

#### Climate Justice in India

Climate Justice in India brings together a collective of academics, activists, and artists to paint a collage of action-oriented visions for a climate just India. They offer historically and socially grounded perspectives on justice implications for Indian society, politics, and economics. This unique and agenda-setting volume informs researchers and readers interested in topics of just transition, energy democracy, intersectionality of access to drinking water, agroecology and women's land rights, national and state climate plans, urban policy, caste justice, and environmental and climate social movements in India. It synthesizes the historical, social, economic, and political roots of climate vulnerability in India and articulates a research and policy agenda for collective democratic deliberations and action.

This crossover volume will be of interest to academics, researchers, social activists, policymakers, politicians, and general readers looking for a comprehensive introduction to the unprecedented challenge of building a praxis of justice in a climate-changed world.

**Prakash Kashwan** is Associate Professor of Environmental Studies at Brandeis University, Waltham, Massachusetts. At the time of preparation of this volume, he was Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Connecticut. He is the author of *Democracy in the Woods* (2017), editor of the journal *Environmental Politics*, and co-founder of the Climate Justice Network.



# Climate Justice in India

Edited by Prakash Kashwan





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009171915

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009171908 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0.

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009171908.

First published 2022

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kashwan, Prakash, editor.

Title: Climate justice in India / edited by Prakash Kashwan.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022020696 (print) | LCCN 2022020697 (ebook) | ISBN

9781009171915 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009171908 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Climatic changes--Government policy--India. | Climatic changes--Social aspects--India. | Environmental justice--India. | BISAC:

LAW / Environmental

Classification: LCC QC903.2.I4 C57 2022 (print) | LCC QC903.2.I4 (ebook) | DDC 363.738/74560954--dc23/eng20220722

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022020696

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022020697

ISBN 978-1-009-17191-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### **Contents**

List	of Poems and Artworks	vii
List	of Tables	ix
List	of Figures	xi
List	of Abbreviations	xiii
Prej	face and Acknowledgements	xvii
1.	Introduction: Climate Justice in India Prakash Kashwan	2
2.	Urban Climate Justice in India Eric Chu and Kavya Michael	25
3.	How Just and Democratic Is India's Solar Energy Transition? An Analysis of State Solar Policies in India Karnamadakala Rahul Sharma and Parth Bhatia	50
4.	Extractive Regimes in the Coal Heartlands of India: Difficult Questions for a Just Energy Transition  Vasudha Chhotray	74
5.	Climate Justice Implications of the Relationship between Economic Inequality and Carbon Emissions in India Haimanti Bhattacharya	98



6.	Climate Action Plans and Justice in India Arpitha Kodiveri and Rishiraj Sen	115
7.	Social Mobilizations for Climate Action and Climate Justice in India Prakash Kashwan	140
8.	Reimagining Climate Justice as Caste Justice Srilata Sircar	162
9.	Intersectional Water Justice in India: At the Confluence of Gender, Caste, and Climate Change Vaishnavi Behl and Prakash Kashwan	183
10.	Realizing Climate Justice through Agroecology and Women's Collective Land Rights Ashlesha Khadse and Kavita Srinivasan	207
11.	Conclusion: Pathways to Policies and Praxis of Climate Justice in India Prakash Kashwan and Eric Chu	229
Abo	out the Editor and Contributors	246
Abo	out the Poets and Artists	250
Ind	ex	251



**Poems** 

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-17191-5 — Climate Justice in India Volume 1 Edited by Prakash Kashwan Frontmatter More Information

### Poems and Artworks

'Global Warming'		
Samvedna Rawat, trans. Veena Chhotray		
'Stage'	139	
Waharu Sonavane, trans. Bharat Patankar and Gail Omvedt		
'The House with No Windows'	161	
Praneeta Mudaliar		
Artworks		
Empowerment	1	
Nidhin Donald		
Let Justice Bloom	49	
Anupriya		
Green Solidarity	97	
Anupriya		
Water Mother	182	
Anupriya		
Connected Worlds	206	
Anupriya		



#### **Tables**

2.1	Analysis of key social equity or justice dimensions in recent	
	urban climate change plans in India	34
3.1	Source of solar power policies across states	60
3.2	Presence of policy instruments for energy justice in state solar	
	policy documents	62
5.1	Data description	103
5.2	Statistical summary of the data	104
5.3	Measures of correlation between variables	107
5.4	Regression results	108
6.1	Analysis of the NAPCC on social justice considerations	122
6.2	SAPCCs and climate justice considerations	124
10.1	Operational land holdings of women from different social classes in India	212
10.2	Operational holdings of women and women cultivators by	
	state in 2010–2011 and 2015–2016	213



