This book offers a radical reinterpretation of the development of the modern world through the concept of Jacobinism. It argues that the French Revolution was not just another step in the construction of capitalist modernity, but produced an alternative (geo)political economy – that is, “Jacobinism.” Furthermore, Jacobinism provided a blueprint for other modernization projects, thereby profoundly impacting the content and tempo of global modernity in and beyond Europe. The book traces the journey of Jacobinism in the Ottoman Empire and Turkey. It contends that until the 1950s, the Ottoman/Turkish experiment with modernity was not marked by a peripheral or statist capitalism, as conventionally presumed, but by a historically specific Jacobinism. Asserting this Jacobin legacy then leads to a novel interpretation of the subsequent transition to and authoritarian consolidation of capitalism in contemporary Turkey. As such, by tracing the world historical trajectory of Jacobinism, the book establishes a new way of understanding the origins and development of global modernity.

Eren Duzgun is Assistant Professor at the University of Nottingham, China Campus. His research focuses on historical sociology, political economy and international relations. His work has appeared in the European Journal of International Relations, the Review of International Studies, the Journal of International Relations and Development and the European Journal of Sociology, among other scholarly outlets.
LSE INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

SERIES EDITORS

George Lawson (Lead Editor)
Department of International Relations, London School of Economics
Kirsten Ainley
Department of International Relations, London School of Economics
Ayça Çubukçu
Department of Sociology, London School of Economics
Stephen Humphreys
Department of Law, London School of Economics

This series, published in association with the Centre for International Studies at the London School of Economics, is centred on three main themes. First, the series is oriented around work that is transdisciplinary, which challenges disciplinary conventions and develops arguments that cannot be grasped within existing disciplines. It will include work combining a wide range of fields, including international relations, international law, political theory, history, sociology and ethics. Second, it comprises books that contain an overtly international or transnational dimension, but not necessarily focused simply within the discipline of International Relations. Finally, the series will publish books that use scholarly inquiry as a means of addressing pressing political concerns. Books in the series may be predominantly theoretical, or predominantly empirical, but all will say something of significance about political issues that exceed national boundaries.

Previous books in the series:
Before the West: The Rise and Fall of Eastern World Orders Ayşe Zarakol
How the East Was Won: Barbarian Conquerors, Universal Conquest and the Making of Modern Asia Andrew Phillips
The World Imagined: Collective Beliefs and Political Order in the Sinocentric, Islamic and Southeast Asian International Societies Hendrik Spruyt
Socioeconomic Justice: International Intervention and Transition in Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina Daniela Lai
Culture and Order in World Politics Andrew Phillips and Christian Reus-Smit (eds.)
On Cultural Diversity: International Theory in a World of Difference Christian Reus-Smit
Capitalism, Jacobinism and International Relations

Revisiting Turkish Modernity

EREN DUZGUN

University of Nottingham
For Destine Celal, my mother.
Contents

Acknowledgments page ix

1 Introduction 1
The Plan of the Book 13

2 Modernity, Historicity and Transdisciplinarity 16
Historicizing Modernity: Beyond Fragmented Methodologies 17
From Marx to Marxism: Unifying the “Political” and the “Economic” 26
International Historical Sociology: Unifying the “Social” and the “International” 35
Uneven and Combined Development: Modernity, Temporality, Multilinearity 41
Renewing International Historical Sociology 48
Conclusion 52

3 Capitalism, Absolutism, Jacobinism: The International Relations of Modernity 54
The “Great Divergence” in Post-Feudal Europe: England versus France 57
The (Geo)politics of Capitalist Modernity: “The Improvement of Property” 64
The (Geo)politics of Absolutist Modernity: “The Improvement of the Public” 70
The French Revolution and the Rise of the Jacobins 76
Property and the Terror: Beyond Capitalism and Socialism 82
Substituting Capitalism: The “Citizen-Soldier” and “Public School” as Keys to Understanding Alternate Routes to Modernity 88
Conclusions: Rethinking the Jacobin Model and the “International” 94

4 Disputing Ottoman Modernity (1839–1918) 99
The (Geo)politics of Ottoman Centralization Attempts 102

vii
viii

French Revolution and the Ottoman Empire: Between the Ayans and the Peasantry 106
The Tanzimat as a Combined Project: Between Jacobinism and Capitalism (1838–1876) 110
Sharecroppers, Peasants and Landlords: Toward a Market-Dependent Society? 118
From the Constitution to the Revolution: The Rise of Jacobinism (1876–1908) 126
From Abdülhamid II to the Young Turks: Inventing a Jacobin Islam and a Jacobin Public 134
The Geo(politics) of Revolution: Reimagining the “People” 139
The Young Turk Revolution, War and the Jacobin “Terror” (1908–1918) 143
Conclusion: A Substitute Jacobin Route to Modernity 155

