic Normativity," *Contemporary Studies in Kantian Philosophy* 4 (2019): 1–19.

Chapter 3: Robert R. Clewis, "Beauty and Utility in Kant's Aesthetics: The Origins of Adherent Beauty," *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 56, no. 2 (2018): 305–36.

Chapter 6: Robert R. Clewis, "The Majesty of Cognition: The Sublime in Baumgarten, Mendelssohn, and Kant," in *Baumgarten's Aesthetics: Historical and Philosophical Perspectives*, ed. J. Colin McQuillan (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2021), 241–72.

Chapter 8: Robert R. Clewis, *Kant's Humorous Writings: An Illustrated Guide* (London: Bloomsbury, 2020).

This book came into existence, alas, in a time of Covid-19. I am grateful to everyone who made its publication possible despite the countless stresses caused by a global pandemic.

I have incurred innumerable debts to those who have shaped my understanding of Kant's aesthetics and his intellectual development. Any list of the individuals to whom I am indebted will surely be inadequate.

For their suggestions or comments, or in various ways shaping this book, I would like to thank Uygar Abaci, Karl Ameriks, Lydia Amir, Henny Blomme, Jane Boddy, Karin de Boer, Emily Brady, Reinhard Brandt, Javier Burdman, Noël Carroll, John Carvalho, Loraine Clewis, Rick Clewis, Jennifer Dobe, Ivan Drpić, Corey Dyck, Richard Eldridge, Antonino Falduto, Susan Feagin, Serena Feloj, Luigi Filieri, Lea Fink, Luca Fonnesu, Courtney Fugate, Pablo Genazzano, Kristin Gjesdal, Paul Guyer, Espen Hammer, Jackson Hoerth, Desmond Hogan, Jonathan Johnson, David Kim, Pauline Kleingeld, Heiner Klemme, Efraín Lazos, Charles Lewis, Paulo Licht dos Santos, Robert Louden, Huaping Lu-Adler, Samantha Matherne, J. Colin McQuillan, Jennifer Mensch, Stefano Micali, Kate Moran, Pablo Muchnik, Lara Ostaric, Stephen Palmquist, Konstantin Pollok, Dennis Schulting, Elisa Schwab, Sandra Shapshay, Susan Meld Shell, Werner Stark, Michela Summa, Oliver Thorndike, Edgar Valdez, x

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-20942-7 — The Origins of Kant's Aesthetics Robert R. Clewis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Bart Vandenabeele, Ian Verstegen, Achim Vesper, Michael Weiß, Reed Winegar, Mary Wiseman, John Zammito, Melissa Zinkin, and Günter Zöller.

Hilary Gaskin was a constant source of support at all stages of this project. I am indebted to the anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press for their astute advice on the proposal and typescript. Many thanks to Donna Smyrl for helping design the two figures. Antje Kühnast read a late draft of the book, and Seydel Acuña and Sarah Kim helped me with some of the proofreading. All of this book's remaining errors and infelicities are of course my own.

The very early stages of the book were in part supported by an Alexander von Humboldt Foundation fellowship at the University of Munich (LMU). I am grateful to Günter Zöller for assisting me during my stay, which led to my editing a volume, *Reading Kant's Lectures* (2015), which in turn laid the foundation for working with Kant's lectures and literary remains as I do in the present study.

One of the pleasures of writing this book was holding and touching some of the original student transcriptions of Kant's lectures. I am grateful to the *Journal of the History of Philosophy* for awarding me a Kristeller-Popkin Travel Fellowship that made archival research possible. For access to such materials, I am indebted to the Marburger Kant-Archiv (with special thanks to Werner Stark), the Archiv der Berlin-Brandenburgischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, and Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin-Preußischer Kulturbesitz.

This book was also in part made possible by the Max Planck Institute for Empirical Aesthetics in Frankfurt am Main, where I completed several of the chapters in 2019 and early 2020, before the pandemic struck. I am grateful to Winfried Menninghaus and the Max Planck researchers with whom I discussed this project.

I would also like to thank another group in Frankfurt: scholars of Kant's philosophy at the Goethe University of Frankfurt and members of the Frankfurt Kant-Arbeitskreis. I am indebted to Marcus Willaschek, who welcomed me to Goethe University, and I profited a great deal from conversations with Gabriele Gava, Jamie Hebbeler, Achim Vesper, Christian Wenzel, and other members of the Frankfurt Kant-Arbeitskreis.

My understanding of aesthetics has been informed by the enjoyable discussions that have taken place in the Philadelphia Area Aesthetics Reading Group over the years. May the readings continue!

The last phase of the book was also in part supported by a grant from the American Council of Learned Societies.

For the lively discussion and useful comments, I would thus like to thank the organizers, commentators, and audiences where I presented earlier versions of this material, including Goethe University, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Vytautas Magnus University, and the University of Pavia (humor); the University of Würzburg (formalism); the University of Potsdam (genius); the University of Pennsylvania, LMU Munich, and the Immanuel Kant Baltic

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Federal University in Kaliningrad (fine arts); Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg and Federal University of São Carlos (normativity); and Princeton University (sublimity). Thanks, too, to the participants and audiences at the Twelfth International Kant Congress in Vienna (2015) and the Thirteenth Congress in Oslo (2019), and at the meetings of the American Society of Aesthetics and the European Society of Aesthetics.

I am very fortunate to have Michael Clinton, Donald Duclow, and Patrick Messina as friends and colleagues in the humanities at Gwynedd Mercy University, and I am grateful to Betsy Chapin, Lisa McGarry, and Mary van Brunt for their ongoing support of this project.