# **Figures**

5.1	Geographical scope (shaded dark) of empirical analysis	102
5.2	GDP of India (at constant 2004–2005 prices)	105
5.3	Monetary value of exports and imports of India	105
5.4	Carbon emissions in India	105
5.5	Economic inequality indicators for India	106



#### **Abbreviations**

ACCCRN Asian Cities Climate Change Resilience Network
AKRSP [I] Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (India)

AMRUT Atal Mission on Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation

AP Andhra Pradesh

ASUS Ambedkar Slum Utthan Sangathan
BCCL Bharat Coking Coal Limited
BJP Bharatiya Janata Party

CBA Chhattisgarh Bachao Andolan

CBDR Common But Differentiated Responsibilities

CCL Central Coalfields Limited

CDKN Climate and Development Knowledge Network

CIL Coal India Limited

CMM Chhattisgarh Mukti Morcha
CoP Conference of Parties

CRDPs Climate-Resilient Development Pathways
CSE Centre for Science and Environment
CSR Corporate Social Responsibility
DGSM Dasholi Gram Swarajya Mandal
EIA Environment Impact Assessment

EIA/SIA Environmental and Social Impact Assessments
ERR Earthquake Rehabilitation and Reconstruction

FLCs Forest Labour Co-operatives

FRA Forest Rights Act



GDP Gross Domestic Product

GEAG Gorakhpur Environmental Action Group

GHGs Greenhouse Gases

GIZ German Agency for International Cooperation

GST Goods and Services Tax

GW Gigawatt

GWSSB Gujarat Water Supply and Sewerage Board

HPERC Himachal Pradesh Electricity Regulatory Commission

HRtWS Human Right to Water and Sanitation
HSAA Hindu Succession (Amendment) Act
IAS Indian Administrative Service

ICI India Climate Justice

ICJF Indian Climate Justice Forum

IMF International Metalworkers Federation

INDCs Intended Nationally Determined Contributions
 ITUC International Trade Union Confederation
 IUCN International Union for Conservation of Nature

JLG Joint Liability Groups

JMACC Jharkhand Mines Area Coordination Committee

JMM Jharkhand Mukti Morcha

JNNURM Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission

JOHAR Jharkhand Organization for Human Rights

KSSP Kerala Sastra Sahitya Parishad

kWh Kilowatt-hour

LARRA Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Act

LSGIs Local Self Government Institutions

LVC La Via Campesina

MAKAAM Mahila Kisan Adhikaar Manch

MGNREGA Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act

MKSP Mahila Kisan Sashaktikaran Pariyojana

MMDRA Mines and Minerals (Development and Regulation) Act

MP Member of Parliament
MP Madhya Pradesh
MW Megawatt

NABARD National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development

NAPCC National Action Plan on Climate Change

NBA Narmada Bachao Andolan

NCDHR National Commission on Dalit Human Rights

NCRB National Crime Records Bureau



NDCs Nationally Determined Contributions

NESPON North Eastern Society for the Preservation of Nature and Wildlife

NGO Non-governmental Organization

NGT National Green Tribunal NHG Neighbourhood Group

NRLM National Rural Livelihoods Mission NTPC National Thermal Power Corporation

NTUI New Trade Union Initiative

NVDP Narmada Valley Development Project

OBC Other Backward Classes
ODF Open Defecation Free

PACS Primary Agricultural Co-operative Societies
PESA Panchayat (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act
PESA Panchayat (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act

PIL Public Interest Litigation

PMCCC Prime Minister's Council on Climate Change

PSUs Public Sector Undertakings

PV Photovoltaics RE Renewable Energy

RECs Rural Electric Co-operatives

REDD Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation

RESCO Renewable Energy Service Company RSS Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh

RTI Right to Information

SAPACC South Asian People's Action on Climate Crisis

SAPCCs State Action Plans on Climate Change

SC Scheduled Castes
ST Scheduled Tribes

SECL South Eastern Coalfields Limited

SHG Self-help Group

SIPB State Investment Promotion Board

SSP Sardar Sarovar Project

T-Zed Towards Zero Carbon Development
TERI The Energy and Resources Institute
TNRLM Tamil Nadu Rural Livelihoods Mission
TNWC Tamil Nadu Women's Collective
TUED Trade Unions for Energy Democracy
UAPA Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act

