

HYBRID SOVEREIGNTY IN WORLD POLITICS

The idea of ‘hybrid sovereignty’ describes overlapping relations between public and private actors in important areas of global power, such as contractors fighting international wars, corporations regulating global markets, or governments collaborating with nongovernmental entities to influence foreign elections. This innovative study shows that these connections—sometimes hidden and often poorly understood—underpin the global order, in which power flows without regard to public and private boundaries. Drawing on extensive original archival research, Swati Srivastava reveals the little-known stories of how this hybrid power operated at some of the most important turning points in world history: spreading the British empire, founding the United States, establishing free trade, realizing transnational human rights, and conducting twenty-first century wars. In order to sustain meaningful dialogues about the future of global power and political authority, it is crucial that we begin to understand how hybrid sovereignty emerged and continues to shape international relations.

Swati Srivastava is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Purdue University. Her research has received awards from the National Endowment for the Humanities, Andrew Mellon Foundation, American Council of Learned Societies, and International Studies Association. She is the founder of the Big Tech and Political Responsibility research lab at Purdue.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 161

Hybrid Sovereignty in World Politics

Editors

Evelyn Goh
 Christian Reus-Smit
 Nicholas J. Wheeler

Editorial Board

Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong Khong, Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Andrew Linklater, Nicola Phillips, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd, Jacquie True, Leslie Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.

- 161 Swati Srivastava
Hybrid Sovereignty in World Politics
- 160 Rohan Mukherjee
Ascending Order
 Rising Powers and the Politics of Status in International Institutions
- 159 Claire Vergerio
War, States, and International Order
 Alberico Gentili and the Foundational Myth of the Laws of War
- 158 Peter Joachim Katzenstein
Uncertainty and Its Discontents
 Worldviews in World Politics
- 157 Jessica Auchter
Global Corpse Politics
 The Obscenity Taboo
- 156 Robert Falkner
Environmentalism and Global International Society
- 155 David Traven
Law and Sentiment in International Politics
 Ethics, Emotions, and the Evolution of the Laws of War
- 154 Allison Carnegie and Austin Carson
Secrets in Global Governance
 Disclosure Dilemmas and the Challenge of International Cooperation

Series list continues after index

Hybrid Sovereignty in World Politics

SWATI SRIVASTAVA

Purdue University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20447-7 — Hybrid Sovereignty in World Politics
Swati Srivastava
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009204477

DOI: 10.1017/9781009204453

© Swati Srivastava 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-20450-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-20447-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20447-7 — Hybrid Sovereignty in World Politics
Swati Srivastava
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For my parents,
Namita and Chandra Shekhar Srivastava

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiv
Introduction	1
A Foundational Myth	4
The Argument	6
Plan of the Book	10
1 Hybrid Sovereignty in International Theory	12
<i>Idealized Sovereignty</i>	16
Conceptualizing <i>Idealized Sovereignty</i> in Early Modern Thought	16
Experimenting with <i>Idealized Sovereignty</i> in the Founding of America	20
<i>Idealized Sovereignty</i> in IR	25
<i>Lived Sovereignty</i>	28
Evolution in Sovereign Functions	28
Conceptualizing <i>Lived Sovereignty</i>	30
<i>Lived Sovereignty</i> in IR	32
Hybrid Sovereignty	34
Conclusion	39
2 Ideal-Types of Public/Private Hybridity	40
Public/Private Hybridity in Global Governance	43
Did the Medieval Law Merchant Exist?	48
The Logic of Ideal-Types	50
Ideal-Types of Public/Private Hybridity	55
Research Design	62
Methodology	63

