

Freedom in Captivity

How do borderland dwellers living along militarised frontiers negotiate regimes of state security and their geopolitical location in everyday life? What might ‘freedom’ mean to those who do not resist captivity engendered by borders? Focusing on the predicaments of a double-minority, *Freedom in Captivity* examines the affective attachments, political imaginaries and ethical claims-making among the Shi‘a Muslims of Kargil in the union territory of Ladakh, India. In contrast to calls for freedom in the Kashmir Valley, Shi‘as on the frontiers of Kashmir have sought belonging to India. Yet they do not entirely succumb to its hegemonic ideological boundaries. Departing from the dominant focus on physical cross-border mobility, this book is an invitation to re-imagine borderlands as cartographies of ideas, cutting across spatial scales. Based on original ethnographic research conducted between 2008 and 2021, the book offers a unique *longue-durée* insight into the lives of people residing at the intersections of the biggest states in Asia.

Radhika Gupta is Assistant Professor at the Institute for Cultural Anthropology and Development Sociology, Leiden University, Netherlands. Her research interests include anthropology of religion (especially Islam), borderlands, post-colonial politics, urban anthropology, environmental humanities and critical theory.

SOUTH ASIA IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

South Asia has become a laboratory for devising new institutions and practices of modern social life. Forms of capitalist enterprise, providing welfare and social services, the public role of religion, the management of ethnic conflict, popular culture and mass democracy in the countries of the region have shown a marked divergence from known patterns in other parts of the world. South Asia is now being studied for its relevance to the general theoretical understanding of modernity itself.

South Asia in the Social Sciences will feature books that offer innovative research on contemporary South Asia. It will focus on the place of the region in the various global disciplines of the social sciences and highlight research that uses unconventional sources of information and novel research methods. While recognising that most current research is focused on the larger countries, the series will attempt to showcase research on the smaller countries of the region.

General Editor
Partha Chatterjee
Columbia University

Editorial Board
Pranab Bardhan
University of California at Berkeley

Stuart Corbridge
Durham University

Satish Deshpande
University of Delhi

Christophe Jaffrelot
Centre d'études et de recherches internationales, Paris

Nivedita Menon
Jawaharlal Nehru University

Other books in the series:

Government as Practice: Democratic Left in a Transforming India
Dwaipayan Bhattacharyya

Courting the People: Public Interest Litigation in Post-Emergency India
Anuj Bhuwania

Development after Statism: Industrial Firms and the Political Economy of South Asia
Adnan Naseemullah

Politics of the Poor: Negotiating Democracy in Contemporary India
Indrajit Roy

Nationalism, Development and Ethnic Conflict in Sri Lanka
Rajesh Venugopal

South Asian Governmentalities: Michel Foucault and the Question of Postcolonial Orderings
Stephen Legg and Deana Heath (eds.)

Adivasis and the State: Subalternity and Citizenship in India's Bhil Heartland
Alf Gunvald Nilsen

Maoist People's War and the Revolution of Everyday Life in Nepal
Ina Zharkevich

New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy: State, Class and Social Change
Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi (eds.)

Crafty Oligarchs, Savvy Voters: Democracy under Inequality in Rural Pakistan
Shandana Khan Mohmand

Dynamics of Caste and Law: Dalits, Oppression and Constitutional Democracy in India
Dag-Erik Berg

Simultaneous Identities: Language, Education and the Nepali Nation
Uma Pradhan

Deceptive Majority: Dalits, Hinduism, and Underground Religion
Joel Lee

Colossus: The Anatomy of Delhi
Sanjoy Chakravorty and Neelanjan Sircar (eds.)