5 Kemalism as the Ultimate Turkish Substitution for Capitalism (1923–1945) 160
The Prelude to the Republic: The (Geo)politics of Sharecropping 162
Industrialization, Monopolization, Peasantization (1923–1945): Kemalism as State Capitalism? 167
The Army, the School and the “Terror”: Redefining Property and the Citizen-Turk 179
Conclusion: Kemalism as a Turkish–Jacobin Synthesis 187

6 Reinterpreting Capitalist Modernity à la Turca 190
Land and Democracy: World War II and the Prelude to Multiparty Politics 192
New World Order, Petty Commodity Production and the Transition to Capitalism 196
A Failed Jacobin Coup and Its Legacy: The 1961 Constitution and “Social Republic” 203
Planners, Oligopolists and Workers: Contradictions of a Capitalist–Jacobin Compound 210
Capitalism of the Oppressed: Reinterpreting the National View Movement 222
Turkey’s (Not-So) Great Transformation, 1980–2002: Secularism against Capitalism 231
Consolidation of Capitalist Modernity: From Neo-Ottoman Commonwealth to Capitalist Authoritarianism 244

7 Conclusion 258

Bibliography 269
Index 304
Acknowledgments

This book is the revised version of a doctoral thesis I embarked on about ten years ago at York University, Toronto. The Political Science Department at York was an intellectual heaven driven by curiosity, skepticism and progressive politics, which I most gratefully acknowledge. In a cutthroat PhD market that prioritizes research with immediate “relevance” and “impact,” York provided me with the financial and intellectual resources to ask “big” questions, explore “large processes” and make “huge comparisons” in a way perhaps only a few places would dare to encourage their students today.

At York, I am most indebted to my supervisor Hannes Lacher. Hannes was the sharpest critic as well as the most generous supporter of this project. Indeed, the very idea of this book crystallized in his graduate seminars, and I have tried to build on and reformulate some of the theoretical questions Hannes raised in his own doctoral project. Ellen Meiksins Wood, whom I was very lucky to have on my dissertation committee for a while, was a continuous source of inspiration until the final penning of this book. Ellen fell ill and passed away before the completion of my thesis, but anyone who reads this book will understand the extent of my debt to Ellen from the frequency of references to her work, and from my critical endorsement of her particular interpretation of historical materialism. Upon Ellen’s illness, I was fortunate that George Comninel accepted her place. George offered numerous invaluable insights, while saving me from making a couple of embarrassing errors about early modern European history. Kamran Matin, my external examiner, provided extensive comments that not only forced me to formulate my arguments much more clearly, but also guided the future development of my work, especially in connection to the field of International Relations. During my viva, Feyzi Baban and Greg Albo also made several important suggestions for improvement, which I have integrated into the revising of the book. More recently, Benno Teschke, Stephen Miller, Ruben Gonzales-
Vicente, Alp Yücel Kaya, Spencer Dimmock and Görkem Akgöz were all very kind to agree to read various draft chapters of the book; I benefited immensely from their comments and critiques. I am also indebted to George Lawson, the lead editor of this book series, for encouraging and supporting this project, as well as the two anonymous reviewers who provided helpful advice on the content and presentation of the argument. Thanks also go to John Haslam, Hannah Weber, Toby Ginsburg, Jane Bowbrick and Abigail Neale at Cambridge University Press and Vinithan Sedumadhavan at Straive for skillfully guiding me through the publication process.

Over the longue durée, I have received help, feedback and encouragement from many people at different stages of my academic life. Adam David Morton, Alexander Anievas, Andreas Bieler, Baran Gürsel, Can Cemgil, Ceren Ergenç, Charles Post, Claire Vergeiro, Ece Kocabıçak, Faruk Yalvaç, Galip Yalman, Gjovalin Macaj, Jeroen Duijndam, Joseph Bryant, Jonathan London, Melpa AỊtuşik, Mustafa Türeş, Necati Polat, Pınar Bedirhanoğlu, Ray Bush, Sabine Dreher, Sam Knafo, Sam Putinja, Sümerjan Bozkurt, Şebnem Oğuz and Zülküf Aydın deserve much thanks. On a more personal level, I am very lucky to have met some wonderful friends along the way. Special thanks are due to Aziz Güzel, Barbara Calvo, Ezgi Doğru, Erdem Akbaş, Frantz Gheller, Jessica Evans, Julian Germann, Licianny Matos, Lilian Yap, Lucy Angus, Nicole Swerhun, Rengin Ataç, Serdar Sözübek, Thomas Chiasson-Lebel, Vedat Altun and Zeynep Kaşlı. Fulya, my partner, witnessed the final stages of the completion of this book; I thank her for the love and joy she has brought into my life. Finally, to my family: Destine, Baran, Elif, Deniz and Woolly. Thank you so much for years of support, generosity and constantly reminding me what matters most. I love you so much.