	Cases	64
	Conclusion	69
3	Hybrid Sovereign Empire in the English East India Company	70
	Seeing Like a Company-State	74
	Emergence of Sovereign Competence in the Company	76
	First Transformation: EIC Cycling through Ideal-Types of Public/Private Hybridity	79
	<i>Contractual Hybridity</i>	82
	<i>Institutional Hybridity</i>	86
	<i>Shadow Hybridity</i>	91
	Second Transformation: Company Sovereignty Shifts from Privilege to Right	94
	Emerging Desires for Self-Possessed Company Sovereignty	95
	Establishing Self-Possessed Company Sovereignty	98
	Clashes of <i>Idealized</i> and <i>Lived Sovereignty</i> in EIC's Corporate Empire on Trial	105
	Conclusion	110
4	Contracting American Wars through Blackwater	112
	Sovereignty under Contract	116
	The Post-9/11 Contractor Force	118
	Blackwater in American Total Force	121
	Sovereign Dilemmas in <i>Contractual Hybridity</i>	124
	Weber and the Monopoly over Legitimate Use of Force	124
	Distributed Accountability	127
	Politics of Distributed Accountability	131
	Constructing "Inherently Governmental"	138
	The Bureaucratic State of American Contracting	138
	Defining Inherently Governmental	141
	Conclusion	146
5	Institutionalizing Markets through the International Chamber of Commerce	147
	Limiting Corporate Responsibility	152
	Delegitimizing NGOs	155
	The Global Compact	157
	Norms and Guiding Principles on Corporate Responsibility for Human Rights	158
	Agenda-Setting on Trade and Investment	161
	Early Lessons with the ITO	161
	Working with the GATT	163

Failing Upward with the MAI	165
“Self-Governance” in Rulemaking	167
Policy Commissions and Standards	167
Constructing Commercial Crime	172
Sovereign Dilemmas in <i>Institutional Hybridity</i>	176
Championing “Palm Tree Justice” in International Arbitration	176
Politics of Exclusivity in Arbitration	181
Conclusion	184
6 Shadowing for Human Rights through Amnesty International	185
Building a Global Polity	190
Getting Its Foot in the Door	192
Campaign for the Abolition of Torture	196
Imposing American Responsibility	200
Solidifying the Polity in Cold War Politics	202
Projecting Moral Purity	204
Impartial Research Expertise	206
Government Independence	209
Sovereign Dilemmas in <i>Shadow Hybridity</i>	211
Financing Help to Exit a Crisis	212
Leveraging Access and Advocacy through a Diplomatic Network	216
Bargaining for Access and Reforms in Closed Countries	220
Politics of Mistrust in Realizing Human Rights	224
Conclusion	228
7 Conclusions on Power and Responsibility in Hybrid Sovereignty	229
Reconsidering Sovereign Power	230
New Challenges to Sovereign Irresponsibility	232
Structural Responsibility and Hybrid Subjectivity	236
<i>References</i>	240
<i>Index</i>	278

Figures

1.1	Hybrid sovereignty	<i>page</i> 36
2.1	Ideal-types of public/private hybridity	43
3.1	Number of sovereign functions in EIC charters, 1600–1780	77
3.2	Number and types of sovereign functions in EIC charters, 1600–1780	78
3.3	Main EIC charters in year, 1678–1780	79
3.4	EIC general court special sessions, 1678–1780	80
3.5	Number of EIC MP-directors by year, 1678–1780	81
3.6	EIC special sessions, MP-directors, and main charters, 1678–1780	83
3.7	EIC forced loans or fiscal extractions in year, 1678–1780	84
3.8	EIC forced loans/fiscal extractions and main charters in year, 1678–1780	85
3.9	Number of crown and commons special sessions, 1678–1780	88
3.10	Type of EIC legal cases as plaintiff by year, 1650–1880	95
3.11	Frequency of major EIC wars by year, 1600–1800	99
3.12	Frequency of discussion of EIC’s sovereign rights in director meetings by year, 1750–1775	101
4.1	Value of Blackwater federal contracts in millions (USD), 2001–2008	114
4.2	US government prime contract spending in inflation-adjusted billions (USD), 1984–2018	117

Tables

2.1	Characteristics of ideal-types of public/private hybridity	<i>page</i> 56
4.1	Ratio of contractors to troops in major American wars	113
5.1	Sample ICC rules and standards as represented by the organization	169

Acknowledgments

Reading the right book at the right time is life-steering. The three books that steered me toward this project are not obviously connected. David Foster Wallace's *Infinite Jest* stirred me to write about complex relations; Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* confirmed that I had valuable things to say; Alex Wendt's *Social Theory of International Politics* made me feel less alone. This book would not have been possible without them.