When Ideas Matter: Democracy and Corruption in India
Bilal A. Baloch

In Search of Home: Citizenship, Law and the Politics of the Poor
Kaveri Haritas

Bureaucratic Archaeology: State, Science, and Past in Postcolonial India
Ashish Avikunthak

The Odds Revisited: Political Economy of the Development of Bangladesh
K. A. S. Murshid

An Uneasy Hegemony: Politics of State-building and Struggles for Justice in Sri Lanka
Shyamika Jayasundara-Smits

Founding Mothers of the Indian Republic: Gender Politics of the Framing of the Constitution
Achyut Chetan

Freedom in Captivity

Negotiations of Belonging along
Kashmir's Frontier

Radhika Gupta



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20161-2 — Freedom in Captivity
Radhika Gupta
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia
314 to 321, 3rd Floor, Plot No.3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009201612

© Radhika Gupta 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-20161-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Notes on Transliteration</i>	xvii
Introduction: Freedom in Captivity	1
1. Genealogies of Political Consciousness	32
2. Reforming Self and Society	57
3. Fighting for Justice	97
4. Talking about Culture	129
5. Living on the Edge	160
Epilogue	194
<i>Glossary</i>	201
<i>Bibliography</i>	206
<i>Index</i>	225

Figures

Map of Kargil and surrounding regions	xviii
I.1 Vijay Diwas, 2009	3
I.2 Signboard with images of Khomeini and Khamenei, 2009	11
I.3 Muharram procession, Kargil Bazaar, 2009	24
2.1 A poster of Ali Shariati in the Kargil town bazaar, 2015, saying ‘The Impact of the Revolution in Kargil Ladakh’	60
2.2 Main Bazaar, Kargil town, 2009	64
2.3 A woman shopkeeper at a kitchenware shop in Apo Bazaar, Kargil town, 2015	67
3.1 Raising fists, Khomeini’s <i>barsi</i> , 2008	100
3.2 Poster displayed at a public function in Kargil, 2008	106
3.3 Agha Hussain on a victory parade, 2008	117
3.4 Women voting in the Hill Council elections, 2008	123
4.1 The <i>chamba</i> in Apati, 2008	139
4.2 Man in a bus on Mendok Rgyaspa, Suru Valley, 2008	145
5.1 The stream that marked the erstwhile ‘border’ in Badgam, 2008	165
5.2 A gathering of poets, 2008	185

Acknowledgements

It has taken over a decade to bring this project to fruition. I faltered many times along the way, uncertain if I had anything of value to say. Had it not been for the faith reposed in me by family, friends and, above all, people in Kargil, I might not have persisted. When I embarked upon this research, everyone in Kargil was eager to tell their stories, for their voices to be heard. This book is a small gesture of gratitude for the immense learning, friendship and grace I have received from them over the years.

My introduction to Kargil was facilitated by the International Association for Ladakh Studies (IALS). I am indebted to the entire Munshi clan, especially Gulzar, Aijaz and Riaz Munshi, and Dr Fatima, for their hospitality and valuable insights into the region. The companionship of Stanzin, Lamo, Benazir and Asgar at the Munshi Habibullah School made fieldwork all the more fun. I am deeply grateful for the generous support offered by the Iqbal family who took me into their home in the cold wintertime as one of their own. I spent many joyful hours in the company of Shafiq, Shakila, Iliaz, Mustafa, Hussain (Chandu) and Sajjad. On shorter visits, the staff at Caravan Serai kept me well fed. I will always carry with me the humour, wisdom and care of Bashir and Zahra Wafa, who have unreservedly kept the doors of their home open to me. Memories of apricot excursions with Zahra hold a special place in my heart. I benefitted enormously from Rahman *sahib*'s wisdom and encouragement to always think deeper and harder and have been touched by his family's warmth. Even after the initial months of assisting me with research, Jaffar continued to be a good friend and a source of many insights. Many thanks to Fayaz Husain for his kindness and shared research trips to several villages. Sajjad Kargili has been a bedrock of support. I am immensely grateful to him for sharing his knowledge, helping with

organising my trip to Iran and the wonderful memories of journeys across the Kargil district. Thank you, comrade!

