

A PHILOSOPHER LOOKS AT SCIENCE

What is science and what can it do? Nancy Cartwright here takes issue with three common images of science: that it amounts to the combination of theory and experiment; that all science is basically reducible to physics; and that science and the natural world which it pictures are deterministic. The author's innovative and thoughtful book draws on examples from the physical, life and social sciences alike, and focuses on all the products of science – not just experiments or theories – and how they work together. She reveals just what it is that makes science ultimately reliable and how this reliability is nevertheless still compatible with a view of nature as more responsive to human change than we might think. Her book is a call for greater intellectual humility by and within scientific institutions. It will have strong appeal to anyone who thinks about science and how it is practised in society.

NANCY CARTWRIGHT is Professor of Philosophy at Durham University and Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. Her publications include *The Dappled World: A Study of the Boundaries of Science* (Cambridge, 1999), *Hunting Causes and Using Them: Approaches in Philosophy and Economics* (Cambridge, 2007) and *Nature, the Artful Modeler* (2019).

A Philosopher Looks at

In this series, philosophers offer a personal and philosophical exploration of a topic of general interest.

Books in the series

Nancy Cartwright, *A Philosopher Looks at Science*

Raymond Geuss, *A Philosopher Looks at Work*

Paul Guyer, *A Philosopher Looks at Architecture*

Stephen Mumford, *A Philosopher Looks at Sport*

Onora O'Neill, *A Philosopher Looks at Digital Communication*

Michael Ruse, *A Philosopher Looks at Human Beings*

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20188-9 — A Philosopher Looks at Science
Nancy Cartwright
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

A PHILOSOPHER LOOKS AT
SCIENCE

NANCY CARTWRIGHT



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20188-9 — A Philosopher Looks at Science
Nancy Cartwright
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009201889

DOI: 10.1017/9781009201896

© Nancy Cartwright 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow, Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Cartwright, Nancy, author.

TITLE: A philosopher looks at science / Nancy Cartwright.

DESCRIPTION: First edition. | United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Series: A philosopher looks at | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022007041 (print) | LCCN 2022007042 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009201889 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009201896 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Science–Philosophy. | BISAC: SCIENCE / Philosophy & Social Aspects

CLASSIFICATION: LCC Q175 .C375 2022 (print) | LCC Q175 (ebook) | DDC 501–dc23/eng20220422

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022007041>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022007042>

ISBN 978-1-009-20188-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Tabi

CONTENTS

List of Figures page x

Acknowledgements xi

Introduction 2

Science = Theory + Experiment 3

It's All Physics Really 5

The Laws of Physics Fix Happenings

 Deterministically 7

What's Wrong with These Three Images? 8

1 Theory + Experiment Do Not a Science Make 12

 Preface 12

 The Centrality of Theory and Experiment, Knowledge
 and Observation 17

 The Melange of Theory Ingredients 19

 Concepts 20

 Defining Concepts 21

 Stabilising Concepts 32

 Misusing Concepts 34

 Models and Narratives 53

 Diagrams, Illustrations and Graphs 58

 Experiments and the Testing of Theory 60

 Experiments: A Life of Their Own 62

 Exploring 63

 Creating Phenomena 66

 Reconstituting Phenomena 67

CONTENTS

- You Can't Build an Experiment without a Gigantic
 Meccano Set 71
- 2 Dethroning the Queen 80
 Preface 80
 The Mechanical Philosophy and Its Legacy 83
 Physicalism and Materialism 86
 How Philosophers Talk about Reduction 89
 Type-Type Reduction 91
 Token-Token Reduction 93
 Supervenience 97
 Grounding 101
 Why Chemistry Isn't All Physics 103
 Even Physics Isn't All Physics 107
 Unity at the Point of Action 120
- 3 A Nature More Negotiable 122
 Preface 122
 Whence 'Dappled'? 126
 The Disappearance of Diversity 128
 A Contemporary Example Where
 Difference Mattered 134
 A Review of the Argument for Absolute Rule 136
 Arguing from Science to the World 140
 Where Is Physics Successful? 144
 Tendency Laws and How to Understand Them 156
 In Sum 165
- Parting Thoughts 168
 Some Starting Cases to Consider 169
 Diagnosis 177
 Take-Home Message 181
 Anthony Fauci, AIDS and the Parallel Track 182

CONTENTS

Barbara McClintock and the Right to Be Different 186
Conclusion 188

Notes 189

Bibliography 195

Index 202

FIGURES

- Frontispiece: The Meccano set of science *page* 1
- I.1 Typical children's drawing of a scientist 3
- I.2 An increasingly typical children's drawing of a scientist 4
- I.3 Another typical drawing of a scientist 5
- I.4 The pyramid of the sciences 6
- 1.1 Kites and rectangles instead of forces, masses and accelerations 30
- 1.2 A cake diagram for Person A (abused as a child) 50
- 1.3 A cake diagram for Person B (not abused as a child) 50
- 1.4 A cake diagram for Person C (abused as a child: conditions not combined) 51
- 1.5 Kinesin walking cargo down a microtubule trail 69
- 1.6 Kinesin pushing microtubule along 70
- 1.7 Millikan's own model of his measurement device 72
- 1.8 Millikan's actual apparatus 73
- 1.9 Why Millikan's and Fletcher's results constitute a measurement of the charge on a droplet 75
- 4.1 Vajont dam 170

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Little of what I say here is new. I build heavily both on the work of others and on my own earlier work. You can look to that if you want to see more detailed philosophical developments of the ideas here: *The Dappled World* (1999), *Nature, the Artful Modeler* (2019) and *The Tangle of Science* (with Jeremy Hardie, Eleonora Montuschi, Matthew Soleiman and Ann Thresher, forthcoming).

A number of people have made huge intellectual contributions to the work: Andrew Bollhagen, Omar El-Mawas, Elizabeth and Peter Fisher, Jeremy Hardie, Matthew Soleiman and Richard Vagnino. Faith Bollhagen, Lucy Charlton and Adrian Harris have contributed original drawings. Nicola Craigs, Omar El-Mawas and Matthew Soleiman have been invaluable in the final production.

This book was supported by funding from the European Research Council (ERC) and the John Templeton Foundation. The ERC funding is for *Knowledge for Use*, under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program (grant agreement No 667526 K4U). The content reflects only the authors' views, and the ERC is not responsible for any use that may be made of the information it contains. The Templeton funding is for *The Successes and Failures of Science through the Lens of Intellectual Humility: Perspectives from the History and Philosophy of Science*, ID: 62247.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20188-9 — A Philosopher Looks at Science
Nancy Cartwright
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