The steering continued past these origins. Ian Hurd trusted me to pursue a project of immense ambition. He alternately let me run wild and queried my wildness, always at the necessary times. His imprints of *how* to think about politics are on every page of this book without any imposition of *what* to think. With Mary Dietz, I ruminated on conceptualizing the problems of sovereign power and how they escape easy resolutions. Jim Mahoney guided in organizing case materials and proved a model for mapping the metaphorical larger forest from the details of specific trees. Bruce Carruthers encouraged exploration in various archives and offered support in corralling the different stories into coherent narratives.

Deborah Avant, Sammy Barkin, Virginia Haufler, Ian Hurd, Stephen Krasner, and Hendrik Spruyt participated energetically in a book workshop held at Purdue University in summer 2019. I especially thank Steve for his generous reading of the argument, Hendrik for his detailed constructive comments, Debbi and Sammy for thoughtful marginalia, and Ian and Virginia for helping place the workshop feedback in context. I also thank Ann Clark for providing written comments. Lejla Dervisevic and Lauren Muscott were excellent graduate participants and rapporteurs. I am grateful to Eric Waltenburg, interim department head, and Purdue's College of Liberal Arts for funding the workshop.

Others too assisted in this journey. From courses and conversations at Northwestern, Ana Arjona, Wendy Espeland, Beth Hurd, Steve Nelson, Will Reno, Andrew Roberts, Hendrik Spruyt, and Jessica Winegar shared insights on tackling the intricacies of political distinctions. The International Studies Association (ISA)-Northeast crew of Sammy Barkin, Harry Gould, Patrick

Acknowledgments

xv

Thaddeus Jackson, Dan Levine, Dan Nexon, Laura Sjoberg, and Brent Steele provided fierce mentorship. Siba Grovogui, Michelle Jurkovic, Jennifer Mitzen, and Jelena Subotic read the entire manuscript and pushed for necessary revisions at the 2018 ISA-Northeast Scholars' Circle. I also thank Andrew Ross for inviting me as the Circle's honoree. Bentley Allan, Cecelia Lynch, and Joshua Shiffrinson offered fantastic advice on the book submission process. Patrick Jackson's feedback on Chapter 2 came at the right moment. Special thanks to Arjun Chowdhury for helping with the revisions. Gary Herrigel, Anne Holthoefer, and Michael Reese were the original shepherds of these ideas in a master's thesis at the University of Chicago. My high school English teacher and debate coach, Yen-Yen Chiu, was the first to encourage me to analyze arguments and write them. Mr. Ireland's drama class introduced me to the poem I use as an epigraph in the Introduction.

Humboldt State University was a great short-lived intellectual home as a new faculty member embarking on manuscript revisions. Purdue University continues to be so. I thank my department colleagues for their encouragement, advice, and Wine Wednesdays. I have benefited immensely from my mentorship committee: Ann Clark, Rosie Clawson, and Keith Shimko. Cherie Maestas has been a generous department head. A shout-out to the junior faculty: Tara Grillos, Kyle Haynes, Molly Scudder, Logan Strother, Joan Timoneda, Giancarlo Visconti, Zach Warner, and Melissa Will. I also thank my graduate students for their engagement with the manuscript in seminars.