UIDSSMT Urban Infrastructure Development Scheme for Small and Medium

Sized Towns



ULBs Urban Local Bodies
UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNDRIP United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNDROP United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other

People

UNDROP United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other

People Working in Rural Areas

UNFCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

UNHCR UN High Commissioner for Refugees

UP Uttar Pradesh

USAID US Agency for International Development

VECs village energy committees

WASMO Water and Sanitation Management Organisation

WB West Bengal

WCD World Commission on Dams



## Preface and Acknowledgements

My ongoing engagements with international and national debates on climate justice are a result of an intellectual journey over the past two decades that has brought me time and again to the complex intersections of environmental protection and social justice. Market-based solutions became the backbone of ostensible global responses to climate change at the United Nations Climate Change Conference held in Bali in December 2007. The sense of excitement among environmental economists then is difficult to describe from where we are today. However, to those of us who had spent time in the field, this euphoria was evidently and grossly misplaced. The journey that market-based solutions would have to take, from Bali to places like Bastar in Chhattisgarh, where they would be eventually implemented, is not paved with the freedom of choice that pro-market advocates like to celebrate.

Markets are designed to facilitate the accumulation of surplus in the hands of those who can channel it higher up in the 'food chain'. In most cases, the market ecosystem is essentially a centralizing force and does not work for the poor and marginalized. Unfortunately, this argument often falls through the cracks due to the lack of interdisciplinary work that is needed to produce knowledge that may help inform public debates on these complex questions. The market-based solutions institutionalized at the Bali climate conference, especially carbon offsets and carbon emissions trading, have proven to be colossal failures.

Perhaps even more embarrassingly, the advocates of market-based climate solutions lost the battle of ideologies to right-wing reactionary forces. Even in the supposedly knowledge-driven market economies of the Global North, ultra-conservatives have been successful in labelling neoliberal policies, such as offsets and cap-and-trade policies, as



Preface and Acknowledgements

xviii

part of 'the radical Left's progressive wish list'. This is not surprising to many on the left but this also offers much food for thought for students of policy analysis, who focus rather narrowly on coming up with 'efficient solutions'. While smart analyses can be helpful, the belief that such analyses are sufficient to drive policy change has proven to be a chimera. This is why it is necessary to cultivate a strong awareness of the extent to which the beneficiaries of the status quo use their political and economic power to thwart sensible debates on the unprecedented environmental and social crises.

This edited volume is meant as an early intervention to bring consideration of social, economic, and environmental justice to the centre of climate change debates in India. Considering the vastness of the subject matter at hand, there seems to be no better way than to convene a group of fresh voices engaging specifically with each of the many aspects of climate justice. Unlike many other edited volumes, this one is not merely a byproduct of a conference or a workshop. The contributors were kind enough to respond to my invitation to write a chapter specifically for this volume. Yet, this was not easy, as this collaboration entailed working through more than one draft of the chapter abstract followed by several drafts of each chapter. Such close and enriching collaboration with the contributors helped produce chapter texts that offer fresh insights at the cutting edge of these pressing debates.

Climate justice debates in India in the past have foregrounded struggles against the strangulating hold of the forces of global capitalism, neocolonialism, and neo-imperialism. These are valid concerns – a frontal response to these regressive forces is necessary to realize a better future for the planet and the majority of the population of the world. Yet, the task of addressing the serious threat that the climate crisis poses to the lives and livelihoods of poor and marginalized groups, including the urban poor, cannot wait for victories against those formidable adversaries. Equally important, the beneficiaries of the status quo continue to seek to mould the global climate policy process and national policymaking processes to suit their interests.

This is why it is risky to focus narrowly on climate advocacy driven solely by the goal of reducing average atmospheric temperatures, no matter how radical the target. Such advocacy is premised on two assumptions that are rarely made explicit: in many instances, aggressive climate action is equated with climate justice. If climate crisis affects the poor and the marginalized the most, wouldn't 'fixing' the climate crisis automatically minimize vulnerabilities and produce climate justice? Or so the argument goes. Unfortunately, any such expectations must be tempered. As the chapters in this volume show, in the pursuit of climate justice, the means matter as much as the ends. A second and related unstated assumption is that we must prioritize climate action before we can pursue climate justice. In the words of Jonathan Logan, one of the founders of Extinction Rebellion (XR) America, 'If we don't solve climate change, Black lives don't matter. If we don't solve climate change now, LGBTQ [people] don't matter ... I can't say it hard enough. We don't have time to argue about social justice.'