I would like to thank Elisa Schwab, Sofia, Giulia, and Lawrence as well as Giovanna for making this book possible.

I lost my grandfather Chester McConnell Thompson on January 23, 2021 – one of many taken by Covid-19 – and I dedicate this book to his memory.

xi

A NOTE ON CITATIONS

References to Kant's writings are from the works by Immanuel Kant published in the Academy Edition (Akademie-Ausgabe [AA]), *Kant's gesammelte Schriften* (1900–), edited by the Royal Prussian, subsequently German, then Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences, in 29 volumes, now published by Walter de Gruyter.

Following convention, references to the first *Critique (Kritik der reinen Vernunft)* use the standard A/B page numbers, where "A" refers to the first edition of 1781 and "B" to the second edition of 1787. Citations use Arabic numerals to indicate the AA volume, followed by the page. For instance, "V-Anth/Parow 25:380" refers to the Parow anthropology lecture transcription, Academy Edition volume 25, page 380. When a lecture is not published in the Academy Edition, references are to the manuscript page number. Thus, "V-Anth/Reichel ms page 83" refers to page 83 in the unedited manuscript of the anthropology lecture Reichel. Kant's *Reflexionen* (Reflections or handwritten notes) are cited by means of the abbreviation "R" followed by the conventional number of the individual Reflections provided in the Academy Edition volumes. For example, "R 1503; 1780–84; 15:805" refers to Reflection number 1503, written at some time between 1780 and 1784 and found on page 805 of AA volume 15.

Translations of Kant's writings are typically taken from the Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant (Cambridge University Press, 1992–), with occasional (silent) modifications. When the Cambridge Edition does not translate a passage, the translation is frequently my own and indicated as such.

ABBREVIATIONS

The following abbreviations of Kant's works stem from the ones adopted by the journal *Kant-Studien* (published by Walter de Gruyter in Berlin). Since most of the abbreviations refer to writings found in the Academy Edition (AA), the relevant volume (when applicable) is listed after each text.

AA	Akademie-Ausgabe
Anth	Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht (AA 07)
BDG	Der einzig mögliche Beweisgrund zu einer Demonstration des
	Daseins Gottes (AA 02)
BGSE	Bemerkungen in den Beobachutngen über das Gefühl des
	Schönen und Erhabenen (AA 20)
Br	Briefe (AA 10–13)
EEKU	Erste Einleitung in die Kritik der Urteilskraft (AA 20)
GSE	Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen und Erhabenen
	(AA 02)
Kowalewski	edition that includes V-Anth/Dohna (published in Immanuel
	Kant, Die philosophischen Hauptvorlesungen Immanuel Kants, ed.
	Arnold Kowalewski [Munich and Leipzig: Rösl, 1924])
KpV	Kritik der praktischen Vernunft (AA 05)
KrV	Kritik der reinen Vernunft (cited according to the A and
	B editions)
KU	Kritik der Urteilskraft (AA 05)
Log	Jäsche Logik (AA 09)
MS	Die Metaphysik der Sitten (AA 06)
MSI	De mundi sensibilis atque intelligibilis forma et principiis
	(Inaugural Dissertation) (AA 02)
NEV	Nachricht von der Einrichtung seiner Vorlesungen in dem
	Winterhalbenjahre von 1765–1766 (AA 02)
NG	Versuch, den Begriff der negativen Größen in die Weltweisheit
	einzuführen (AA 02)
Phil Enz	Philosophische Enzyklopädie (AA 29)
R	Reflexion (AA 14-9)

xiii

xiv	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
TG	Träume eines Geistersehers, erläutert durch die Träume der
	Metaphysik (AA 02)
UD	Untersuchung über die Deutlichkeit der Grundsätze der
	natürlichen Theologie und der Moral (AA 02)
ÜGTP	Über den Gebrauch teleologischer Principien in der Philosophie
	(AA 08)
V-Anth/Brauer	Anthropologie 1772/73 Brauer, unedited manuscript
V-Anth/Busolt	Anthropologie 1788/89 Busolt (AA 25)
V-Anth/Collins	Anthropologie 1772/73 Collins (AA 25)
V-Anth/Ding	Anthropologie Dingelstaedt, unedited manuscript
V-Anth/Dohna	Anthropologie Dohna-Wundlacken (in the Kowalewski edition)
V-Anth/Fried	Anthropologie 1775/76 Friedländer (AA 25)
V-Anth/Ham	Anthropologie Hamilton 1772/73, unedited manuscript
V-Anth/	Anthropologie 1781/82 Menschenkunde (AA 25)
Mensch	
V-Anth/Mron	Anthropologie 1784/85 Mrongovius (AA 25)
V-Anth/Parow	Anthropologie 1772/73 Parow (AA 25)
V-Anth/Phil	Anthropologie 1772/73 Philippi (AA 25)
V-Anth/Pillau	Anthropologie 1777/78 Pillau (AA 25)
V-Anth/Reichel	Anthropologie Reichel, unedited manuscript
V-Lo/Blom	Logik Blomberg (AA 24)
V-Lo/Dohna	Logik Dohna-Wundlacken (AA 24)
V-Lo/Phil	Logik Philippi (AA 24)
V-Lo/Wien	Wiener Logik (AA 24)
V-Met/Herder	Metaphysik Herder (AA 28)
V-Met/L1	Metaphysik L1 (AA 28)
V-Met/Mron	Metaphysik Mrongovius (AA 29)
V-Met/Vig	Metaphysik Vigilantius (AA 29)
V-Mo/Collins	Moralphilosophie Collins (AA 27)
V-PG/Holstein	Physische Geographie Holstein (AA 26.1)
V-PP/Herder	Praktische Philosophie Herder (AA 27)