My peers were equally inspiring. Early drafts benefited from the feedback of participants of the Northwestern International Relations Working Group. Mariana Borges, Giuseppe Cumella, Gina Giliberti, and Sidra Hamidi were relentless in their friendship. Bantering with Josh Freedman led to many new ideas in these pages. In Erin Lockwood I found a similar drive and interpretive focus to study practical international politics and corporate power. Mara Suttman-Lea offered equal parts respite and motivation in our weekly writing group meetings in the final two graduate school years. Sofia Fenner, Spencer Headworth, and Aditi Shirodkar traded notes from the field. From ISA-Northeast again, Yoni Abrahamson, deRaismes Combes, and Simon Pratt were excellent conspirators in forming a supportive and enduring coalition.

Many others played a crucial role. The Andrew Mellon Foundation and the American Council of Learned Societies financially supported writing and research, as did Northwestern's Buffett Institute for Global Studies, the Graduate School, and the Political Science Department. Over the years, many archivists at national libraries and organizations gave their time to locate, hold, and scan materials. I especially thank Stéphanie Torkomyan. I received generous feedback at the London School of Economics, University of Notre Dame, University of Chicago, Boston University, University of Warwick, and University of Cambridge. Coffee shops and musicians helped fuel the writing. The Coffee Studio in Chicago is a jewel.

At Cambridge University Press, I thank John Haslam for ably shepherding the project during a pandemic. I also express gratitude to two anonymous reviewers for their generous and constructive feedback. Joining the Cambridge Studies in International Relations series is a dream come true.

Portions of the book have appeared in previous publications, including “Corporate Responsibility,” *Oxford Research Encyclopaedia of International Studies* (2020); “How to Hold Unjust Structures Responsible in International Relations,” with Lauren Muscott, *International Studies Quarterly* (2021); “Navigating NGO–Government Relations in Human Rights: New Archival Evidence from Amnesty International, 1961–1986,” *International Studies Quarterly* (2022); and “Corporate Sovereign Awakening and the Making of Modern State Sovereignty: New Archival Evidence from the English East India Company,” *International Organization* (2022).

Outside academia, friends and family were gracious enough to pretend to care about unclear typologies. Claire Mueller, Marina Kato, Christina Lee, Amber North, Shibani Rajadhyksha, Austin Rubino, Ashley Russell, Vanessa Soma, and Soren Sudhof stepped in and out of ongoing conversations over the years, picking up where we left off. My grandfathers, Sirish Chandra Mathur and J. P. Srivastava, eagerly followed my progress. Aunts, uncles, and cousins in New Delhi, Mumbai, Sydney, and San Diego offered encouragement along the way. Vera and Anil Kripalani, in particular, helped arrange and accommodate my family’s initial move to the United States. Susan and Bruce McElhattan engaged good-naturedly with my research (even sitting through a practice job talk!) and provided nourishing food, drink, and company at every available opportunity from Pittsburgh to Puerto Vallarta. John McElhattan and Matt Elwell helped tremendously with the fun factor. Amand Srivastava shared my love of research, albeit not of a political kind, and his generous and gregarious spirit always uplifted me at the right moments. Welcoming Divya Mathur to the family was a joyful distraction from revisions.

My parents, Namita and Chandra Shekhar Srivastava, have started over many lives to give me one worth living. They have changed and left jobs, foregone educational opportunities, moved across four continents, separated from their loved ones, all to provide a stable home and create a wider universe of options for my brother and me. As an international civil servant, my father can relate to the many lived experiences in these pages and feel the politics of hybridity more intuitively than I ever could. My research is driven in part to explain his reality and the many like him. My mother is the source of all my confidence. Her warmth, compassion, humor, and resilience are contagious, even though she remains unmatched. My parents audaciously believed in and fought for my future. I dedicate this book to them.

Finally, David McElhattan is the concentrated form of all my inspirations and loves. He helps me untangle Latourian diagrams, gin cocktails, late ‘60s rock,

Acknowledgments

xvii

David Lynch, The Bachelor franchise, and many other mysteries of life. His observations and unparalleled articulations of social problems have sharpened mine. His support, in work and play, was uncompromising and indispensable. I thank him most of all for steering me through my daily routines of writing about the world and navigating it.