#### Preface and Acknowledgements

xix

Make no mistake, the arguments that the likes of Logan are making are based on an ideology of authoritarian environmentalism. It seeks to use the climate crisis as a totalizing cause to marginalize considerations of a just world. These developments should alert advocates of environmental and climate justice in India. We already have the ingredients necessary for an authoritarian and Malthusian movement on climate action. It is not a coincidence at all that in his novel, *The Ministry for the Future*, Kim Stanley Robinson chose to use India as the site for a hypothetical unilateral deployment of planetary-scale solar geoengineering operations. Deeply entrenched socioeconomic inequalities and a disturbingly widespread acceptance of political authoritarianism are essential ingredients for the rise of climate authoritarianism. Yet, this is not merely a war of wits. Any visions of an alternative world must also outline concrete pathways to translate those visions into reality. In this spirit, this volume seeks to mainstream climate justice within nascent discussions on climate policy and programme development in the Indian context.

Each chapter engages with specific here-and-now issues that sit at the intersection of the climate crisis and socioeconomic crises, of which we have plenty. However, none of the contributors relies on simplistic technocratic solutions that are often presented as silver bullets. Each chapter points to more difficult but enduring tasks of building social, economic, and environmental resilience in sectors as diverse as food, water, energy, including coal and the transition to renewable energy, urbanization, and climate policy development at both the national and state levels. None of the contributors expects to see any major changes to occur without powerful grassroots mobilizations coupled with supportive political and policy advocacy. The history of environmental social movements in India offers deep lessons about building more inclusive climate social movements. While each chapter offers a deep-dive into a specific topic, a comparative reading of the chapters offers cross-cutting insights that will help build bridges across sectors.

In curating this volume, I have drawn inspiration from many conversations that helped animate some of the key arguments that appear in this volume. This included a fortuitously timed invitation in April 2020 to address a webinar as part of the aptly named *Solidarity Series: Conversations During Lockdown and Beyond* organized by the Centre for Financial Accountability, New Delhi. A second virtual talk delivered in February 2021 as part of a series on *Anti-Caste Politics and Environmental Justice* co-organized by Seshadripuram Evening Degree College, Bangalore, and Anti-racist Research and Policy Center (ARPC), American University, created a productive space for some deeper thinking on questions of caste-based oppressions and its implications for climate justice. Two grants from the University of Connecticut were vitally important to this process. A Research Excellence Program grant from the Office of Vice President for Research supported travels to India in the summer and winter of 2019. A Human Rights Faculty Seed Grant for my research on *Economic and Social Rights in a Climate-Changed World* allowed me the space in Spring 2021 to conduct the last round of work on the editing and writing for this volume.



Preface and Acknowledgements

XX

The reflections, arguments, and insights that appear in the volume are a result of engagements with many activists, researchers, and scholars. Rahul Banerjee and Soumya Dutta generously shared their rich understanding of the histories of different strands of environmental and climate movements in India. Several conversations with Nagraj Adve, Rajeswari Raina, and others involved in the Teachers Against Climate Crisis group motivated me to expand the circle of engagement for this volume. Navroz Dubash at the Center for Policy Research (CPR) and colleagues at India Climate Collaborative offered valuable support for the widest possible dissemination of the book.

I am grateful to each of the contributors who worked patiently and diligently on this long and sometimes arduous journey and to the artists, poets, and translators for their creative contributions. The photograph on the book cover showing fishing boats parked in a clock-shape in the village of Champu Khangpok, Langolsabi, Loktak Lake, is by photographer Deepak Shijagurumayum. The photograph also represents the spirit of Naamee Lup, which is a banner representing the collaborative work of the NGO Indigenous Perspectives, Fisherfolk Unions, ESG Bangalore, and other civil society organizations. We are thankful to Ram Wangkheirakpam, the Convenor of Indigenous Perspectives, Manipur, for his kind support. Special word of thanks for Eric Chu who provided valuable inputs on numerous occasions. This volume has benefited from the diligent copy-editing work of Chitralekha Manohar and her team at The Clean Copy and a very supportive steering of the editorial process by Anwesha Rana and Qudsiya Ahmed at Cambridge University Press.

The love, care, and discipline that keeps me on track comes from my family in Storrs – Saroj, Zia, and Sophie – who have lent strength and emotional energy every step of the way. I dedicate this volume to the social justice advocates and climate activists who have demonstrated the courage and conviction needed for persevering in the hope of a more just world.

Storrs, CT April 5, 2022 Prakash Kashwan