I have been fortunate to have many teachers in Kargil. Thanks to Sibte Kalim for language lessons. Along with Master Sadiq Hardasi, late Sadiq Ali Sadiq and Bashir Wafa, he also taught me much about Balti culture, helping me to imagine Baltistan. Tanvir *sabib*'s lessons in history were invaluable. Shaykh Rajai and Hajji Batul patiently explained several aspects of Islam and Shi'ism in a spirit of quiet friendship, as did Archo Fatima from Minji. I am also thankful for the time given to me by Hasan Khan, late Shaykh Ahmad Mohammadi, late Shaykh Zakiri (Imam Khomeini Memorial Trust), Agha Qasim (Saliskot), Shyakh Anwar, Nasir Munshi and Hajji Azgar Ali Karbalai. A brief stint of fieldwork in Iran in 2009 would not have been possible without the help and hospitality of Shaykh Lutfi, Hasnain and Rubab, Shaykh Zakiri, Javad *bhai* and Shahid *bhai*. The warp and weft of this book are also composed of conversations with Nazir and Ali Taq at the Jammu and Kashmir Cultural Academy, Abba Zakir, Ahmad Ali Payja (Apati), Ahmad Jawan (Drass), Akhon Fida (Sangra), Dr Raza, Hajji Mohammad Hussain and family (Lato), Hajji Tahira, Mahdi (Poyen) Mahinder Singh and family, Malik (Chanegond), Master Ali Khan and family (Purgue), Master Baqir (Pashkum), Master Gulzar and family, Master Namgyal (Wakha), late Musa Chigtan, Parveen, Rokia and Hajji Zahra (Pashkum), Ustani Hamida, Wazir Ali (Shilikitse), Zakir Ali, and the students at Dar al-Quran, especially Jina, Sakina and Zahra. I am indebted to all of them and the many others who are not mentioned here by name for their hospitality and indulgence. Many names have been anonymised in the text to protect the privacy of views that are not in the public realm.

In Leh, I am deeply grateful to Tsewang Yangjor's family and Bicky at Padma Guesthouse for their care and friendship over the years. Tashi Morup has been an abiding friend; thank you for all the brief restorative escapes to beautiful, quiet spots in and around Leh. Much gratitude to Abdul Ghani Sheikh for generously sharing his knowledge. My work has also been blessed by John Bray's sustained interest, encouragement and resourcefulness. A warm thank you to Janet and Saiyid Rizvi for their enthusiasm surrounding my research.

This book has morphed out of my DPhil dissertation at the University of Oxford. A scholarship from the UK India Education and Research Initiative (UKIERI) generously funded my PhD. I am grateful to David Gellner and Fernanda Pirie for smoothly and diligently shepherding me through the doctoral process. At different stages of writing, I was fortunate to receive generous feedback from Faisal Devji, Mohammad Talib, Paul Dresch and Sondra Hausner. My time in Oxford was enriched by the camaraderie and intellectual support of Ammara Maqsood, Jelena Baranovich, Kabir Mansingh Heimsath, Linda Fibiger Martin Saxer, Masooda Bano, Melanie Griffiths and Sandeep Sengupta.

Acknowledgements

xiii

I was fortunate to receive postdoctoral fellowships at the Max Planck Institute and the Centre for Modern Indian Studies in Göttingen. Amidst starting new research in Bombay, I luxuriated in the time to read widely and slowly rethink and start revising my Kargil work. I am grateful to Aparna Nair, Ajay Gandhi, Dag Erik Berg, Lalit Vachani, Leilah Vevaina, Michaela Dimmers, Nandagopal Menon, Nate Roberts, Neena Mahadev, Patrick Eisenlohr, Peter van der Veer, Roschanack Shaery-Yazdi, Reza Masoudi Nejad, Sebastian Schwecke, Srirupa Roy and Weishan Huang for friendship and stimulating feedback on fragments of this work. A shared interest in Shi'ism made for lively conversations with Sarover Zaidi. Many of the arguments in this book were influenced by intense discussions over delicious food with Shaheed Tayob. Without these, life in a small German town might have been unbearable.

In Leiden, I thank Nira Wickramasinghe for her support in a system that can be overwhelming. A teaching relief grant for one semester from the Leiden Institute for Area Studies enabled me to finally wrap up this manuscript. Bindu Menon, Crystal Ennis, Erik de Maaker, Martijn Boven and Sanjukta Sunderason offered valuable feedback on portions of the manuscript. Walks in the neighbourhood with Sanjukta helped crystallise many ideas. Ajay and Nandu continued to read my work at critical stages and offered constructive feedback.

I am grateful to Qudsiya Ahmed and Anwasha Rana at Cambridge University Press for appreciating my scholarship and for their professionalism. It gives me great pleasure to publish with them. The completion of this book is also an opportunity to thank my teachers at the Department of Sociology, Delhi School of Economics, whose classes and scholarship have remained a source of inspiration.

Conversations with fellow borderland travellers and scholars, Sahana Ghosh and Farhana Ibrahim, linger throughout these pages. Their feedback along the way has been invaluable. Farhana has been integral to this project from its inception to completion. Along with her, Mijin, Rohini, Sonia, Prashant and Vinayak have stood by me through a long and sometimes bumpy journey. Aparna Balachandran's humour and support and Amit Ahuja's regular nudging and advice at critical moments were crucial in persisting with writing. I have been nourished by Ned Bertz's humour, gentle support and companionship. He has also patiently read and corrected messy portions of this manuscript.

Latika Gupta, my sister, has contributed to this book in every possible way: from sharing the love for Ladakh to discussing ideas, editing parts of the text, problem solving and, above all, enabling me to be so far away. It is joyous to share our mother's passion for the Himalayas. My parents' love has lit my path, always reminding me to stay grounded, value humility and retain perspective in life. I dedicate this book to my family.

Abbreviations

BADP	Border Area Development Programme
BCF	Baltistan Cultural Foundation
BJP	Bharatiya Janata Party
CAA	Citizenship Amendment Act
CEC	Chief Executive Councillor
FCR	Frontier Crime Regulation
FCRA	Foreign Contribution Regulation Act
IALS	International Association for Ladakh Studies
IB	Intelligence Bureau
IKMT	Imam Khomeini Memorial Trust
INTACH	Indian National Trust for Art and Cultural Heritage
J&K	Jammu and Kashmir
KASCO	Kargil Social and Cultural Organisation
KDA	Kargil Democratic Alliance
LAHDC	Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council
LBA	Ladakh Buddhist Association
LG	lieutenant governor
LoC	Line of Control
MLA	member of state legislative assembly
MP	member of parliament
NC	National Conference
NGO	non-governmental organisation
PDP	People's Democratic Party

xvi

Abbreviations

SC	Supreme Court
ST	Scheduled Tribe
UT	union territory
VHP	Vishva Hindu Parishad
WIN	World Islamic Network
YMBA	Young Men's Buddhist Association

Notes on Transliteration

I have used John T. Platts' *Dictionary of Urdu, Classical Hindi and English*¹ to transliterate most of the Urdu and Hindi words. For words not found in the dictionary, I have transcribed phrases and terms in a way that best reflects the pronunciation in the Kargil region. Diacritical marks have not been used throughout the text for the sake of simplicity with the exception of *ʿayn* and *hamza* (for examples, Qur'an, *shari'a*, and *ʿulama*). All entries in the glossary use diacritical marks but omit emphatic consonants.

To reflect subcontinental and local pronunciation, *i* and *u* are used rather than *e* and *o* (for examples, 'Qur'an' in place of 'Qoran' and 'Muharram' in place of 'Moharram'). Exceptions have been made for constructions that approximate the Urdu pronunciation (for example, *yaum-e-azadi*).

Persian and Arabic words not found in Platts' dictionary have been transcribed following the *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies (IJMES)* guidelines. Accordingly, words found in the *Merriam-Webster Dictionary* and the *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* have not been treated as technical terms and are therefore not italicised or marked with diacritics (for examples, 'abaya', 'agha', 'fatwa', 'hadith' and 'hijab').

Purigi, Ladakhi and Balti are Tibetan dialects. I have transcribed the words according to the local pronunciation as this varies between dialects. Purigi often includes words from Urdu, Persian and Arabic (for example, 'Hajji Mo'). Where the spelling is relevant, I have included the widely accepted Wylie transliteration of the Tibetan script² in only the glossary.

Notes

1. Digital Dictionaries of South Asia, <http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/platts> (accessed on 20 July 2022).
2. Turrell Wylie, 'A Standard System of Tibetan Transcription', *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 22 (December 1959): 261–67, <https://doi.org/10.2307/2718544> (accessed on 20 July 2022).